A Creation of Personal Piety: The Performance Art of Medieval Pilgrimage at Montserrat

HOLLISTER, LAURA,NICHOLE

Laura Nichole Hollister

A Creation of Personal Piety: The Performance Art of Medieval Pilgrimage at Montserrat

Abstract

This thesis begins with a reconceptualization of medieval pilgrimage as a performance art. The consideration of pilgrimage as an act of creation where the individual pilgrim (lay or ecclesiastical) serves as the artist and audience of the performance introduces an alternative way of looking at the space, interactions, and activities involved during the course of pilgrimage. The performances and pilgrimages are unique events and personal acts of piety that engage the actor and landscape in distinct ways, but also derives shape from the textual and cultural contexts tied to the specific site and time period where each performance occurs.

Chapter One provides the theoretical background necessary to begin identifying pilgrimage as performance art through an analysis of David Davies' performance theory. Chapter Two introduces and explores the sixteenth- and eighteenth-century literary sources that are the bases for the discussion of the foundation myths associated with Montserrat and the creation of the cult of the Virgin of Montserrat. Chapter Three explores Montserrat's natural and architectural geography, the role of the physical presence of the pilgrimage site as a tie to the ascetic and eremitic heritage of Montserrat, and the setting's link to the foundation myths. Chapter Four analyzes the mountain landscape utilizing arguments of liturgical drama to determine the degree to which a single narrative path exists during the enactment of pilgrimage and can be determined from Montserrat's miracle texts. Chapter Five looks further in depth at the miracles to determine if a realistic rather than symbolic landscape should be considered when analyzing pilgrimage and how the landscape affects the pilgrim's individual performance and identity.

A Creation of Personal Piety: The Performance Art of Medieval Pilgrimage at Montserrat

Laura Nichole Hollister

Thesis submitted for the degree of PhD

School of Modern Languages and Cultures

Durham University

2019

Table of Contents

List of Illustrations

Acknowledgements

Immense gratitude and thanks must be expressed to my supervisors, Andrew M. Beresford and Manuel Hijano for all their time and support. I am further grateful to Andy for all the thoughtful and detailed feedback that I received. I am extremely thankful that Andy stuck by me through all the theoretical reconfigurations that occurred during the course of writing this thesis. He helped advance my thesis beyond what I thought I was capable.

I would like to thank the School of Modern Languages and Cultures for the many research trips made possible by its generous funding.

I would also like to acknowledge and thank all the care, support, and much needed hugs received from my Welsh family during this three-year journey. Without the support Beccy and Bron Summers during the many research trips and much needed holidays, this thesis would have been a much more onerous endeavor.

An indescribable level of gratitude and appreciation must go to my parents Pat and Karen Hollister and my brother Patrick Hollister. Without them I would not have been able to come to study in Durham in the first place. Their constant love, support, and unwavering faith in my abilities to complete this degree helped to keep the reoccurring doubts and anxieties at bay. This thesis is dedicated to all my family, those who will see the completion of my degree and those who have passed. Thank you all for making this experience possible.

Introduction

The Development of Pilgrimage Studies

Since the emergence of pilgrimage studies as a discipline in the late seventies, structured spheres of movement related to specific geographic locations remain major components of the field. Recently, a shift in scholarship expanded pilgrimage studies from its focus on a singular goal or experience at the end of the ritual journey to encompass variation and movement within the processional route. This alteration in approach amplified the conversation regarding pilgrimage giving it the opportunity to be more inclusive of landscape and historical context rather than remaining a strictly shrine-centered phenomenon. Since the millennium, pilgrimage studies has grown and now incorporates a wider array of disciplines under its purview from a more traditional archaeological approach looking at the dispersal of pilgrimage badges discovered along trade and processional routes (Spicer & Hamilton 2005) to gender studies that approach the mobility of early Christian pilgrimage and the freedom and restraints it placed on religious women (Dietz 2005).

When studies devoted specifically to pilgrimage gained more notoriety due to the work of Victor and Edith Turner (1978), the field was in its infancy. The studies of Turner and Turner (1978) were anthropological in nature, as suggested by their monograph *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture: Anthropological Perspectives*. This early approach sought to establish similarities between different locations of pilgrimage in a normative frame (Turner & Turner 1978). Distinct cultural practices of pilgrimage were analyzed in relation to how the traits of one Christian community were able to be translated across cultural boundaries to another site of pilgrimage while retaining similar religious meanings. Turner and Turner sought to impose unity on the varying Christian cultures which practiced pilgrimage and also on those participants that

constituted the practitioner body of pilgrimage activities. Their initial approach, along with other early pilgrimage studies, grouped pilgrims together as a community whose identity derived from a temporary suspension of their associations with ordinary society (Eade & Sallnow 1991). As a result of the anthropological methodology behind this initial perspective, Victor and Edith Turner (1978) studied pilgrimage through a historical lens of succession and stratification. The first phase of pilgrimage studies sought to understand how the above-mentioned community of pilgrims developed and evolved through the progression of time. The idea of a pilgrim community or *communitas* became a central guiding tenet of the discussion of pilgrimage. For example:

> Communitas persists through religious and theological change; but it requires terms and norms to give it frame, focus, and a flow pattern. While one religion prevails, social and cultural structures seem immutable. But structures, and the symbols which manifest them, do break up and crumble. What often persists is communitas, no longer normative or ideological, but waiting to be given new form by a new religion. (Turner & Turner 1978: 202)

This early stage of pilgrimage studies took the components of the ritual act and the participators entirely out of their social, and to an extent, historical context, in favor of identifying the occurrence of pilgrimage as embodied by a group or *communitas* that could exist as separate and distinct from other cultural constructs.

Turner and Turner's concept of *communitas* began with Victor Turner's (1969) earlier work regarding *liminality*. The liminal and the group of pilgrims unified in a harmonious rite of passage in their *communitas* are designated by a temporary suspension from the normal rules of society and their social obligations. Liminality is a temporary state that, according to Turner, is

connected with spaces of conversion or breach and images of reversal and inversion (Bynum 1991). An example of the inversion, reversal, and violation of social norms is when a member of the nobility or society's elite discards his or her clothing and symbols of office for simpler garb to join a *communitas* and undertake a pilgrimage. The symbolic and temporary disposal of one's rank through dress is a concept comparable to Francis of Assisi stripping off his clothes at the moment he decides to forego his familial connections for a simpler life dedicated to God (Bynum 1991). Liminality determined by Turner's conceptualization is an integral phase in any social drama or human experience categorized as a ritual such as pilgrimage. As a necessary component to the enactment of ritual, the concepts of *communitas* and *liminality* within pilgrimage, in theory, have certain universal characteristics and meaningful activities that can be directly translated from one situation to another and one religion to another without any disruption of practice or significant loss of meaning. This universal and *communitas*-based or liminal approach to pilgrimage continued as the main vein of study in the field until John Eade and Michael Sallnow (1991) responded to Turner and Turner in their somewhat argumentatively entitled collection of essays *Contesting the Sacred: The Anthropology of Christian Pilgrimage*.

Distinct from Turner and Turner, Eade and Sallnow focus on the 'essential heterogeneity of the pilgrimage process, which was marginalized or suppressed in the earlier, deterministic models' (Eade & Sallnow 1991: 3). They insist on deconstructing the universal category of pilgrimage and its actors or liminal *communitas*, a term they view as inappropriate to an adequate analysis of the variety involved in the ritual practices. The contention of Eade and Sallnow to treat each instance of pilgrimage as a singular activity with its own historical and cultural significance demonstrates the shift away from the approach of Turner and Turner which gave pilgrimage its formative push into the realm of systematic inquiry. Yet, the victory of a case-by-

case understanding of pilgrimage over the community of pilgrims or *communitas* approach is in fact superficial and just as limiting as Turner and Turner's (1978) original concept promoting the liminal uniformity of the pilgrims' identities removed from their regular social status. Although Eade and Sallnow propose to break with the application of blanket terminologies and concepts related to pilgrimage, their approach still advocates a separation of the pilgrims and pilgrimages from the realities of their surroundings, albeit in a distinct manner from Turner and Turner. According to Eade and Sallnow, the new agenda for pilgrimage studies that emerges from their collection of essays constitutes:

> a recognition that pilgrimage is above all an arena for competing religious and secular discourses, for both the official co-optation and the non-official recovery of religious meanings, for conflict between orthodoxies, sects, and confessional groups, for drives towards consensus and communitas, *and* for counter-movements towards separateness and division. (Eade & Sallnow 1991: 2)

While Turner and Turner (1978) sought a universal harmony to describe the acts and traditions associated with pilgrimage, Eade and Sallnow (1991) advocate competition and conflict. This approach denotes division as the means to understanding each individual instance of pilgrimage. The act of pilgrimage becomes a studied ritual form because it represents an activity on the periphery or adjacent to the norm, it is a segregated sphere where secular and religious parties try to assert their dominance. Although presented in a more combative manner, Eade and Sallnow, as in the case with Turner and Turner, inadvertently construct pilgrimage as a peripheral or liminal activity demarcated by the conflicting spheres of religion and secularity within a culture utilizing imagery and terminology denoting discord, inversion, and a breach in society.

Eade and Sallnow purport to dismantle the approach to pilgrimage created by Turner and Turner. However, their consideration of the shrine or area of focus at the end of a pilgrimage further echoes aspects of the methodology created by the discipline's founding members:

> The power of a shrine, therefore, derives in large part from its character almost as a religious void, a ritual space capable of accommodating diverse meanings and practices- though of course the shrine staff might attempt, with varying degrees of success, to impose a single, official discourse. (Eade & Sallnow 1991: 15)

Even though Eade and Sallnow disregard and challenge Turner and Turner's conceptualization of a community of pilgrims (*communitas*) born from a rite of passage created in the liminal separation from society, they similarly restate the two major misconceptions of their predecessors. The first contentuous assumption is that all of the emphasis on pilgrimage should be placed on the final or end location of the shrine. The second is the promotion of the shrine or location of rite of passage or ritual of pilgrimage as separate or containing an inherent otherworldliness from the surrounding social activities and landscape. Turner and Turner (1978) attached labels of liminal unity to the community of pilgrims existing distinct from, inverted, and even at odds with the everyday life of a fully integrated member of society. Eade and Sallnow similarly utilize terminology that is not completely beyond reproach. For them, the shrine or site of focus of pilgrimage 'appears as a vessel into which pilgrims devoutly pour their hopes, prayers and aspirations' (Eade & Sallnow 1991: 15). Eade and Sallnow attempt to take a more individualistic view regarding pilgrimage analysis. Instead of creating a communal pilgrim identity to describe the process, they focus on the shrine location rather than the fluid conglomeration of a mobile community of people. At the shrine, the individual, rather than a community sharing set goals as a group of pilgrims, acts as a distinct body that pours his or her

unique hopes and dreams into the shrine. However, these authors merely trade Turner and Turner's concept of *liminality* for their *void.*

The term *void* can have multiple definitions. However, of interest to this thesis is *void* defined as a 'total absence of something normally present' and 'a break or open space, as in a surface; gap' (Agnes 2008: 1601). Also of interest to the current argument is the *liminal* defined as 'at a boundary or transitional point between two conditions, stages in a process, ways of life, etc.' (Agnes 2008: 832). The terms *liminal* and *void* begin to construct the pilgrim identity as constitutive of a separate and distinct group of actors or a *communitas* existing on the outskirts of society. Although Eade and Sallnow purport to break from Turner and Turner's concept of liminal *communitas*, they use the shrine as a void to demarcate its location as a break with society. The *void* distinguishes pilgrims and the ritual activities in which they engage from the rest of the socio-economic or mundane community body. Inadvertently, Turner and Turner along with Eade and Sallnow opened the study of pilgrimage, but also severely limited the scope of the field by focusing on the distinct and segregated activities of pilgrims in the area of the shrine. While the field of pilgrimage continues to advance from its initial creation at the hands of Victor and Edith Turner, the ideology separating religious activities from secular ones still plagues the field's research impulses. The desire persists to emphasize religious acts through a separation of spaces. As is the case with Eade and Sallnow, later authors such as Michael Goodich (1998) continued to promote a heavily structured and formalized methodology regarding rites of passage or ritual activities such as pilgrimage which involve a spiritual or physical journey or change. In these approaches to pilgrimage and ritual, those involved in the activities are considered marginalized or liminal individuals who detach from their families and economic obligations to undergo a transformation or redefinition of their social positions (Goodich 1998). The emphasis

is on demarcating marginal individuals and their liminal personalities and space of transformation that 'flies in the face of accepted norms' (Goodich 1998: 222).

The approaches of Turner and Turner, Eade and Sallnow, and Goodich use ritual acts such as pilgrimage and terms such as *liminality* to designate space and individuals from one another. The emphasis of this methodology is on who is decidedly acting within a ritual community and consequentially at a break with society as opposed to those not involved in the ritual. The space of ritual is also simplified into what is outside of the normative and temporarily detached from civic duties due to the liminality of those involved in opposition to familial and social obligations. Liminality is a necessary concept to comprehend in the discussion of pilgrimage and vital in understanding the considerations of space and movement involved in pilgrimage and needs to be defined as it will be used in this thesis before moving forward.

Caroline Walker Bynum's (1991) monograph questions Victor Turner's (1969) *liminality* and its capacity to be a universally applicable concept connected with spaces of conversion and breach. By analyzing hagiographic texts depicting female and male saints, the author arrives at the conclusion that liminality 'may be less a universal moment of meaning needed by human beings as they move through social dramas than an escape for those who bear the burdens and reap the benefits of a high place in the social structure' (1991: 34). Bynum's conclusion is determined by a disagreement with Turner's theories of inversion used to denote the liminal phase. She claims that the inversion inherent in the liminal state cannot be satisfactorily applied to male and female saints. When the male saints are in a liminal phase, their gender roles tend to be reversed and they are described in effeminate and mystical terms. When women are described in hagiographic texts or involved in rites of passage such as receiving the Eucharist they tend not to inherit the status of inversion that is a crucial component to Turner's concept of liminality.

The women are described as reaching a higher, purer state of womanhood which more firmly situates them in their traditional societal roles rather than freeing them from the dominant boundaries of their gender status (Bynum 1991). What the author's study offers to the discussion of liminality is that the traditional approach favors a certain type of actor engaged in a ritual process. Liminality or the *communitas* is a release for the elite men who create the structural foundation from which they temporarily escape (Bynum 1991). This approach towards liminality is a heavily gendered analysis which compares and contrasts the male versus female medieval experiences of rituals or rites of passage. Despite the bias of the approach, the author opens the discussion of liminality by questioning the earlier methodologies that sought to strictly identify those involved in a ritual or rite of passage and place all marginal groups of society within the same category. This thesis also expands and alters the concept of liminality pertaining to pilgrimage.

The focus of this thesis is not the male noble elite that engages in pilgrimage, but everyone including the nobility and laity, male and female members of the clergy, and the children and adults who engaged in pilgrimage to Montserrat. The liminality attached to pilgrimage is not the formalized marginalization in which a suspension of familial and civic duties results in redefining an individual's position in society. There is an alternate approach to the concept of liminality or rituals and arts occurring on the margins of society. In Michael Camille's (1992) *Images on the Edge: The Margins of Medieval Art* he argues against a strict Bakhtin-style reading of medieval art and warns against dividing artworks along the lines of the pious and grotesque that exist side by side and never merge, such as an approach reflected by Turner's (1969) concept of liminality and its decisive break with society. Instead, Camille addresses liminality through instances of where religious words (what he considers the sacred)

and profane images (such as centaurs, sciapods, and pygmies) are placed together on a page to show that spaces where sacred and profane aspects interact are neither outside nor inside aspects of medieval life, but in-between or on the edge (1992). Liminal acts or artworks are not exclusive but inclusive integrations and hybridizations of spaces that serve as 'an unfixed boundary between physical, devotional, and temporal loci; a liminal space between the material and the imaginary; a fluid stratum between the spoken, the written, the depicted, and the experienced' (Gertsman & Stevenson 2012: 2).

The ritual, actions, texts, images, individuals, and spaces of pilgrimage exhibited in this thesis exemplify the liminal as defined as an in-between hybridized space in which room is supplied to integrate aspects of the sacred (or the religious world, its deeds and meditations) and profane (the mundane or ordinary society). The liminal space of pilgrimage and those involved in the act do not exist outside of medieval life, but integrate all of its components together through the nature of the space that allows room for such a fluidity of activity and performance. Unfortunately, the divisive attitude towards liminality and pilgrimage or inability to understand each component of society in a larger socio-cultural picture is not a limitation solely prevalent in the study of pilgrimage. The related fields of ritual and religious studies contain similarly stymieing approaches resulting in dichotomies that disengage theory from the practical aspects of the space and actors involved. The persistence of the binary delineation of space and actions associated with ritual locations continues to thrive and hinder a deeper understanding of the participatory fields of research.

This thesis expands the dialogue of pilgrimage studies by comparing and contrasting the field to similar disciplines plagued by limited and dichotomous approaches. What the forthcoming branches of research have in common is that they reflect the Turner approach to

liminality and its desire to formalize and definitively designate distinctions of ordinary and extraordinary environments of interaction and reception or rituals. In religious studies terminology, the *ordinary* refers to the profane sphere, that which is concerned with the daily lives of the lay populace. This environment generally pertains to the body and its corporeal concerns that engage with such necessities as food, entertainment, and commerce. The *extraordinary* environment is designated as the sacred. The sacred is concerned with thoughts of the soul and activities that seek to draw the human body away from concerns of the flesh and towards the contemplation of God and divine truths. While the body and the soul can generally pertain to a human being existing in any social level of society (lay and ecclesiastical), the sacred sphere generally resonates most with the clergy and ecclesiastical pursuits enacted in religious locations such as churches, cathedrals, and pilgrimage sites.

Pilgrimage and Ritual Theory: An Overview

Before discussing the specifics of pilgrimage to the mountain location of Montserrat in Catalonia, which serves as the case study for this thesis, this section first outlines the current movements of the disciplines utilized in the analysis of the lay experience and creation of pilgrimage at the mountain site. The overview serves to familiarize the reader with the disciplines involved in the upcoming discussions and also provides the basic structure for advancing the following research. The section begins with the consideration of the sacred versus the profane spheres of medieval society in past and current scholarship related to pilgrimage and ritual studies. Then the definitions of each are related to address the relevant dichotomies that persist in maintaining the bifurcated approach to pilgrimage dependent on the static concept of the sacred and profane separation of spaces. Once these theories are reviewed the section

progresses to more specific dialogues of aesthetic, cognitive literary, and performance theories. In order to build the theoretical background upon which this thesis' approach to pilgrimage is based, first it is necessary to summarize the advancements in the field of pilgrimage studies since the counter-reaction of Eade and Sallnow to the *communitas* paradigm of Turner and Turner.

Catherine Bell's (2009) work on ritual theory encapsulates the progression in the approach to the field and shows the perpetuation of the theoretical dichotomies related to the sacred versus profane sphere that limit the understanding of ritual practices such as pilgrimage. As in the case with pilgrimage studies, ritual theory has the capacity to address how ritual can aid in the study of religion, society, and culture. However, as Bell (2009) points out, the theory becomes more of a tool for analysis in larger theoretical discourses rather than its own comprehensive unit worthy of study. According to Bell (2009), *ritual* defined as the physical enactment of religious rites is presented as secondary to the more profound religious experience, which consists of emotional contemplation of religious ideologies such as theorizing or scholastic reflection on liturgy. As the author contends, the primary focus of religious studies became the sacred space in relation to its ability to promote higher cognitive and liturgical reflection. In Bell's study, the sacred space equates to the location which houses the enactment of and reflection on the ritual. The prominence given to a sacred space and its corresponding rituals favors ecclesiastical involvement over the designated profane space and the laity's involvement in the rites.

Ritual as a tool for interpretation of religious activities would benefit the field of pilgrimage studies. However, religious studies that utilize ritual to denote a sacred space related to an educated ecclesiastical introspection of the liturgy (as distinguishable from the ordinary lay and profane action) transposes the researcher back to the liminal spheres and voids of Turner and

Turner, and Eade and Sallnow. Bell (2009) denotes that ritual, similar to the Turner paradigm of *communitas*, becomes a method of differentiation. Except that in pilgrimage the divide exists between the spheres of engaged pilgrimage versus the lay society outside the ritual activity, whereas ritual theory divides the sacred sphere of ritual into two categories. The ritual becomes an action that is distinguishable and separate from conceptual aspects of religious rhetoric, such as those constructed with the theoretical musings of symbolism, mythology, and analytical theology. Bell continues to describe how theorists attempt to bridge the conceptual and behavioral dichotomy between ritual thought and action. However, she states that the theorists have yet to dissolve the distinctions inherent in ritual theory. The main issue of the dichotomy is that ritual analysis uses the location of the rite as a traditionally conceptualized liminal space denoting and demarcating spheres of sacred thought and profane or lesser ritual actions from one another. However, the ritual activity is the only location where the two spheres can converge in a proscribed series of ordered interactions. This space that acts as a temporary break where sacred thoughts and actions and lay actors converge appears to advocate ritual as a necessary liminal activity existing outside socitety's boundaries to allow two opposing forces (ritual act and thought) to interact. Bell (2009) tries to overcome this definitive dichotomy by looking not at the divide between ritual contemplation and action, but rather by imposing categories on an individual basis, in the manner of Eade and Sallnow, to determine what does or does not constitute a ritual through a process she calls *ritualization*. She uses the term *ritualization* to draw attention to the social interactions of ritual by considering how each ritual involved in the process of *ritualization* distinguishes itself from other practices and what each act accomplishes rather than focusing on a designation of actors or spaces. While Bell's approach focuses on broadening the context of ritual and does not separate ritual action from thought, she still defines

ritual as differentiation. The distinction that ritual draws between sacred or religious activities and other activities perpetuates the concept of a liminal or sacred space that has specific and highly structured interactions with the profane or secular space. This conceptualization of the sacred liminal sphere of pilgrimage versus the ordinary spaces of human society first drawn up by Turner and Turner not only has parallels in the divide between action and thought in ritual theory, but a similar dichotomy of space and action appears in the discipline of archaeology regarding the study of pilgrimage landscape.

In her study of pilgrimage archaeology on the Camino de Santiago de Compostela, Julie Candy (2009) labels the confusion inherited by archaeologists from historians and anthropologists concerning pilgrimage as a *theoretical ghetto*. This *theoretical ghetto* exemplifies the differences in approach between Turner and Turner and Eade and Sallnow, where the former created and defined the field and the latter pulled apart and recontextualized the criteria of definition (Candy 2009). She notes that this issue of using pilgrimage or ritual to locate and pick apart previous arguments still persists in archaeology. As is the case with Bell, Candy seeks to move beyond the *theoretical ghetto* by focusing on action or movement embodied within the ritual participants through an emphasis on the physiological movements of the pilgrims and how they shape the landscape of the pilgrimage routes. Candy's approach interprets the process of pilgrimage as a 'choreographed form of ritualised activity and motion' (2009: 3). She defines landscape not in terms of binaries dependent on the location of the fixed architectural structure of a church (the sacred space) in which ritual activities occur, but includes every material component that could be encountered during a journey or associated with travel involved in pilgrimage. The active nature of involvement between the pilgrim's movements and the 'multi-dimensional, shifting locales' of sacred centers, takes Candy's (2009: 3)

archaeological approach away from the shrine-based focus of Turner and Turner and Eade and Sallnow and their concepts of a designates space of liminal activity.

Candy argues for an engagement of pilgrimage archaeology with landscape theory that addresses how society and place become intertwined in the active participation of the natural and architectural settings with the moving body. In this way, the human participant as a unit of bodily consciousness and sensory perception, rather than the segregated ritual act, becomes the lens through which the archaeologist can derive meaning from the pilgrimage landscape. This prompts the focus of pilgrimage archaeology and landscape theory to move away from the consideration of a single site of a church or an easily identifiable liminal or sacred location of ritual movement to emphasize the study of landscapes, routes, and pilgrimage communities in flux (Candy 2009). Similarly, Bell (2009) responds to the stagnant approach of ritual theory by focusing on the interactions of the social body of the participant with the symbolically constructed spatial and temporal environment of ritual space. These approaches make space for conceptualizing locales of ritual or pilgrimage as dependent and determined by the individual's movments and interactions with a broader sense of what can be considered the ritual landscape.

While a bodily approach to pilgrimage on an individual basis seems to create a new realm of discourse for pilgrimage, the methodology is still rooted in the ultimate shortcomings of the field which uses pilgrimage, or in this case the body of the pilgrim, to delineate and differentiate the constructed space of pilgrimage from other activities and locations. Not only does current research into pilgrimage through archaeology or ritual studies perpetuate the sacred versus profane divide, but by focusing on the body as a moving entity it further disassociates the physical enactment and activities of ritual from a cognitive reflection regarding religious

discourse. The body and thoughts of the pilgrim become two separate spheres that do not necessarily interact with each other.

The body of the pilgrim is extricated from a cognitive awareness of its place within the wider socio-religious context. This demarcation and separation of the moving body and cognitive reflection causes ritual act and ritual thought to become further dissociated from one another. When action resides in a separate, secondary position compared to religious contemplation 'they [the participants] begin to feel the meaning of their actions through their bodies rather more than understand or rationalise them in a conscious, cognitive way' (Candy 2009: 16). Furthermore '[ritualization] is designed to do what it does without bringing what it is doing across the threshold of discourse or systematic thinking' (Bell 2009: 93). In both of these definitions, the pilgrim's body becomes distinct and disconnected from cognitive, systematic, or reflective thinking. Not only are the actions of the body separated from contemplative thought, but the ritual becomes limited to a dictated area of influence that does not affect activity outside the religious or sacred sphere in which it acts. This bodily approach further adds to the rigid definitions of pilgrimage and limits the contexts and understanding of spaces that should be accepted and utilized when pursuing research of individual ritual practices.

Candy tries to break the sacred versus profane divide by looking at the route and landscape of pilgrimage to show that the sacred center is not fixed at the journey's end, but a moving and shifting topography. Landscape theory and a bodily focus expand the discussion of pilgrimage away from a fixed location of ritual. However, Candy's focus on physiological movement inadvertently reinforces the *theoretical ghetto* of her own field by using the body to promote the separate spheres of static versus active reception and perception. The body may contextually move in a structured space, yet the focus is specifically on movement and

differentiation caused by the participant's actions within the ritual of participation. The body moves through a space. The body walks, pauses, speeds up, and slows down based on physiological pressures such as individual physical fitness and health concerns. Yet another half of the conversation is missing. While the body performs these acts and walks the ritual path, the reflexive or cognitive mind of the lay pilgrim remains distinct from the discussion of pilgrimage. The changing landscape and its interactions with the moving body and the unique entity that encapsulate each of the pilgrims' identity as they inhabit the space needs to be addressed.

The motivations of the pilgrims that spur them on their journeys through the natural landscape and the information they rely on to guide them in their travels and inform them when they arrive at the constructed area of the shrine are also integral to the understanding of pilgrimage. The pilgrims' perceptions, how they change with the socially and historically contextualized landscape and are affected by their interactions with what they perceive, and how their actions and perceptions shape their environment and the concept of what is considered sacred and profane must join the conversation of ritual and pilgrimage studies. A bodily focus such as Bell's (2009) and Candy's (2009) fails to take into account these aspects of pilgrimage because it only looks at one part of the pilgrim. In order to unite the body and mind of the pilgrims and to understand their experiences, a new method of analyzing pilgrimage is needed that engages with the reciprocity between the pilgrim's body and thoughts and how the individual creates a discourse and interacts with the fluid landscape. The manner in which this thesis will address the sacred and profane division of spaces inherent in studies of medieval pilgrimage and discuss the individual's experience and interaction with landscape is by regarding the act or ritual of pilgrimage as a creation of art. Specifically pilgrimage will be considered synonymous with performance art designated by an initial need or motivation which is

manipulated in a specific medium in a definitive time frame to achieve a determinant output or creation of a work of art (Davies 2004). Before pilgrimage can be regarded as performance art, it is first necessary to establish how pilgrimage can be considered art, namely through its connections to the field of aesthetics.

The Mind and Body Divide: Further Methodological Approaches

The traditional study of aesthetics formed as an offshoot of psychology with a vague focus on the concepts of beauty in art. Unfortunately, the nonspecific desire to understand beauty at the field's inception continues to affect current trends of research and theories within the discipline. When seeking a unified and structured approach to aesthetics, the theorist turns to all-encompassing blanket approaches to beauty in art similar to Turner and Turner's (1978) definitions of *communitas* in their studies of pilgrimage. Any attempt to determine a precisely structured list of components which define an aesthetic or beautiful artwork leads to an ambiguous set of categories that constantly needs to be reevaluated when exceptions to the rules arise. The fluidity of terminology inherent in the field leads to a definition of aesthetics and its theoretical underpinnings that remains purposefully vague as the following demonstrates: 'aesthetics is the area of philosophy that concerns our appreciation of things as they affect our senses, and especially as they affect them in a pleasing way' (Carlson 2000: xvii). Also lacking in specificity and echoing an earlier theoretical approach to beauty, Monroe Beardsley (1958) claims that aesthetics is the philosophy of criticism that deals with the meaning and truth of characteristics of aesthetic objects in regard to describing and evaluating them. An additional definition of aesthetics that reinforces the divide in the discipline that emphasizes aesthetic (beautiful) as opposed to a non-aesthetic (ordinary) experience is offered by Noël Carroll (2001).

Regarding the aesthetic experience of artwork, Carroll states that 'a decisive portion of our cognitive activity is spent placing the artwork in its correct category or genre, which, in turn, enables us to appreciate the suitability of its formal articulation' (2001: 5). According to Carroll, this categorical thinking with respect to stylistic structures present in a work of art plays a major role in the appropriate appreciation of the aesthetic experience. From these definitions, a rigid image begins to form of aesthetics as a method or study of the reception of art objects, that, when meeting certain malleable categorical requirements, can be considered aesthetic or pleasing to the senses.

The more recent scholarship of Beardsley (1958) and Allen Carlson (2000) seeks to describe the pleasant reaction to beauty in art. In the case of aesthetics, art is considered to be a painting or an object that holds a certain predetermined artistic value that can be aesthetically as opposed to normally viewed. Carroll (2001) also endeavors to define the aesthetic experience by proscribing the structurally-based categories that indicate an aesthetic appraisal of art. Contemporary movements of aesthetics, although still vague, utilize a descriptive rather than proscriptive approach to discern whether or not a work of art is aesthetically pleasing on an individual basis. However, the scholarship initiated by eighteenth-century philosophers such as Immanuel Kant that sought resolutely to categorize and distinguish aesthetic objects and reception from ordinary or less cognitive appreciations of day-to-day items, still remains thoroughly embedded in the field. The study of aesthetics retains this tradition of receptive differentiation as the field continues to evolve. Even authors such as Carroll (2001), who seek to promote alternative methods to appreciate art, exhibit the aesthetic dichotomy that he purposes to break. Carroll's main argument is that there are various ways to appreciate art and that while an aesthetic experience is one such method, it is not 'definitive of our responses to artworks' nor

should art 'be characterized exclusively in terms of the promotion of aesthetic responses' (2001: 5). However, the structure of his monograph is divided into sections that emphasize the differences between the aesthetic and the other more emotionally based responses. Carroll intends to expand the conversation of art appraisal to include appropriate emotional reception. However, the distinction between aesthetic and other modes of art reception indicates that there is still a tendency to construct an aesthetic appreciation in a more categorically cognitive manner determined by abstract and critical theories of beauty rather than through the more emotive responses.

Aesthetic theory leaves the researcher with a threefold dilemma. First of all, it lacks a coherent or unified definition of what it categorizes as an aesthetic object and a unified approach of how to theorize about the object. In one respect, the ambiguity and vagueness is useful in that it allows scholars to adapt and manipulate the term *aesthetics* to suit their research, which on the one hand means that this branch of philosophy can be used as a tool to aid studies in multiple disciplines. However, it is necessary to remain vigilant and ensure that the application of an aesthetic view does not become liberally used without a firm basis in its academic and historical background.

A second dilemma with regard to aesthetics follows from the initial vagueness of its terminology. While an aesthetic object refers to a work of art, the term *art* can also be used indiscriminately and become a misleading or meaningless word. An aesthetic object or piece of art can vary from a work of Van Gogh hanging in a museum to an old growth forest if viewed in an appropriately aesthetic manner. For example, one of the inherent problems Carlson (2000) cites in his work on environmental aesthetics is that the potential scope for analyzing natural aesthetics is enormous. Theoretically, what can be considered beautiful (aesthetic) under the

banner of environmental aesthetics can range from wild landscapes such as an untouched field or forest to the constructed environment of a crowd of stalls in a city marketplace (Carlson 2000). The size of the landscape under focus can also vary tremendously. Depending on how one defines and studies the environment, a landscape can range from the size of a national park to a backyard or even the microsystem of a single pond (Carlson 2000). The challenge is to determine the nature of the aesthetic object under review and whether context, location, and medium are appropriate in determining what constitutes a work of art, as well as to what degree context is necessary in understanding the contested work.

A final issue in aesthetics is the persistence of a separation of aesthetic versus non-aesthetic worthy objects and appraisals. Aesthetic theorists from Kant to Carlson may differ in what each considers an aesthetic object. However, modern theorists such as Carlson continue to follow the pattern set by Kant that esteems aesthetically beautiful objects or locations, which are worthier of study and are believed to engage a higher cognitive process, over what they designate as ordinary objects. Geddes MacGregor's (1957) work reflects the early twentieth-century's continuation of the Kant-based separation of aesthetic versus non-aesthetic objects through distinctions in cognitive processing faculties and the preference for a strictly delineated aesthetic object. When aesthetic theory is applied to the realm of religious activity, MacGregor distinguishes between two types of perceptive processes. The process that produces a higher level of cognition is considered a pure aesthetic religious perception and reflection. While the lower or cheaper process is that of ordinary or muddled perception (MacGregor 1957). The ordinary perception is the easier and handier cognition that meets the lower demands of everyday life. In order to have the higher aesthetic experience, MacGregor mirrors the Kantian idea of the detached sublime that exists in the true aesthetic appreciation of art. According to MacGregor

(1957), the highest form of religiously aesthetic judgement comes from the scholar or thinker who seeks out the sublime of a transcendent beauty and 'must exercise a certain detachment in order to get back to "pure" intellectual reflection' (121). Although MacGregor's text is dated and has a clear orthodox Christian bias, he indicates that certain objects or in his case certain religious acts of worship are distinguishable from the interaction and understanding of everyday society. Through subjectively imposed distinctions over what can be considered worthy and stimulating of a higher cognitive thought, Kant and MacGregor delineate an aesthetic appreciation as a detached activity that solely looks to the appropriate aesthetic contemplation of an art object devoid of all other cultural or intellectual context and reflection. Later aesthetic scholars, such as Carlson, do not take such an extreme view in the creation of a separate, idealistic realm for the sole purpose of aesthetic reflection.

Although the language and style of the debate has changed, the heritage of limiting aesthetic interactions or reception through the concise denotation of engaging with an object or landscape still remains entrenched in current aesthetic discourse. For example, in his monograph on aesthetics in the environment, Carlson describes various methods of interacting aesthetically with nature. He states that there is an appropriate way to engage with an object. This aesthetic reception of the natural environment or landscape:

> involves more than simply either passive contemplation of pleasing form or spontaneous delight in sensuous surface. Essential to aesthetic appreciation is active engagement, involving cognitive and emotional interaction between the appreciator and the object of appreciation. (Carlson 2000: 194)

Deviating from the previous trends in aesthetic inquiry, Carlson (2000) acknowledges that the understanding of beauty or the aesthetic appreciation of an art object or landscape is dependent

on an engaged interaction between the viewer and the object being viewed. Initially Carlson's approach opens the conversation of aesthetic appreciation to an engagement involving both cognitive and emotional interactions. He also gives the art object or environment along with the observer roles in the aesthetic experience. Although Carlson steps away from viewing aesthetic objects in an idealized, detached state of the Kantian Sublime, his version of aesthetics still places strict protocols on what can be considered a correct aesthetic appreciation. In addition, Carlson's (2000) utilization of the term *appreciator* reflecting the human component of the interaction and *object of appreciation* when discussing the aesthetic landscape continues to give prominence and the majority of agency to the human observer over the aesthetic environment. In this relationship, the *appreciator* retains the more active role of aesthetic determination. The human subjectivity alone determines the aesthetic art value of the appraised art object or landscape.

Despite Carlson's promotion of an active relationship between the human *appreciator* and the appreciated environment, examples of his adherence to the strict desire to categorize and designate the correct method of aesthetic appreciation appear earlier in his work. He promotes the way to appreciate the object through cognition determined by a scientific knowledge of the geographical history of a landscape. The techniques utilized in the creation of the natural works of art, such as the tectonic shifting of continental plates, are further examples of technical information necessary for the appreciation of the object. However, earlier in his monograph Carlson advocates emotional as well as scientific components as integral to a holistic understanding of the landscape. He does not refute himself with regard to an emotional response in aesthetics. Emotion has a place in the appreciation of art, but a hypothetical emotional response does not lead to the correct or appropriate aesthetic reception such as the information

attained through scientific or historical reflection and cognition. Appropriate reception and appreciation of aesthetic objects involve prior scientific knowledge and study. The theoretically correct response to art cannot rely on the arousal model of contemplation dependent on immediate emotional responses, which would give the receptive process over to emotional response rather than gathered data.

Carroll endeavors to exemplify the limitations of Carlson's environmental model of aesthetic appreciation as a result of its overly scientific background. However, Carroll does not manage to answer the dilemma of a preference for cognition versus the emotional response present in aesthetic inquiry. As Carlson before him, Carroll (2001) attempts to expand the conversation of aesthetics by widening the possible experiences of art and aesthetic reception. This expansion of the aesthetic experience includes emotional responses to art as legitimate interactions. Carroll's emotional response to art can work in concert with aesthetic appreciation or other models, such as Carlson's environmental model of aesthetically appreciating natural landscapes. However, in his search to find alternative ways of appreciating art, Carroll takes a narrative approach to identifying art that limits the scope of his argument and application of aesthetics. For Carroll (2001), emotion can create a legitimate reaction to art, but this response will not necessarily be an aesthetic appreciation. As is the case with Carlson's argument which focused on natural scientific history to aid in the proper aesthetic experience of landscape, Carroll limits a specifically aesthetic appreciation of art to the cognitive realm dependent on prior knowledge and education.

In his discussion of aesthetic and non-aesthetic or emotional experiences, Carroll (2001) finds it necessary to define whether an object or performance is considered art with respect to the nature and practical structures of the artwork. After listing a variety of previous traditions in art

history for sorting between art and non-art objects, he arrives at his definition of art and how cognitively to approach and analyze an aesthetic work. For Carroll 'art is a cultural practice' (2001: 66). To identify the object in question, the audience needs to be cognitively or thoughtfully aware of the cultural tradition the artwork falls into and how the piece interacts or breaks with the tradition. Initially this claim seems to show a positive movement away from the necessary scientific historic background that Carlson (2000) promotes in his appreciation of landscape or the Kantian heritage of reflecting on an aesthetic object in an intellectual vacuum devoid of any other influencing factors. However, the cultural practices to which Carroll refers do not include the larger socio-historical practices of the culture in which the art was produced. Carroll, as well as Carlson and other philosophers of art, utilize culture as a limiting term that pertains to the 'corpus of art internal to the practice of art' (Carroll 2001: 67). As is the case with the cyclical, vague, and internal-looking definitions of aesthetics, Carroll's definition of culture prevents art from interaction with fields beyond the critically imposed categories of analysis constructed by philosophers and theoreticians.[1]

Carroll's cultural narrative of art compiled from the knowledge of the linear progression of artistic style and form is meant to engender a widening of what is considered art. This approach relies on identifying new works through a consideration of how the objects fit into the history of the art world and that tradition's internal culture (Carroll 2001). In order to categorize an object as art and have an appropriate response to the work, Carroll states that the audience needs to have specific knowledge of where the piece fits into the historical discussion of art movements before and after the object of focus. His idea of art as a cultural practice has its limitations similar to Carlson's work. Carroll and Carlson propose, albeit in vastly different

[1] See Carlson (2000: xvii) and Beardsley (1958) for further definitions of aesthetics.

manners, that an aesthetic appreciation of artwork and the competent identification of art is a process determined by previous and pertinent historical knowledge of the formal and structural components of the viewed object. This focus on a specific stylistic culture or scientific background necessary to appreciate objects severely limits the percentage of the general population that has the capacity to identify and respond to art as well as the object's, landscape's, or environment's potential to influence the aesthetic experience. Although Carroll proposes to entertain emotional responses as legitimate and equal to aesthetic responses, his methodology continues to underline the inherent dilemma in aesthetics that has difficulties synthesizing various modes of reception without relegating the emotional response as inferior and distinct from a more cognitive or aesthetic appreciation.

This perceived distinction between aesthetic and ordinary (or more emotional) modes of reception is reminiscent of the sacred versus profane divide prevalent in pilgrimage studies and ritual theory. Aesthetic theory gives prominence to art reception that engages higher cognitive and receptive functions over interactions with what is deemed a non-aesthetic object such as a chair or stool present in everyday life. However, if the same chair is placed in the proper setting, such as an art gallery installation, then the chair can be viewed in an aesthetic light which is believed to engage a higher level of thinking. Once the chair is in the gallery, it can be analyzed in relation to its structural similarities to other such works present in the history of carpentry or chair art. This divide of specialized reception versus ordinary reception is the ritual divide encapsulated. The sacred space denoting a specific location of ritual enactment and appreciation equates with a specialized aesthetic view only accessible to those few educated theorists with the adequate art-cultural knowledge to engage in the aesthetic appreciation. The profane becomes the ordinary day-to-day and non-aesthetic reception. Despite the flaws in aesthetic theory, the

concept of a single object or landscape having the potential to be appreciated in an aesthetic (art) manner depending on its cultural situation and manner of observation and reception can be adopted and modified to contribute to the conversation of the space and art performance of pilgrimage. This thesis engages with such theories surrounding art and aesthetic reception in order to advance the conversation of pilgrimage to utilize art and its creation to integrate rather than differentiate the space pilgrims inhabited. Reconceptualizing the creation and engagement of art and space will destabilize the sacred versus profane perception of formally designated and differentiated spaces. In order to redefine pilgrimage as art, an analysis of the components of pilgrimage to Montserrat including all the ritual aspects of pilgrimage (place, artifacts, locations, movement, objects, and actors) is necessary.

Understanding the development and trends in the field of aesthetics is the first step in navigating the traditional analysis and arguments surrounding art and the interactions between the designated observer or appreciator and the art object. In recent years, further methodologies have emerged from the ideas and motivations of aesthetics to discover new ways of analyzing and understanding literary arts. The approaches of cognitive literary theory, ecocriticism, and especially performance theory offer new fora in which to bring together the discussion of how art and the environment interact with the observer. These methodologies can be adapted to dispel the dichotomies of art versus ordinary objects and address the sacred versus profane divide. Each of these fields of study, as is the case with aesthetics, focuses on cognition or critical thinking in relation to art and the environment in which it is perceived and interacts with the audience. Where they differ from a traditional aesthetic approach is that cognition is not necessarily given a higher status in the appreciation of art. Instead, the field of cognitive literary theory looks at the process and representation of cognition, analysis, or aspects of reflective thinking within the art

and how this affects the work and the human audience. Performance theory takes the basic aesthetic framework even further in that it demonstrates how cognition or what is deemed more reflexive thinking and emotional, cultural context, and space interact in the reception of performance art. The ecocritical approach acknowledges the presence of the natural environment in literary works of art and its protagonistic potential in catalyzing human actions and identities (Scarborough 2013). The following section briefly describes cognitive literary theory to introduce its most prominent lines of inquiry and to denote how such theories have the potential to expand the discussion and approach to art objects and art landscapes. Then performance theory is introduced, which is the fundamental basis for understanding the art in pilgrimage or pilgrimage as art within this thesis. A methodological approach to pilgrimage combining aspects of ritual theory and related cognitive theories such as performance theory will expand the understanding of the cultural reception surrounding and permeating individual instances of pilgrimage.

Cognitive literary theory considers and combines biological aspects of human nature and cognition within the work's culture-specific context to analyze and explore the use and function of the brain within works of fiction (Jaén & Simon 2016). Cognitive literary theory does not focus on contemporary works of art or artists as is the case with some branches of aesthetics. Instead, this approach takes current scientific questions pertinent to activities or components of mental processing such as vision (or tactile sensations) and uses them to look back to early modern or previous eras to investigate 'the interaction of human brains with historically specific circumstances that produce literary and cultural artifacts' (Crane 2015: 15). In the case of cognitive literary theory, the cultural artifacts are equivalent to the textual products of works such as novels, plays, and poetry. What is unique and helpful from this approach is that through a

cognitive reading of literary works or artistic productions, the researcher looks to uncover signs of normal or average brain function within the texts or culturally produced artifacts. Instead of using a symptomatic approach to reading, which seeks to analyze the abnormalities within a text or values the hidden sublime and metacritical possibilities of an author or the work's artistic rendering, cognitive literary theory provides a method to bring the average or ordinary perception of the layperson to the front of the academic discussion of art production and reception (Crane 2015). Unlike ritual studies and art approaches that tend to favor the actions and reactions of the ecclesiastical minority or the aesthetic art world that produces categories of art for the sake of critics and theorists, cognitive literary theory permits the experiences and brain functions of the average medieval lay pilgrims to come to the forefront of the discussion regarding art and visual reception and interaction. An ecocritical approach to the images and descriptions of the natural environment in literary works such as medieval romances and hagiographic texts also seeks to acknowledge the setting or landscape in terms of its geological, geographical, and tangible floral characteristics. The purpose of cognitive literary theory and ecocriticism is not 'dismissing symbolic or allegorical readings for the natural world in medieval texts, Rudd exhorts us to read beyond the figurative meanings and see the actual [physical] elements that are "over-written by the allegory"' (Scarborough 2013: 1). The combination of a symbolic and literal reading of the texts and landscapes associated with pilgrimage is necessary to establish the ritual as a creative act of performance art not defined by a strict contrast of spaces such as employed by static notions of the sacred and profane.

Another key to cognitive literary theory that makes it useful in questioning the divide between cognition and emotion apparent in aesthetics and ritual theory is that the literary theory attempts to discard the dichotomy of reception through its cognitive approach. This theory

acknowledges that thought and the reception of art objects are inextricably linked to the human body as well as its external culture. Thought is embodied and cannot be separated from the sensory centers of the body. Essentially thought is dependent on kinesthetic and spatial experiences of the perceptive body (Crane 2015).[2]

Performance theory evolved from cognitive literary theory's approach that focuses on the body's role in spatial experience. Both theories address and advance beyond the consideration of thought as a separate entity from the sensory body. However, performance theory is a more pertinent methodology to the actions involved in pilgrimage research because it highlights the activities and movements of the entire staged production, rather than solely involving the written side of the literary artwork which is the purview of cognitive literary theory. Due to the nature of a staged enactment, performance theory places further importance on grounding the mind through perception and interaction in the body via the actor's and observer's connection to the space of the performance (McConachie 2008). Cognitive literary theory begins to create the space to acknowledge and attempt to understand the questions of cognition and reception of the ordinary mind within aesthetic and art-related studies in literature. Performance theory adds to this acknowledgement that physical spaces are key components of interacting with art in order to advance the understanding of artworks beyond static objects or texts. This theory acknowledges memories of the past and provides a practical and cognitive framework for performance and reception in the present (McConachie 2008).

[2] The kinesthetic experience relates to the individual's awareness of the placement and movements of the body parts through the sensory organs (Oxford Dictionaries 2018).

In general, the positive attributes of the performance theory methodology tend to outweigh the problems facing the discipline. However, it is worth noting that performance theory, as is the case with aesthetics and Bell's (2009) idea of ritual theory, shares the dilemma of searching to discover a unified and adequate vocabulary to discuss the combination of the body and mind that the performative aspect of the theory mandates. This theory also tends to repeat the shortcomings of its predecessors. It does not expand the idea of performance or art beyond the more staged aspects of performance, which in turn limits how the theory has been applied, until now. Performance theory along with the other theories previously listed each have certain methodological shortcomings when taken on their own to analyze a work of art, performance, or aesthetic object. However, together with the pros and cons of each firmly in mind, this thesis initiates a multivalent approach to pilgrimage that will help address and promote a new way of attacking the thought and action divide, as well as dispel the concept of sacred versus profane spaces that plague each of these theories individually.

The Sources of Montserrat

The mountain, church, shrine, and associated architectural structures (cenobitic and eremitic), as well as the natural landscape and routes through the environment are all integral to the construction of pilgrimage at Montserrat in Catalonia, Spain that serves as the case study for this thesis. Montserrat is an ideal candidate for such a study regarding the nature of pilgrimage since it is a pilgrimage site in its own right for those who wish to visit the statue of Nuestra Señora de Montserrat (Our Lady/ The Virgin of Montserrat) and a stop on the pilgrimage route to Santiago de Compostela. As a result of its renown as a pilgrimage site, Montserrat attracted local pilgrims as well as international visitors.

The site's history of ritual procession and activity was first documented around the mid-twelfth century and continues to the present day with just a brief lapse in activity as a result of the destruction caused by the Napoleonic Wars in the early nineteenth century (Larsa Montserrat 2017). As a location of pilgrimage with such continual use, Montserrat has a rich medieval and contemporary history similar to Santiago de Compostela. However, the smaller scale of Montserrat is a more manageable size for the course of this research. Montserrat is still an active site of pilgrimage. In fact, it is the second most popular pilgrimage location in Spain with over two million visitors each year. Despite its ongoing popularity, this thesis will focus on Montserrat's pilgrimage activities from the foundation of the first shrine to the Virgin of Montserrat to the height of pilgrim visitations in the Middle Ages (Montserrat Tourist Guide 2016) and not the current activities at the site. This time period will roughly encapsulate 888 to the mid-fourteenth century. This thesis will use contemporary geographic references and comparisons of Montserrat when necessary or appropriate to contextualize the movement and activities of the lay pilgrims described in the medieval sources used including the *Cantigas de Santa Maria* and the *Llibre Vermell De Montserrat*. The reliance on contemporary sources and pilgrimage activity will only pertain to the physical landscape of the pilgrimage routes to establish the space and environment of the setting. This thesis will not depend on the contemporary literary or visual evolution and traditions associated with Montserrat to analyze its medieval practices of pilgrimage.

The strictly medieval texts that survive with references to pilgrimage practices and miracles of Montserrat are contained in the *Cantigas de Santa Maria* written by Alfonso X King of Castile in Aragon around 1257 to 1275 and the songs 'O Virgo Splendens' and 'Stella Splendens' located in the *Llibre Vermell* from the fourteenth century. Both texts are referenced

in this thesis to formulate and identify the spaces and activities involved in pilgrimage to Montserrat. Other later sources exist such as the Còdex 41 from the Arxiu Capitular of Barcelona written in the fifteenth century which contains a collection of miracles mainly attributed to the Virgin Mary. However, these sources do not contain specific references to the Virgin of Montserrat and for its lack of specificity Còdex 41 will not be used as a source since this thesis is concerned with the history of construction and foundation of pilgrimage specific to Montserrat and not other sites dedicated to the Virgin Mary. The creation of pilgrimage and the identity of each participant is unique to each specific site. It is the position of this thesis that the landscape, activities, and textual history of one site and the impetus of its foundation cannot be blindly applied to any site dedicated to the Virgin.

Due to the paucity of medieval texts related to Montserrat and their limited contents relating six miracles of the Virgin of Montserrat and two songs written to direct pilgrims in their activities (the contents of the *Cantigas* and the *Llibre Vermell* respectively), the seventeenth- and eighteenth-century compilations of the history of Montserrat as well as a sixteenth-century collection of miracles of the Virgin of Montserrat are consulted in addition to the medieval texts. The texts used from the eighteenth century are the *Epitome historico del portentoso Santuario y real Monasterio de Nuestra Señora de Montserrate, ilustrado con los sucesos historicos más memorables de los Principes sus devotos y bienhechores* from 1747 and the *Historia verdadera de la aparición de Nuestra Señora de Monserrate y los Condes de Barcelona, con los sucesos estraños y maravillosos de la Infanta Doña Riquilda y el Ermitaño Fray Juan Garín* from 1745 both written by Pedro Serra y Postius and the *Abrégé d l'histoire Notre-dame du Montserrat* from 1723. These sources are used for their related histories of Montserrat and general descriptions of the natural and architectural landscape of the mountain. Of prime importance are

the accounts of the foundation legends which are also considered the first miracles of Montserrat. These foundation myths pertain to the apparition or rediscovery of the Virgin statue and the sins and penance of Montserrat's first hermit, Fray Juan Garín. The seventeenth-century source consulted as a further confirmation and comparison of the legends recounted by the eighteenth-century texts is the *Histoire de l'abbaye et des miracles de nostre Dame de Montserrat* from 1617 written by Mathieu Olivier. As is the case with Serra y Postius' history, Olivier details and describes the landscape of the mountain, recounts the two foundation myths, and lists the miracles of Montserrat. There are further histories such as *L'Histoire de Notre Dame de Montserrat* by Prestre J. Gaultier (1619). However, these further texts recapitulate the same basic historical and descriptive information as the sources already listed in this thesis and do not vary markedly or offer information unique to the main texts of focus. The final source consulted for its detailed descriptions of the miracles of Montserrat listed in the works of Serra y Postius (1747), the *Abrégé* (1723), and Olivier (1617) is the 1594 text written by Pedro Alfonso de Burgos, the *Libro de la historia y milagros, hechos a invocación de Nuestra Señora de Montserrate*. Burgos' text provides a brief description of the history and landscape of Montserrat to favor an exhaustive account of the site's miracles from 888 to 1496. The Burgos text is used in this thesis as the main reference of Montserrat miracles other than the two foundation myths of the statue apparition and the penance of Juan Garín. While Burgos does describe these two legends, the details do not differ significantly from the accounts of Serra y Postius and the *Abrégé*. The sixteenth-century compilation serves as the source of the miracles analyzed in this thesis while the seventeenth- and eighteenth-century texts provide the data and narratives of Montserrat's historical, geographic, and architectural components in addition to the extant versions of the medieval foundation myths.

The aim of a thorough analysis of the extant medieval texts referencing Montserrat, the later sixteenth-, seventeenth-, and eighteenth-century histories and miracle compilations, and the natural, geographic, and architectural landscape of Montserrat is to conceptualize the activity and space of pilgrimage to exemplify its engaging and individual nature that serves as a constructive work of performance art for the individual. To achieve this goal the discussion of pilgrimage must expand beyond a concentration on the space of the shrine or sacred location of the object of veneration. Neither will this study give prominence to the pilgrim's journey at the expense of the shrine precinct and its influencing role in the process. Limiting the discussion of pilgrimage and pilgrimage routes to the interior and demarcated spaces within a cathedral or shrine structure leads to the arbitrary separation of religious acts and spaces from the larger secular society. This spatial distinction caused by analyzing the interior versus the exterior space of the church or other locations, in which ritual acts such as pilgrimage occur, leads to the perpetuation of the *communitas* paradigm that idealizes those involved in religious activities into communities separated from a perceived other. Designating the landscape and activities and ritual of pilgrimage through the process of denoting those involved with a specific role only practiced within a demarcated setting of a religious or sacred nature forces the researcher to aim for universals when looking at ritual activities and the landscape of their enactment rather than discussing each situation as presented.

The terminology or dichotomy associated with this universal approach to the space and activities of pilgrimage are perpetuated by the continued use of the distinctions between the sacred and profane in the discussion of medieval rituals. For the purpose of this thesis the terms *sacred* and *profane* will be used in the analysis of the space and activities of pilgrimage not to reinforce these distinctions, but to reveal that no one space labeled as sacred or profane is

completely defined by that denomination. The creation of the activities and spaces of pilgrimage is a process of hybridization 'a mingling of different registers and genres [that] seems to have been both a verbal and visual fashion for elite audiences' (Camille 1992: 13). No one space or action is without its sacred and profane connotations.

The conceptualization of the sacred and profane as they are used in this thesis are taken in part from the manifesting nature of the sacred from Mircea Eliade's (1959) *The Sacred and the Profane: The Nature of Religion* and the ambiguous nature of the profane discussed by William Robins and Robert Epstein (2010) in their introduction to *Sacred and Profane in Chaucer and Late Medieval Literature*. Although Eliade proposed to illustrate and define the sacred and profane through their opposition, a theme of the potential of the manifestation of the sacred from the natural or profane world persists throughout the author's argument, 'by manifesting the sacred, any object becomes *something else*, yet it continues to remain *itself*, for it continues to participate in its surrounding cosmic milieu. [...] for those who have a religious experience all nature is capable of revealing itself as cosmic sacrality' (1959: 12). The author equates the sacred manifestation with a religious experience that creates a space of structure and a point of defined consistency within the 'chaos of homogeneity' which constitutes the natural or profane world (1959: 23). The sacred becomes a break in the profane space that creates a center in which communications between the 'religious man' and Heaven or another cosmic axis are established (Eliade 1959: 20). However, the author's desire to definitively contrast the sacred and profane cannot remain intact in a post-Turner research environment. The sacred within the concept of a liminal *communitas* and the decisive identities of the sacred and profane limits the participants and spaces that can directly interact with a religious activity. Those capable of having such religious experiences are the clergy and other religious men and women. The idea of the sacred

being attached to religious spaces or the ecclesiastical sphere minimizes the actions and participants of the lay population living in the profane sphere. The emphasis on Eliade's work should not be the distinction he places on the sacred and profane, but the capacity of any object to become something other than its defining natural properties. The potential for an object to become sacred given the correct set of circumstances and mindset implies that any experience of the natural (profane) world also has the capacity to become a sacred religious experience.

The use of the concept of the sacred in this thesis denotes the construction of a specific experience of space and activities that is connected with a religious activity or ritual such as pilgrimage, but not exclusively defined by the religious. The use of the idea of profane within this thesis is not merely in contrast or opposition to the sacred. It conveys a sense of ambiguity that comes from the root of the word in which the preposition pro- of profanus can imply a physical sense of place of the profane being in front of or adjoined to a sanctuary or denote a more intangible concept of a realm of the profane which comes before entrance or elevation to the sacred (Robins and Epstein 2010). The alternate later medieval definition of profane was also used to mean irreligious, desecrating, heretical, evil, or someone actively working against the religious word of God. The uncertain sense of space, physical and of the more ideological connotation, that interacts with and is the landscape from which activities and objects of the sacred arise constitutes the definition of the profane within this study. The emphasis of the nature of adaptability, fluidity, and co-dependence of the sacred and profane is one manner in which this thesis addresses how the space, movements, and activities of those involved in pilgrimage defy the consideration of a ritual activity inhabiting only one sacred domain.

Instead of continuing to promote the separation of places involved in pilgrimage by strictly contrasting ideas of space and activities such as the sacred versus the profane or the

communitas versus the other (or the integrated member of society) and treating each as their own uncompromising entities, the aim of this thesis is the reevaluation of the creation, utilization, and interactions of spaces during the journey and performance of pilgrimage. To begin this discussion, the first step is to construct a working definition of how pilgrimage will be contextualized in this thesis. Once a definition of pilgrimage is established, the literary history and sources of Montserrat will be analyzed to examine the process of pilgrimage and how the activities and spaces are referenced within the miracle and hagiographic texts. The pilgrimage accounts of the protagonists in the foundation myths of Montserrat (the apparition of the Virgin statue of Montserrat and the penance of Juan Garín) and the site's other collected miracles will address the question of why the intent and experience motivating the participation in a ritual act such as pilgrimage are necessary components to creating a mutable and adaptable landscape and ritual.

Understanding pilgrimage as a constructive and interactive process of art production will move the discourse of pilgrimage and its landscape away from the limiting dichotomies of sacred and profane designations. In order to begin the discussion of Montserrat, it is necessary to establish a working definition of what sort of art objects or landscapes exist within this area of Catalonian pilgrimage. Montserrat, the location, literary history, and art of pilgrimage are discussed in conjunction with spatial awareness of the mountain landscape in order to make obsolete the current dichotomous theories of pilgrimage which severely limit the discipline's potential for growth. During the discussion of the literary history and other textual sources of Montserrat, excepts from the source materials will remain true to the original spelling, yet punctuation and accents marks have been standardized to aid the modern reader in an easier reading of the texts. The following chapter begins to identify the pertinence of art in pilgrimage

by introducing how art in the form of active participation, engagement with the landscape, and performance was enacted during medieval pilgrimage to Montserrat.

Chapter One

Pilgrimage as Art

An Introduction to Montserrat

The original Monastery and Church structure of Montserrat housing the shrine of the Virgin's statue consisted of a small number of buildings. A few centuries after the foundation, with the help of Abbot Oliba of Ripoll (1025), Montserrat began to develop into a pilgrimage location capable of receiving a greater number of visitors each year. Although the first Church was constructed in the thirteenth century to house the image of the Virgin and the structure expanded from donations and royal patronage, the mountain's isolated location continued to cause difficulties in the shape of appropriate temporary accommodations for the visitors. The Monastery only had the capacity to house nobles and clergymen (Gómez Muntané 1990). Thus, Montserrat did not have the facilities to tend to the multitude of lay pilgrims visiting the shrine during the site's inception and growth (Gómez Muntané 1990). Not only was space at a premium on the mountain, but in the thirteenth century so many pilgrims were coming to Montserrat that James I King of Aragon (1208-76) had to mandate that visitors supplied their own food to feed themselves in an effort to not place undue strain on the Monastery's resources (Ansón 2007). As a result of the lack of adequate shelter, the pilgrims tended to stay awake through the day and night within the vicinity of the shrine. By the time the *Llibre Vermell de Montserrat* was written in the fourteenth century, Montserrat had become a 'lloc gairebé obligat' to visit for those pilgrims going to Compostela coming from Italy, the French roads from Languedoc, and the Mediterranean through the port at Barcelona (Altés i Aguiló 1989: 9). The increase in international pilgrims led to a period of expansion and architectural activity at the sanctuary of Montserrat. From 1327 to 1373 the original church of Montserrat was amplified to include the

enlargement of the Galilee porch of the church (begun in the thirteenth century), the addition of the bell tower (1327), and the consecrations of the new High Altar (1341) and the Chapel of the Eleven-Thousand Virgins (1360-70). The songs of the *Llibre Vermell* dedicated to the Virgin Mary served multiple purposes at the sanctuary, church, and mountain of Montserrat. Songs such as the more structured format of 'O Virgo Splendens' with its use of antiphony reflecting a Roman-style song acted as 'instruccion[es] religiosa[s] de los peregrinos que acudían al Santuario' (Gómez Muntané 1990: 19). While the verses and their accompanying music could act as guidelines and instructions of pilgrim actions, the entire collection of the *Llibre Vermell* 'se trata, sin embargo, de una colección única, sobre todo por su propósito: entretener a los peregrinos que acudían a adorar a la Virgen de Montserrat' (Gómez Muntané 1990: 9). The songs not only acted as instructive tools for the pilgrims' actions, but also as a means to keep them entertained during their time on the mountain and 'transformar esa manifestación en otra de carácter piadoso' (Gómez Muntané 1990: 20). The instructions for the clergy to utilize, written in the introduction to 'Stella Splendens', while interacting with the visiting pilgrims of Montserrat reveal an acute awareness of space, intent, and performance with regard to the activity of pilgrimage:

> Quia interdum peregrine quando vigilant in ecclesia Beate Marie de Monte Serrato, volunt cantare et trepudiare, et etiam in platea de die, et ibi non debeant nisi honestas ac devotas catilenas cantare. Et de hoc uti debent honeste et parce, ne perturbent perseverantes in orationibus et devotis contemplationibus. (*Llibre Vermell* 1989: fol. 22^{r})[1]

[1] 'Because sometimes the pilgrims taking vigil in the church of the Blessed Mary of Montserrat, wish to sing and dance about, and even in the square during the day, and since they should not

The above passage comes from fol. 22^{r} in the facsimile of the *Llibre Vermell de Montserrat*. The original *Llibre Vermell* is dated between 1396 and 1399. The volume's one hundred and thirty-seven folios contain songs, poems, and dances dedicated almost exclusively to the Virgin Mary. Within this compilation, two songs are specific to the Virgin of Montserrat: 'O Virgo Splendens' and 'Stella Splendens'. The passage quoted above is a rubricated set of instructions that precedes the lyrics and sheet music to 'Stella Splendens'. The lyrics to both 'Stella Splendens' and 'O Virgo Splendens' are in Latin. However, it becomes apparent from the set of rubricated instructions preceding each song and especially the popular form of the virelai composition of 'Stella Splendens,' almost exclusively employed by Alfonso X's (1221-84) *Cantigas de Santa Maria* (Goméz Muntané 1990), that they were destined to be taught to and sung by the lay pilgrims visiting the sanctuary of Montserrat.

The acknowledgment of the mountain space of Montserrat is also present in the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*. The *Cantigas*, most likely written and compiled between 1257 and 1279, contain four hundred and twenty-seven songs that recount most of the common miracle narratives associated with the Virgin Mary throughout thirteenth-century Europe (Scarborough 2009: 20-5). Three hundred and six of the *Cantigas* were written in the popular musical form of the *virelai*. 'Stella Splendens' is also in the form of a virelai for two voices written in the *Ars nova* style of notation. The *virelai* is 'uno de los tipos de canción que, junto con la balada y el rondo, dominaron la música vocal francesa en los siglos XIV y XV' (Goméz Muntané 1990:

---

sing anything other than respectful and devout songs. And they [the songs] should be used respectfully and sparingly so as not to disturb those [pilgrims] steadfast in prayer and devout contemplation.'

127). The *Ars nova* denotes '[un] estilo de composición musical propio del siglo XIV. Se caracteriza por el ejemplo de valores inferiores a la semibreve y por el uso indistinto, por vez primera en la Historia de la Música Occidental, del tiempo perfecto y del imperfecto' (Goméz Muntané 1990: 123). The author notes that the *Cantigas* written by Alfonso X are also almost exclusively structured as virelai. Whether the virelai was more of a local Hispanic form or an imitation of French repertoire of the popular *Ars nova* is uncertain (Goméz Muntané 1990). However, what can be said about the virelai and its popular and active utilization in the format of 'Stella Splendens', as opposed to the more liturgical character of 'O Virgo Splendens', is that it promoted vitality of worship and ritual dance in the round 'sequitur alia cantilena, omnia dulcedine plena eiusdem domine nostre, ad trepudium rotundum' (*Llibre Vermell* 1989: fol 22[r]) and in structure emulated the popular *Cantigas*.[2]

The relationship between the music and the texts of the *Cantigas* indicates that they were meant to be sung (Scarborough 2009: 25-26). As is the case with the songs in the *Llibre Vermell*, the *Cantigas* were most likely performed in churches dedicated to the Virgin, but also in Alfonso X's royal chapel, at court, and possibly in public places during Marian festivals (Keller & Cash 1998: 9). The *Cantigas* were written in a simple narrative style and in a galician-portuguese dialect indicating that they were meant for all classes of society, even the poor. Of the over four hundred miracle songs and narratives contained within the *Cantigas*, six are dedicated specifically to the Virgin of Montserrat, making Montserrat the only Catalan sanctuary recorded in the compilation (Baraut i Obols 1949). As is the case with the generic and non-specific

[2] '[this song] follows the other song, all of the community full of sweetness for our Lord, for a dance in the round.'

descriptions of the Virgin in 'O Virgo Splendens' and 'Stella Splendens' which only indicate the universal nature of the Virgin seated on the mountain of Montserrat, the *Cantigas*, regarding Montserrat, are also vague, general, and in a format easily memorized for oral transmission (Baraut i Obols 1049):[3]

> Esta é como Santa Maria tolleu a agua da fonte ao cavaleiro, en cuja erdade estava, e a deu aos frades de Monssarrad a que a el queria vender [...] E daquest' un gran miragre fez pouc' á en Catalonna a Virgen Santa Maria [...] Monssarraz éste chamado o logar u é a fonte sabrosa, grand' e crara, que naç' encima dun monte que era dun cavaleiro; e d'outra parte de fronte avia un mõesteyro de monges religiosos. (Alfonso X 1981: lines 1-14*)*

While the miracle related in *Cantiga* 48 and the five others are straightforward in style and language, the text of Alfonso's songs and those of the *Llibre Vermell* use the iconography of the mountain of Montserrat to relate a more specific topographical situation of the monastery and its pilgrims (Baraut i Obols 1949).

At first glance, the instructions of the *Llibre Vermell* and the natural aspects of the *Cantigas* may seem restrictive since they outline how the pilgrims should act, as well as indicate the mindset they should be in while singing and dancing and provide a limited glimpse into the topography of the mountain landscape. Rather than dictating exactly how a pilgrim should

[3] Examples of the invocation and descriptions of the Virgin of Montserrat from the *Llibre Vermell.* 'O Virgo splendens hic in monte celso miraculous serrato' (O Virgin shining brightly on this high serrated mountain) *(Llibre Vermell* 1989: fol 21^{v}). 'Stella splendens in monte ut solis radium, miraculis serrato exaudi populum' (Splendid star on the serrated mountain, with miracles shining like a beam of light, hear the people) (*Llibre Vermell* 1989: fol 22^{r}).

approach and interact with the shrine and space of Montserrat, these restrictions and the descriptions of the mountain in the songs begin to address the diversity of movement involved in pilgrimage, extend the pilgrimage activities to locations beyond the immediate precinct of the Virgin's Church, and exemplify the importance of a dynamic and interactive setting to the creation of miracles and pilgrimage at Montserrat.

One of the main, if not the primary objects of veneration at Montserrat, is the statue of the Virgin of Montserrat enthroned with the Christ child.

Figure 1. The Virgin of Montserrat and Christ Child. It is a Romanesque sculpture of painted wood thought to be dated to the twelfth century.

Since the eleventh-century's expansion of Montserrat from a collection of hermitages to a functioning monastery capable of attracting large numbers of pilgrims, the Virgin's statue has been housed in the main active site of worship, the capilla or chapel dedicated to the Virgin and later the Old and New Churches of Montserrat. Before the construction of the New Church and

subsequent translation of the statue to the new structure in 1560, the Virgin's image was located behind the High Altar of the Old Church (Serra y Postius 1747). If this investigation were to adhere to the tone of previous studies on pilgrimages where the shrine and its housing structure were viewed as the focus and end goal of the ritual procession, then a detailed architectural analysis of the Old Church and the flow of pilgrim movements within it would follow. However, as indicated by the *Llibre Vermell* and the *Cantigas*, pilgrimage activities of devotion did not begin or end at the cathedral doors, but spilled into the surrounding open space of the Church courtyard and further abroad into the natural and constructed environment surrounding the pilgrims:

> Vença, mon cher amy, vois-tu ceste montagne, qui surgissant du plain d'une basse campagne [...] c'est Mont-Serrat [...] Monte iusqu' à l'Eglise, & tu verras l'Image de la Mere du Dieu [...] Puis sortant du convent tu pourras visiter Les Hermites: va donc, & commence à monter, et traveser ce roc: et tu verras des hommes devots plus sainctement [...] Puis (si tu veux) tu peux à la grotte descender, là où, l'Image sainct fut suavé de l'esclandre des Mores impiteux: sans ouvlier le lieu, où Frere Iean Guerin s'unissoit tout à Dieu. (Olivier 1617: 13)[4]

[4] Come, my dear friend, see this mountain, that rises from the plain of a low country [...] this is Montserrat [...] Climb up to the Church and you will see the Image of the Mother of God [...] Then upon leaving the sanctuary/convent you can visit the Hermits: so then, go, and begin to climb, and traverse that rock: and you will see the holiest devout men [...] Then (if you wish) you can descend to the cave, that which, the saintly Image was saved from the scandal of the impious Moors: [also] don't forget the place, where Fray Juan Garín united fully with God.

This excerpt from Mathieu Olivier's seventeenth-century history of Montserrat and its miracles is part of a section of notice or advice to the pilgrims journeying to the mountain which comes before the main body of the text. The address provides a summary of key locations for the pilgrim to visit on the mountain outside of the immediate vicinity of the church space housing the Virgin statue. The hermitages located all over the mountain and the caves where the Virgin statue was rediscovered and Juan Garín returned to his pious life are all integral components to the pilgrimage experience and are all unequivocally dependent on the natural environment provided by the mountain's geological formation. Space or place within the medieval performance of pilgrimage and devotion has a more fluid and integral identity than promoted by previously conceived research approaches into pilgrim activities which emphasize a designation of space determined by the concepts of sacred and profane areas. This expansion of the utilization and acknowledgement of space to include natural and architectural components as well as the profane contributions necessitates reinterpreting pilgrimage as an activity that has scope and influence far beyond the familiar processional routes circumambulating the choir, aisles, and shrines of the static church location.

In addition to expressing a more comprehensive understanding of the space involved in ritual that is more interactive and complicated than simply a definition of sacred space, the songs of the *Llibre Vermell* and the *Cantigas* also indicate an audience of all classes of Catalonian and international society and their active involvement in the singing and dancing of the virelai in praise of the Virgin of Montserrat. 'Stella Splendens' begins with a general invocation of the Virgin's (the Stella Splendens) attention and proceeds to list all of the members of society involved in the Virgin's praise through its seven verses:

> Concurrunt universi gaudentes populi divites et egeni grandes et parvuli ipsum ingrediuntur ut cernunt occuli. Et inde revertuntur graciis replete […]. Principes et magnates extirpe regia, saeculi potestates […] proclamant tudentes pectora […]. Prelati et barones, comites incliti, religiosi omnes, atque presbiteri, milites, mercatores, cives, marinari, burgenses, piscatores praemiantur ibi […]. Rustici aratores, nec non notarii advocate scultores, cuncti ligni fabri, sartores et sutores, nec non lanifici, artifices et omnes gratulantur ibi […]. Reginae comitissae, illustres dominae, potentes et ancillae, iuvenes parvulae, virgines et antiquae, pariter viduae, conscendunt et hunc montem et religiosae […]. Coetus hii aggregantur, hic ut exhibeant, vota regratiantur […]. Cuncti ergo precantes sexus utriusque mentes nostras mudantes, oremus devote, virginem gloriosam matrem clementiae, in coelis gratiosam sentiamus vere. (*Llibre Vermell* 1989: fol. 22^{v}–fol. 23^{r})[5]

[5] 'Rejoicing, the people assemble all together, the rich and the needy, the old and the young, they flock here and witness, and returning from there full of grace […]. Rulers and magnates of royal lineage, the mighty of the generation […] they cry out beating their chests […]. Prelates and barons, illustrious counts, all types of monks and priests, soldiers, merchants, citizens, sailors, burgers, and fishermen are recompensed there […]. Peasants, ploughmen, and scribes, advocates, sculptors, and all the carpenters, tailors and shoemakers, and also the weavers, and all types of craftsmen are made to rejoice there […]. Queens, countesses, illustrious ladies, powerful and servile, youths and young girls, virgins and old women and widows alike, as well as nuns climb this mountain […]. They all assemble together in this place where they gratefully present their

The sick, poor, weak, wealthy, the rulers of society, the lay, and ecclesiastical are all engaged in processing as pilgrims to Montserrat to praise the Virgin through song, dance, and offerings. The protagonists of the *Cantigas* including the Benedictine community of Montserrat, noble and common pilgrims, and thieves emphasize the wide reach of the cult of the Virgin of Montserrat which encompasses each sector of society in the various activities of pilgrimage.

The language of the instructions, as well as the texts of 'O Virgo Splendens' and 'Stella Splendens' expand pilgrimage activity beyond an immediate and solemn reverence directly in front of the shrine, which is why the songs are preceded by an introduction of the appropriate manner in which to perform the songs and dances. Respect and focus are highlighted in the rubricated directions as two key aspects that the clergy should try to instill in the pilgrims as they engage in the performance of their activities. The respect should be enacted in a twofold manner during the pilgrims' devotions. On the one hand, the pilgrim actors should observe a reverential and appreciative attitude towards the materials they are singing. In addition, the devout should retain a respect for those engaged in other activities of pilgrimage such as prayer and quiet contemplation. Without the appropriate respect and focus of intention, the already lively atmosphere at the Monastery was liable to deviate into chaos:

> Es cosa (dize) de mucha maravilla ver aquí tantas diversidades de gentes, de todas las Provincias, cada día del Mundo llegan aquí tantos, y de tan diversas generaciones, y lenguages, que ni ellos unos con otros se entienden, ni los que tienen cargo de darles recado los puede entender. (Serra y Postius 1747: 98)

---

vows/offerings […]. Therefore, everyone of both sexes beseeching and altering our minds, let us devoutly pray that we see the, glorious virgin, mother of clemency, gracious in heaven.'

The clergy members who wrote the instructions for the *Llibre Vermell* were well aware of the necessity and usefulness of channeling the focus of the pilgrims through the performance of song and dance. Given the multitude of people arriving at the shrines and the possible problems of language and class diversity, a method of diffusing a potentially volatile situation through a song and dance of praise written in the popular virelai form was constructed through the songs learned at the shrine and the corresponding activities that accompanied the lyrics. To keep the constant crowds of pilgrims devout and respectful during their time on the mountain 'idcirco superas et inferius aliaquae sunt scriptae' (*Llibre Vermell* fol. 22^{r})[6], both 'O Virgo Splendens' and 'Stella Splendens' were offered as methods to direct pilgrim intent and deter deviant behavior and entertain. Although not as explicit as the songs in the *Llibre Vermell*, Alfonso X's *Cantigas* also allude to the proper manner in which to seek the Virgin's help in the related miracles. Alfonso established prerequisites for the Marian plots of his *Cantigas*. In order to receive the Virgin's intervention, the recipient must have strong faith in the Virgin, he or she must demonstrate confidence in the Virgin's abilities of intercession, and finally, the protagonist must give thanks for the miracle (Scarborough 2009: 35-40). Without these attributes meant to channel respect for the Virgin and her abilities and focus the need and attention of the pilgrims or those participating in the miracles, activities on the mountain could become detrimental and potentially dangerous. For example, *Cantiga* 302 pertains to a thief who joins a group of pilgrims journeying to Montserrat for the wrong reasons and without proper respect for the Virgin and the process of pilgrimage. While at the shrine the thief steals from his fellow pilgrims as they sleep. When he awakens the next day, and hears the Mass, the thief is unable to leave the sanctuary until he confesses his sin. The thief's lack of respect and focus on the correct process of pilgrimage

[6] 'above and below [the songs] some [directions] have been written.'

prevents him from accomplishing his goal of leaving the mountain until he redeems himself through confession.

The excerpts from the *Llibre Vermell de Montserrat* and the *Cantigas de Santa Maria* list the diverse groups of people interacting in creative and vocal ways during their pilgrimages to the Virgin's shrine, indicate a variability and natural component to the landscape of ritual, and promote a specified and focused mindset when engaging in pilgrimage. Through the related miracles and initiatives of song and dance three determining components for a correct performance of the pilgrimage arise from the activities of devotion at Montserrat. The constitutive parts of performance encompass the space (landscape), intent (respect and focus), and the enactment (ritual activities, interactions, and movment) of the devout. The concept of a correct performance does not mean that there is a definite set of rules and regulations that outline every act of the pilgrim's movements. The correct performance or enactment of the pilgrim activities is a term coined by David Davies in his work *Art as Performance* (2004). While this thesis will utilize the corresponding constitutive elements of performance theory as set out by Davies, throughout its course the term *completed* will be used in order to designate a fully realized creation of performance rather than the term *correct* concerning artwork. Art, artwork, and performance art are synonymous in Davies' and this thesis' consideration of pilgrimage. A performance art, and subsequetially pilgrimage, is an active creative process resulting in a specific outcome. The upcoming section enumerates Davies ontology or methodology for understanding art as performance rather than proscribing a finite definition of the concept. Once performance theory is explained, the components of the methodology of identifying a performance art is applied to medieval pilgrimage at Montserrat.

Performance Theory

A completed performance does not have one set guiding structure applicable to all creative enactments that can be considered art. Rather than defining art using abstract theories of aesthetics which focus on the beauty, style, and form of the object, the performance of Davies' theory delineates a focus of appreciation dependent on the artist or performer not the critical reception of a piece. This focus is determined through an acknowledgement by the artist of the cultural and interpretive norms of the intended audience or community of receivers (Davies 2004). The ontological approach when dealing with works of art allows each individual instant of a performance complete with an artist and audience to be unique to the specific culture of creation. There is no space in performance theory for the consideration of art outside its creative process. The activity of art production will always be informed by those involved in its creation: the artist and the audience. As in the case with Davies (2004), Bruce McConachie (2008) claims that the narrative structure of a performance must work within the larger model of the spectators' culturally conventional practices in order for the audience to become willing participants. A completed performance such as pilgrimage to Montserrat is one that is situated within and acknowledges the receptive norms of its culture of context through the artist or performer's focus of appreciation. For example, pilgrims to Montserrat would be familiar with the miracles popularly disseminated through public performances of Alfonso X's *Cantigas*. In order to reach as wide an audience as possible, Alfonso, the creator (artist) of the *Cantigas*, wrote them in the vernacular with the purpose 'de reconstruir así el habla del pueblo, buscando la expresión apropriada en cada ciencia o para la versión de los grandes modelos' (Filgueira Valverde 1985: xxiii). Alfonso used the vernacular as the normative cultural aspect that would tie the audience together and best identify with the culture of audience reception of his work. However,

knowledge of the traditions and culture of pilgrimage at Saint Cuthbert's shrine in Durham, England would not be pertinent to Montserrat. Cuthbert's shrine is distanced from the Virgin of Montserrat by location and the immediate audience's language and culture. What may be a completed performance at Montserrat will not automatically translate to a culturally relevant set of actions with religious and historical significance at Cuthbert's shrine. Each performance is unique, embedded within and created by its culture of context. The performance of devotion cannot be unilaterally applied to every instance of pilgrimage in medieval Christendom.

Performance theory expands the interpretation of what is considered art to include the creative process behind activities such as the drafting of play manuscripts and musical scores, as well as the physical process of sculpting or modeling tactile materials. However, this theory when adapted to more traditional examples of performance pieces such as plays and other scripted works tends to set a distinction between the roles and interactions of the artist and spectator. The limitations of the standard relationship between artist and spectator in the performance of a play have yet to be reevaluated in the consideration of how such relationships are created and enacted in individual instances of pilgrimage. In order to describe pilgrimage as a performance, it is first necessary to identify who the artist and audience are in the current incarnation of the artistic process of performance and the roles of each before the creative roles are applied to pilgrimage.

Advocates of performance theory such as Davies (2004), McConachie (2008), and Erika Fisher-Lichte (2013), acknowledge that the creation of art and performance is a process. Davies (2004) begins by explaining how the creation of a work of art, which can include but is not limited to a painting, sculpture, or pieces of literature, is a performance unique to the exact time and place in which the artist manipulates the medium of work. This manipulation of the medium

or the construction process is what Davies identifies as performance. In the creation of a piece such as a sculpture when the process ends with the artist's final mallet strike it is easier to identify or delineate the specific time frame of the creation and performance. However, in the construction of a work such as a play where each performance is a new, live interaction with different artists, audiences, and circumstances, understanding the creation process becomes more complex.

The first step in conceptualizing art as performance is through a knowledge of the cultural contexts present during the artist's creation of a piece and the relationship the cultural surroundings initiate between artist and audience. Davies (2004) proposes that a performance or work of art can only occur in conjunction with the artist's understanding, however vague, of the interpretive norms of the audience's reception within their culture of reference. According to this interpretation of the theory, the artist or actor's role in the performance takes center stage over the input of the audience because the use of culturally relevant components is dependent on the creator's manipulation of the medium of work. Fischer-Litche's work on the performance of ancient Greek plays supports performance theory's active, process-like creation of art. However, as is the case with Davies, she separates and distinguishes the roles of actor and audience into two interactive yet autonomous entities: 'Every performance requires two groups of people, the "doers" and the "onlookers", who have to assemble at a certain time and place in order to share this situation' (2013: 29). Mary Carruthers' (2013) work on the experience of art and beauty in the Middle Ages further distances the object or creation of art from the spectator giving the artwork a distinct agency that leads the audience on a journey to understand the specific work.

Although each of the above authors states that in the creation, performance, and reception of art culture, the creation of the work is determined by the audience constantly interacting with

the artist and artwork, their approaches each contain a similar, central limitation. These theories separate the artist or actor's performance from the audience. As a result of this separation, the current incarnation of performance theory prevents identifying the artist/actor and the audience/spectator as the same person. The application of performance theory, within this thesis, to the creative process and unique experience of pilgrimage as performance, including its physical and mental aspects, offers an alternative consideration to the role or roles of those involved in a performance. Whereas a traditionally conceptualized play has the actors performing for a group of people or public audience, however small, pilgrimage is a more personal and individually tailored experience that does not need a gathering of external audience members to be considered a performance. This thesis proposes that pilgrimage can break down performance theory's dichotomous concept of distinct and separate artist and audience identities to embody both within the actions and performance of pilgrimage. In order to understand how the enactment or performance of pilgrimage combines the identities of artist and spectator in each individual pilgrim's body, first it is necessary to summarize the artist's and spectator's roles in the performance or creation of art according to Davies' established performance theory.

The theory states that a performance must specify a focus of appreciation to be considered not only correct or completed, but an artwork. The focus of appreciation is the vehicle or medium by which a certain content is articulated (Davies 2004). The medium or method of performance in the case of pilgrimage is linked to articulation of content from the creation through to the enactment of each specific performance. Regarding pilgrimage, the medium of the art performed will be constitutive of the processing, singing, dancing, culturally significant knowledge gained through oral tradition or textual sources, and journeying to and from the site of veneration.

Focus of Appreciation

The medium or vehicle of performance is linked to the articulation of content (Davies 2004). The articulation can range, for example, from set designs and costumes for a play, to the chosen key of arrangement for a musical score. This articulation of content creates the focus of appreciation which results in a complete performance. The completed artwork does not rely solely on the efforts of the actors or artists directly involved in the performance. Instead, articulation or the generation of understanding a piece is dependent upon the artist and spectator interactions. Each component works together as mediator using a shared set of cultural norms, stories, and understandings to draw a logical bridge between the content of the work and its focus or vehicle of articulation (Davies 2004).

Performance theory highlights the aspect of art that is a unique creation each time a work is performed. According to the theory, an artwork is 'a performance that specifies a focus of appreciation' and a work is 'the performance whose description determines the work's modal properties' (Davies 2004: 146). No one performance can be exactly the same as another, even if each event is undertaken by the same cast, director, and production team. This is because a performance is not only created by the actor/artist, but also by their unique interactions with the intended audience during each performance. The focus of appreciation becomes a reality through the generative nature of a complete performance. Davies specifies a structure with three key components to distinguish how focus completes a performance or work of art.

According to performance theory, focus of appreciation aims, animates, and motivates a performance. Focus marks the temporal boundaries identified with the work and it is the product of the performance that achieves a definite outcome (Davies 2004). In other words, focus of appreciation determines the constitutive aspects of performance from its initial inception or

purpose for creation, through its performed duration, to the final moments of the work when the initial aim of the production is achieved. The capacity to analyze and understand an artwork resides within the focus of appreciation which proscribes a basic structure of a goal-oriented process of creation existing for a specific and temporally unique duration. The compilation of the *Cantigas* by Alfonso X provides an example of how the focus of appreciation of performance theory can be applied to the creation of medieval texts and further instances of performance such as pilgrimage.

Although the *Cantigas* were widely popular in many forms and 'llur fama és, sobretot, per via de transmissió oral, que s'haura expandit inicialment enllà de las fronteres catalanes' (Baraut i Obols 1949: 3), the text initially was written by Alfonso and his collaborators 'clearly designed primarily as an art object' (Scarborough 2009: 31). However, the *Cantigas* should be considered a work of performance art rather than the art object designated by Scarborough. According to performance theory, the first step in identifying a performance is by distinguishing the actor/artist from the audience/spectators. In the case of the *Cantigas*, Alfonso X is the driving force behind the creation of the text and will be considered the author/artist for this discussion, while the audience is the general population of those people under his reign and the wider Iberian Peninsula.

During Alfonso's rule, he was in a constant battle to claim the title of Holy Roman Emperor. One of the motivations or artistic aims behind the production of his work was disseminating his political ideologies or propaganda suggesting a unified peninsula led by a single, strong figure which he embodied (Valvedre 1985; Keller & Cash 1998; Scarborough 2009). The method in which he articulated these goals was through regional and universal examples of Marian miracles (that he knew, had heard or researached) written in the vernacular

using an easily understandable narrative style to reach as wide an audience as possible. The time period of creation for the initial work would constitute its entire time of compilation from roughly 1257 to 1279. The final outcome of the creation of the *Cantigas* may not have been achieved in Alfonso's lifetime. However, on his death, he ordered that the copies of the *Cantigas* be placed in the church in which he was interred (the Cathedral of Seville) and performed regularly ensuring the continual enactment and popularity of his work (Flory 1996). The creation of Alfonso's work adheres to the components of Davies' performance theory. However, a performance does not rely solely on the artist's creative process. The emphasis of performance theory's structure is heavily or almost entirely influenced by the creative actions or intentions of an artist/actor manipulating a medium for a designated audience. This approach involves the audience in a secondary manner as necessary to the completion of the performance, but still segregates them into a category distinct from the artist/actor. The secondary status of the observer brings into question the audience's involvement within the creative process.

Performance theory states that the first component of the focus of appreciation is 'the thing whose specification is the aim of the performance, this aim being what animates and motivates the performance' (Davies 2004: 151). The aim pertains to the articulation of the artist's goal or statement, not that of the audience. In this case, articulating an artistic statement does not mean that the artist or actor chooses to utilize a specific painting or acting technique to comment on the current climate of artwork or the affairs of the world. Articulating an artistic statement is not an action inherently political in motivation, although in Alfonso's case political idology can shape the narrative of the artwork produced. However, a more appropriate way of understanding the artistic statement is as the more general aim or goal of the artist or actor. These goals are the answers raised by the questions of what the artists want to achieve and how they

will manipulate the performance through the medium of expression to achieve this ultimate purpose. The goal is more practical than theoretical.

Understanding the open nature of the artistic statement behind the performance of a work is necessary in order to locate audience involvement in the creative process. The artistic statement is the aim of the performance and is an integral part of the focus of appreciation. Another necessary component is that the product of the performance is construed in such a manner that the audience can take something away from the performance. In other words, the work achieves something determinant (Davies 2004). The initial goal of the artist must be catered to the receptive norms of the cultural context in which the work is produced and performed to make it relevant to the audience. The overriding intention or goal of the artist, that is a necessary component of the focus of appreciation and the completion of the performance, is 'to be interpretable by the interpretive norms of a particular community of receivers–artist's manipulations can be guided by this intention only in a world in which the same interpretive norms obtain' (Davies 2004: 163). McConachie (2008) also recognizes that a work, or in his case more specifically a play, will not be well received or understood if the artists/actors deviate too far from contemporarily understood staging techniques and methods of thematic interpretation. Alfonso X caters to the cultural expectations of his audience through the use of the vernacular in his narratives and by using a subject, the Virgin Mary, that is well-known and easily recognized by his audience.

Popularly circulated information such as cultural traditions, commonly utilized narrative structure and form, reoccurring religious and civil motifs, structures of musical compositions such as the virelai, and legends are part of the interpretive norm accessible to and constitutive of the individual audience members in their time and culture of reception. The audience members'

expectations and culturally contextualized knowledge help to guide the focus of appreciation. The audience's presence molds and manipulates the artist's initial goals of the performance to be understood and received by the spectators, leading to a determinant product of a completed performance.

Another important aspect of the audience's interpretation or reception of a performance informed by cultural norms is the fact that the artist's manipulation and utilization of these norms can only be guided by intentions that will be used in an area, culture, or time period where the same interpretive norms are recognizable and prevalent (Davies 2004). The unique methods of artistic interpretation belonging to specific cultural time periods are important to recognize in relation to the study of medieval pilgrimage as performance and art. Rather than approaching the actions of pilgrimage as applicable to any community of actors in all time periods, an audience engaging with a specific historical setting indicates the unique aspect of performance and its focus of appreciation. Each pilgrimage's focus of appreciation is a distinct occurrence constituted by the artistic aim and a determinant outcome. Pertaining to the specific timing of each performance, the focus of appreciation, and thus, the creation of the artwork, is not only determined by the historic time and location of its creation, but also by the work's temporal boundaries: the beginning and end of each instance of performance or pilgrimage.

Performance theory provides the researcher with three structural factors for a performance as defined through the specification of a focus of appreciation. These components, while in part are determined and initiated by the artist/actor, are also created in combination with the spectator's capacity of interpretive understanding dependent on their specific time period and culture of reception. While performance theory advocates an interactive and co-dependent relationship between the artist and audience, as of yet it does not acknowledge or propose a

method in which the doer (artist/actor) and watcher (audience/spectator) contribute equally to the creation of a performance. Adapting performance theory to the live action of pilgrimage from a consideration of the creation of literary art objects through performance, such as a play script or Alfonso's *Cantigas*, necessitates equal contributions from the actors and audience involved in pilgrimage and their interactions with the space of performance. The change required in performance theory is the capacity to identify the actor and audience in pilgrimage as the same individual. The ritual acts of pilgrimage exemplify that the actor and the audience can be identified within the same body of the individual medieval pilgrim to Montserrat. The manner in which the textual and oral traditions of a site are interpreted determine the actions and understanding of the pilgrim as actor and audience in the act of creation and performance art.

Interpreting Cultural Norms: The Texts, Traditions and Symbols of Pilgrimage to Montserrat

Until this point, the ideals and components of performance theory have detailed a general concept of art as performance through a generative process of creation. While applicable to any type of performance, the focus of appreciation and temporal aspects of this theory have been conceptualized more towards the discussion of the production of art objects such as paintings and sculptures or literary works such as the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*. This is not to say that a work of art such as a play is not addressed by the theory. When looking at a performance as art, the same concepts behind the focus of appreciation apply to an art object or an art enactment such as a play. The performed work takes its form from the script and stage directions established as the author/artist puts pen to paper. Unlike the art creation involved in a more tactile and static medium such as marble or clay, after the play is written the process of creation is not suspended in the time and place of the playwright's final pen stroke. The play or drama's original script is recreated through a new mobile and adaptable medium of the human body with each enactment.

The generative performance which becomes the art of a play, drama, or musical production requires a focus of appreciation as is the case with an artwork created in a more static medium. However, due to the adaptive nature of individual performances of the same text, the focus of appreciation of a play or constantly re-enacted work has two further interpretive norms or constraints in addition to those detailed in the previous discussion of created art-objects. These additional categories must be considered in order to articulate the artistic statement of the work and for the audience to react immediately to such a performance whether through laughter, cajoling, contemplation, or tears. The further constraints consist of the performance piece's method of describing the instructions for performing the work. The instructions are usually written in the form of a script or musical score. The play's script, in addition to the interpretation of the work by its given community of performers are the additional categories necessary to create and complete a performed work of art (Davies 2004).

A performance is first dependent on the original script or score, the creation of which was a temporally specified act of art production. The performance of the written words of a script gives an artwork a culturally contingent life dependent upon the actors interpreting the words and the audience living through the performed interpretation. The original piece written by a third-party artist, in combination with the performers' interpretation of the original textual body of work must interact with the audience to produce a completed performance that achieves an artistic goal. The first parallel to identify between performance art and pilgrimage to Montserrat is the format of a script or score detailing instructions for the enactment of pilgrimage. In the case of Montserrat, there are extant scripts and musical scores regarding the proper articulation of the pilgrim performances.

The first creation of a performance script for pilgrimage to Montserrat comes from the *Cantigas* of Alfonso X. The compilation of Alfonso's work was the initial performance that resulted in a corpus of Marian miracles or a textual art object. The texs relating the miracles and histories of Montserrat are the scripts that lead to the enactment or performance of pilgrimage dependent on the examples and instructions provided within their contents. Three of the *Cantigas* miracles dedicated to the Virgin of Montserrat are related to the performance of pilgrimage (*Cantigas* 57, 302, and 311). In each narrative, the main protagonist enacts a journey or performance of pilgrimage that satisfies the three requirements of performance theory. For example, the pilgrim of *Cantiga* 311 has a clear aim for initiating his performance of pilgrimage, he has an identifiable time frame of action, and achieves a definite outcome. The good man of the *Cantiga* begins a pilgrimage as he is accustomed to doing two to three times a year and is joined by his friend. After they leave Barcelona the weather turns foul and during a lightning storm the good man is struck dead. His friend continues to Montserrat where he blames the Virgin and says his friend wasted his time and money on her. The good man who was struck by lightning is resurrected and berates his friend for doubting the Virgin.

Although the pilgrim's progression is momentarily stalled on account of his death and necessitates the additional support of his friend to beseech the Virgin on his behalf, the journey still achieves the initial outcome defined by the pilgrim's desire and need to visit Montserrat. The creation of the *Cantigas* recorded a tradition of the performance of pilgrimage so that at a later date others could learn from the performances of these narrative songs of the process they must go through to interpret the miracles through their own interactions with the mountain and Virgin of Montserrat.

The *Llibre Vermell* of Montserrat also provides examples of the instructive nature of scripts or musical scores that inform the creation and enactment of the actors performing pilgrimage. The songs of the *Llibre Vermell* dedicated to the Virgin of Montserrat not only give further historical and cultural knowledge of the types of people who made pilgrimages to Montserrat, as listed in the lyrics of 'Stella Splendens', but also offer more directional staging and blocking for those who arrive at the shrine. Even though the texts of the *Llibre Vermell* are in Latin instead of the vernacular like the *Cantigas*, this does not nullify the concept that scripts and scores affected and informed the actions of the pilgrims during their pilgrimage. As María del Carmen Gómez Muntané (1990) notes in her book about the songs and dances in the *Llibre Vermell*: 'El manuscrito parece destinado a los predicadores, y en general, a los eclesiásticos a quienes correspondía el cuidado e instrucción religiosa de los peregrinos que acudían al Santuario' (19). The instructions and songs may have been inscribed in Latin, nevertheless the songs and dances were clearly written for the entertainment of the pilgrims so that they should not disturb others preserved in prayer and devout contemplation: 'ne perturbent perseverantes in orationibus et devotis contemplationibus' (*Llibre Vermell* 'Stella Splendens' 1989: fol. 22^{r}).[6] The songs, miracles, and legends of Montserrat were performed during pilgrimages and also read at the Benedictine church so that the illiterate were able to learn about the cult and could be educated in how to praise and supplicate to the Virgin. The clergy, with the help of the songs, dances, and the rubricated instructions held within the *Llibre Vermell* act as the directors of the actor/pilgrims within their performances. The additional directions offered by the songs of the *Llibre Vermell* and their scores help to guide the actors' movements by familiarizing them with the places and cultural traditions they will come across during the physical aspects of their

[6] 'not disturbing those persisting in prayer and devout contemplation.'

interpretation of the texts through the performance and journey through the Catalonian landscape to Montserrat. The songs, praises, and miracles dedicated to the Virgin, such as present in the *Cantigas de Santa Maria* and the *Llibre Vermell* were able to reach a wide audience due to their public performances during feast days at churches dedicated to the Virgin of Montserrat and in a a more secular setting such as Alfonso's court as indicated by his presence in between the Virgin and the festivities in Figure 2 below. The performances of the miracles and praise of the Virgin were able to reach farther than a merely literate audience such as the Benedictines at Montserrat.

Figure 2: Miniature from *Cantiga* 120 depicting the manner in which to praise the Virgin Mary. From Alfonso X's *Cantigas de Santa Maria*.

The performances were full of life and public displays of devotion to the Virgin that helped spread her renown before the printing press arrived at Montserrat in the fifteenth century. The

form of praise included dancing in the round, singing, and musical accompaniment indicated in the miniature from Alfonso's *Cantigas* (Figure 2) and through the text and rubrication of 'Stella Splendens'.

The songs of the *Llibre Vermell* and the *Cantigas* of Alfonso X act as scripted guides to the events that took place and continue to occur at Montserrat. They are the primary extant medieval art objects that reveal some of the activities of Montserrat pilgrimage and begin to indicate the prominent nature of the landscape within the performance. However, the majority of information regarding Montserrat, its history, foundation miracles, and pilgrimage practices is preserved in later texts from the sixteenth, seventeeth, and eighteenth centuries. Each of these histories and compilations is its own art production with distinctive cultural contexts that determine the artistic goals and ideological leanings of each. For example, Serra y Postius's works are a clear attempt to garner favor with King John V of Portugal (1698-1750), to create better political ties between the Crowns of Portugal and Catalonia, and show his devotion to the Virgin of Montserrat. The author exemplifies his goal in creating the history by using the historical records of patronage of Montserrat to provide King John with a long line of Catalonian nobles who honored the Virgin and offers patronage to Montserrat as a method through which John can join the prestigious ranks he cites. The author of the *Abrégé* promotes a French presence at Montserrat and a desire to educate his audience and spread the renown of the site. Olivier also emphasizes a French presence at Montserrat, but does so as a means to unite rather than divide the people of France and Spain through his dedication to Anne of Austria, Queen of France (1601-66). Olivier uses his text to cement 'un telle amitie ferme' between Spain and France when Montserrat was continuing to expand and could use further royal patronage (1617:

4).[7] The author, a Benedictine friar, would have known of Queen Anne's patronage to other religious houses and could have sought her influence for Montserrat. However, the emphasis on the commonalities between the French and Spanish people and Montserrat's tie to both nations hints at a further desire to calm the increasingly volatile atmosphere between the two nations that would result in Anne's husband, Louis XIII (1610-43) declaring war on Spain in 1635.

Burgos' writing was influenced by the arrival of a printing press at Montserrat in 1499 as a part of Abbot García de Cisneros' reforms (1456-1510) that led to the Benedictine monastery on the mountain becoming a renowned publisher of works about the mountain, papal and royal bulls of concession, and the stamped image of the Virgin of Montserrat. Cisneros' press made the Monastery so prolific that by the time Burgos was writing in the late sixteenth century, the dissemination of Montserrat devotion was at its height of renown. Texts such as Burgos' became important components in the strategy to continue to expand the Monastery as a culture center. Although each of these texts is distanced from medieval devotion at Montserrat by time, they follow in the tradition of performance theory by taking a set written or oral tradition and re-enacting or reinterpreting it to create a new performance and work of art. While the writers' goals and narrative emphasis may have changed from the *Llibre Vermell* or the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*, there are still core images and concepts taken from the original extant and extinct medieval sources that have remained constant, if slightly altered, in the sixteenth-, seventeenth-, and eighteenth- century sources utilized in this thesis.

An example of the continuity and reinterpretation of the medival artworks or scripts is evident when focusing on the role and image of the mountain of Montserrat in the *Cantigas* and later histories. In her study of the Marian illustrations of the legend of Montserrat, Concepción

[7] 'a solid frienship'

Alarcón Román describes the legend as creating both a narrative model and a model of iconographic representation for the site in which the image of the serrated mountain is a central focus of the cult (2008). She continues to state that the related histories always dedicate the first chapter to a physical description of Montserrat and have done so since the first historian, Pedro Alfonso de Burgos, wrote in the sixteenth century. This theory proves true for the five non-medieval sources used in this thesis ranging from the sixteenth to eighteenth centuries. From Burgos (1594) to Serra y Postius (1747), each author begins their history with a description of the mountain usually accompanied by a printed image.

Figure 3: Printed image of the Virgin of Montserrat from the introduction to Burgos' text 1594.

Figure 4: Printed image of the Virgin from the introduction to Olivier's text 1617.

Figure 5: Printed image of the Virgin from the beginning of Serra y Postius' 1747 history.

The elements that repeat in the printed images of Montserrat are the mountain, the image of the Virgin Mary and the Christ child enthroned on the mountain, the Benedictine sanctuary, the hermitages, the path up the mountain, and the pilgrims (Alarcón Román 2008). However, in above images from the sources this thesis uses, only Olivier's text depicts the pilgrims on their ascent up the mountain. The images that Alarcón Román desribes in her article generally portray the pilgrims, yet this motif is not consistently used in the imagery. The author of the study of the Marian images of Montserrat claims that the mountain is the principal element of the site's iconography since the *Llibre Vermell*. However, the integral nature of the mountain and its landscape appears earlier in the text of Alfonso's *Cantigas*. Writing about the *Cantigas*, José Filgueira Valverde (1985) describes the cultural atmosphere in which they were produced as a time exemplifying a return to nature through a domination of the natural in art and literature. It was a time of increasing control over the natural environment combined with a fondness for the secrecy and mystery of the natural world (Filgueira Valverde 1985). This concept is consistent with the central figure of the Virgin enthroned as a Queen upon the mountain as she oversees pilgrims, Benedictines, and hermits alike. The Virgin in Figure 3 dominates the scene and appears larger than the mountain backdrop, yet she is not removed from the setting. The folds of her robes blend with the distinctive rocks of Montserrat making it difficult to determine where the Virgin's image ends and the mountain begins. The Virgin and her mantel become one place and her position as mother to the Christ Child imbues the space with a protective, maternal location for pilgrimage (Twomey 2019: 302-25). However, the image of the mountain of Montserrat depicted in the *Cantigas* also constructs a savage and aggressive landscape in which the topographic situation of the monastery and those visiting the site is one in 'perill constant que les roques representen per al Monestir i l'esglesia' (Baraut i Obols 1949: 6). The *Cantigas* of

Alfonso X related the scarcity of water (*Cantiga* 48), a lack of food (52), the dangerous and shifting nature of the precarious rocks looming above the monastery (113), the ever-present risk of theft during pilgrimage (57 and 302), and the potential of natural disasters and premature death that can strike down a pilgrim (311). Despite the peril and uncertainty prevelant in each journey to the mountain and the potential risks of ascending, the nature of the mountain and its presence in connection to the Virgin remain consistent from the *Cantigas* of Alfonso X to the eighteenth-century texts written by Serra y Postius at the height of Montserrat's cultural renown. The textual sources of Montserrat from the thirteenth to the eighteenth century are all relevant to evaluate the creation and implementation of the performance of pilgrimage to the mountain.

The literary basis of a performance such as pilgrimage creates explicit constraints necessary for the artwork to be correctly articulated (Davies 2004). The performers' understanding of how they should interpret their actions and words derived from the provided cultural and textual scripts adds a non-specific level of spontaneity to the enactment. When describing a performance as an event, Fischer-Lichte (2013) agrees that a play's text is but one source material of a performance. The text does not work alone, but in conjunction with the performative and architectural spaces in which the work is enacted, in addition to the medium of expression of the actor's body. In the case of Montserrat, the physical and natural space of the mountain also interacts with the individual during a performance. Davies (2004) describes the importance of interpretation of textual aspects by the actors, also known as his community of performers, to show the input a group of artists has on each performance. However, his wording has a similar undertone to Turner and Turner's (1978) description of pilgrims inhabiting a separate and liminal community while all acting towards a single goal. On a certain level, the pilgrims journeying to Montserrat share a loosely collective goal in so far that once the pilgrims

decide to engage in the pilgrimage, no matter where they began, they will all seek to reach the determinant area of the shrine. In this sense, the pilgrim is in fact different from the non-pilgrim passerby. However, this does not mean that all the roads leading to Montserrat converge forcing the diverse array of pilgrims to come together and share identical physical performances. The initial motivations of travelling, the specific destination of the mountain, and the shrine of Montserrat are components to the pilgrimage, but as actors, the individual pilgrims will not arrive at their goals or interpret the performances in identical manners. The medieval routes to Montserrat provided multiple opportunities to reach the mountain by land and sea. These paths were determined by the narrative of pilgrimage the individuals created by choosing which shrines and relics to visit on the way to the mountain sanctuary.

'Texts have to be dismembered and incorporated by different actors who transform them according to their particular corporeality' (Fischer-Lichte 2013: 33). On the most basic level every performance of a text will be unique because no two actors have the same body or corporeality. This concept of embodied thought and its inextricable connection to the sensory nature of the human body describes cognitive literary theory's interpretation of representations of thought and action within text-based works of art. By utilizing an embodied approach to the human manipulation of thoughts and actions represented in a play text, cognitive literary theory can combine with performance theory to explore how a textual form of art evolves into a performed art. Movement, voice, gesture, look, and physical capabilities are just some of the body-based sensual means by which an actor can communicate and interpret the ideas of the text from which they work (Stevenson 2010). Each body of the actor and spectator arrives at a performance with its own historical, cultural, and personal background informing interpretation and reception. Individual members of the wider cultural community could derive very different

devotional meaning from their own confrontation with the event (Stevenson 2010). Just as the individual actor's interpretation of a role differs depending on training and personal history, the individuals engaged in their performances of pilgrimage will differ in their understanding of the stories or oral traditions of the site with which they have contact, even if they have access to the same corpus of texts. Such variations occur in the different interpretation of the pilgrim bodies, the manner in which the protagonists interact with the legends, and also in the distribution of the Virgin's foundation and miraculous texts in the diversity of countries which adhere to her cult.

The Audience in the Actor and Vice Versa

Understanding the pilgrim as an actor interpreting a textual or oral source is only one half of applying performance theory to the art of pilgrimage. In order to situate pilgrimage as an art of performance, the complementary role of the pilgrim as spectator or audience must also be discussed. The duality of one figure serving as actor and spectator appears within the two foundation myths of Montserrat. The details and summaries of Montserrat's foundation myths will come primarily from the medieval versions preserved in the eighteenth-century texts by Serra y Postius (1745 and 1747) and the *Abrégé* (1723). After a detailed account of the fourteen hermitages extant on Montserrat in the 1700s, Serra y Postius, as is the case with the *Abrégé*, introduces the reader to the foundation myths of Montserrat beginning with the account of the rediscovery of the statue of the Virgin Mary. What follow are the concurrent details of the image apparition myth from the eighteenth-century texts. The slight deviations of the French text from the Spanish are included in brackets.

Several shepherds (seven) from Monistrol were at the base of the mountain (by the river Llobregat) with their flocks when they saw bright lights coming from the mountain and then

heard celestial music. The shepherds told their Master of the occurrence. Their Master then went to the mountain to see the miracle for himself. He had the same experience as his men, so he then called upon the local Priest to verify the incident. After the Priest saw the miracle, he called upon the Bishop of Manresa who came with many clergymen, knights, and citizens to witness the event. The following day (Saturday) the Bishop saw the miracle 'y todos llenos de admiración, y alegría vieron, y oyeron los celestiales prodigios' (Serra y Postius 1747: 32). That Sunday, the Bishop sent some youths to go and find where the lights descended into the mountain. Guided by the lights and extraordinary smells the youths (Bishop) discovered the hidden cave on Montserrat and in it the image of the Virgin Mary.

Once the image was rediscovered, the Bishop wanted to take the statue back with him to the Cathedral of Manresa in a grand procession to honor the Virgin properly. However, the procession only made it as far as what is now the location of the first Church to Mary constructed on the mountain. Once the statue processed that far, it grew heavy and could no longer be moved. On that site, a chapel was constructed to Mary which later became the Old Church that housed the image of the Virgin. Here ends the eighteenth-century account of the apparition of the Virgin statue of Montserrat.

In the first narrative describing the discovery or apparition of the Virgin's statue in the cave on Montserrat, the Virgin's image plays the roles of actor and spectator within the legend. As actor, the statue representative of the Virgin determines the staging or space where the events of the performance will unfold: 'Unos dichosos Pastorcillos […] recogiendo al anochecer su ganado, repararon, que descendían de el cielo ciertas luzes, y que se detenían entre unas quiebras de dicha montaña' (Serra y Postius 1747: 32). Through the use of lights (ciertas luzes), celestial songs, and extraordinary fragrances, the shepherds become aware of a sacred space or the

manifestation of the sacred on the mountain and begin to pay specific attention to the site of the spectacle to determine its exact location and the meaning behind the events: 'Y todos, llenos de admiración, y alegría vieron, y oyeron los celestiales prodigios' (Serra y Postius 1747: 33). The shepherds and the members from each section of the communities of Monistrol and Manresa that appear later in the narrative become active spectators in witnessing the unfolding of events leading to the discovery of the Virgin's statue on Montserrat and the establishment of the mountain as a space that has the potential to manifest as sacred. The apparition of the Virgin statue and the interaction with the locals of Monistrol recall the Annunciation of Christ's birth to the shepherds keeping watch in their fields, 'then an angel of the Lord stood before them, and the glory of the Lord shone around them [...] and suddenly there was with the angel a multitude of the heavenly host, praising God' (Harper Collins 2006: Luke 2.9-13). Lights and heavenly sounds herald the discovery of the Virgin of Montserrat in a manner that echoes the proclamation of Christ's birth. Each apparition occurs in a natural setting that encourages the shepherds who witnessed them to make a journey to discover Christ and his mother in the manger at Bethlehem and the Virgin of Montserrat holding the Christ child in a similarly protective setting of a cave. The nature of the statue's rediscovery associates the Virgin of Montserrat and the mountain of her discovery with the maternal and protective aspects of Mary's role as the mother of Christ. In this first part of the narrative, the Virgin statue is the principal actor utilizing lighting and other sensory effects (smells and sounds) to create the heavenly portents to attract the attention of the community members of Monistrol to witness her miracles and perceive the mountain as something other than grazing land or a geographical marker. However, towards the end of the tale, the line between actor and spectator blurs with the human discovery of the hidden statue.

Once the statue is discovered in the Santa Cova (sacred cave) on Montserrat, the members of the community present, including the clergy, intend to honor the statue by placing it in a cathedral:

> Y executándolo, en procesión, llenos todos de celestial gozo, adoraron la Sagrada Imagen […] la llevavan processionalmente cantando hymnos, con ánimo de colocarla en la Catedral de Manresa. (Serra y Postius 1747: 33)

Now the statue becomes a bystander as well as an actor or creator of its own journey. The procession or performance is enacted on the Virgin's behalf complete with music and a company of actors. Yet, the statue still retains its own influence as an actor in the performance as a result of its status as the specific object of veneration. The community members through their ritual performance of procession (the medium) along with their concrete goal (aim seeking a determinant outcome) also become actor/artists with a tangible focus of appreciation to create a legitimately realized performance.

The finale of the Virgin's apparition reveals that the roles of actor and spectator are not so much interchangeable between the statue and the community, but shared in a constantly reinterpreted and interactive relationship. This is evident when the community begins their procession back to Manresa but meets with an obstacle to the intended goal: 'Maria Santissima manifestó querer quedarse en la montaña con nuevo prodigio; pues al llegar al puesto en donde está edificada la Iglesia vieja, no pudieron moverse de aquel lugar los que la llevavan' (Serra y Postius 1747: 33). Once again, the statue of Mary exerts an influence over those gathered. As in the case with the community of actors in their own procession, the Virgin statue fulfills the prerequisites for a performance as defined as a focus of appreciation. The statue's aim motivating its performance is to stop the procession to Manresa. By halting the previous

procession, the Virgin's image demarcates a temporal boundary in which its actions are effective. Finally, by halting the procession, the statue achieves a determinant outcome: the erection of a structure to house the image on the site where the procession stopped. While the statue enacts this performance, the community of processors simultaneously engages in a performance while becoming an audience beholden to the will of the Virgin of Montserrat.

As the statue pauses the procession, it effectively ends the community's performance and begins the Virgin's own process of creation. The community members become witness to the miraculous obstinacy of the statue. However, their performance is not completely abandoned, merely modified. Once the Bishop of Manresa realizes the statue can no longer be moved, he immediately orders those gathered to construct a chapel on the site in which to place the Virgin (Serra y Postius 1747). The community members simultaneously witness the statue's performance while retaining their identities as performers through the still identifiable markers of a focus of appreciation. The company's original aim of processing to honor the Virgin still remains, although the location of their predetermined journey changed from Manresa to Montserrat. The temporal boundary of the performance or procession, although shortened with the change in location, still denotes a specific time and place of a unique performance. Despite the alteration to the product of the community's performance in response to the statue's performance, the procession managed to achieve a determinant outcome of honoring the Virgin by constructing a structure to house her image on Montserrat.

As the tale depicts, the actor and audience can occupy the same body or object to varying and interactive degrees within the time frame of the performance. There can be no passive participants in a performance when the experience is co-determined by the actions and behaviors of both actor and spectator located in their culture, timeframe, and location of context (Fischer-

Litche 2013). Although Davies' performance theory advocates the active involvement of both artist and audience in the performance of art creation, the theory cannot adequately address the individual nature of performance embodied by pilgrimage as art. Performance theory's persistence in making a physical distinction between actor and audience means that the theory is an adequate starting point for understanding pilgrimage as performance, especially with regard to its specifying the focus of appreciation. However, the theory must be modified with respect to understanding pilgrimage as an activity of art creation where the single pilgrim body can be creator and audience to the art and performance of pilgrimage. Montserrat's second foundation legend, the penance of the hermit Fray Juan Garín, offers a further example of the interaction of the roles of actor and spectator within one pilgrim's body in the textual and cultural history of Montserrat.

Movement and the ritual procession through space with a determinant religious goal are the main forces of motivation in the narrative of Juan Garín. Two of the main protagonists, Fray Juan Garín and Count Wilfred the Hairy of Barcelona (840-897), travel to and from Montserrat multiple times during the legend's duration. The following are the details of Fray Juan Garín's narrative from Serra y Postius' 1747 account. The French source does not offer as much detail as Serra y Postius, as a result, the below summary comes from the Spanish texts that provide a better flow for the full narrative of the penance of the hermit Juan Garín. On the one hand, the foundation myths of Montserrat indicate how the creation of the mountain as a site of veneration is constitutive of the enactment of performance art through movement and pilgrimage. In addition, the accounts provide descriptions of the key locations and customs of Montserrat pilgrimage that are necessary to understand how the narrative and the pilgrim's interpretations of the tales interact with the physical landscape.

In the time of Wilfred the Hairy, first Count of Barcelona, lived the hermit Fray Juan Garín in a cave on the mountain of Montserrat. Fray Garín was dedicated to a life of prayer, contemplation, and hard living. He lived in such a saintly manner that the Devil was jealous and sent forth two demons to tempt Garín to sin. One devil went to Barcelona to possess a girl named Riquilda, the daughter of Count Wilfred. The other devil disguised himself as a hermit to gain Garín's confidence.

Count Wilfred took his daughter to Garín for a cure to her possession since nothing else had worked to expel the demon. Garín initially did not want the girl with him in his cave, but eventually he conceded to the Count's will. The demons sent to tempt Garín began to incite love for the girl in the Hermit's heart. Garín tried to run from the temptation, but the demon disguised as a hermit convinced him to stay. Eventually Garín relented to sin. After having sex with Riquilda, Garín killed her and then buried her in the cave. Afterwards Garín went to Rome to speak to the Pope and beg for pardon. There he received his penance to roam the land on all fours as a beast and never to lift his face to heaven. Garín became a savage animal and was unrecognizable as a man.

During his penance, Garín was found by the Count's men and brought to Barcelona because he was believed to be a beast and a rarity, not a human being. During some festivities, the Count's wife carried in their three-month-old son. On seeing Garín, the child spoke and said 'levántate Fray Juan Garín, levántate y está derecho, que Dios te ha perdonado tus pecados' (Serra y Postius 1747: 58). After the child told Garín to rise, the Hermit gave thanks and confessed what he had done to the Count. The Count asked to be taken to his daughter's body. Along the way to Montserrat, Wilfred wanted to stop at the chapel dedicated to the newly discovered image of the Virgin. When Garín, the Count, and his men reached the cave and

unearthed Riquilda, she was miraculously alive. The only hint of her death left as proof of the miracle was a thin scar on her neck where Garín had slit her throat. In honor of the Virgin and the miracle, Count Wilfred created a monastery and a church on Montserrat to the Virgin where Riquilda became Abbess and Garín advised her until his death. Here ends the eighteenth-century account of Fray Juan Garín.

The Count's first journey to Montserrat while seeking a remedy for his daughter's illness not only initiates the performative aspect of the legend, but it is also the catalyst that encourages Garín on his own pilgrimage away from Montserrat. Count Wilfred's visit to Montserrat reiterates the components of the specified focus of appreciation necessary to complete his work through his generative roles as creator and actor of the performance. Wilfred's main goal motivating his performance is to seek the Hermit Garín in order to heal his daughter Riquilda. The temporal boundary of the Count's performance occurs in a series of stages throughout the narrative. The first stage or act of the performance is when Wilfred processes from Barcelona to Montserrat with his daughter. However, the performance does not end there because a determinant product (his daughter's healing) is not achieved until the Count returns to Montserrat at the end of the tale led by Juan Garín. Neither the Count's pilgrimage or Garín's are one-way performances that are achieved by the pilgrims enacting their journeys alone. In order to complete the performance, the pilgrim must also become the audience and actively receive a type of divine performance from the intercession of the Virgin of Montserrat.

After the death of Riquilda by his hands, Juan Garín initiates his first pilgrimage to Rome with the goal of begging the Pope pardon for his sins: 'mais Dieu qui conserve l'innocent […] toucha son coeur d'un repentir si vis, qu'il alla á Rome se jette aux pieds du S. Pere pour en

obtenir le pardon: il lui enjoignit une penitence de sept ans' (*Abrégé* 1723: 11).[8] As is the case with Count Wilfred, Fray Garín's performance is not completed during the first part of his journey when he arrives at Rome. The forgiveness he seeks cannot be achieved until at least seven years of penance pass. The prolonged nature of Garín's and Wilfred's pilgrimages necessitates a third-party intervener to induce the protagonists into their additional or complementary roles as audience allowing the performance to come to completion. This is only achieved once Garín and Wilfred's performances reunite in Barcelona.

After living as a wild man on Montserrat, Juan Garín is captured by the Count's men who think that the former holy man is a beast and bring him to the Count's court in Barcelona. At the court in Barcelona Garín and Wilfred become audience members and witnesses to a miracle: 'Y el Señor [Dios], que es poderoso para desatar la lengua a los infantes' gave the ability to speak to Wilfred's three-month-old son who said 'Levántate, Fray Juan Guarin, levántate, y está derecho, que Dios te ha perdonado tus pecados' (Serra y Postius 1747: 58). On witnessing the divine intervention of God speaking through a baby to lift Garín's penance, the Hermit and the Count become involved in a divine performance as is the case with the shepherds of Monistrol. This catalytic performance is designed to return them to the final location necessary to complete their initial pilgrimages, the mountain of Montserrat.

As active witnesses to the miracle that occurred in Barcelona, Fray Juan Garín and Count Wilfred return to Montserrat for the body of Riquilda. Once there the pair becomes witness to

[8] 'But, God who preserves the innocent [...] touched his heart with a repentance so strong, that he went to Rome and threw himself at the feet of Saint Peter to obtain pardon: where the Pope ordered him to serve a seven-year penance.'

another miracle, the resuscitation of Riquilda through the intervention of the Virgin Mary of Montserrat. As spectator to the Virgin's miracle, Wilfred accomplishes his goal of healing his daughter. Garín, as spectator, is once more restored to his status as a holy man, pardoned, and at peace in his home on the mountain. The interaction with the Virgin and the shifting of Garín and Wilfred's identities between creators/actors and spectators to divine performances help them complete their own performances and pilgrimages. Without the necessary divine intervention Garín would still be wandering the wilderness in a space between sin and redemption and Wilfred would still be waiting for news of his daughter's whereabouts. The protagonists in Montserrat's foundation legends (the statue apparition and the penance of Fray Juan Garín) reinforce the complex relationship of creator or actor and audience of a performance integrated within the body of the individual pilgrim. The characters' processions and enactments of their pilgrimages through the narrative landscape determine the focus of appreciation and embody the reception of the performance of pilgrimage. These narratives offer further insights of the performative nature of pilgrimage to and from Montserrat through the visual and sensory descriptions of the processions of the actors and audiences.

Cognitive performance theorists such as Bruce McConachie (2008) and Nicola Shaughnessy (2013) note how multisensory and engaging the process of vision is in a performance. The visual cues and interactions of a pilgrim's embodied mind during the performance are more complex than ritual theories indicate. According to performance and cognitive theories, what is perceived and viewed in an art performance is understood through various densely interconnected parts of the brain. In order to interpret what is seen during the act of looking at anything from a simple object, such as a chair, to a more complex performance piece previous experiences are recalled of similar events which add to the accumulated

knowledge of the individual in order to understand and interpret the present event (McConachie 2008). The author calls these recalled and conceptualized memories that interact with past recollection and current experiences *schema*. The schema are not past snapshots that are stored in the brain and recalled when needed, they are linked to various cognitive and sensual faculties of the brain in order to create a complete visual picture and understanding. This multisensory and interactive nature of vision also pertains to the diverse nature of performance that simultaneously stimulates cognitive and sensory functions within the pilgrim as actor and audience.

In performanc theory, sensory observations such as tactile, olfactory, or visual stimuli activate diverse regions of the brain to complete a holistic picture of the environment. Recall and reflection are involved in the ritual act and the movement of performance. The stimuli created by the landscape aid in religious contemplation and the act of pilgrimage by connecting the spiritual narratives and lessons with the known physical realm of observable features. However, observable features of the landscapes and ritual involved in pilgrimage affect the medieval participant more tangibly than the sense of vision offered by performance theory's concept of modern theater. In the medieval understanding of vision, the sense of sight directly allowed the spectator or observer to internalize and embody knowledge from the visual experience (Frank 2000). Objects were sources of light that allowed spiritual and tangible qualities to be transmitted in a two-way process (Woolgar 2006). The viewer's perception created the conditions for an encounter with a sacred past (embodied in an object or specific landscape) to become a present event or experience. The visual contact of the individual with an object or landscape 'engenders change in the viewer' (Frank 2000: 111). The observed setting and the human participant (actor) are engaged in an active exchange that transmits knowledge and formulates the visual experience. In this manner, medieval spectatorship becomes an inherently kinesthetic occurrence

where audience reception and interaction with a performance enacted in the context of devotional practices involves the body's ability to be an avenue of physical sensation (Ehrstine 2012). Through vision and the other senses such as smell and hearing, which were equally charged with a moral, spiritual, and physical capacity to transmit knowledge (Woolgar 2006), a performance had the ability to tangibly alter the perceived environment according to the pilgrim's individual process of vision and experiences of the senses. Through this process, the pilgrim (performer/actor) could 'transform familiar [or unknown] surroundings' into a uniquely personal setting of performance (Ehrstine 2012: 311).

The processional legends of Montserrat would not be complete without the participation of the pilgrims as actors and audience and their sensory interactions with the setting of performance, the natural landscape and features of the mountain. The divine apparition of the Virgin statue was heralded with an array of sensory stimuli in the form of lights, celestial music, and extraordinary fragrances. The subsequent human involvement in the extrication of the statue from the cave and intended procession to Manresa required the auditory (the loud) and tactile (the physical) elements in the human reenactment and contemplation of the divine portents: 'Llenos todos de celestial gozo […] la llevavan processionalmente cantando hymnos, con ánimo' (Serra y Postius 1747: 33). The human processions in the tale of Fray Juan Garín are full of noise and a jovial, public attitude similar to the divine acts in the apparition tale. For example, when Count Wilfred first visits Garín on Montserrat, he does not go alone, but with a whole company of retainers: 'El Conde […] el mismo en persona le fue a visitar a la hermita, llevando consigo a su hija, y muchos criados que los acompañavan' (Serra y Postius 1747: 52). The Count's company, full of noise, reverence, and cajoling, enters the mountain of Montserrat which is known for quiet contemplation and invades Garín's peaceful life with a loud, human presence.

The second time members of the Count's household go to Montserrat they are engaged in a hunting party, another boisterous human and potentially disruptive activity:

> En llegando los perros a ella [la montaña] comenzaron a dar ladridos, y ladrar con mucha vehemencia, y prisa. Los cazadores […] se acercaron a donde oían el estruendo, y ruido que hazían los perros. (Serra y Postius, 1747: 57)

As is the case with the shepherds of the apparition myth, the Count's men discover an incredible object on the mountain as they are led to the specific site by the human representation of celestial music, hunting dogs barking. Once the hunters discover Garín hiding in his cave, they are ordered to bring him to Barcelona: 'Uvifredo les mandó se le traxessen delante […] y llevaron delante de el Conde, y de allí dieron con él en Barcelona, maravillándose todos los ciudadanos de ver monstruo semejante' (Serra y Postius 1747: 57).

In the manner that the Virgin statue was discovered by fanfare and carried in a procession, so too was the body of Juan Garín. The body of Garín in his animalistic state was so incredible and otherworldly that it became to the people of Barcelona an object to be marveled and celebrated as a curiosity rather than a sacred object such as the statue of the Virgin. What these narratives exemplify is that the interaction with divine and marvelous objects or bodies is a multisensory and potentially raucous performance. The Virgin of Montserrat does not remain silent, but employs sensory tactics to affect and alter the mountain landscape and the community's perception of Montserrat. The community members and also pilgrims processing to Montserrat absorb this new knowledge of the potential sacred nature of the mountain and statue by responding to the Virgin's cues. The pilgrimages are not silent, but involve active and physical movement during the course of their devotion such as the singing of hymns and the involvement of entire households and communities from shepherds to bishops carrying objects to

aid in the performance. The pilgrimage landscape is not a barren, static space through which pilgrims walk. The landscape is rather an interactive space of performance where actors and audience members interact and react to the space they inhabit and objects they observe for the duration of the performance. Pilgrimage involves the multisensory interaction of the pilgrim body as actor and audience with the space of their performance whether it be at the shrine, cathedral courtyard, or Catalonian countryside. The following sections will look more specifically into questions of space and intent regarding performance at Montserrat.

The Space of Pilgrimage

With regard to identifying a performance as a work of art, the importance of the work as specifying a focus of appreciation cannot be overstated. This focus of appreciation is generated by the completion of an artwork determined by the aim of the performance, its temporal boundaries, and the product of a performance achieving a determinant goal (Davies 2004). While the focus of appreciation gives structure to the analysis of a complete performance, a goal, time frame, and finale are not the only components present in the cultural contexts of the work that regulate and determine its interactions with both the actor/artist and audience. Within the discussion of pilgrimage as performance and art, in addition to the previously stated components or categories of performance theory, two further determining factors should be added for a wider-ranging understanding of the ontology of performance. The additional categories that aid in the further study of pilgrimage are the space or place of the ritual activity and the intent and movement of the acting bodies involved in the performance of the artwork. The following discussion will begin with a consideration of the role of space in the performance of pilgrimage to Montserrat.

Natural and artificial spaces are reoccurring motifs within the histories and legends of Montserrat. In fact, the mountain of Montserrat is not so much a backdrop or setting for the performance of pilgrimage, but more of an active protagonist in its own right anthropomorphized with adjectives describing its beauty and its ability to affect change in the pious. Pedro Serra y Postius (1747) begins his *Epitome Historico* of Montserrat with a brief, but detailed description of the geography of the location and the miraculous qualities of the flora and fauna present on the mountain. According to his text, from afar, the mountain appears uninhabitable, but the miraculous landscape aids in giving the viewer hope by merely looking at it and lifts the soul (Serra y Postius 1747). In the eighteenth-century text, the mountain as an observable landscape or feature continues to adhere to the medieval understanding of the affective nature of vision and the other senses. Sight of the mountain has the potential to interact with and elevate the observer. Before addressing further the interactive nature of Montserrat's space, it is prudent to understand how space or place is conceptualized in performance and aesthetic theories regarding art.

Aesthetics, according to Allen Carlson's monograph regarding aesthetics and the environment, is defined as 'the area of philosophy that concerns our appreciation of things as they affect our sense, especially in a pleasing way' (2000: XVII). Recent studies in aesthetics (see *Rediscovering Aesthetics* 2009) attempt to expand the traditional purview of the field beyond categories of objects which Carlson designates as pleasing or beautiful. Although Carlson's wording is slightly dated, his definition promotes the movement towards a multisensory interaction with artwork while retaining aesthetics focus on beauty and appreciation. In an approach that echoes the medieval interaction of the senses, Carlson takes this affectation of the senses further by claiming that there is a need for an aesthetic understanding of the perceived environment. As a result of the spectator's immersion within the environment their

appreciation of an art object is subsequently affected by their surroundings (Carlson 2000). The author's emphasis on the environment's importance in aesthetic appreciation goes against the objectification of nature by science and the subjectification of nature to scenic views of art inherited from the traditionally narrow fields of aesthetic inquiry of eighteenth-century philosophers (Carlson 2000). While still considering the aesthetic experience as one pleasing to the senses, Carlson adds to what can create such an interaction. He fights against the indifferent attitude towards landscape through his natural environment model and its discussion of the appropriate or aesthetic appreciation of nature. The natural environmental model suggests that nature must be appreciated as it is, focusing on its status as the natural surrounding environment, not as an artistic snapshot taken by a tourist to be framed at a later date. An aesthetic appreciation of nature is not the observance of a photographed object from one specific immovable point, but rather

> it is being 'in the midst' of them [the objects], moving in regard to them, looking at them from any and every point and distance and […] also smelling, hearing, touching, feeling. It is being in the environment, and reacting to it as a part of it. It is such active, involved aesthetic appreciation, that is appropriate to the natural environment. (Carlson 2000: 35)

Carlson's understanding of active involvement and reaction to a space reflects the state of movement and activity constitutive of the actor and audience's presence within a medieval performance. Although Carlson tends to focus on a science-based appreciation of natural surroundings, his analysis still proposes the need of active engagement between the viewer and the viewed.

Not only does Carlson advocate a model of environmental appreciation that highlights a reciprocally affective relationship between nature and the spectator reflective of performance

theory, but he also redefines the space of interaction between spectator and environment as ranging from the size of a small indoor shrine to a mountain range. The landscape or environment can consist of pristine nature, more traditional art, and works of architecture. The lived-in environment surrounding the pilgrim as actor and audience is not limited to the extraordinary (or sacred), but includes within it the ordinary and common sites of daily life (Carlson 2000). Reminiscent of Carlson's wide-ranging concept of environmental space that can be analyzed with an aesthetic appreciation in the same manner as more traditional art objects, Jeff E. Malpas, in his study linking space and experience, argues for an acknowledgement of the interactive role of the environment. Malpas (1999) proposes that the environment or surrounding place is more involved with its culture of location and context rather than existing merely as a tangible presence of natural and architectural structures:

> Place encompasses the idea of social activities and institutions expressed in and through structure of a particular place, and idea of physical objects and events in the world that constrain and are sometimes constrained by those social activities and institutions. (Malpas 1999: 35)

This concept of space as wide-ranging and actor-encompassing indicates that the natural and constructed environments can only be appropriately and aesthetically appreciated when situated within the space of action and interactive perception. As a result of living in a space which is dependent on the coexistence of the viewer within the environment, the possible social and cultural institutions present in the specific society of context are inextricably linked to the experience. Seeing and being present within a medieval space was less about what was actually present and more about what the place (sacred or profane) meant for the pilgrims. This nature of perception was tied to a sense of how culturally dependent components such as the form of

religion and understanding of faith led to the ability to change the environment and conjur and display biblical or hagiographic events (Frank 2000). Ritual and cognitive literary theory also tie the environment to the activities of the social individual through the concept of the embodied mind developed from thought and its presence and connection to active experience. The embodied mind connects thought and action instead of separating them into distinct categories. This is a result of the consideration that reception, mimesis, and interpretation of cognition and visual stimuli are dependent on physical acts of reception through the body's sensory receptors. Utilizing a ritual studies standpoint in conjunction with performance theory that reflect the heightened interactions with space, the pilgrim body represented through physical, observational, and sensory capacities is involved in the creation of the performance experience. The current discussion of aesthetic space and the necessity of the observing body (the pilgrim) to act and interact within the context of the specific landscape reinforces the link between the pilgrims embodying the receptive (audience) and interactive (actor) roles within their experiences of a specific landscape, space, or setting. Not only is the mind embodied, but the space is as well since it is constructed by the presence and actions of the pilgrim. The human interactions and activities expressed or performed within the landscape are integral to conceptualizing the roles and effects of the natural and architectural spaces within pilgrimage. Both Carlson's environmental model and Malpas' concept of place as socially interactive are exemplified in the histories of Montserrat accompanying the miracle and legend texts.

Pedro Serra y Postius' *Epitome historico* (1747), as well as the *Abrégé* of Montserrat (1723) describe the natural landscape and environment of Montserrat before and after the relation of Montserrat's foundation legends. These detailed accounts include physical locations and features of the mountain, the constructed landscape of the hermitages and churches, as well

as a description of the Virgin statue. Following Carlson's environmental model of landscape aesthetics derived from scientific data, Serra y Postius begins his 'Breve descripción de la montaña de Montserrat' with precise units of distance to situate Montserrat within its context of the larger Catalonian landscape (1747: 1). According to the text, Montserrat is '7 leguas de Barcelona hacia el Sudeste, y 3 leguas hacia el norte' (Serra y Postius 1747: 3). The author also notes that the mountain has a circumference of four leagues and a height between one and a half and two leagues. A final systematic denotation of space is that on a clear day from Montserrat one can see the Balearic Islands one hundred and eighty miles away (Serra y Postius 1747). The measurements at the beginning of the Montserrat history, along with the later environmental description of the species of flora and fauna that survive on the mountain encapsulate Carlson's need of observable and scientific detail to appreciate adequately the inhabited landscape. However, the focus on the height of the mountain, its unique prominence on the landscape, and the visibility of the landmark indicate that the importance and interaction of the mountain with the surrounding Catalonian communities and populations at least one hundred and eighty miles away such as the Balearic Islands are determined by more than just units of measurement.

While Carlson proclaims knowledge, especially that of a scientific nature, as a guiding frame of environmental interaction, he concedes that natural objects such as a mountain have a wider organic unity or connection with the environment of their location:

> Such objects are a part of and have developed out of the elements of their environments by means of the forces at work within those environments. Thus the environments of creation are aesthetically relevant to natural objects. (Carlson 2000: 44)

Following his reasoning, natural objects or landscapes are not only appreciated by their physical properties such as height, appearance, and geographical distance, but also by their interactive

development with the cultural forces at work in the environment. This would imply that the understanding of a natural object by its environment or cultural location of reception, with regard to what it represents and how it affects the populace, is as important as the object's physical evolution and impact on the landscape. This concept affords relevance to an understanding of space at Montserrat through the described factual distances and locations encompassing the mountain site, along with the more mythical or literary descriptions present in the narratives and songs of the sanctuary. When the histories discuss the height and visibility of Montserrat in the surrounding landscape, the impact will not only be geologically imposed on the natural landscape, but also culturally affect the human institutions from which an integration and understanding of the mountain arises.

The physical descriptions within the histories of Montserrat, especially that of Serra y Postius, pay detailed attention to the location of the pilgrimage site and the relative distance between architectural structures on the mountain and their geographical location to one another. However, as reflected in the myths of Montserrat, natural features are not described in absence of a connection to an architectural location or institution. In the physical description of Montserrat, the first distance noted in the Spanish and French histories is that the mountain is seven leagues from Barcelona. Barcelona not only represents a logical choice for demarcating distance as a result of its size and role as a center or concentration of commercial power, but also due to its importance in the tale of Juan Garín. Barcelona and its institutions of political power and authority, represented by the figure of Count Wilfred of Barcelona, bring the distant, rocky, and unknown landscape of Montserrat to the level of human understanding. Through the Count's interactions with the sequestered Fray Juan Garín, human institutions and culture come together to mingle with nature and an ascetic devotion on the mountaintop. As is the case with the

apparition legend of the Virgin statue, the ultimate interaction of the statue with the clergy and general population of Manresa and Monistrol leads to the creation of a constructed shrine imposed on the natural landscape of Montserrat that serves to direct or focus worship to the Virgin. The interaction between humans and their culturally created institutions of power and communities must be understood in conjunction with the natural landscape. As Malpas (1999) and Carlson (2000) state, the structure of a place or its natural objects do not grow from nothing, but are dependent on the forces and constraints at work in the encompassing environment. For Carlson, the forces at work are more geological in the creative process and for Malpas, the constraints in play are social activities that determine the use and understanding of the created space of focus. In the case of Montserrat, it is unnecessary to segregate space into natural versus human institutionalized regions or sacred versus profane locations. The combination of the natural and constructed elements involved in the interactions of artist, audience, and setting in the performance of pilgrimage and the individual's unique utilization of sensory reception create a specified experience similar in nature to the aesthetic. A single location becomes more than a geological object or feature of religious significance through the interpretations and interactions of the pilgrims with the space.

A variety of locations and spaces exist on Montserrat to grow a sensory relationship with the pilgrim. One of the main interactions of Montserrat as a location which can affect the human element is the prominence of the mountain from afar. In the histories of Montserrat, the mountain acts as a shining beacon to the encircling communities. The mountain is unique and prominent amongst the other geographical formations. It dominates the landscape and on clear days can be seen hundreds of miles away (Serra y Postius 1747 and *Abrégé* 1723). Not only does its stature draw the gaze, but the impossible nature of abundant flora and fauna, despite the lack

of water, also arrests the imagination. The mountain becomes more than a geographically imposing feature as it transforms into a biblically elevated location comparable to another garden of Eden: 'C'est de cette belle Montagne comme d'un champ fertile & d'une source d'eau vive […]. Cette superbe montagne est si élevée, que de son sommet, les autres qui l'environnent, paroissent comme un païs uni' (*Abrégé* 1723: 5).[9] The beauty of the mountain's natural landscape denotes a distinct, Eden-like place that acts as a gilded reliquary containing the statue of the Virgin of Montserrat: 'C'est un jardin délicieux & continuel, un printems au milieu de l'hyver, qui fait à la fois & l'admiration des pelerins qui y viennent de tous les endroits de la terre, & le plus bel ornament du païs' (*Abrégé* 1723: 10).[10]

However, the *Cantigas* of Alfonso X relate a different depiction of Montserrat, one of peril and scarcity of sustenance. Although the *Cantigas* and the *Abrégé* describe the mountain in contrasting terms, both the image of the beautiful garden and the precarious, rocky summit are integral to the conceptualization of the space of pilgrimage at Montserrat. What differentiates the mountain as a vision of eternal springtime from a desolate and arid mountain is not a description of two different locations, but two distinct manners of perceiving and interacting with one environment.

---

[9] 'That beautiful mountain is like a fertile field and a source of life-giving water [...]. The superb mountain is so elevated, that from its summit, all the others surrounding it appear as one uniform place.'

[10] 'It is a charming and perpetual garden, a springtime in the middle of winter, that simultaneously causes admiration in the pilgrims and in those from all the places of the earth, and it is the most beautiful ornament of the land.'

The miracle stories of Montserrat describe that performances related to the site can be enacted by the devout and pilgrims even when not in direct physical contact or view of the mountain. The location adds to the performance, but the role of the devout pilgrim as both actor and audience means that the culmination of their performance does not rely entirely on direct contact with one physical static location or holy object. Montserrat's miracle narratives offer cures to the devout even though they are out of sight of the mountain: 'la devotion à la très-Sainte Vierge si universellement établie par tout le monde chrétien' (*Abrégé* 1723: 4).[11] As far away as France, Germany, and Italy, as long as the pious turn their focus of appreciation or intent towards Montserrat or physically situate themselves to face the direction of the mountain intercession and healing can be procured through the Virgin. Looking directly at the mountain or being in sight of the shrine while praying may result in more effectively focusing the mind of the pilgrim or bring quicker healing. However, the medieval concept of interaction with space or objects was not as rigid as the ideas of fixed spheres of sacred and profane spaces that detrimentally affect current religious and pilgrimage studies. The space in which the pilgrim interacted with Montserrat did not begin or end with the physical capacity to see the mountain or the shrine housing the Virgin statue. For example, of the four-hundred miracles listed in the *Abrégé* (1723), one of the most numerous categories of occurrences was devoted to travelers, especially those on sea voyages. The Virgin of Montserrat rescued countless shipwrecked sailors and incarcerated prisoners from their fates. No two locations of those in need were alike. What is consistent in the varying descriptions of the landscape of Montserrat and the range of locations

[11] 'the devotion to the most holy Virgin is so universally established throughout the Christian world.'

and types of miracles attributed to the Virgin is the dependence on the intent behind each visual and sensory experience to determine the nature and shape of the environment of performance. Purpose and intent are the main motivators behind a performance allowing the space to become adaptable and fluid.

According to Mircea Eliade, the difference between the natural (profane) world and the sacred which 'shows itself, as something wholly different from the profane' is one of perception and the manifestation of the sacred (1959: 11). The sacred is worshipped or becomes a site of pilgrimage because it shows itself to be different and something more than a physical object or location. A sacred stone or mountain will remain a rock or an elevated landscape until it is distinguished from another by a religious experience (Eliade 1959). 'For those who have a religious experience all nature is capable of revealing itself' as a sacred object, environment, or performance (Eliade 1959: 12). In other words, any object or space that a pilgrim engages with and perceives during the performance of pilgrimage has the potential to transform the pilgrim. The location due to its relationship with the observer (pilgrim actor) also has the ability to be transformed by the pilgrim's sensory experience into a ritual performance of pilgrimage and a sacred space if that is the intent of the actor. Sensory experiences and the environment of performance interact with the medieval pilgrim in a two-way process that determines and constructs the landscape and enactment of performance.

Performance theory states three components necessary to the creation of a performance which consist of the artist's goal or aim, a temporally definite period of enactment, and a determinate outcome. An enactable performance such as a play or pilgrimage is also created by the actors' (pilgrims') interpretations of any traditional sources (textual or oral) and their interactions with the space of performance. Medieval pilgrimage to Montserrat is a performance

that is created through a combination of each of the components outlined in performance theory. The manner in which the pilgrimage is enacted depends on the pilgrims' sensory experiences with their environments which determine and affect how they will react to a given situation during the performance. The pilgrims as the embodiement of the actors and audiences of the performances make each journey uniquely adaptable to their intents, needs, and desires. It is the impetus behind the journey that can transform a single mountain path from a route of commerce to an emultion of Christ's passion or the penance of Juan Garín. The intent behind the pilgrimage leads to a diversity of space, performances, and acts at Montserrat.

Chapter Two

The Diversity of Pilgrimage

The space of pilgrimage incorporates the entire performance, from the initial intent to engage in the endeavor, to hearing, reading, or becoming familiar with the stories of Montserrat, to setting out to, and returning from the shrine. The pilgrims engage with the landscape and the cultural and literary heritage of Montserrat without solely relying on the constructed space of the church precinct.

The lyrics and directions of Montserrat's songs, such as those accompanying 'Stella Splendens', read in conjunction with the shrine's foundation myths (the penance of Juan Garín and the Virgin apparition) and the *Cantigas de Santa Maria* propose an emphasis on the diversity and specificity of movement necessary in the performance and landscape of pilgrimage. According to Michal Kobialka's article on the staging of place and space in the eleventh century, there is a subtle difference between the concepts of place and space. Place is fixed, it is connected with order as well as exclusion and is related to the relative distribution of objects, landmarks, and structures within a specific setting (Kobialka 2000). Space is connected with mobility and an ensemble of movements. When motion is introduced into one place it becomes a space determined by the nature of movement occurring (Kobialka 2000). According to these definitions, one fixed place or setting, such as the mountain of Montserrat, becomes a different space each time the movement and actions of pilgrimage are introduced into the setting. The space of the performance of pilgrimage is constantly in flux, which is created through the actions and intents behind the pilgrim actors.

The foundation myths of Montserrat not only represent examples of performance art, but also indicate how potential pilgrim actors could interact with the space and denote the variability

of motivation behind the creation and enactment of the pilgrimages. A further analysis of the foundational texts of Montserrat provides a basis for the fluidity, adaptability, and diversity of space and intent involved in constructing the cult of Mary and individual acts of pilgrimage. The main protagonists, especially Juan Garín, and the specific sites and routes of pilgrimage within the foundation myths exemplify the variety of interpretations and reception a place of pilgrimage can offer to those who make the journey. Literary markers or mentions of specific places can also assist in the search for the corresponding physical recreation of the myths in the geographic area of Montserrat. The use of foundation myths and biblical stories to inform and construct the physical landscape, and human interactions with the holy location have a rich tradition from the onset of Christianity through the medieval period. Simon Coleman and John Elsner (1994) designate the reading of a natural landscape influenced by Christian stories the *Biblical narrative*. In their reassessment of pilgrimage or the study of Christian travel to and around the Monastery of Mount Sinaï, they plot the important sites of visitation to the mountain derived from oral and written Biblical traditions on the physical landscape. Their goal is to show how the Monastery at Sinaï embodied a form of theological or religious experience (performance) fixed in the specific space that combines art, architecture, and liturgy to define the process of pilgrimage to the site (Coleman & Elsner 1994). The locations visited and integrated into the individual's mental reconstruction of the life of Christ were tailored to their needs, motivations for travel, and specific Bible-based knowledge. In addition, Coleman and Elsner mapped the Monastery and other features within the created narrative of legends, words, and oral tradition constructed within the individual journey. The myths of Montserrat also reflect this connection between the actions and spaces portrayed in the literary sources and the practices of the pilgrimage location. Each place visited by the pilgrim manipulates the location through their

movement, intent, and sensory experience to incorporate the environment as an active participant in the performance. Biblical and hagiographic texts have the capacity to superimpose a literary presence onto the natural landscape, as well as aid in the creation and determination of the path each pilgrim or visitor chooses through the holy site. The textual tradition is just as important to understand the diversity of performance as the constructed and natural landscape of the site to the pilgrim experience. The eighteenth-century Spanish and French versions of the Virgin statue apparition at Montserrat are remarkably similar in their straightforward style. However, the Spanish accounts offer slightly more detail than the French. This addition or preference for detail occurs during the verification of the miracle through the appearance of the lights and sounds that were witnessed repeatedly on the mountain. The Spanish versions of the eighteenth century have a tripartite process of verification for the miracle. After the initial viewing of the heavenly signs by the shepherds, the event must be certified by three additional levels of society, each more influential than the last, until the Bishop of Manresa goes to the mountain to witness the miracle. In the French version, the chain of involvement in the discovery of the cave and image is drastically curtailed. According to the *Abrégé* (1723), seven Bergers (shepherds) from Monistrol saw the miracle and then told their superior, the Bishop of Manresa. The Bishop then went to the mountain and found the cave on his own.

One might consider the pamphlet-like nature of the French account as opposed to Serra y Postius' full monograph as a contributing factor as to why the *Abrégé* limits the community involvement in the discovery of the Virgin statue from three stages to one. However, Serra y Postius' earlier 1745 version of the same tale is similarly a smaller booklet-style text that nevertheless has space enough to include the tripartite discovery of the Marian statue. On the surface the tri-level verification of the original miracles that occur on Montserrat reflects

Christian numerology which gives prominence to the number three in regard to the Trinity and is also prevalent in Garín's three sins of lust, homicide, and perjury. In addition to an acknowledgement of the Trinity, the level of detail in the Spanish versions offers a place for every sector of a heavily structured society to participate within the foundation and Marian tradition at Montserrat. From youths (*mancebos*) and shepherds (*pastores*), to knights (*cavalleros*) and the clergy (*curas y obispos*), the entire population surrounding Montserrat comes together to re-discover the sacred image and process it to its permanent location on the mountain. On the other hand, the French account limits community involvement to the seven shepherds (*bergers*) and the Bishopric. The differences in social stratification that emerge when comparing the Spanish and French texts emphasize that each retelling of the Montserrat miracles and each experience of the site is a culturally informed work unique to each pilgrim's social standing and country of origin. These slight, yet important variations in the apparition stories of Montserrat reveal that the texts and interpretation of the performance of pilgrimage are adaptable and had the potential to involve all sectors of society. Additionally, the reading of performance of these legends at churches across Catalonia and abroad guaranteed a constant reinterpretation and enactment of the texts contingent on the reader, audience, and setting of each retelling. The tale of the hermit Fray Juan Garín more clearly promotes the diversity of space and sensory interactions through the variety of pilgrimage types his penance represents.

Garín's Pilgrimages

The slight differences in the Montserrat foundation myth by the French and Spanish authors indicate that a text or site of pilgrimage and its following can be spread and reinterpreted throughout Christendom. The variations within the different versions of the tales of the sins and

roaming penance of Fray Juan Garín and the apparition and rediscovery of the Virgin statue address how one written work is constantly reinterpreted through the continual interactions of the text with the receptive audience. The various incarnations of Montserrat's foundational protagonists (especially Juan Garín) provide further examples of how the movements, motivations, and interactions of the individual with the mountain landscape relate that the acts of procession and penitential wandering of the foundational myths are integral to the variety and personal adaptability of each performance of pilgrimage at Montserrat.

Depending on the version of Garín's legend, different details are expanded upon or obscured even in texts written twenty years apart. As with the apparition of Mary's statue, Serra y Postius offers more information to the reader than the French *Abrégé* as he relates the legend. However, there is a notable instance where the French text provides further descriptions that Serra y Postius omits or chooses not to include. While Serra y Postius expends more effort preparing expectations for the narrative and underlying Garín's saint-like life on the mountain of Montserrat, the *Abrégé* quickly summarizes the first third of the legend in rapid succession with minimalist details until it reaches the section about Fray Garín's penance for his sins.

Serra y Postius (1745 and 1747) details two distinct accounts of Garín's actions before he embarks on his journey to Rome and begins his penance after the murder and burial of Riquilda. In the earlier 1745 version, Garín's motivation to leave for Rome was 'para huir de las manos del Conde, que le havía de pedir cuenta adonde estaba su hija, como confesar sus pecados a los pies del Papa' (1745: 11). In his 1747 account, the Spanish author omits Garín's trip to Rome for forgiveness and describes his subsequent and presumably self-imposed penance living as a wild and naked savage on the mountain. As is the case with the 1745 version, the *Abrégé,* written in 1723, mentions Garín's trip to Rome and further details the savage nature of his seven-year

penance. Yet the reason the text provides for Garín's pilgrimage to Rome differs noticeably from Serra y Postius' account. According to the French source, God, who preserves the innocent, touched Garín's heart making him want to repent for his sins. As a result of God's intervention, Garín goes to Rome to obtain pardon and begins a penance of seven years (*Abrégé* 1723). The eighteenth-century variations of Fray Juan Garín's tale offer three possible readings of the Hermit's motivations for seeking pardon and forgiveness.

The *Abrégé de l'histoire Notre-dame du Montserrat*, which is chronologically the first account, emphasizes God's hand as the motivating force behind Garín's trip to Rome. In this version, Garín's choice is removed from the equation for his pilgrimage. Instead, the Hermit's actions and penance are directed by God and God's representative on earth, the Pope. God's direct intercession denotes the Hermit's elevated status over his fellow man, even in sin. The Hermit does not require a human intermediary until he reaches Rome and upon his return to Montserrat. Although the first stage of Garín's journey came directly from God, ultimately Garín's forgiveness along with the lifting of his penance and Riquilda's resurrection at the end of the narrative are attributed to the intercession of Mary (*Abrégé* 1723). This first account of Fray Juan Garín's penance describes a saintly man's pilgrimage from Montserrat to Rome and back culminating in a Marian miracle.

Serra y Postius' first account of Garín's journey to Rome resembles a regular man's flight from corporeal punishment for his crimes, rather than the action of a saint-like and pious hermit. As Postius states, Garín was determined to set forth for Rome in order to flee from the hands of the Count as well as confess his sins to the Pope. Garín's first motivation for leaving his hermitage came from a place of self-concern and self-preservation. His primary instinct was to run from the site of his sins, hoping to escape any negative association with his deeds by

extricating himself from the location of his fall. Of secondary importance, almost as an afterthought, is the confession of his sins as an accompanying reason to travel specifically to Rome to beg for pardon from Garín's ecclesiastical and social superior (the Pope). This version of the legend highlights a closer tie of Juan Garín to the corporeal and at times sinful world of the everyday man through its more graphic and unflattering description of the Hermit during his time of penance:

> [Garín era] tan feo, tan desmejorado y cubierto de un tan largo pelo, que de todo punto parece que havía perdido la forma de hombre y que era semejante a los brutos; pues no hablaba, no se levantaba en los pies, y estaba tan asqueroso y feo que no se veía en el rostro de razón ni entendimiento. (Serra y Postius 1745: 11)

Although each version of the tale mentions Garín's savage and beastly visage during his penance, only the 1745 account pays such attention to the description of the ugly, disgusting, and base nature of the Hermit's transformation after his fall into sin. The *Abrégé* mentions that Garín walked on his hands and feet in the manner of a beast, ate herbs, and in his sad state was comparable to a savage animal (*Abrégé* 1723). Similarly, in his 1747 version, Serra y Postius echoes the *Abrégé's* beast-like description of Garín living as a savage, but not to the almost cruel extent of his 1745 work. The above excerpt describes not only a fall into sin, but also a fall from humanity. Fray Garín becomes so far removed from his previously pious life that he no longer resembles even the basest man for he lacks both reason and understanding (Serra y Postius 1745). The Hermit-turned-wild man personifies man's primitive, violent, and lascivious impulses in his unkempt state (Boase 1989) that reflects his triple sin of deceit, fornication, and the murder of Riquilda. Essentially, Garín is no better than a non-sentient creature concerned with only the lowest needs and functions of life attending to a corporeal hunger and sense of self-preservation

or survival. The presence of God directly motivating Garín's progression is absent in this version. The Hermit's only connection to the divine is through the three-month-old child who speaks to him through God's power to lift his penance (Serra y Postius 1745). However, even this connection to God is related more to the relationship between Mary and the Hermit than his interactions with God. Garín's penance is lifted through the words of a child who mirrors the age and pose of the Christ-child held in the arms of the statue of Montserrat's Virgin (see Figure 1). The Hermit's final restoration to the man he once was comes not through God, but through the intercession of Mary the Virgin of Montserrat. This incarnation of Mary was present in Garín's return to humanity through her connection as the mother to the Christ-child mirrored by the entrance of Wilfred's wife and child within the foundation myth. Mary's presence is also stated as the reason for the resuscitation of the murdered Riquilda. If the *Abrégé* account depicts a saintly Garín's journey through temptation, sin, and redemption, Serra y Postius offers another, more earthly progression for the protagonist. The 1745 Garín is more grounded in mundane and corporeal fears than his earlier incarnation, this version is more of a common layman than a holy hermit.

The third and final eighteenth-century account of Fray Juan Garín is from 1747. This text was written by Pedro Serra y Postius and represents a middle ground between the two previous versions. In this episode, there is a noticeable lack of divine intercession of any sort until the child of Count Wilfred tells Garín to rise and that his penance is over. Until this point, there is no mention of Garín's journey to Rome. The Hermit's choice to live wild on the mountain appears to be a self-imposed penance for his actions. Any contact with God comes through the actions of the Count's child who brings the beast back to humanity. As is the case in the previous versions, the final moment of healing or redemption for Garín comes through the mercy of Mary on the

Hermit's final return to Montserrat (Serra y Postius 1747). This account stands as a middle ground between the human and divine interactions of the two earlier versions. God as a direct catalyst to Garín's actions is absent, as are the multiple enumerations of the Hermit's saintliness. Initially Garin has enough individual power that no outside or strictly ecclesiastical or divine source is needed to motivate the man's penance. However, God and Mary eventually intercede in the Hermit's life. This narrative also includes a description of the wild, naked, and ugly Garín, but not to the degree of the 1745 text. The 1747 version offers an exemplar of a third type of pilgrim which visited Montserrat. This pilgrim resided in between the ecclesiastical realm of the clergy and the less powerful and more corporeal-minded lower class and is represented by the noble class.

The 1747 text was written specifically with this third type of noble pilgrim in mind. As he states in the prologue, Serra y Postius offers his history of Montserrat to the monarch of Portugal to show how the King represents an inherited legacy of devotion to Nuestra Señora de Montserrat by his virture of being a member of the ruling class. Throughout his work, Serra y Postius connects members of the noble class to Montserrat through the constant reference to the Counts of Barcelona through their inclusion in the foundation myths. The nobility of Barcelona is present at the inception of the holy site in the form of Wilfred's involvement in the construction of the first Monastery and Church at Montserrat and the nobility's subsequent donations. In her work on the medieval versions of Montserrat's legends, Alarcón Román notes that the foundation myths of Montserrat, especially Garín's, emphasize the civil or monarchical and ecclesiastical relationship as indicated through Garín's travels: '[sus] viajes a Roma y a Barcelona dan el poder espiritual (Roma) y civil (conde de Barcelona) para fundar el monasterio' (2007: 37). The author identifies Rome and Barcelona as important locations of power and sites

necessary to the progression of Garín's physical and spiritual journeys and development. However, the major cities are separated into two almost autonomous units of society functioning within their own distinct spiritual and civil spheres. By separating Garín's pilgrimage into locations of spiritual worth (Rome) and civil laws (Barcelona), the author loses the diversity of pilgrims processing and performing at Montserrat, as well as prevents a full and integrated reading of the location. Although Alarcón Román (2007) indicates that the civil and spiritual spheres of society helped found Montserrat, she still treats the components of society (ecclesiastical and lay) as two distinguishable and segregated entities that each act in their own interests rather than existing along a constantly interacting and fluid continuum.

The three versions of Montserrat's foundation myths reflect three distinct motivations for pilgrims of different sections of society. They do not support a dichotomous study of religious traditions and sites through a sacred versus profane divide based on the segregation of spaces and ecclesiastical actors from lay members of society. Instead, they reflect the variety of those who needed, sought out, and practiced pilgrimage at Montserrat, including those from the ecclesiastical profession to those of a more low-born class and everyone in between. Although the sources mentioned in this section are eighteenth-century accounts of the medieval myths and traditions, the variation of pilgrims and their motivations are supported by the extant medieval documentation regarding activities of Montserrat's pilgrimages. The original medieval sources of the myths no longer exist. The accounts that remain are later versions of the earlier oral and pictorial traditions of the tales of Fray Juan Garín and the apparition of the Virgin statue. The various stanzas of the 'Stella Splendens' from the *Llibre Vermell* of Montserrat list those who visit the mountain as 'Principes et magnates ex stirpe regia […] religosi omni, atque presbyteri […]. Rustici, aratores […] artifices et omnes gratulantur ibi' (*Llibre Vermell* 1989: fol. 22^{v}–fol.

23[r]).[1] Each of the three pilgrim types that Juan Garín embodies in the eighteenth-century texts (the ecclesiastical, lay, and noble) are accounted for in the lyrics of the medieval source. The *Cantigas* of Alfonso X also support the presence of all social classes for a plurality of reasons on Montserrat. After being robbed enroute to Montserrat, the noble woman of *Cantiga* 57 continues her journey to the mountain with the purpose of seeking vengeance, 'Virgen Santa, Reynna, dá-me vingança, ca pris viltança en ta romeria' (Alfonso X 1981: line 54-7). The thief-pilgrim of *Cantiga* 302 originally embarks on his journey to steal from his fellow pilgrims, but by the time he reaches Montserrat he is afflicted with immobility due to his original larcenous intent which is then changed as he begs the Virgin for foregivness. Additionally, the pilgrim of *Cantiga* 311 originally begins his pilgrimage as part of an annual tradition. However, his death and resurrection by the Virgin alters his motives and his pilgrimage intent changes from one of emulation to one of praise and thanksgiving. The protagonists of the six *Cantigas* dedicated to the Virgin of Montserrat include the Benedictine monks of Montserrat, a noblewoman, a thief, and a good man (Alfonso X 1981). Not only do the medieval and eighteenth-century texts coincide with the variety of social classes present on the mountain, but the reasons for journeys to Montserrat are as diverse.

Further Examples of Pilgrimage

The apparition of the Virgin statue and Juan Garín's tale of penance indicate the extensive array of social classes involved in the foundation of Montserrat and pilgrimage to the site. These foundation narratives, especially Garín's, exemplify who processed or journeyed in

[1] 'Rulers and magnates of royal lineage [...] all types of monks and priests [...]. Peasants, ploughmen [...] and all the types of craftsmen are made to rejoice there [...].'

penance to Montserrat and provide the motivations behind varying types of pilgrimage. Before analyzing the locations and landscapes of ritual significance enumerated in the Montserrat foundation myths, this section reflects further on the variation of pilgrim motivations and types of pilgrimage present within foundational texts and examines the catalysts behind the motivations for the different pilgrim types.

The pilgrimage routes leading to Montserrat are as personally adaptable and varied as the individuals who visit the Virgin's shrine. Depending on the pilgrim's social class, nationality, and ultimate goal of pilgrimage, the route to Montserrat could vary noticeably. In order to analyze the pilgrim's personal performance and process of the creative journey, the individual motivations for the act of pilgrimage need to be addressed. The variables of performance must be considered in conjunction with any culturally and biblically historical traditions the actions reflect or emulate. The legend of the hermit-monk Juan Garín reflects the range of classes involved in pilgrimage including the clergy, the aristocracy, and the common lay member of society. In addition, the foundation myths illustrate at least three stock types of pilgrimages which resonate with the actual physical practices of pilgrimage that occurred at Montserrat during the Middle Ages.

The three stock types of pilgrimage in the tale of Juan Garín are categorized according to the primary motivation behind each journey. The main types of pilgrimage are labeled as follows: *curative*, *intermediary*, and *emulative* with each identifiable according to their main thematic features. The second *intermediary* category can be broken down further. Furthermore, subcategories could theoretically be added to each category adaptable to the specific site, culture, and time period of pilgrimage. The terms used as designations of pilgrimage types are to help the reader distinguish and identify different motivations behind individual instances of performance.

This should not be considered an exhaustive list, but rather a rhetoric tool to help organize the information presented.

The first type of pilgrimage prevalent in Fray Garín's narrative is the *curative*. The motivation behind this type of journey is to seek healing aid either for the self or for a member of the family. The miracles and supplicatory acts listed in the eighteenth-century Spanish and French sources of Montserrat identify that the pilgrims who acted on behalf of a family member tended to be husbands and fathers appealing to the Virgin for their wives and children (*Abrégé* 1723). However, the compiled sixteenth-century miracles also detail that women maintained a prominent role when appealing to the Virgin. The effects of the pilgrimage were not only conferred upon those who made the physical journey. A pilgrimage committed on behalf of another was considered a valid endeavor and performance. Numerous miracle tales in the histories of Serra y Postius and the *Abrégé* tell of pilgrimages undertaken by husbands on behalf of pregnant or ailing wives. Once the husband reached Montserrat or even if he merely turned to pray towards the mountain from afar on behalf of his wife, curative benefits found their way to the intended patient.

Although this thesis focuses on the longer, physical progression and procession through space such as occurs during the journey of pilgrimage, a performance of pilgrimage does not necessarily need to entail dozens or hundreds of kilometers of walking. A pilgrimage, as evident in many of the miracle tales attributed to the Virgin of Montserrat, can take as little effort as positioning the body towards a specific location and praying with a fervent and devout heart, because even looking or focusing on Montserrat from a distance has the potential to physically affect the supplicant. According to Serra y Postius' history, numerous local pilgrimages took place annually by the communities surrounding the mountain of Montserrat that were within a

day's or less walking distance from the mountain. However, in the instance of the *curative* pilgrimage at the beginning of Garín's tale, the journey for remedy does consist of a substantial walk of about fifty to sixty kilometers by modern measurements from Count Wilfred's home in Barcelona to Garín's cave on Montserrat.

Of the two demons sent from Hell to tempt Garín to sin, one was sent away from Montserrat to Barcelona in order to possess the daughter of Count Wilfred of Barcelona. After exhausting all other avenues, the Count along with his entourage take his daughter Riquilda to Garín to be cured. The Count's efforts to find a cure for his daughter caused him to undertake a journey to a specific and distant location in order to interact and communicate with a known saintly figure, Fray Juan Garín. Alarcón Román (2007) supports the curative nature of Garín's role within the initial stage of the narrative by investigating possible roots of the Hermit's name and their association with medieval medical practices. According to the author, Garín comes from the Latin term, *garum,* which alludes to the making of a poultice of fish entrails to cure a variety of ailments including possession (Alarcón Román 2007). Traditionally established aid from local physicians and clergy could not help the Count's daughter. As a result of the failure of scientific human aid, Wilfred sought out a renowned and isolated hermit who lived on the edge of society, yet was never completely separated from its influences:

> El conde se informó de quien era aquel hermitaño, y teniendo muy grande relación de él, él mismo en persona le fue a visitar a la hermita, llevando consigo a su hija, y muchos criados que los acompañavan. (Serra y Postius 1747: 53)

The Count's journey to Montserrat to interact with the well-known Hermit Garín mirrors the activity of pilgrim's seeking aid from the Virgin of Montserrat. The Count's actions also indicate and reflect additional objects and sites of veneration available to the pilgrims of Montserrat.

The tradition of visiting the hermits living on the holy mountain continued and grew sufficiently from the site's inception through the centuries to merit mention in Serra y Postius' eighteenth-century text. Pedro Serra y Postius (1747) states that the first port of call for knights, nobility, and other pilgrims visiting Montserrat was the Monastery and the Church that housed the image of the Virgin. After seeing the Virgin, the pilgrims made sure to visit the hermits who brought to life the memory of the Disciples, Church, and Heaven with their style of living (Serra y Postius 1747). The hermits of Montserrat were held in such high regard that their simple, pious, and extremely ascetic way of life was equated with past pillars of the Christian Church such as Christ's disciples and the original desert ascetics of late antiquity, who, upon their deaths often ascended directly to Heaven. The hermitages of Montserrat will be discussed further in the following chapter regarding the physical locations, sites, and activities of pilgrimage that are identifiable from Montserrat's foundation legends and histories. Pertinent to the current discussion is not that the Count's journey from Barcelona to Montserrat reveals a motivation for physical and spiritual healing that could only be found on the mountain, but that his visitation to the hermitage at Montserrat was not just a literary construct of Garín's narrative. The figure of the noble pilgrim venturing to Montserrat to seek an audience with a hermit and obtain the healing aspects of the mountain was a component to the actual process enacted on the physical landscape of pilgrimage at the sanctuary of Montserrat.

The second pilgrimage type related in the tale of Juan Garín's penance is the *intermediary*. The *intermediary* or *intercessory* category tends to accompany or blend with the *curative* and *emulative* pilgrimages. For example, when Count Wilfred travels to Garín's cave seeking a remedy for his daughter, he not only desires the healing powers found on the mountain, but also the intercessory abilities of a religious figure deemed to have a more direct connection to

God than the common lay person. In this instance, the intermediary figure positioned between those ailing in the physical world and the healing or restorative powers of the heavenly realm is the Hermit Juan Garín. Throughout Garín's tale different individuals become the required intermediary for healing, restoration, and the lifting of burdens once the Hermit falls from his idealized and saintly status.

During Garín's journey to Rome, before his penance, the Hermit seeks solace and forgiveness from Gods' representative on earth (the Pope). The Pope becomes the catalyst or the intercessory figure that resituates Garín onto the path of salvation and God. However, the trip to Rome is not enough for Garín's sins to be forgiven. The Hermit must return to his home on the mountain and 'anduviese con las manos por la tierra como bestia, hasta que por Dios le fuese relevado que ya le tenía perdonadas sus culpas' (Serra y Postius 1745: 11). Garín's wanderings end after the Hermit is taken from the mountain and brought to Barcelona. In Garín's second, forcibly induced pilgrimage, the Hermit's penance terminates as the Pope foresaw. As a result of the intercession of God working through the body of a human child, Garín is forgiven, permitted to rise from all fours, and sheds his beastly visage. The *intermediary* or *intercessory* mode of pilgrimage emphasizes as its main components a physical journey (of many leagues or a few steps) as well as a necessary third-party figure who enters the narrative to intercede or interfere in the pilgrim's performance. This combination of journeying to a specific location with a determined purpose, along with the appearance and necessity of an outside and intercessory force becomes more apparent in the third instance of *intermediary* pilgrimage at the end of Garín's tale.

Once Garín's penance is lifted and the Hermit confesses his sins to Count Wilfred, Garín and the Count plan to return to Montserrat. In this final stage of Garín's return to Montserrat as a

holy man there is a noticeable physical progression involved from Barcelona to the mountain. The journey serves as a necessary component to accomplish the Count's desired performance of returning to the mountain to collect the body of his daughter for a proper burial. However, Wilfred does not have a single location in mind for the pilgrimage, but two. Before reaching the cave, Wilfred entreats Garín to guide him to 'la Imagen de Nuestra Señora, que pocos días antes se halló en aquella montaña, para quien estaba edificada una hermita' (Serra y Postius 1747: 59). The Count insists on stopping at the newly constructed chapel and hermitage dedicated to the Virgin of Montserrat before processing to his final goal of the cave and recovering his daughter's body. This brief stopover at the new mountain-shrine introduces the final and arguably most influential intercessor in the pilgrimage of Garín and the Count. By stopping and praying at the Virgin's shrine, her (Mary's) intercessory and restorative influence is introduced into the narrative, journey, and performance. The influence of the Virgin of Montserrat is necessary to establish for the continuity of the miracle account, since once the pilgrims reach the cave, the Count's daughter Riquilda is discovered to be alive by the mercy of the Virgin (Serra y Postius 1747). At the end of Garín's tale, the Virgin Mary who is the figure of humanity's ultimate intermediary with God intervenes to restore Riquilda and Garín's lives as well as the Count's family.

In the above discussion, *intermediary* pilgrimage was analyzed in relation to the figure of a spiritual intermediary, such as the Virgin who engaged with the penitent/supplicant at the ultimate goal or end location of pilgrimage. These intermediaries or intercessory figures arose at the end of certain stages of Garín's various pilgrimages, such as the Pope in Rome (at the end of Garín's rational human existence) or the infant child in Barcelona (occurring when the Hermit's bestial lifestyle is terminated). However, in regard to Montserrat, the *intermediary* pilgrimage

also reflects the sanctuary's physical position as a stopping point on the way to the shrine of Saint James at Santiago de Compostela. The image and the Church of the Virgin of Montserrat are not only the ultimate goals of pilgrimage to the mountain. The mountain location and all of its holy items also act as an intermediary stop to the more distant location of Compostela. The chapel to the Virgin visited by the Count in Garín's legend reflects as this prerequisite location that comes before the pilgrim's ultimate goal.

The tale of Juan Garín has distinct stages in the narrative plot, such as the demons preparing him to fall, the fall into sin, penance, and forgiveness which culminate in the final miraculous restoration of Count Wilfred's daughter Riquilda. Each stage or plot point in the legend must come together in a proscribed order to legitimize the progression of events. The intermediary figures introduce interactions into the Hermit's solitary life to ensure that Garín traveled enough, physically and spiritually, to recognize and deserve the miracle at the end of his journey. Garín's search for redemption is physically enacted upon the narrative landscape. The Hermit must travel and stop at various intermediary destinations such as Rome and Barcelona before he is ready to return to his formerly saintly life located on the mountain of Montserrat.

Montserrat and other such churches and shrines located on the Camino de Santiago in medieval Catalonia acted as the necessary and personally adaptable stages or plot points in the individual lives of the pilgrims. Emulative of Garín's journey, the visitor to Montserrat may not have had a straightforward or linear plan in mind when seeking the target of remedy, intercession, or emulation during pilgrimage. Montserrat acted as the main or ultimate goal of pilgrims, especially those local to Catalonia. However, the mountain shrine could just as often be used as an intermediary and necessary stage of preparation for reaching Santiago de Compostela. The act of pilgrimage becomes a personal performance embedded in the participant's past and

current needs, as well as a performance dependent on the socio-historical and cultural memories and traditions linked with the site of pilgrimage.

The third type of pilgrimage, *emulative*, also depicts a tradition of historical and geographical awareness on the part of the pilgrim. The *emulative* pilgrimage refers to the journeys that emulate, reflect, or take the place of pilgrimages to other established and generally more distant sites of pilgrimage. Within the Montserrat foundation myths, pilgrimages to Rome and Jerusalem are recalled through the actions of the protagonist Fray Juan Garín. The Hermit's pilgrimage to Rome is evident on a preliminary reading of the text. Two out of the three eighteenth-century accounts previously discussed cite that after Garín's sins and the murder of Riquilda, he flees from his home on Montserrat and goes to Rome to beg forgiveness and guidance from his ecclesiastical superior (the Pope). Garín's pilgrimage to Rome to seek advice and intercession on his behalf can also be categorized as an *intermediary* pilgrimage. In fact, the *intermediary* denomination may be more accurate in this case, since Garín physically travels to Rome instead of enacting a more local and shorter pilgrimage as an allegory for the longer journey. Although the journey to Rome is more *intermediary* than *emulative*, it initiates a connection in the narrative between Montserrat and other locations of pilgrimage within the wider Christian community. Garín's initial pilgrimage to Rome establishes the ties of pilgrimage to Montserrat with the greater tradition of Christian ritual travel through overt mentions of Rome as a finite geographic location and its designation as the more symbolic site of the Pope's See of power.

When Garín finally takes Count Wilfred to Riquilda's tomb on Montserrat, the overt mention of the Roman pilgrimage becomes replaced by emulative references to the original location of pilgrimage in Christendom, the holy city of Jerusalem: 'pusiéronse en camino, y

llegando donde hizo assiento Nuestra Señora, la dieron la obedencia, y en haziendo oración, guió Fr. Juan Guarín al conde al lugar donde estaba enterrada su hija' (Serra y Postius 1747: 59). Garín and the Count's return to Montserrat enumerates two details that link their actions to earlier pilgrimages to Jerusalem. The first detail is the notation of Fray Garín acting as a guide to the Count. Throughout the legend, Wilfred the Hairy of Barcelona never visits Montserrat without the aid of a guide directing his actions, whether it is his servants bringing him to Garín's cave for the first time or Fray Garín leading the Count to the cave that served as Riquilda's tomb. Garín's role as an ecclesiastical adjacent guide to Wilfred recalls the early pilgrimage of Egeria to Palestine where 'the priests and monks who tended the sacred sites were the pilgrims' guides and interpreters. They provided not only knowledge but also liturgy' (Coleman & Elsner 1995: 89). Garín's aid in rediscovering and guiding a witness (Wilfred) to the site on Montserrat culminates in the ultimate emulation of Jerusalem. Once they arrive at the cave and uncover the form of Riquilda from under her impromptu burial site, the girl is resurrected evoking the image of Christ after his crucifixion. Pilgrimage and performance interact with the physical landscape and literary traditions of Montserrat to emulate sites of suffering and resurrection important to the history of Christianity such as Rome and Jerusalem.

The foundation legends of Montserrat exemplify the diversity of intents behind pilgrimage as well as portray a performance and journey that has the potential to be enacted by the ecclesiastical and lay members of society. The myths also indicate that the mountain environment is a key space in the creation of pilgrimage. However, the narratives only loosely hint at the paths of pilgrimage leading to Montserrat that are also intergral locations to the process of the entire performance.

The Medieval Pilgrimage Routes

The movement through the Catalonian natural landscape described in the eighteenth-century histories, the sixteenth-century miracles, and the *Cantigas* of Alfonso X denotes that the place of worship to the Virgin of Montserrat is not limited to a circumambulatory pilgrimage route through the architecture directly surrounding the Virgin statue. Pilgrimage and a directed contemplation of the Virgin first begin in the minds of the pilgrims who focus their intent on the journey ahead. The performance of pilgrimage initiates as soon as the actor takes the first step towards the shrine with the intent of making the journey. The shrine itself should be understood as the climax of the performance and not the finale. As the documentation of privileges supported by King James I of Aragon (1208-76) details, the lay sector of society understood the complete performance of pilgrimage as the journey to and the return home from Montserrat. In 1271 King James I conferred protection on Montserrat and its pilgrims for the duration of their performance:

> El rey Dn. Jayme de Aragon recibió baxo su custodia, amparo, protección y guidatico a todas las personas que por causa de peregrinación vinieron a visitar la iglesia de Montserrat, desde que salieron de sus casas hasta haver vuelto a ellas; y que ninguno se atreva a los tales peregrinos molestarlos ni inquietarlos, iendo, estando o volviendo de visitar la iglesia de Montserrat, a no ser que haya cometido en esta ocasión algún delito. Lo que manda observar y guardar a todas sus justicias y alcaldes. (Benet Ribas i Calaf 1997: 141)

The protections of the pilgrims of Montserrat were reconfirmed in 1298 and 1303, and did not end with James I. Patronage of the pilgrimage site was taken up by James' son Peter III (1239-

85) and was continually renewed by the kings of the region from James II (1267-1327) in the 1300s to the last reaffirmation by Ferdinand VI (1713-59) in 1751 (Altes i Aguilo 2008).

The wording of the protections granted to Montserrat by King James I emphasizes that the shrine has explicit ties with the local ruling nobility. The history of Montserrat exhorts the reader to follow in the noble tradition of the Catalonian royalty. As patrons and protectors of the mountain site, the royal family received into its purview of protection the pilgrims journeying to and from Montserrat and the actual defense of the Monastery itself (see Ribas i Calaf 1997: 133 and 141). The royal proclamation ensuring the pilgrims' security during their entire journey supports the songs and texts performed at the Church of Montserrat that recognized the need to keep pilgrims focused on their goals and prayers to the Virgin not only within the walls of the Monastery, but also further abroad. The use of the gerund form of the verbs *ir*, *estar*, and *volver* in James' declaration stating pilgrims should not be harmed or disturbed 'iendo, estando o volviendo de visitar la iglesia de Montserrat' (Ribas i Calaf 1997: 141), adds to the fluidity of the landscape and activities involved while pilgrims are engaged in their performances. A finite verb form such as the preterit indicating a specific beginning and ending to an action is not used to describe pilgrimage. This reveals an awareness on the part of the more secular authority that the benefits and blessings conferred on the pilgrim visiting Montserrat do not begin and end at the shrine door. Instead, as is the case with the living tradition of protecting the pilgrims and shrines passed down by the generations of Catalonian royalty, the experience of the pilgrim's performance continues to exert an influence on the pilgrim's life even when the physical journey comes to an end. This acknowledgement of the two-way nature of pilgrimage expands the space involved in the performance of the ritual. The discussion of pilgrim art as performance should

not be limited to the participant's direct contact with the shrine, but also include the wider landscape and space leading to and from the shrine.

There were four principle medieval pilgrimage routes used during the twelfth and thirteenth centuries through the northeastern Iberian Peninsula that lead to Montserrat. These points of entry included two land routes through the Pirenees, one of which passed through Perpignan and Elna and offered multiple churches dedicated to Saint James to visit on the way to Montserrat. The other French route went through the Pass of Portus to join with the old Roman road, the Via Augusta which ended in Barcelona (Ferrer Mallol 2003). The two maritime ports, usually carrying pilgrims from France or Italy, included the Ports of Barcelona and Tarragona. Each method of entering Catalonia for pilgrimage to Montserrat and Santiago de Compostela offered a variety of possible routes with an individually determinable combination of relics and churches to visit on the way. For example, the Pirenees routes that passed through Perpignan diverged into two main choices for the pilgrimage that interconnected in certain key locations before meeting in Lleida and continuing to Barcelona. The two options were the Interior road and the Marian route. The Interior road began in France at Font-Romeu which had Marian and Jacobean significance (Martín Ansón 2003). The church-basilica of Sant Jaume de Rigolisa with its image of James (destroyed in the twentieth century) was a first possible stop on the route that also passed by the church of Santa Maria de Ripoll with the remains of Saint Palladius (sixth century), the church of Seo de Urgel with its relics of Saint Ermengol (Bishop of Urgell 1010-35), and the monastery of Sant Cugat where its namesake was martyred (d. 304) (Martín Ansón 2003).

The Marian route was a more coastal passage that went from Perpignan to the Girona cathedral dedicated to the Virgin Mary and contained the bodies of the Saint martyrs such as

Germanus (d. 305), Paulinus (first century), and Justus (third to fourth century). After Girona, Sant Cugat was also accessible to the pilgrim on the Marian route before arriving in Barcelona. For those landing directly in the ports of Barcelona or Tarragona, Catalonia, especially the City of Barcelona offered the opportunity to engage in further preparatory pilgrimages to saints' shrines and relics before journeying to Montserrat. Barcelona was the confluence of various diverse pilgrimage routes through Catalonia in the twelfth century. The city provided the pilgrims with the chance to visit the relics of Saints Severus (third to fourth century), Olegarius (1060-1137), and Eulalia of Barcelona (d. 304) who was the object of pilgrimage in her own right (Martín Ansón 2003). The churches of Santa Maria del Mar and Santo Domingo de la Calzada were furher locations where pilgrims could pray and ready themselves for the journey to Montserrat. The visual and tactile interactions with the shrines served the needs of the pilgrims in preparing them for their pilgrimage to Montserrat. For example, in the Cathedral of Barcelona, pilgrims could visit the relics of two of the patrons of Barcelona (Severus and Eulalia) and pray for their protection as they passed through their lands during the dangerous journeys.

The medieval landscape of pilgrimage to Montserrat could include isolated mountain passes, maritime voyages, local shrines, larger pilgrimage churches, and city cathedrals all before the pilgrim engaged in the final ascent up the mountain of Montserrat which also had its own variety depending if one approached the mountain from Collbató or Monistrol. While the mountain of Montserrat is a necessary space of interaction within pilgrimage to Montserrat, the process of pilgrimage has a much wider scope than one mountain site. The performance encompasses all of the preparation and diversity of routes and objects the pilgrim interacts with along the way. Each landscape, relic, church, person, city, or object the pilgrim engages with affects them uniquely and molds their reception and interpretation of the performance. The

variety of landscape was not the only way in which pilgrimage diversity was constructed. Images, signs, and objects touched, held, carried, and worn during pilgrimage also affected and contributed to the diversity of performance and the pilgrim's interaction with landscape.

The Objects of Pilgrimage

The manner in which pilgrims continue to feel a tangible connection to their performances, past and ongoing, and integrate further variety into their actions does not solely rely on an expansion of the space of performance to include their homes, patriarchal provinces, and the entire route of the journey. The costumes and objects used and engaged with during pilgrimage also act as a method of extending the influence and effects of the journey. However, one of the qualifiers denoting that a performance has occurred is an acknowledgement of the work's temporal limitations. Even if the setting of performance is elongated to include the movements to and from the shrine, once the pilgrim returns home, the pilgrimage and the actions of the journey end which should terminate the engaged nature of the performance. Although a time limit is crucial to the definition of creating performance art, the objects that have completed the journey do not become inanimate items that can no longer affect the pilgrim and extend the performance. As Fischer-Lichte warns when discussing the space and event of performance from contemporary plays to ancient dramas 'the materiality of the performance cannot exist beyond its duration, its spatiality, corporeality, and tonality are brought forth in the course of performance' (2013: 31). In other words, each performance or play exists for its specific time duration and can never be repeated in exactly the same way again. The enactment of the work is a transitory experience not meant to be a permanent state of being:

> However, this does not mean that material objects cannot be used […] such objects remain as traces of the performance and can be preserved. While the focus shifts to the object itself once it is exhibited […] during a performance the attention is primarily directed at the use made of the object-what actions were performed when an object was manipulated, how did a costume give shape to the body and the way it looked and moved, and what effect this had. (Fischer-Lichte 2013: 13)

The specific clothing worn and objects utilized or accumulated during the enactment of pilgrimage become part of the performance. As a result of their identity being formed from their roles as objects and actions they have the capacity to be preserved indefinitely unlike the journey of the pilgrims. However, once the performance is over, the object will not retain the same active and participatory role as when it was directly involved in the performance. It becomes more akin to a script of a play or the legendary texts of Montserrat existing on its own. In order for the object to be brought to life and become involved in a performance piece, a new production or procession must be initiated by human action. The changing of the objects' roles should not downgrade the importance of such tools. The items accumulated during pilgrimage can serve as tokens to induce memory or become concentrators of focus such as the candles in the Montserrat miracle tales. The physical movement may no longer be an aspect of the object. However, it can still help to aid and hone the religious experience and focus to create a new, shorter performance distinct from the original.

With regard to the performance of pilgrimage to and from Montserrat, a variety of objects and clothing aid the pilgrims in completing their performances. Items such as candles appear in different forms within the process of veneration at Montserrat. The *Abrégé* notes that '[at Montserrat] On y distribuë des chandelles sur lesquelles l'Image de la sacrée Vierge est

empreinte, i dont les merites pour les femmes en travail les ont renduës recommandables par toute la terra' (1723: 14).[7] The same source later relates the miracle of a man who lights a candle of the Virgin of Montserrat, holds it in his hands, and invokes the Virgin. As a result of the intervention of the Virgin initiated by the candle, the man's wife residing in the Diocese of Rodez in France immediately gives birth after being in labor for eight days (*Abrégé* 1723). In the first example above, the use and distribution of candles at Montserrat represent types of souvenirs to be kept as reminders of the trip to the mountain, rather than being actively utilized during the performance of pilgrimage. This does not mean that such souvenirs or reminders cannot become involved in a later performance, as demonstrated by the candle's utilization in France during the prayers of a husband for his pregnant wife.

Candles, especially of the large slow-burning variety also play a role during the performance of pilgrimage to Montserrat. The candles were a large part of local community-wide pilgrimages to Montserrat during specific days of the Easter liturgical season. Each community surrounding the site had a specified day when the entire town processed to the mountain shrine. The sectors of the community involved in the pilgrimage included priests, other members of the Church, and the people of the *pueblos*. The members of these towns and villages entered Montserrat with '[una] cruz alta, y pendones tendidos con buena orden, y devota compostura, llevando algunas antorchas, y todos los demás cirios encendidos en las manos; cantando las litanías de la Virgen' (Serra y Postius 1747: 100). In addition to the personal candles and torches carried by the pilgrims, each community offered their own large slow-burning candle to the

[7] 'They have and distribute candles on which the image of the sacred Virgin is printed, and whose merits for women in labor have made them credible throughout the land.'

Virgin ‘para que ardiesse en todas sus festividades’ (Serra y Postius 1747: 100). Each community’s candle had ‘un rotulo en pergamino de letra grande, que nombrava la villa, o el lugar cuyas eran’ (Serra y Postius 1747: 100). In order to burn throughout the celebrations and be an active participant in the performance this necessitated that the candles were of an immense stature. Serra y Postius (1747) notes that the smallest weighed around ten quintales which is the equivalent of about 2,204 pounds or 1,102 kilograms. Once these candles were processed from their town of origin, they were place in the Old Church of Montserrat to burn throughout the year. Even when the New Church was built to house the Virgin statue in 1560, the tradition of bringing and lighting the candles continued. This practice did not fall from favor until 1669 when Don John of Austria (1629-79) gilded the inside of the New Church and did not want the smoke from the candles to obscure the gold (Serra y Postius 1747).

During the community’s performance of pilgrimage, the candles acted as props or involved participants in the creation of the artwork. The candles, as is the case with the Virgin statue carried in the apparition legend, had a presence and weight that directly affected those processing and carrying them up the mountain to the shrine. Once the objects were deposited in the Church, they took on a different meaning as the performance of those who brought them to the mountain ended. The candle remained at the shrine to be lit daily while the pilgrim actors returned home. Yet the candle’s continued presence allowed a remnant of the original performance to remain. Perhaps more importantly for the community was that a constant presence stayed at Montserrat representing their interests. Even if the *pueblo* could not permanently reside on Montserrat in a constant state of performance, a candle identifying its people was able to remain in the shrine constantly interacting with the Virgin until a year passed

and the community brought a new candle to replace the old one and reaffirm their connection to the mountain.

There are additional objects involved in the pilgrimage of Montserrat that will be highlighted briefly. These items are more portable than the large candles and are a part of the performance that can be brought home by the pilgrims, extending the space, memory, and action of veneration well beyond the public shrine of Montserrat.

Crosses, torches, and different styles of dress accompanied pilgrims during their performances. While the *pueblo*-wide processions utilized a 'cruz alta,' the individual pilgrims tended to receive smaller scale crosses while at Montserrat from the hermits who lived on the mountain (Serra y Postius 1747: 100). Although they did not share the same duties as their Benedictine brothers, the Montserrat hermits were connected to the Monastery while still retaining a certain level of autonomy. In fact, the latest date ascribed to the Monastery exerting influence over the hermits posits it as late as 1333 (Alarcón Román 2007). These hermit-monks emulated the ascetic life of Fray Juan Garín:

> distribuyen el tiempo, que de los ejercicios santos les queda, en trabajar cruzes comunmente pequeñas, para dar a los peregrinos, y devotos, que suben a visitar las hermitas, los quales son apreciadas por todo el orbe christiano, por las grandes indulgencias, a ellas han concedido los sumos pontifices. (Serra y Postius 1747: 468)

A variety of other objects could be obtained at the sanctuary or carried the entire journey by penitential pilgrims. Some bore lit candles or torches, others heavy crosses of wood, and some carried bars of iron in their arms (Serra y Postius 1747). Not only did the pilgrims equip themselves with such objects to emulate the sufferings of Christ, but many came barefoot and others came 'con las rodillas desnudas por las agudas piedras, las quales dexan bañadas de

sangre' (Serra y Postius 1747: 471). The diverse array of objects, clothing, and approaches to Montserrat are depicted in the below miniatures from the *Llibre Vermell*.

Figure 6. *Llibre Vermell* fol. 30^{r}, Miniature of the Virgin of Montserrat.

Figure 7. *Llibre Vermell* fol. 30^{r}, Examples of the ecclesiastical pilgrims.

Figure 8. *Llibre Vermell* fol. 30^{r}, Examples of the variety of pilgrims to Montserrat.

In the above depictions, the Virgin Mary and the Christ Child are venerated by a wide variety of pilgrims, men and women, lay and ecclesiastical. No two devotees are the same. The supplicatory figures each have their own unique method of approaching the Virgin carrying rosaries or books. They also have individual manners of dress from clad feet, to ecclesiastical garb, or little clothing at all. Three of the pilgrims, the woman with the rosary, the barefoot blue-caped man, and the man with the red cap and black belt also carry staffs reminiscent of the image of Juan Garín embarking on his pilgrimage to Rome after he murders Riquilda.

Figure 9: Print of Juan Garín's pilgrimage to Rome from Mathieu Olivier's (1617) history of Montserrat.

The staff, along with the wide-brimmed traveller's hat, and conch shell can be associated with pilgrimage in general, but also have a strong connotation to Santiago de Compostela. The pilgrims displayed in homage to the Virgin of Montserrat are extremely diverse including members of the laity and mendicant orders (men and women) and those who appear healthy and others with a clear ailment such as the man with the eyepatch to the far right of the Virgin in Figures 6 and 8. The additions of the staffs, which are a common sign of pilgrimage, and the pilgrim holding a book and pointing to the Virgin indicate the renown of the Virgin of Montserrat which is carried beyond Catalonia through textual traditions and word of mouth by pilgrims headed to Compostela and other sites. Not one of the pilgrims approaching the Virgin of Montserrat is dressed in an identical manner or bears the same combination of items. These images highlight the individual nature of each pilgrim experience as the actors approach the Virgin and engage in the art of their performances determined by their own individual needs, not according to some prescribed ideal of a single, unified group of pilgrims engaging in identical actions for the same determinant outcome. Even the community-wide pilgrimages that processed to Montserrat together differed in their clothing and dress from one another. The local processions to Montserrat took place during the time surrounding the Easter season of the Church calendar. For example, on the second day of Easter 'subían a Montserrat en procesión los de la Villa de Piera y los del lugar de la Granada' (Serra y Postius 1747: 99). The members of the contingency from Granada dressed as pilgrims (possibly carrying staffs as an indication of their engagement in pilgrimage) and those from Piera had their own unique traditions. From April to the end of September the communities around Montserrat performed their pilgrimages according to the tradition, expectations, and desires of each.

The pilgrims physically climb and process around the Monastery, shrine, and the numerous hermitages located on the mountain according to their individual desires. Through the pilgrims' movements, choices, their individual objects, and interactions with further actors and the landscape, the pilgrimage becomes a full-scale play or performance. Moving through the architectural and natural landscape at Montserrat transforms the pilgrim and environment. Their interactions are the active and engaged parts of the performance that recreate, interpret, and witness the founding legends of the Monastery. The objects and clothing the pilgrims acquire during their performances continue to connect the individual with the location and its unique history. Through the constant repetition of a set script of the widely-known foundation myths of Montserrat, the pilgrims can enact their own specifically constructed performances derived from a common textual heritage. The individual's journey acts as a new reinterpretation of the familiar stories with each performance dependent on its own set of actors, props, motivations, and costumes. The use of objects or props during and after the performance enables the pilgrimage to become a living entity that continues to affect the pilgrim even once they have left the shrine and returned home. The other pilgrims, landscape, and objects engaged with in the performance of pilgrimage to Montserrat exemplify the diversity of the journey. The Virgin of Montserrat is another component that exhibits a variety of natures throughout the discussions of the legendary texts and images associated with the site. The variability of the Virgin's representation must be addressed to determine Mary's role in the performance of pilgrimage.

Mary: Protagonist, Landscape, or Object of Veneration?

The images of the Virgin of Montserrat depict Mary enthroned with the Christ Child on the mountain. As Alarcón Román (2008) details, the image of the Virgin in connection with the

mountain remain constant in the various *Cantigas*, legends, and images associated with Montserrat. However, the variety of the description of the Virgin, as an image, mountain, statue, and divine intervener, confuses the issue of what Mary's role within the performance of pilgrimage entails. The physical object of the Virgin's statue within the foundation legend of Montserrat acts as a tangible weight which affects the manner of procession enacted by those carrying Mary's image. However, as Lesley K. Twomey comments in her monograph regarding the interactions and representations of the Virgin as sacred space 'the statue [within the apparition myth] not only represents the Virgin, because it is an image of her, but, because of being her likeness, it is her' (2019: 302). As is the case with the candles, crosses, and other objects used during pilgrimage, the Virgin's statue or image can be involved during the performance. However, the nature of the statue as an image of Mary additionally necessitates acknowledgement of her divine presence. In Twomey's work, she discusses a number of the *Cantigas de Santa Maria* of Alfonso X that describe different statues of the Virgin acting to protect a specific castle in which it was located from an invasion of Islamic forces. The territory which the statue occupied, the castle or chapel, becomes Mary's land to protect. When she is invoked by her supplicants, the statue of the Virgin exerts its influence to protect her loyal Christian vassals and the image and the Virgin herself from desecration (Twomey 2019: 302-10). In the case of the castle, Mary's presence sanctifies the immediate location and turns the land into holdings under her protection. Where Twomey argues that the location of the statue allowed the Virgin to protect a castle by imbuing it with her presence, this thesis expands the influence of the statue and Mary beyond one architectural structure.

Before the Virgin of Montserrat was rediscovered, the statue remained entombed in a cave for over a century in order to protect the image from desecration during the Islamic invasion

in the eighth century. During the time in which the statue was buried, the earth around it encompassing the entire physical mountain of Montserrat was the Virgin's domain. The mountain was imbued with the Virgin's protective power to keep her image safe. After the image is unearthed, the statue (the Virgin Mary) exerts her influence to remain on the mountain. By forcing the community and clergy members of Monistrol and Manresa to build a chapel on Montserrat to house the image, Mary claims the entire mountain as her holding. The statue of the Virgin housed in the Church of Montserrat is an object with which the pilgrims can interact with physically through visual and tactile means. The object can affect the pilgrim in this manner. However, the statue is not the only method through which Mary can exert her influence. The entire mountain of Montserrat also is synonymous with the Virgin's likeness and her divine presence. The mountain and Mary are the same body and engaging with and climbing the mountain with the intent of performing a pilgrimage activates the sensory perception necessary to construct a potentially sacred space and interaction with Mary's divine presence which encompasses all of Montserrat.

The Virgin as the statue and mountain is further supported by the images of the Virgin of Montserrat depicted in the *Llibre Vermell* and the emphasis of the physical nature of the mountain in Alfonso X's *Cantigas.* In the images of pilgrimage in the *Llibre Vermell*, Mary and the Christ Child are in the foreground of the scene. Mary is surrounded by the variety of pilgrims each performing and interacting with her in a unique manner with slight differences in posture, clothing, and objects carried. This scene occurs in a natural setting where she is surrounded by foliage and has an ample backdrop of flowering trees. The focus of the image is the interaction with the Virgin that occurs outside of the church structure which remains empty with a darkened interior to her left. At Montserrat, Mary's presence is neither contained by the physical

architecture of the church nor the wooden image of her statue. The *Cantigas* of Alfonso X also emphasize the mountain of Montserrat as imbued with Mary's presence and under her protection rather than depicting the Virgin acting through her statue.

Cantigas 48, 52, and 113 describe the manner in which the Virgin physically alters and manipulates the course of nature on the mountain of Montserrat to protect the Benedictine community from thirst (*Cantiga* 48), hunger (*Cantiga* 52), and death (*Cantiga* 113). The Virgin imposes her influence to relocate a fountain to inside the grounds of the monastery to prevent the monks from paying rent for its use, she also sends wild goats down from the mountain to the Church to be milked daily, and stops a boulder from rolling down the mountain and crushing the Monastery. In these *Cantigas*, the statue is not mentioned. Instead, what is emphasized is the sustaining and mothering nature of the entire mountain (as Mary) that acts to ensure that those devoted to her are provided with water to grow their food, shelter from the elements, and nourishing milk. In Alfonso's *Cantigas*, the entire mountain is Mary's province over which she exercises her motherly protection to sustain and heal those who call on her and punish those who abuse her mountain such as the thieves in *Cantiga* 57 and the dishonest pilgrim in *Cantiga* 302.

Pilgrimage to Montserrat is dependent on a diversity of actors, audiences, architectural and natural landscapes, routes, intents, and objects to create each interpretation of the pilgrim's experience. This performance is not one that is determined by an emphasis on the Virgin limited by the embodiment of a statue and the architectural location in which the image is housed. The space and interactions of pilgrimage at Montserrat are not dependent on restricting entry to a single sacred location through the gate or doorway of a church structure (Twomey 2019: 180-83), rather, the culmination of the diversity of the landscape, activities, and objects of pilgrim

interaction allows the manifestation of the sacred during the performance to be guided by the goal of the individual pilgrim.

Chapter Three

Montserrat's Unique History: The Ascetic Heritage

Introduction

This thesis has proposed a new approach to studying pilgrimage through a reconsideration of the ritual act as a performance art or art production and the interactive nature of the landscape in which it is enacted. The act of art creation extends beyond a concentration on the shrine center as the main goal of the performance to include movement to and from a specific location of focus such as the Monastery and hermitages of Montserrat. Incorporating the longer journey of the pilgrim into the discussion of the phenomenon or ritual moves the conversation away from a traditional shrine-based consideration of pilgrimage found in previous studies such as those of Victor and Edith Turner (1978), John Eade and Michael Sallnow (1991), and more current trends of twenty-first century research. The entire journey from the pilgrim's home, including progression to and around the shrine and back again, is important when considering the pilgrimage as performance.

After the initial establishment of pilgrimage as a performance of art creation, Chapters One and Two turned to the foundation myths and historical texts of Montserrat to address and delineate key concepts of performance and examples of pilgrimages that appear within the written sources available. The foundation narratives of the statue apparition, Fray Juan Garín's penance, and the miracle texts of Montserrat provide depictions of the qualifiers of an art production established in David Davies' (2004) performance theory. Each myth contains the necessary categories of actors and audiences who enact their performances during a specified temporal duration with a focus of intent that is achieved through an artistic goal influenced by the culture of reception, all of which result in a determinant outcome. These texts, especially the

miracles, exemplify the need for a focus of intent and the necessity of movement for a complete performance of art or pilgrimage. Only with an artistic aim that takes into account culturally relevant markers and information such as myths and societal norms can a performance gain legitimacy and impact the spectator. The need for a focus of intent is also pertinent to the miracles of Montserrat. By enacting certain accepted or traditional steps, the supplicant seeking aid from the Virgin of Montserrat can succeed in petitioning the intercessory Virgin and subsequently engage in a worthy performance. As the French collection of miracles describe (*Abrégé de l'histoire Notre-dame du Montserrat* 1723*)*, if the pilgrims or supplicants follow the mandates of a correct performance, then they can be healed by the Virgin even at a distance from the mountain such as in communities of France or Germany.

The healings and resurrections attributed to the Virgin of Montserrat that occur away from the mountain shrine posit some difficult questions with regard to the performance of pilgrimage. The miracles reveal that a focus of intent and an honest mind open to the influence of the Virgin can take the place of a direct or geographically close contemplation of the statue at the shrine of Montserrat. Also, as in the case of the French miracle of the mother praying for her child, the physical component of the pilgrim's journey can be truncated into merely turning to correctly orient the body to face the mountain (*Abrégé* 1723). A slight movement in the general direction of Montserrat could result in a miracle and pilgrimage. In addition to the main shrine on the Catalonian mountain, there also existed further locations that could offer healing or restorative intercession in the form of satellite or auxiliary shrines and chapels dedicated to the Virgin of Montserrat in Barcelona, Madrid, Rome, and further abroad that were administered by the Benedictines of Montserrat (Serra y Postius 1747; Alarcón Román 2007). These auxiliary chapels, such as still exist in Barcelona, indicate that the Virgin of Montserrat was a popular

figure of supplication not only in Catalonia, but further abroad including other European cities such as Rome that have their own sites and traditions of pilgrimage. Yet, the popularity of the Virgin of Montserrat outside the Iberian Peninsula brings into question the miraculous nature of the specific mountain and statue. By the admission of Montserrat's own historical and hagiographic texts, it is not entirely necessary to perform a physical, long-distance pilgrimage to the mountain in order to receive the Virgin's healing and restorative benefits. Even though the *Cantigas de Santa Maria* dedicated to the Virgin of Montserrat praise six of the miracles that occur on or near the mountain, the majority of Mary's examples of intercession and healing do not take place on Montserrat. Additionally, in the legend of Juan Garín's penance, the Hermit's elevation and return to a recognizable human form occurs in Wilfred's court in Barcelona and not on the Virgin's domain of Montserrat.

The long-reaching effects of the Virgin's abilities brings into question the necessity of making the long journey to the Montserrat and whether the purpose or personal advantage of embarking on the procession up the mountain is worth the danger or required pilgrimage to the location. This specific performance of pilgrimage needs to be understood in the manner of what it offers the wandering pilgrim that cannot be achieved by a visit to a local shrine dedicated to the Virgin of Montserrat or any of the other incarnations of the Virgin present in the medieval Iberian Peninsula. The overarching concern of these considerations is the determination of the unique factors that make Montserrat a necessary goal and location of the ritual journey and performance. Understanding why pilgrimage (long-distance and the local community-wide variations) persisted and grew from Montserrat's literary foundation in 888 through the fifteenth century requires a more in-depth analysis of Montserrat's physical landscape and the literary tradition connected to its isolated location.

In the first part of his *Epitome histórico* of Montserrat, Serra y Postius (1747) repeatedly describes the mountain as prodigious, unique, and in possession of an aura of impenetrability and inaccessibility. If the mountain and its distinctive height, landscape, and seven leagues distance from Barcelona does not deter travelers, then the safety upon the roads might make them reconsider engaging in any potential pilgrimage. Although, hypothetically, the pilgrim to Montserrat was granted physical and secular protections guaranteed by the proclamation of James I and the divine aid of the Virgin, mishaps were common on the road. As Serra y Postius mentions, although the pilgrim should be able to walk without risk 'en algunas partes, no sin susto de él que ignora [la Virgen], que agenos de desgracias, están llenos de milagros sus precipios' (1747: 3). Several Montserrat miracles, as well as Alfonso X's *Cantigas* 57 and 311 warn that robbery and death at the hands of the elements were not uncommon on the road to Montserrat. Despite the distance, physical hardships, and issues of safety, pilgrimage increased and persisted:

> Es cosa (dize) de mucha maravilla ver aquí tantas diversidades de gentes de todas las Provincias; porque no solamente del Principado de Cataluña […] a de allí mucha gente, mas aún de toda España, Francia, Italia y Alemania. (Serra y Postius 1747: 98)

The author proceeds to discuss the distances traveled by the visitors to Montserrat. Despite or perhaps in spite of all of these possible difficulties and dangers involved in the distance traveled from home 'no reparaba su fervor en la larga fatiga del camino, ni en las varias inclemencias de los tiempos' (Serra y Postius 1747: 100).

Derived from the textual and historical descriptions of the mountain, Montserrat grows into an imposing and isolated geographical feature. In spite of the length of the journey and other competing antagonistic forces, pilgrims continued to travel to this desolate wilderness with a

determination and fervor to visit not only the Virgin's statue, but also the landscape of the mountain. The mountain of Montserrat contains various hermitages which recall the eremitic tradition of the desert-dwelling monks at the inception of Christianity, four of which were present on the mountain before the Benedictines from the Abbey of Ripoll began construction on the Monastery of Montserrat in 1023. An understanding of the necessity and importance of undertaking the physical journey, performance, and pilgrimage to the mountain arises from the following study of the combination of natural landscape, eremitic structures, and the ascetic tradition that infused the foundation of Montserrat.

The Geographical Landscape

The mountain of Montserrat is situated 35 kilometers (22 miles) from Barcelona. The Monastery sits on an outcropping protected by the mountain at 723 meters (2,372 feet) above sea level. The highest and most remote hermitage on the mountain, which is dedicated to Saint Jerome (342-420), is situated beyond the Monastery at 1,224 meters (4,016 feet) above sea level. On opposite facing sides of the mountain are the communities of Monistrol de Montserrat and Collbató. In the twenty first century, the Monastery is easily accessible. A vacationing family can hire a car and drive through Montserrat Natural Park before arriving at the summit. There is also a train that runs regularly from Monistrol to the mountaintop. Not to mention that there are also vacation package deals available bringing tourists up the mountain with the aid of pre-arranged transportation. These options depict the relative ease with which the modern tourist can scale Montserrat.

However, the medieval trails climbed by horse, mule, or simply by walking reveal that the decision to progress up the mountain was not an easy one. Travel to the medieval shrine and Monastery was not meant to be a day trip or a weekend getaway now made possible by the

various hotels on the mountaintop. The journey to the Monastery plateau was a painful, physically and mentally intensive journey that did not end when the pilgrim reached the Monastery gates. The Monastery may have been an important resting place for the determined pilgrim and offered a chance to visit and touch the legendary statue of Nuestra Señora de Montserrat, but the Benedictine sanctuary was not the sole (or arguably the main) goal of the pilgrim.

Dotted around the mountain grouped on the two opposite facing sides were the famous hermitages of Montserrat. The most remote hermitage of Saint Jerome (now in ruins) sits 501 meters (1,644 feet) above the Monastery. To reach the Monastery from the Collbató side of the mountain takes two to three hours of constant climbing, depending on age and level of physical fitness. Once the medieval pilgrims reached the Monastery, contingent upon the hermitages they wanted to visit, they could expect to expend at least another hour or two hiking to the group of hermitages on the *Tebas* or Thebes side of the mountain.

The mountain and its corresponding hermitages were grouped into two categories. The first set of hermitages nearest the Monastery were placed together under the designation *Tebas* or Thebes recalling the capital of Late Antique Egypt. The other gathering of hermitages were grouped on the *Tebaida* or Thebaid side of the mountain, which also takes its name from the desert region of Egypt. The stark contrast of Montserrat rising prominently above the surrounding landscape, its difficulty of access at least in the medieval era, and the labeling system of the mountain sides closely links the mountain setting with the early Christian heritage connected to the Egyptian desert and its ascetic practices. From this combination of elements Montserrat begins to form as an isolated, almost arid image reflecting the desert of Egypt. The descriptions of Montserrat as inaccessible, uninhabitable, and impenetrable yet miraculously

fecund with flora and fauna add to the mountain's identity as a spiritual and physical safe haven. Montserrat becomes akin to a second Garden of Eden surrounded by the harsh desert environment (Serra y Postius 1747).

The natural landscape of Montserrat speaks to a remote and isolated location that is miles away from any large cities or communities. It stands alone, rising above the civilizations below it as if physically attempting to distance itself from the temptations of humanity. The natural landscape hints at the importance of space, isolation, and journey through harsh environments. In addition, the architectural structures of Montserrat serve to link the mountain with the early Christian ascetic tradition based on the eremitic lifestyle of solitary wandering and isolation in extreme environmental conditions.

Other than the Benedictine Monastery begun in the eleventh century, about a century and a half after the proposed discovery of the Virgin's statue and life of Juan Garín, the additional structures on the mountain (most noticeably the hermitages) are difficult to designate into either wholly natural or constructed creations. Many of the mountain hermitages utilize the natural landscape and cave systems of Montserrat as the basis for their architecture. The tradition of the Montserrat hermits who dwelled in the caves recalls the isolated living conditions of the Christian fathers inhabiting the Egyptian desert. What further links these hermits and the landscape of Montserrat to the ascetic lifestyle are the names chosen for the hermitages. Among those evoking the Egyptian past are the hermitages of Saints Jerome, Onnophrius (*Onofre*) (fourth century), John the Baptist, and Antony (251-356). Of these four hermitages, Saints Onnophrius and John were attached to the Thebes side of the mountain. Saints Jerome and Antony were located near each other on the Thebaid side. The namesakes of these hermitages include: Antony regarded as the father of monasticism, Jerome hagiographer of desert fathers

and a member of the ascetic tradition, Onnophrius a hermit who lived in the Egyptian desert for seventy years, and John the Baptist contemporary of Christ and a precursory figure of the ascetic lifestyle.

The structure of the hermitages with their cave bases and architectural additions is a physical manifestation of the hybridization, interconnectivity, and evolution of the eremitic and cenobitic traditions which coexisted on Montserrat through its architecture, foundation stories, diverse religious communities, and ascetic heritage. Figures 10 and 11 below depict two of the extant hermitages of Montserrat and the architectural additions made to the natural cave setting.

Figure 10. On the left is the later constructed chapel of Saint John. To the right carved into the side of the cliff are the hermitages of Saints Onnophrius and John the Baptist.

Figure 11. The interior of the hermitage of Saint Onnophrius.

The following section analyzes the necessity of the ascetic tradition, how it flourished on the mountain, and in what manner the eremitic and cenobitic traditions intermingled and helped to develop one another. Montserrat's first hermit Juan Garín is the point of reference to understand why pilgrimage persisted and grew at Montserrat. The analysis begins with a comparison of the similarities and differences between the tale of Juan Garín with the accounts of the desert fathers whose namesakes reside on Montserrat, specifically the legend of Saint Onnophrius.

Onnophrius and the Ascetic Tradition

Translated from a Coptic text written around 1000, the Life of Saint Onnophrius is narrated by a monk named Paphnutius (fourth century). Although the related narrative is entitled *The Life and Ascetic Practice of Our Holy Father Abba Onnophrius the Anchorite* (Paphnutius 2000), Onnophrius does not play an overwhelming role in the narrative. After Paphnutius visits two other hermit dwellings in the Egyptian desert he eventually encounters Onnophrius, the titular subject of the *Life*. The first monk Paphnutius encounters is a desert-dwelling hermit long since dead and once the narrator 'took hold of his arm and it came off in my hands and disintegrated into dust' (Paphnutius 2000: 145-46). The second cave which Paphnutius discovers in the desert is the home of a monk who runs wild with animals and 'when he came near to me, he was naked and his hair covered his shame and served as clothing over him' (Paphnutius 2000: 146). This naked hermit living in seclusion may at first seem the antipathy to Church order and the establishment of such rules and regulations as found in a monastic environment, his nudity being of primary concern and differentiation. Instead of the image of the well-regarded 'varón santo' reminiscent of Fray Juan Garín's renown before his penance, the solitary Egyptian eremites in their animalistic nudity seem to represent the Hermit after his fall (Serra y Postius 1747: 51). Their garments made entirely of their overgrown hair identifies them with the image of the bestial Juan Garín depicted below in Figure 12.

Figure 12. Depiction of Fray Juan Garín from the cover of *La Leyenda de Fray Juan Garín, Ermitaño de Montserrat. Estudio sobre sus origenes y formación*.

Unlike the figure of the hairy wild men detailed in Roger Boase's (1989 & 2016) and Dorothy Yamamoto's (2000) studies of the savage, isolated outcast motif in medieval Romances, the hairy hermits in Onnophrius's tale are not personifications of the primitive, amoralistic nature of humans. As Yamamoto claims (2000: 160-69), the wild man's status is not deducible from his physical appearance alone. Despite the pronounced, animalistic nudity and harsh living conditions, the different hermits within the *Life of Onnophrius* address the strong and intermingling identities of the eremitic and cenobitic communities and a state of a heightened religious experience.

Paphnutius is a cenobite who journeys into the desert to seek knowledge and learn from any fellow monks living in the harsh environment. The first nude and still living desert-dwelling eremite he encounters is named Timothy. He freely shares his tale and experiences with Paphnutius, after initially fearing that his visitor was a demon sent to tempt him. Yet before he begins his tale, Timothy makes sure to initiate his narrative with the following precursor: 'I was a monk living in a community of monks in the Thebaid' (Paphnutius 2000: 147). Here Timothy hints at the fluidity between the identity of a monk as a solitary eremite and a community-dwelling cenobite. Although the living arrangements may differ between the ascetic solitary or cloistered monks, the unifying factor is a life of seclusion and a spiritual journey. The physical acts of wandering through the desert or a more metaphorical movement such as internal ascension to God through contemplation connects both groups of ascetics.

Paphnutius's journey into the desert and his interactions with Timothy, and later, Onnophrius first serve to indicate the closeness between the desert eremites and the cloistered cenobites. This heritage of interaction between the varieties of holy men is purposefully acknowledged in the naming of the Montserrat hermitages recalling four of the desert fathers. The physical layout of Montserrat creates a visual closeness as well as a division between the Monastery and the hermitages. From certain hermitages such as that of Saint Michael one can view the Monastery directly. However, a majority of the eremitic dwellings are out of sight of the Benedictine sanctuary. In order to see the Monastery, the hermits must make the journey down the mountain from their caves. Conversely, if the Benedictines wished to journey to the hermitages of Saints Jerome, Onnophrius, John the Baptist, or Antony they needed to walk a couple of hours up the mountain's slope. The mountain of Montserrat, the physical embodiment of the Virgin and purview of Mary, acts as a choir screen directing and constructing the

interactions the cenobites and eremites (Jung 2000; Williamson 2010). The solid, yet semiporous structure (the landscape of the mountain) allows for an active exchange between those within the cloistered walls (the Benedictines) and those without (the hermits).

As is the case with a choir screen, direct visual contact and interaction between the desert eremites and cenobites of Onnophrius's *Life* or between the hermits and monks of Montserrat due to the geological formations was limited, but not completely obstructed. The two communities managed to connect with one another through the exchange of oral communication and travel. Paphnutius's words relate the tales he acquired in the desert to his fellow monks upon his return to the cloistered community: 'I, your brother, was thinking one day that I would go into the further desert so that I could see whether there were any brother monks in the farthest reaches of the desert' (Paphnutius 2000: 145). The narrator shares his stories with his brethren who in turn copy down his words:

> Now those brothers were lovers of God […]. They hurriedly wrote down these words which they heard from Abba Paphnutius. They quickly put them in a book and sent it to Scetis where it was placed in the church for the benefit of those who heard it. And they spoke about it and it was the topic of conversation in the mouth / of everyone as they glorified God. (Paphnutius 2000: 166)

The words and experiences of Paphnutius were written down and regularized into a physical object able to be viewed, read, and retold in a manner that connected the eremitic and cenobitic traditions. The texts act as a narrative bridge between the two contemporary forms of asceticism through the movements of Paphnutius, the narrator, who is free to travel between both realms as he seeks out knowledge from those residing in the desert. Paphnutius's efforts and discovery of Onnophrius echo the legend of Jerome that relates the acts of Antony (Father of Monks) as he

seeks out Paul of Thebes (the first hermit) in the desert to emulate his ascetic form of piety (Beresford 2010). However, the written word is not the only manner in which the two traditions join together. The auditory or oral nature of the spoken word is also important to the ascetic relationship.

The *Life* of Onnophrius is a narrative juggling act. Many voices mix to create the tale which Paphnutius later relates to his fellow monks to be written and preserved. Paphnutius the cenobite and part-time eremite manipulates the concept of the heard word through the use of first person and large sections of related dialogue. By the time the *Life* of Saint Onnophrius is written, the events and interactions of the tale already underwent a series of changes and phases of contemplation and revision. The incidents were remembered by Paphnutius, related orally to his monastic community, and then those words were taken and transcribed to be read aloud at a later date feasibly by individuals far removed by time and location from the initial creation of the text and the events related. The only one to interact directly with the desert experience was Paphnutius. However, through the oral tradition of his narration, future cenobitic communities could indirectly witness the clash or intermingling of religious lifestyles through a transcribed oral account. The process of creating the written *Life of Onnophrius* is in itself an instance of art production reminiscent of the process involved in the creation of the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*. The text has the potential to act as a script which may initiate later generations of cenobites to perform their own pilgrimages of emulation into the desert following Paphnutius's model. At Montserrat, the oral tradition or spoken word has a literary heritage as is the case with the legend of Onnophrius, but shared words are further broken down into the most basic component, that of pure sound. The base unit of sound connects the eremitic individuals and cenobitic communities inhabiting the mountain landscape.

Most of Montserrat's hermitages do not have a clear line of sight to the Benedictine Monastery. However, the chiming of the Monastery bells that indicate the time of prayer and services such as Lauds, Matins, and Vespers, are audible from the different hermitages scattered around the mountain. Sound in its most basic tones unites the hermitages and Monastery on Montserrat in spite of the unique mountain landscape that physically distances the communities from one another. Sound is also highlighted in the statue apparition legend and the penance of Fray Juan Garín. In each foundation myth, heavenly and mundane noises become protagonists and methods of unification:

> y que se detenían [ciertas luces] entre unas quiebras de dicha montaña […] oyéndose consecutivamente en aquel lugar celestial música […] y todos, oyeron los celestiales prodigios. (Serra y Postius 1747: 32-3)

The initial discovery of the Virgin's statue was heralded by heavenly lights and more significantly to the current discussion, sound. The discovery of the penitent, hair-covered Juan Garín on the mountain also exemplifies sound as a method of encountering the unknown and in this case the animalistic rather than the divine:

> En llegando los perros a ella [la cueva de Garín] comenzaron a dar ladridos y ladrar con mucha vehemencia y prissa. Los cazadores se acercaron a donde oían el estruendo y ruído que hazían los perros. (Serra y Postius 1747: 57)

Words or legends and their most basic element of transmitted sound allow the eremites and community of cenobites separated by the rough terrain in the narratives of the desert fathers and the foundation myths of Montserrat to interact and learn from one another. These two versions of religious communities are not the complete opposite or antithesis to one another that initially appears from a cursory glance at writers such as Paphnutius, even though his descriptions of the

naked, long-haired monks echo Augustine's condemnation of the false monk or the itinerant *gyrovague* who did not submit to the authority of an elder or abbot (Dietz 2005).[1] Although the descriptions of the desert eremites initially propose individuals living on the periphery of a regulated community and seem to encapsulate the fears of insanity and ungodliness in medieval society (Yamamoto 2000), the figure of the roaming hermit in the *Life* of Onnophrius and the legend of Juan Garín are not representative of the 'dialectical antithesis of all men should strive for' (Husband 1980: 5). Instead, the solitary roaming eremites are exemplars to their cenobitic brethren that are regulated through the monastic dissemination of their lessons.

In the following section, the voices of opposition to the similarities and interactions between the eremitic and cenobitic traditions and ways of life are discussed. While Jerome will be mentioned and utilized to relate the arguments and distinctions in place against the propriety of eremitism, this thesis pays more attention to the commentary and concepts highlighted in Paphnutius's (2000) *Life*. While Jerome and Onnophrius have ties to the hermitages of Montserrat, Paphnutius's *Life* reflects a closer connection to Montserrat's tale of Juan Garín. As a result of the similarities to Montserrat's foundation myths, the voice of the systematization of eremites that can be read from Paphnutius's text is more pertinent to the current discussion than that of Jerome's account. However, both authors are important in addressing the seemingly

[1] A *gyrovague* is the worst classification of monk according to Augustine and the *Regula Magistri*. The *Magistri* does not consider the *gyrovague* worthy of the title *monk*. The individuals designated by this term roam from one monastery to the other as guests in an unsupervised manner disrupting the lives of the proper monks they visit (Dietz 2015).

diverse elements of eremitism and cenobitism that are brought together in the ascetic tradition and heritage of Montserrat.

Paphnutius

On the one hand, Paphnutius's (2000) *Life and Ascetic Practice of Our Holy Father Abba Onnophrius* advocates the novelty and educational draw of the ascetic life of the desert eremites. The beginning of the narrator's march into the desert seems to be initiated by nothing more than a whim to 'see whether there were any brother monks in the farthest reaches of the desert' (Paphnutius 2000: 145). The desire to learn from his brethren is strong enough for the cenobitic monk to bear a journey or performance of pilgrimage lasting four days and nights into the desert without food or water.

Eventually, Paphnutius discovers two inhabited desert dwellings, first that of Timothy and then Onnophrius and is able to converse with the desert hermits and learn from them. According to Paphnutius, his journey into the desert was time well spent: 'Now after a journey of three days I came into Egypt, and when I found the God-loving brethren, I rested with them for ten days. I told them what had happened to me and they said to me, "Truly you have been worthy of a great gift"' (Paphnutius 2000: 166). Paphnutius's journey into the harsh landscape of the desert furthers his religious education and augments his esteem in the eyes of his fellow cenobites and anchorites who receive the tale of his encounters. On the other hand, Paphnutius's interactions in the desert, combined with his descriptions of the eremites who reside there, are not given without an attempt to discipline and regulate the desert experience by depicting to the intended audience exactly who is qualified to make the sojourn into the arid environment.

Paphnutius's initial interactions with Timothy and Onnophrius are laced with fear and trepidation over the exotic nature of the encounters. The nudity of the eremites versus the clothed Paphnutius is the first device used to differentiate the cenobitic visitor from the desert-dwelling hermits. A partial reversal of the Garden of Eden, the nudity of the eremites indicates a sort of shame as well as a feral naivety, implying that the desert hermits are more akin to animals than men: 'I looked up and I saw a herd of antelope in the far distance coming towards me–with that brother right in the middle of them. When he came near to me, he was naked' (Paphnutius 2000: 146). Later, when Paphnutius first spies Onnophrius, the desert dweller is described in terms even more animalistic than the encounter with Timothy: 'Now suddenly I looked and I saw a man in the distance; he was very terrifying because his hair was spread out over his body like a leopard's. Indeed, he was naked, and leaves covered his / male member' (Paphnutius 2000: 151). Whereas Montserrat is described in the pristine terms of an elevated, Eden-like garden, the tradition of the nude and hairy desert solitary present in the eremitic tradition and the popular imagery of Juan Garín grounds the celestial occurrences of the mountain in human terms reminding the reader/pilgrim of the Fall induced by pride.[2] In the tale related by Paphnutius, Eden is referenced in the leafy covering that serves as additional clothing to hide Onnophrius's shame. The desert wanderers begin to be depicted as a reiteration or second generation of humanity's Fall from grace when it was cast out of Eden and sent into the desert.

This fallen status attributed to the desert eremites becomes starker when contrasted with the activities of Paphnutius before his first encounter with the hermit Timothy: 'So I stayed there

[2] See Figure 12 and Figure 14 for depictions of the bestial Juan Garín and the imagery of the hairy desert ascetics.

[in the hermit's cave] praying until late in the day and I was reciting Scripture I had learned by heart' (Paphnutius 2000: 146). Paphnutius's world is portrayed as that of book learning, order, and logic in the performance of the communal ascetic or cenobitic lifestyle. While he sits and finds a quiet place to recite prayers and lessons, the lone ascetic (the eremite) chooses to roam around the desert in the midst of herds of wild animals (Paphnutius 2000). The desert hermits reject clothing and possessions, including the written word and more standardized knowledge in order to engage in penance for their sins or to avoid any external forms of temptation. The cenobites are concerned with a more figurative sense of elevation through prayer and meditation while the eremites prefer or require a physical journey to elevate their spiritual status. The ambulatory nature of the eremites makes them difficult to discern as learned man from the other creatures of the desert. Fear of an unknown and unestablished identity and of falling into sin color the interactions between the desert eremites and cenobites in the *Life* of Saint Onnophrius.

When Paphnutius, the younger of the two ascetics, meets Timothy, he must talk the Hermit down from his fear by exhibiting through touch and sight that he is a man of flesh and blood and not a demon sent to tempt the eremite. Paphnutius relies on logic to progress the narration. Once he calms Timothy, the narrative develops through a series of questions Paphnutius asks of the anxious eremite. Eventually Paphnutius's calming influence is absorbed by Timothy who is finally able to relate his tale though the cenobite's guidance. By the end of their meeting, Timothy is described as the spiritually stronger, his previous fears cast aside. It is Paphnutius who is ushered away from the cave and solitary life and told 'you are not strong enough to resist the attacks of demons' (Paphnutius 2000: 150). The Hermit is condescending of Paphnutius's determination, but practical. It took Timothy thirty years of suffering to reach his current state of naked devotion. By rejecting Paphnutius's request to join him, Timothy

proclaims that the road to an ascetic life of the eremite is long and cannot be achieved by an unplanned whim to venture into the desert and meet some brethren. The fear that initiated the interaction, originally hinting at the eremite's faintness of heart, is promoted as a healthy respect for the progression of spiritual awareness rather than a hysterical emotional state. In Paphnutius's next desert meeting with Onnophrius, the cenobite rather than the eremite exhibits fear of the unidentifiable and flees from the terrifying figure that approaches him in the desert. On seeing the unfamiliar form of the animalistic desert hermit, Pahpnutius becomes frantic: 'When he came up close to me I was afraid and I climbed up on a ledge of the mountain, thinking that perhaps it was a wild ass' (Paphnutius 2000: 151). The fear Paphnutius exhibits in his second encounter shows that Timothy's warnings are true. The young monk has not learned enough in the safety of his monastery to face the fear of the unknown. Instead of confronting the object that brings him discomfort, Paphnutius's response, as is the case with Garín's reaction to Riquilda invading his space, is to run away.

When Paphnutius and Onnophrius meet, the younger monk (Paphunutius) must literally be talked down from a mountain pinnacle he climbs to escape the hair-covered, unidentifiable creature that approaches him. Through the older hermit's telling of his tale and a further series of questions and answers, the eremite brings logic back into the narration and conquers the cenobite's fear. Paphnutius's tale of his encounters with the desert eremites initially imposes a separation between the religious lifestyles of the eremitic and cenobitic paths through a difference of physical description. The desert hermits are depicted as nude, animalistic, and not immediately recognizable as human, while their cenobitic brethren are represented through a concern of clothing and the practical logistics of worship and order.

The nudity and fear prominent in the interactions with Timothy emphasize the fallen, almost base nature of the eremites who wander the desert without answering to a higher intermediary authority such as an abbot or bishop. Yet, the signifiers of the Hermit's identity described in the initial meeting soon become less definitive. Paphnutius's purely cenobitic persona becomes compromised first when he fears his initial encounter with Onnophrius and again upon the older man's death: 'Now I took of the cloak I was wearing and tore it in two: the one piece was for a burial shroud and with the other piece I covered myself so that I would not stay naked' (Paphnutius 2000: 159). Still clothed more thoroughly than either Timothy or Onnophrius, Paphnutius nevertheless exemplifies the ease of adaptation and fluidity between the identity of an eremite and a cenobite. By ripping his garment, the cenobite shows that the cloistered lifestyle and its inhabitants are cut from the same metaphorical cloth as the desert eremite. The two styles of ascetic living are derived from the same background. Only the outer trappings designate them as different.

The *Life of Onnophrius* (Paphnutius 2000) and works of Jerome tend to be read as promoting regulation and cenobitic authority over the eremite or itinerant monk. The texts relate a desire to dictate when a monk can and should be ready for a solitary, eremitic lifestyle. Montserrat also had a tradition of preparation for the eremites once the Benedictine Rule had been firmly established and the hermits were required to give obedience to the priory. As a result, some of the hermitages, such as the one dedicated to Saint John the Baptist, eventually developed into locations where the abbots of Montserrat went to retire. This tradition of a preparation before joining the eremitic life applies to the monks as well as pilgrims of Montserrat. The pilgrims went through phases of preparation and wandering comparable to that of the desert eremites to achieve their miracles, performances, and establish their pilgrim

identities. However, a deeper reading of the textual evidence indicates that the goal of a solely secluded ascetic lifestyle is not resolutely achieved. Instead, the *Life of Onnophrius* (Paphnutius 2000) acknowledges the porous boundaries between the two lifestyles of eremitic and cenobitic seclusion. If there was no fear that cenobites could easily fall into the eremitic lifestyle as a result of the similarities between monks and hermits, then there would not be such adamant attempts to curb the itinerant lifestyle and impose monastic rule and regulation. One further example of Paphnutius's attempt to impose his sense of logic and rule on the desert monks such as Onnophrius needs to be addressed. This desire to curb the eremitic lifestyle or at least control its enactment resonates with the landscape of Montserrat.

In the *Life of Onnophrius* (Paphnutius 2000), the desert-dwelling monks are distanced from the cenobites by physical descriptions that create an aura of fear and reverence around the figures. Although Timothy and Onnophrius's animalistic natures are initially linked to the fallen, sinful state of humanity acutely aware of its own nudity, the hermits are nevertheless portrayed as models of religious devotion. Even though their appearances mask immediate recognition of the dedicated and learned status of the eremites, their conversations reaffirm their ties to the ideological tenets of the Church, if not the hierarchical structure.

Through his inquiries into the lifestyle and daily routines of the desert hermits, such as when and where they take Communion, Paphnutius learns that his brethren did not enter the eremitic life as uninitiated laity. Instead, as Augustine and Jerome and as the later retirement of the Montserrat abbots support as the proper order of religious progression, the desert eremites began their religious education in cenobitic communities in Thebes and the Thebaid. Although Timothy and Onnophrius resided in the desert for thirty and sixty years respectively, by the time

they meet Paphnutius they brought with them the ideas and order learned in their cloistered monastic communities into the desert landscape of seclusion:

> Then there came into my heart a thought of this kind: 'Rise and go, and stay in a place by yourself. You will lead a life of quiet contemplation as an anchorite. You will welcome the brethren, you will show great hospitality to the stranger, and you will earn more than enough through the work of your hands.' That which I thought, I did, so I left the community of monks. (Paphnutius 2000: 147)

Contemplation, hospitality, and hard work are the three essential aspects of the ascetic life instilled in Timothy's heart by the word of God. Yet these three tenets of the eremite are not at odds with the cenobitic lifestyle or indeed distinct from it in any way. In fact, even the eremite's desire for seclusion, which Timothy and Onnophrius emphasize, does not pertain either solely to the eremitic or cenobitic traditions. Instead of division or placing the cenobitic rules and regulations over the perceived animalistic hysteria of the eremite, texts such as the *Life of Onnophrius*, the apparition of the Virgin of Montserrat, and the tale of Juan Garín serve to address the necessity of a porous combination of the eremitic and cenobitic traditions rather than creating distinctions.

The manner in which the eremites and cenobites co-exist in the tale of Onnophrius and on Montserrat was through the regulatory dissemination of information regarding the solitary ascetic figures. Although the desert hermits in Paphnutius's narration appear to be the embodiment of the unregulated and disruptive presence of the *gyrovague* and motif of the wild man, they eventually show that they are at a spiritual level higher than the observing cenobite. The strength of the hermits' devotion and the interest in their form of asceticism come from the

ability of Paphnutius and the Benedictines of Montserrat to regulate the flow of information regarding the isolated ascetics.

In the *Life* of Onnophrius, Paphnutius's narration and experience is filtered through its many retellings and inscription. Eventually it becomes a written object which transforms the original journey into one that can be read and contribute to an internal elevation in which the audience aims to 'vivere nel silenzio, va nel deserto interno' or to engage in a performance of a physical emulation of Paphnutius's pilgrimage (Casali 2006: 27). The narration provides easier access to the location of the desert eremites through a textual tradition that warns the audience against performing a similar act until they are mentally prepared and have a clear goal for the undertaking. Paphnutius's text acts as a safety measure to prevent young cenobites from engaging in such a pilgrimage before they are ready through the controlled dissemination of information. The regulation of ascetic figures (hermits) through narrative is also prevelant in Montserrat's history of cenobitic and eremitic interactions.

Before the hermitages of Montserrat became retirement homes for the Benedictine abbots, the four original structures were autonomous entities. By 1023, before the Monastery of Ripoll began the consolidation of Montserrat, the hermitages were already famous locations of pilgrimage. The renown of Montserrat's hermits led to the official reclamation of the mountain for Ripoll led by its Abbot Oliba. After the acquirement of Montserrat by Ripoll, the Monastery is first mentioned on the site in 1027 (Ribas i Caláf 1997). This time frame marks the beginning of attempts to control and elevate the dissemination of information about the hermits and the Virgin statue by the Benedictine community. By 1025 traffic to Montserrat had increased considerably due to Oliba and the Benedictine's influence (Martín Ansón 2003). Noble pilgrims began to be offered room and board for the three days it was permitted for them to stay at the

Monastery. This cultivation of Montserrat's renown was pushed even further by the introduction of Abbot Cisneros' reforms in 1493 and the arrival of the printing press at Montserrat in 1499.

The dissemination of the historical and hagiographic traditions of Montserrat by the Benedictine community continued to increase the renown of the Virgin and the practice of pilgrimage. The legend of the eremitic figure of Juan Garín 'les enseñaba y recordaba los pasos obligados para conseguir el perdón de Dios' and acted as 'una reprobación de la vida ermética Antigua [...] propone el ermitismo independiente como parte de la vida cenobítica (Alarcón Román 2007: 34). Neither the *Life* of Onnophrius or the legend of Juan Garín promote eremitism over the cenobitic lifestyle. The texts reveal a co-existence and codependency of each form of ascetic living. In Paphnutius's tale, Onnophrius is a religious individual who the cenobites of Egypt should aspire to emulte in their dedications. The hermits of Montserrat and Juan Garín are also highly spiritual individuals whose pilgrimage to Montserrat the medieval pilgrims should emulate. The dissemination of the tales of the eremites through their Benedictine hagiographers ensures the mutual continuance of their existence through the increased foot traffic to Montserrat to see the legendary hermits.

The *Life* of Onnophrius and related miracles, *Cantigas*, and legends of Montserrat act as guiding handbooks for their respective audiences, cultures, and time periods. These documents or scripts help the audience to understand the steps and components necessary for a performance of pilgrimage and spiritual elevation in each context and cultural period under discussion. For example, the Onnophrius text was written in a time that ascetic desert eremitism was still a widespread enactment of Christianity. Although there were opponents to the desert hermit, such as Jerome and Antony's warnings against itinerant monks or *gyrovagues*, the eremites were an evolution or adaptation of the ascetic forms of suffering inherited from the late antiquity

Christian martyrs and earlier Christian practices. As Andrew M. Beresford states, the desert asceticism was not an absolute substitution of the practice of martyrdom. As is the case with eremitism versus cenobitism, one does not outrank the other. The choice of one form of worship over the other is an active one that 'aggressively displaces the by now socially irrelevant mode of sanctity espoused by the martyrs' (Beresford 2010: 10).

The lives of the desert saints written by authors such as Jerome do not represent an aggressive evolution from one form of devotion to another where the newer version utterly reconfigures the former until it is no longer recognizable. Rather, they represent alternative methods of practicing and implementing ascetically constructed forms of pilgrimage and spiritual elevation determined by a heritage of shared practices. Paphnutius takes the evolution further. Writing at a later date than Jerome, the temporary desert wanderer fluctuates in his descriptions between the tensions and compatibility of the monophyletic branches of post-martyr asceticism (eremitism and cenobitism) indicating that the two forms of ascetic lifestyles support one another. The texts of Montserrat taken in conjunction with the literary heritage and evolution of Christian practice within the lives of the desert saints, especially Onnophrius, can be read as the next post-martyrdom progression of Christian practice to an even more personal performance of devotion through pilgrimage promoted by the desert ascetics.

The two forms of asceticism of focus in this chapter are the eremitic and cenobitic varieties. There is a tendency in current scholarship to arbitrarily segregate these practices into distinct branches or examples of performance and enactments of devotion. The designation of eremitic and cenobitic practices as distinct detrimentally limits the potential of each in their capacity to work together in a process of creation in regard to personas, sites, and experiences of Christian significance. The following discussion of ascetic forms begins by addressing the binary

opposition of asceticism in comparison to the everyday life proposed by authors such as Geoffrey Galt Harpham (1987). This thesis engages with authors such as Harpham to contend with their claims and show that ascetic lifestyles, individuals, and landscapes are not antagonistic to one another, but, rather work together to advance the evolution of performance of acts of devotion such as pilgrimage.

The Ascetic Imperative?

Geoffrey Galt Harpham (1987) begins his *Ascetic Imperative* by analyzing the ascetic lifestyle in the manner of Catherine Bell's (2009) consideration of the enactments of rituals. Bell (2009) diagnosed the inherent flaw in ritual theory as the use of ritual as a tool that identifies opposition and the realm of interaction between the sacred (ecclesiastical) and profane (lay) spheres of society. Bringing to life Bell's (2009) warnings about ritual theory, Harpham (1987) endorses asceticism as a discipline of self-denial that 'neither simply condemns culture nor simply endorses it; it does both. Asceticism, we could say, raised the issue of culture by structuring an opposition between culture and its opposite' (Harpham 1987: XII). Where Bell sees ritual as promulgating a binary attitude of opposition within culture and suggests the dismantling of this dichotomy between sacred and profane thought and action, Harpham uses asceticism as a tool. As is the case with Bell's ritual, Harpham imposes a binary opposition between the everyday, normal culture and that which opposes the norm, which in this case is ascetic seclusion.

Harpham (1987) discusses the ascetic tradition and narratives of the desert saints linguistically to separate the normal socio-economic culture from its opposite of ascetic seclusion. Additionally, he inherits the tendency of Paphnutius and Jerome to differentiate the

ascetic lifestyle further into the seemingly distinct, yet compatible and complimentary ascetic forms. Harpham's (1987) linguistic approach creates the distinction between the individual eremite and cenobite determined by the use of language as it appears in different forms of text and speech. The author focuses on a differentiation of the degree of regulation and structure apparent in the lives of the two types of monks. Reminiscent of Paphnutius (2000), Harpham attempts to highlight the cenobitic life as built on order and logic of the regulated word of God learned in the monastic community. This life of cenobitic seclusion is placed in opposition to the 'heroic fanaticism of the early desert solitaries' or eremites (Harpham 1987: 14). Linguistically speaking, this idea of structure versus chaos within asceticism leads to the conceptualization that 'cenobitism is the "writing" of asceticism, while eremitism is its "speech"' (Harpham 1987: 22).

Harpham's (1987) distinction between cenobitism and eremitism divides the monastic regulation of rules and writing into thought narrative versus eremitic speech and mimicked action. This distinction is useful as an analytical approach when dealing with the texts and lives of the desert saints, especially those written by pro-cenobitic narrative voices. However, the categorization or separation of early Christian monasticism into eremitic and cenobitic traditions hinders a fuller realization of the texts. Harpham's (1987) dichotomy arbitrarily imposes distinctions between the two desert traditions that more recent studies of asceticism exchange for tensions and compatibility between the differing types rather than separating the cenobitic from the eremitic tradition.

Rather than consider cenobitism and eremitism in opposition, contemporary studies of asceticism focus on the tension between the two Christian lifestyles that arose from the concept of the Greek origin of the word monk: which is *monachos* and means alone or solitary (Albarrán Martínez 2010). This life of solitude, or *moneros bios*, stood in opposition to the *kosmikos* or the

mundane life, which can also be categorized as the lay world. Contemporary ascetic research pushes the idea that 'la división entre ascetismo y monacato, o vida ascética y vida monástica, no puede ser delimitada de forma estricta, puesto que ambos conceptos van unidos' (Albarrán Martínez 2010: 79). Although this movement also proposes that both forms of monasticism share basic elements of asceticism, the separation between the solitary ascetic life (*moneros bios*) and the mundane (*kosmikos*) proposed by Harpham's analysis still remains.

The basic principles of asceticism promote a tension between individual practices of devotion and isolation (celibacy, prayer, and dress) with the need for performing acts of charity. This battle between isolation and duty is used to exemplify that in the study of asceticism, the antagonistic forces of seclusion and public responsibility are connected and co-dependent on one another for their development and structure. However, this ascetic world of tension still is not studied as being compatible or existing in a co-dependent tension with the lay or mundane world of the *kosmikos*. Since Harpham (1987), asceticism has been discussed in promoting a consideration of the entire tension-rich history of the forms of desert piety, inclusive of the eremites dwelling in their secluded caves and the cenobites living in monastic communities in the Egyptian desert, instead of placing the different types or categories in opposition. Yet, as is the case with the dated ideas of ritual and pilgrimage that separate the thoughts and actions of those involved in the performance of Christian piety from the other or mundane arena, the ascetic act of extreme isolation is placed in opposition to the everyday flow of life outside the desert cave or monastery. In order to combat the idea that the ascetic practice or heritage can only exist in isolated pockets exterior to the *kosmikos* (the mundane/ lay world), the following argument returns to Harpham's (1987) idea of equating cenobitism with the written word and narrative thought. Eremitism will be represented by the use of the spoken word and mimed action.

Utilizing the idea of word and speech in asceticism, while looking at the *Life of Onnophrius* (Paphnutius 2000) as a precursor to the legend of Juan Garín, will address how the above discussion of ascetic tension evolves in the tradition of Montserrat. Once the ascetic comparison of Onnophrius and Garín is established, it will then be possible to combat the division between the ascetic or solitary isolation and the mundane world of the laity. This will be achieved through a study of how the ascetic tensions and traditions become incorporated into pilgrimage to Montserrat, its Monastery, and its isolated hermitages.

The *Life of Onnophrius* (Paphnutius 2000) reveals a number of tensions and distinctions between the structures of the cenobitic and eremitic lifestyles. The cenobitic life of the narrator Paphnutius shows a preoccupation with propriety of dress and physical appearance, as well as a need for the structure and rules of daily prayers, learning, and the taking of the Eucharist found in a secluded community of monks. Yet the distinctions between the two methods of enacting asceticism become inconsequential when Paphnutius witnesses the miracle of Onnophrius's death and ascension.

Despite the fact that Onnophrius lives as a wild man resembling a horrible object rather than a human being, the desert Hermit attains the elevated status of a holy man upon his death. The *Life of Onnophrius* (Paphnutius 2000) is a form of misnomer. As an audience reading the first-hand account or word of Paphnutius the only action of Onnophrius's life that is witnessed through the narrator's description is the Hermit's death. The death, the ultimate secluded and isolated experience of the eremite, the final act of his performance of piety, is preserved by the cenobite Paphnutius. The experience becomes the recollected word of the narrator and the word and memories become the text and lessons of future generations of cenobites. Without the isolated form of asceticism enacted in the lives of the desert fathers or other such singular

individuals who purposefully distance themselves from the larger community, monasteries would not have exemplars to imitate. Without the existence of individuals such as Paphnutius who were dedicated to the written text and preservation of the word of God, the eremites would remain isolated figures of aging old men running naked in the wilderness living as animals who no one would be able to learn about or remember.

The *Life of Onnophrius* on the one hand posits a necessity for rule and order through the cenobitic life of prayer, work, and contemplation. Some scholars read these efforts as an attempt of the larger governing body of the Church to restrict the lives of the eremites and bring them under the authority of a bishop or other ecclesiastical figure (Dietz 2005). The text of Paphnutius and other writers such as Jerome are not without such political motivations, but the type of controlling efforts proposed need to be reevaluated. Both the hermits of Paphnutius's tale lived in monastic communities prior to their solitary wanderings. Maribel Dietz (2005) would analyze the mention of this detail of the saints' lives as promoting the anxieties of the Church over the charismatic ascetic individuals who could attract the Church's followers and detract from its support. The Church and its representation through cenobitic narrators such as Paphnutius try to define the proper eremite by mentioning that the hermits first learned how to control their minds and bodies in monastic communities before going into the wilderness on their own and retiring to isolated hermitages as did the abbots of Montserrat. Only after many years of education under the regularized ecclesiastical authority are individuals free to live on their own. Dietz (2005) reads this style of narrative effort as the Church promoting obedience to God through trained obedience to an abbot. This approach depicts the narratives of the desert saints as pro-control and against the truly wandering lifestyle of an ascetic monk or individual unattached to a specific institution. The unattached and individual monk is that which Jerome deems a *Remnouth* and the

Regula Magistri calls a *gyrovague* (Dietz 2005). Each term described the monk in an uncomplimentary light.

Dietz and authors such as Paphnutius and Jerome utilize the term or concept of the inappropriately trained and wandering *gyrovague* to distinguish between different forms of monastic travel and acts of devotion. Dietz (2005) furthers the discussion of the various forms of monastic travel by emphasizing the necessity of distinguishing between different types of religious travels, especially pertaining to monastic movement and pilgrimage. She defines pilgrimage as a separate endeavor to the other modes of religiously motivated travel in an effort to avoid proscribing the term (pilgrimage) to any and all forms of religious movement. Dietz continues to explain that the emphasis placed on the correct form of solitary/ascetic living and travel led to a stricter adherence to stability and the favoritism of a more structurally rigid environment, evident in Catalonia after the ninth- and tenth-century founding and restoration of the Benedictine houses. The end of monastic travel, such as engaged in by Paphnutius or Antony to find their desert elders, faded away to be replaced by a promotion of lay travel through pilgrimage. Pilgrimage is specific to goal-centered religious movement for a desired and planned purpose (Dietz 2005) that evolved from a need to control ritual acts of procession or travel. This form of more regulated travel is a performance with a clear delineation of time and a focus of intent that leads to the achievement of a determinant goal. However, even if texts such as Paphnutius's and the emergence of the Benedictine Order in Catalonia proposed cenobitism as preferable to the solitary wandering figure, the heritage of Montserrat promotes further interactions between the roles of the hermit and the monk in connection to the travels of pilgrimage.

Harpham (1987) distinguishes cenobitic and eremitic traditions through the regulation of language and actions rather than through Dietz's (2005) control of movement. Dietz (2005) argues that texts classifying the early monasticism of Egypt use Church authority, the Word and the Rule of God on earth, to promote the cenobitic lifestyle over that of the isolated individuals. In either approach, classification through linguistic or physical variations and differences are highlighted to delineate a sort of sibling rivalry between different ascetic lifestyles and habitats. However, when the ascetic tensions of the cenobite versus eremite and isolated living versus integration into the larger community including the world of the *kosmikos* are applied to a physical location and not limited to the realm of textual landscape, a different picture begins to form. Instead of antagonistic forces, the physical landscape of Montserrat combined with the foundation texts explain how complimentary and necessary the cenobitic and eremitic traditions are to the foundation and continuation of Montserrat as a sacred place of Catalonian Christianity and an optimal location for pilgrimage.

In the *Life of Onnophrius* (Paphnutius 2000), Timothy, the first desert hermit encountered by the biographer, designates the three duties of an ascetic monk. He must receive brethren, show abundant hospitality to strangers, and work with his hands. However, each of these three demands of the ascetic man has the potential to bring him into contact with temptation and sin. As is the case in the legends of the female desert saints Thaïs and Mary of Egypt, the establishment of the saintly persona and identity that leads to a figure's ultimate ascension requires interactions with the lay or profane world of bodily temptation. The temptation is a necessary first step that leads to sinful living through prostitution in the case of the above female saints and general fornication in the case of the previously mentioned males. The fall into sin then requires the intervention of the divine, sacred, or figures of ecclesiastical authority to aid the

subjects of the narratives on their way to penance, redemption, and renown. The form or instigator of the fall into sin for the male saints tends to come in the guise of a demon possessing an alluring female. This is why when Timothy first meets Paphnutius, he is uncertain as to whether the cenobite is man or demon and needs assurances of his guest's humanity.

When Timothy first began his life of solitude, he was led astray (through fornication) by a demon-possessed nun who went to him seeking aid for a simple task. The duties of an ascetic hermit which require that he lends aid and hospitality to those in need cause a tension between Christian acts of devotion, aid, and self-preservation, usually in the form of a struggle to retain a continued celibacy. Montserrat's legend of the hermit Fray Juan Garín adopts this ascetic tension between duty and expectation of the holy man and his tie to the larger Church community through charity which challenges the individual's desire for solitude. In the tale of Onnophrius, when the ascetics were tempted and fall from the lives of purity they had endeavored to live, they received help from unknown angelic strangers who set them back on the correct paths through holy instruction. Similarly, in the legend of Saint Thaïs, her chosen profession of prostitution (her fall) comes to an end with the intervention of a human figure of ecclesiastical authority and religious superiority, a travelling abbot who 'rescued her from iniquity' and takes her to a nunnery to live a life of sequestered seclusion (Beresford 2007: 3). The Abbot is the catalyst in the:

> vital but fleeting encounter [between the profane landscape of interactions inhabited by the prostitute and the sacred exemplified by the Abbot] suggesting that clerical involvement in the lives of fallen women [or men such as Timothy and Juan Garín] need not be permanent. In fact, after the application of a gentle but appropriate stimulus, they can be left without further guidance to achieve their own salvation. (Beresford 2007: 3)

This stimulus or catalyst of ecclesiastical or divine intervention not only places the saints and ascetic hermits on the necessary paths of redemption through penance and even harsher modes of ascetic living, but the intercessory stimulus also ensures that the lay pilgrims enact correctly directed pilgrimages through ascetic and martyr-like suffering.

Garín's tale and fall into sin retains the tradition of coexisting tensions between solitude and community involvement represented through the interactions of the sacred (ecclesiastical) and profane (lay) landscapes and intentions, but the manner of his redemption and the characters involved reveal an evolution from the writings of the desert saints. The antagonistic tendencies of solitary wandering versus structured communal living of the early Christian hermits and monks work together to condemn and save Garín through the collaboration of the eremitic, ecclesiastical, and lay authorities of Catalonia.

The tale of Fray Juan Garín opens with a perfect, incorruptible description of the isolated Hermit who lives in a cave that '[h]oy día conserva su nombre' (Serra y Postius 1747: 52). Garín lives in total isolation upon his mountain following the tradition of the ideal eremite described by Timothy in Paphnutius's narration. Garín is dedicated to prayer, contemplation, and hard living. In fact, he is so dedicated to this life of solitude that he never commits a sin. As is the case with Timothy before him, Garín's solitary living in the harsh and isolated mountain environment unfortunately creates the perfect setting for temptation, especially as occurs in both stories when the devil takes a personal interest in causing the holy men to sin.

According to Harpham's (1987) linguistic interpretation of asceticism, the desert landscape or setting was a location impervious to history. The Hermit established himself as adjacent to or distinguishable from the familial and communal obligations existing outside the desert boundaries. In addition to the desolate, super-historical nature of the location, the solitude

led to a ‘blank monotony of the external scene [that] provided no resistance to the generation of images’ (Harpham 1987: 55). The generation of images caused by the extreme heat of the desert and isolation of the mountain do not necessarily manifest directly in the appearance of anthropomorphic phantoms or mirages. In the earlier case of Timothy, the idea of an actual image is important because the hermit loses the ability to distinguish between fantasy and reality. The denial of physical interactions with humans for over thirty years causes Timothy to fear what he sees, which is humanity and the social interactions that he has forgotten. Living alone in the desert, Timothy, as is the case with Mary of Egypt and Juan Garín, becomes unaware or unfamiliar with the protocols of society. Although their ascetic lives of seclusion and harsh living are penitential, in their simplistic states of survival and ascetic prayer, the desert and mountain dwellers almost ‘return to a state of endenic or prelapsarian grace, feeling shame [or awareness] at her [their] nakedness only when approached by human eyes’ (Beresford 2007: 46). When Timothy meets Paphnutius, the first non-possessed human he has seen in years, he cannot process the image he sees because he lacks the recognition and understanding to interpret the interaction. Within Timothy’s tale, the lack of human interaction and the desert environment generate images of demonic and angelic phantom figures and voices that act as catalysts for Timothy’s reactions to his surroundings.

The hermits of the Egyptian desert constructed their identities and forms and enactments of devotion through direct angelic or demonic intervention in their lives. For example, when Timothy first moved into the desert he suffered so much from his new lifestyle that he contracted a near fatal disease in his liver. Since the Hermit was truly alone in the desert and could not be reached by fellow monks or hermits of a community, his aid came in the form of a ‘man radiant with glory’ who healed him (Paphnutius 2000: 150). Mary of Egypt’s guide comes from a direct

manifestation of the Holy Spirit, similar to Timothy, and not through any intervention of human members or authorities of the Church. When Onnophrius entered the desert, an illuminated aid from God also guided him in his efforts:

> Now when I entered the mountain and had walked in the desert for six or seven miles, I saw a cave. I turned towards it because I saw that there was a person inside it. A great saint of God came out to meet me. He was handsome in appearance because his face shone with a great grace. (Paphnutius 2000: 154)

As is the case with the discovery of the Virgin statue of Montserrat by the communities of Monistrol and Manresa, the desert hermits and saints know that the sudden apparitions they behold are heaven-sent portents from the illumination and divine appearance of the intervening visitors. The light found in the desert narratives is a pure one. The figures that come to help the hermits are angels or saints sent directly from heaven using illumination and their sudden appearances and disappearances as the validity of their credentials. The penance in which the saints engage before they are visited by the divine figures prepares them by making them mentally predisposed to notice and receive a manifestation of the divine turning the desert into a sacred space. The emergence of images heralded by light and accompanied with an isolated location occurs in a distinct form during the foundation of Montserrat. In the Virgin apparition, the lights and celestial music clearly announce a divine presence and a change in the perception of the landscape in a manner reflective of the texts of Onnophrius. However, there is a marked difference in the state of penance, intervention, and awareness represented in the lives of the desert saints when compared with the narrative of Fray Juan Garín. There is a distinct lack of heavenly illuminations and divine portents in the life of Montserrat's ascetic hermit. The images

that were present in the lives of Timothy and Onnophrius become corporeal actors in the legend of Montserrat.

The capacity of the desert isolation and harsh environment to manifest images evolves into the mountain landscape's strategic generation of corporeal rather than visual temptation and redemption. This physical rather than mirage-based temptation embodied by the imposition of Riquilda's human presence within Garín's cave of ascetic and solitary confinement derives from Montserrat's proximity to the community of Barcelona. Montserrat provides the semi-isolated stage for an act of temptation. The mountain setting and especially the environment of the cave are key in creating the mirage-inducing distance needed for Garín to sin. Yet unlike Harpham's (1987) claim that the landscape provides a passive stage for the inevitable transgression, without the specific variability provided by the landscape, the sin would never occur. The isolation created by Garín's secluded cave dwelling is an active participant and protagonist in the tale. The cave physically separates the Hermit from the sight of other humans and the elements acting as a protective womb (Bereseford 2010), as well as a co-conspirator in murder, and ultimately a tomb. Without the mountain and isolated landscape, Garín would not have the seclusion or space to create his own demons and scene of sin. Harpham's (1987: 55) 'blank monotony' of the external landscape should be reconfigured as an expectant canvas waiting to be sullied with the intrigue and drama of human interaction rather than remain a sterile and inanimate background.

In a desire to escape the community of Barcelona and the larger body of Catalonia representative of the mundane (or profane) world, Garín refrains from any and all social interactions. Even when Count Wilfred seeks the Hermit's aid for his possessed daughter Riquilda, Garín attempts to push away the Count, his daughter, and companions despite the ascetic's charge of giving charity to all those who seek his guidance. Initially Garín attempts to

retain his complete isolation constructed by the remote mountain setting of Montserrat. The Hermit's actions give temporary credence to the separationist arguments in ritual, pilgrimage, and ascetic studies that cite the ability to detach the lay world of action from an ecclesiastical world of theory and the sacred landscape from the profane. Juan Garín believes it possible and necessary to remain a figure distinct and isolated from the mundane flow of time and culture occurring around his mountain. He attempts to exist in a traditional conceptualization of sacred space that is kept contained and apart from the lay space and its natural distractions. However, cenobitism and eremitism share a common familial root and the study and performance of pilgrimage require the dual interactions of the audience and the actor and landscape (sacred and profane). Garín's world of ascetic contemplation cannot take form without the constant interactions and convergences of the lay world which Count Wilfred brings to the mountain. Fray Juan Garín's initial separationist intent on the mountain creates a setting that imbues the Hermit with a false sense of divergence and security from lay or profane interference. The holy man adopts a precautionary rather than reactionary approach towards his religious isolation. The best method to stay away from temptation is to keep it at a distance. However, as the disguised demon reminds Garín, in order to act as Christ did, one must face the desires and temptations of the world, not run from them (Font 1820).

Despite Garín's discomfort with the presence of the Count's daughter in his solitary dwelling 'sintió mucho esta demanda el ermitaño; dio muchas razones para escusarse,' the Hermit eventually consents to help her (Serra y Postius 1745: 53). Although the isolation of his mountain cave creates the perfect setting for an act of healing, which is the reason Riquilda and the Count make the pilgrimage to Garín's cave, the method of his help leads to a flawed performance of charity. The ineffective interactions with sacred and profane (lay) factors through

an attempt of distancing himself from pursuits outside of his ascetic lifestyle caused Fray Garín to commit the triple sin of fornication, murder, and perjury.

The root of Garín's failure to heal Riquilda and his fall into carnal temptation has a twofold basis articulated within the narrative. One contributing factor to the Hermit's failure is the incomplete nature of both his and Riquilda's attempted performances. Garín lacks the necessary focus of intent to create a fully realized performance. The other factor of Garín's downfall comes from his erroneous assumption that an individual can be completely isolated from the larger ecclesiastical or lay community or space. In this manner, the tensions of the ascetic traditions (the cenobitic and eremitic branches) work in concert to establish and expand the ascetic heritage of Montserrat. The interactions of the cenobitic structure and communal system of living and the eremitic solitude within Garín's tale reveal their symbiotic natures rather than a parasitic and antagonistic relationship.

Until this point, the pilgrimage and movements of the Hermit have been discussed, but not those of the secondary, yet crucial character of Riquilda. Her first journey from Barcelona to Juan Garín's cave on Montserrat begins her failed performance of pilgrimage in search of healing and the Hermit's failed charity. The incomplete pilgrimage initiated by Riquilda necessitates the commencement of Garín's own journey to Rome (the center of the Church authority and order) to seek redemption. The death of the Count's daughter forces the order, law, and texts of the Church represented by the Pope to cooperate with Garín's eremitic solitude to resolve Riquilda's performance and construct Montserrat's ascetic identity.

Although the mandates of ascetic life require that eremites show charity to those in need, this benevolence introduces new sources of temptation into the established routine of the solitary hermit. Initially, Garín rejects Riquilda and the Count's request and the disruption of his ascetic

ways. In Serra y Postius' 1745 text, the Hermit even attempts to argue against Riquilda's presence trying to excuse himself on the grounds that the life of a hermit requires solitude. Garín believes that Riquilda would be an impediment to his prayer and that his cramped living quarters within the narrow cave would not provide sufficient room for the both of them (Serra y Postius 1745). The Hermit's rejection of Riquilda begins to affect the performance of pilgrimage sought by the girl. Riquilda's goal in seeking out the renowned figure of Juan Garín is to end her possession. This is the motivation which animates her performance and necessitates a journey to the remote mountain location. The Count and Riquilda's sojourn to Montserrat reflects a version of the travels indicated in the saints lives of the desert eremites (Onnophrius and Paul of Thebes). The tradition of a cenobite seeking education and knowledge from an eremite is replaced by the lay intrusion of the community of Barcelona's ruling family into the Hermit's domain. However, Garín's goal of conducting his own private prayers and internal, solitary performances of piety within his cave act as impediments to the actions of both characters and a form of resistance to the change and evolution of traditional examples of religious travel.

As part of Riquilda's pilgrimage, Garín reluctantly agrees to house her and pray over her for nine days. Nine days plus the time it takes to process from Barcelona to Montserrat and back again would constitute the temporal boundary of Riquilda's performance. However, before the nine-day pilgrimage can be completed, Garín relents to the demonic temptation by having sex with his charge and then killing her. The Hermit's actions do not end Riquilda's pilgrimage, instead, they interrupt the desired product of performance, healing from demonic possession, for nearly seven years while Garín flees the mountain cave for Rome to initiate his own performance and pilgrimage of redemption. Although Riquilda's performance is postponed, her death does not end the desired outcome of her pilgrimage. To say that Riquilda's journey terminates while

Garín enacts his penance places an artificial degree of separation between the actions of the two characters and their dominant spheres of habitation, the Count's home in Barcelona (Riquilda), and Garín's Montserrat cave. Instead of the ecclesiastical structure and hierarchy of cenobitism encroaching upon the solitary wilderness of the eremite, the cenobitic tradition is replaced with the structure and authority of the Count's house of Barcelona that comes together with the eremitic lifestyle in the wilderness of Montserrat.

Riquilda and Garín's interactions do not promote an incompatibility between their two lifestyles. Instead, the entwined nature of their completed performances proposes a link and constructive relationship between the *moneros bios* of ascetic solitude and the mundane *kosmikos* that replaces the cenobitic presence in the desert narratives. The failure of a performance does not consist of a one-way set of conditions where Garín's actions merely prevent or delay Riquilda's completion of pilgrimage. As is the case with the interactions of Paphnutius with Timothy and Onnophrius or of Thaïs with the Abbot who took her from a life of prostitution, the two types of lifestyles represented within the legends (cenobitic structure and authority versus solitary living or the mundane world) need to come together and push one another to elevate the usually titular protagonist to a higher state of being after a period of penance. Riquilda's presence has the ability to affect the performance of Garín's daily prayers and ascetic duties, just as the Hermit has the potential power and reputation to free the girl from her possession. Although the Hermit's pre-penitential and solitary lifestyle does not have the same sense of motion as involved in his later movements of pilgrimage and wandering penance, Garín's earlier routines and prayers still constitute a performance. Juan Garín's creation of art (performance) requires the same components for completion as pilgrimage when considered in the context of the ascetic tradition of storytelling or the mimetic hagiography it represents.

In his *Ascetic Imperative*, Harpham (1987) claims that the desert of the early Christian ascetics was the stage for temptation or the act of transgression. However, the only manner in which the tales of the desert hermits can be told, the only way anyone can observe the stage and its performance, is by the intervention of an outside voice or narrator through hagiographic texts: 'And yet even an imperfect [man-made] account [of the lives of the desert saints] "provides monks with a sufficient picture for ascetic practice" enabling them to imitate his [Antony's] example, to "emulate his purpose"' (Harpham 1987: 5). Harpham considers these texts as providing models of exemplary conduct. The models act as a sort of emergency art written with the intent of answering the uncertainty the desert figures create with regard to the appropriate form and conduct of Christianity as proscribed through the literary tradition. According to Harpham (1987), the writer and audience of texts such as the *Life of Antony* or the *Life of Onnophrius* strive for an impossible and perfect imitation of the topic of the work, the desert saints Antony and Onnophrius. In accordance with Harpham's (1987) linguistically-based ascetic theory, the act of writing a hagiographic text or compilation such as that of Fray Juan Garín, as is the case with the process of writing and enacting a play or performance, has an identifiable motivation for its creation dependent on a culturally generated desire to answer questions posited by the ascetic lifestyle.

Harpham's (1987) analysis of ascetic hagiography also identifies the product of the performance. Central to the appreciation of the works written about the desert saints are the artist's (writer's) and the audience's (reader's/listener's) desires to achieve the religious status of perfection of the eremitic models within the given texts. The final component necessary to equate a hagiographic writing with a work of art as proscribed in performance theory is the temporal boundary of the performance. When it pertains to the production of a written work of

art, the temporal marker is the time it takes the author to complete the physical process of writing the text (Davis 2004). The act of writing a hagiographic text and the tales of the desert ascetics is as much a performance art as the journey of pilgrimage. The hagiographic mimesis forming the structure of Garín's tale borrows the motifs of the solitary cave setting, as well as the cycle of sin, wandering, and redemption from the tradition of ascetic writings. The generation and reception of Garín's text, as is the case with those of the desert eremites, should be read in the light of a performance. Not only does the act of writing a text become a performance, but Garín's life of solitary prayer which purposefully recalls the didactic desires of hagiographic texts further contextualizes his actions within the legend as an educative narrative of performance. However, unlike the *Life of Onnophrius* and the *Life of Anthony,* Garín's legend is an exemplar of how not to act. Instead of being a model of solitary piety, Garín is the antimodel whose performance is doomed to fail. His failure is necessary to establish Montserrat as a unique combination of cenobitic and eremitic practices along with the mundane or lay influence, specifically of the Counts of Barcelona, that are needed to ensure that the site is sustained and functions harmoniously. In the case of Montserrat, it is through Garín and Riquilda's botched, solitary, and self-involved performances that a new proposal of a pilgrimage location built on the coordination and cooperation of communal (cenobitic and lay) and solitary (eremitic) components emerges.

When Garín and Riquilda's interactions are not working in concert to allow the melding of the lay and eremitic spheres they impede each of their desired performances of piety and healing. Although Garín does not carry malicious intent towards Riquilda and at least in words promises to guide and help her, his lack of a genuine desire and devotion to aid the Count's daughter is as detrimental to the performances as the demon's intervention. As Harpham (1987) expresses, in the ascetic discipline imitation (or performance) of a text is the ideal result of such

a lifestyle because the text or written word has a history of establishment. The word is authoritative, structured, and preserved in a set, reproducible, and non-degradable form. It is the scriptural basis for all subsequent performances. The danger of parody or giving a false imitation or performance without a true desire to focus the actor's journey and achieve a determinant goal leads to a false production or performance that lacks a true devotion in the act of the performance's creation. In the case of Garín, this faulty focus of intent leads to sin and penance that the Hermit is incapable of ending without the healing intervention of the Virgin. Montserrat's ascetic eremite has been significantly altered from the tradition of the desert saints. Where the Egyptian eremite was once a capable healer and holy person with a direct line to the words and beings sent from Heaven, the Montserrat hermit has become a figure who needs the guidance of the Pope, the intervention of the Virgin to aid him in the completion of his original promise to heal the Count's daughter, and repeated interactions with the lay court of Barcelona to elevate his status and regain his identity as a holy man.

Conclusion

At first glance, the tale of Fray Juan Garín appears to be a concentrated effort of the Church and the Benedictine Order to promote the structured and guiding influence of the ecclesiastical hierarchy over the devout lifestyle of the individual eremite. As is the case with Paphnutius's (2000) *Life of Onnoprhius*, Garín's tale of penance along with the statue apparition of Montserrat are crafted with order in mind. Garín pays fealty to the wishes of the Count of Barcelona, a figure of political and lay power, as well as deferring to the judgement of the Pope and ecclesiastical hierarchy for his penance. Although Garín initially begins his narrative living in ascetic isolation, it is not until the Pope delivers Garín's penance that the Hermit truly begins

to emulate his roaming desert forbearers who were nearly indiscernible as humans due to their hairy, animalistic appearances. The Church and its human representatives of authority (the Pope) may dictate the terms of Garín's penance and ascetic roaming, but without the original context of the Hermit's life of isolation this prescribed penance would have been unnecessary. Garín's complete isolation from the concerns of the mundane *kosmikos* was the vital catalyst and setting for his sins of pride, fornication, and homicide, rather than the result of previous sins committed in the confines of the lay realm:

> In the desert, the self was not simply circumvented or denied, desire could symbolize, represent, and allegorize the self without the impediment of object. Thus the attempt to escape the desirable world actually pitched the ascetic into the world of desire. (Harpham 1987: 55)

In the isolated landscape of the desert or the mountain 'the external scene provided no resistance to the generation of images [or ideas] which, contained within themselves the very pleasure the ascetic was trying to renounce' (Harpham 1987: 55). Montserrat's unique landscape provides the stage where the hermit, pilgrim, or performer meets with true hardship. By removing the self from other distractions, those desires and flaws of the mind and body come to the forefront. The flaws, concerns, preoccupations, or supplications are given the space necessary to become the center of attention (focus of intent) and find room to develop according to the needs of the lone performer. Without the representation of Church authority, the community-based life of cenobitism replaced by the communal aspects of the family and lay presence of the Count of Barcelona, Garín would never have been lifted from his state of penance. However, the freedom of the harsh, isolated ascetic lifestyle provides the necessary space and inducement of penance that reveal the moral defects of pride and lust that Fray Juan Garín carried in his person. Ascetic

isolation cannot exist without a central Church structure which it acknowledges as it remains on its periphery. As Alarcón Román (2007) discusses in her work on the myth of Juan Garín, the legend of the Hermit begins as a hagiographic text that describes the eremitic tradition prevalent on the mountain. It then evolves into a Marian tale when Count Wilfred appears as a co-founder of the first monastery of Montserrat with the Hermit. Garín becomes the co-council to the Abbess of Montserrat (Riquilda) while he continues to live in ascetic solitude (Serra y Postius 1747). The practice of eremitism gave shape to the first cenobitic community on the mountain which evolved into the Benedictine monastery whose abbots retired to the hermitages of Montserrat. The cenobitic and eremitic communities at Montserrat share a common foundation and parallel evolution that shaped their interactive nature on the mountain's landscape.

This section began with questioning the necessity of pilgrimage to Montserrat. According to performance theory, the performance of an act of piety such as pilgrimage can be attained without the coverage of great distances as long as the performer has a focus of intent. While a focus of intent incorporating an artistic goal, time frame for production, and achievement of a determinant outcome are fundamental to a complete performance, all of these components are dependent on the individual culture and time frame of context in which the pilgrimage or creation of the work takes place. The focus of intent and appreciation of the art produced do not exist in a theoretical sphere hovering outside or on the verge of the participant's daily life. As is the case with the ascetic traditions of eremitism and cenobitism that developed from constant, complimentary, and conflicting interactions with one another, a completed performance relies on the artist's (pilgrim) interaction with the surrounding political, cultural, and ecclesiastical spheres of interests which are constitutive of their integrated socio-cultural experience. Landscape, including natural, constructed, and literary, along with the historical context from which the

setting is developed are essential to a complete understanding of pilgrimage as a performance art production. In order to answer the question of necessity of journey to a specific site of pilgrimage, Montserrat and its unique landscape containing eremitic and cenobitic traditions evident through a mixture of constructed architecture, space, and literary traditions, must be contextualized with regard to the site's ascetic and literary traditions.

Montserrat's isolated landscape of crag-like cliffs and caves combined with its foundation myths and hermitages named after desert saints and Christian martyrs seeks to establish itself as part of the evolution of the early Christian ascetic lifestyle. As is the case with the lives of the desert eremites, Montserrat provides a setting so different from the surrounding environment that its jutting peaks seem alien or otherworldly compared to the encompassing landscape. The mountain offers an almost extremity of isolation comparable to the endless sand dunes of the Thebaid. However, as is the case with the early ascetic tradition it emulates, Montserrat is never truly isolated from the influences of regulation, whether they come from monastic rules or secular hierarchy.

From the hermitages of Saints Onnophrius and John the Baptist, which are higher on the mountain and out of sight of the Monastery and its church, the hills surrounding Barcelona are visible on the horizon. The glimpses of Barcelona and the scattering of small towns at the mountain's base, such as Martorell that existed in the Middle Ages, serve as reminders of the enormity of distance the mountain offers from those centers of commerce. The distance and height further serve to remind the viewer or pilgrim of the worries, concerns, and sins they carry with them from those locations. The isolated desert or mountain landscapes do not serve as blank stages of detachment where pilgrims flee to forget their daily lives and connection to the *kosmikos* (the lay world). The location of Montserrat creates a space embedded within the history

and culture of its immediate geographic location (Catalonia) as well as its place within the wider heritage of Christian dogma and practices.

The mountain landscape of Montserrat replete with numerous caves and an altitude of separation does not only serve as the necessary setting for the creation of individually constructed performances of the pilgrim. The mountain location and specifically its heritage of hermitages carved out of the caves and rock of the mountain also play a wider-ranging role in the development of Christianity into a more intimate and personal religion. The caves of Montserrat inherited physically and metaphorically from the literary tradition of the desert ascetics become the stage and arena where the pilgrims can perform their own versions of the imitation of suffering of Christ, early Christian martyrs, and desert ascetics in a manner reminiscent of liturgical dramas crafted according to individual need.

Chapter Four

The Miraculous Landscape

Introduction

Space and the literary heritage of ascetic desert-dwelling hermits are necessary components in the creation of a pilgrimage at Montserrat. The natural landscape of the site is one such component of the setting or space through which a pilgrim moves, performs, and interacts to create a unique site of pilgrimage. The mountain serves as a physical embodiment or representation of the harsh wilderness of Egypt described in the desert ascetic literary tradition. The early-Christian literary legacy of the desert saints such as Onnophrius, Antony, and Mary of Egypt took a physical form on Montserrat's desolate and solitary landscape through the construction of architectural structures which share namesakes and configurations that recall the lives and locations of the cave-dwelling saints. The physical manifestation of the ascetic tradition on the mountain led to a hybridity of the Montserrat hermit dwellings. The hermitages existed as symbolic forms taken from the ascetic literary heritage which was constructed and regulated by the cenobitic branch of asceticism. The emulation of the symbolic ascetic motifs was then made into tangible and real architectural structures with an interactive presence on the mountain by combining the already extant cave systems of Montserrat with architectural modifications. The oral and written traditions of the desert ascetics built into the natural landscape of Montserrat constructed the setting of performance and pilgrimage as a space of isolation and religious contemplation.

A performance landscape of individual and adaptable suffering arises from the ascetic tradition that shaped the mountain location of Montserrat. The literary tradition of the desert ascetics informed the relationships between personal (ascetic/eremitic) and group (cenobitic)

forms of living and devotion that were adapted into Montserrat's own corpus of texts through the literary figure of Fray Juan Garín and in the namesakes of the hermitages on the mountain. The ascetic literary heritage is only one method in which the landscape, cultural, and religious traditions relevant to Montserrat interacted to manipulate the space and determine the creation and the performance of pilgrimage. Although the ascetic influence on the mountain landscape favors a consideration of the space as removed from the immediate distractions of mundane (profane) life through an emphasis on saints and isolated asceticism, Montserrat was constantly connected to the larger socio-economic structure of Barcelona as a result of its geography and foundation legends of the Virgin statue and Juan Garín.

The mountain of Montserrat is a desolate, arid, and isolated place. Montserrat's literary tradition describes the ascetic life and practices of the hermit Juan Garín in the appropriately secluded setting. However, holy figures (saints and hermits) and clergymen are not the only actors involved in Montserrat's foundation myths and miracles. Every sector of society contributed to the discovery of the Virgin statue in the apparition legend. In Garín's penance, the Hermit interacts with his religious superior (the Pope). However, his redemption does not come from the Pope, but from the Count of Barcelona's infant son. The ascetic heritage or literary tradition of Saints Onnophrius, Antony, and Jerome engaged with the physical presence and form of the mountain of Montserrat to create a landscape vital to the complete performance of pilgrimage. A physical landscape is necessary to promote the ascetic interactions of the pilgrim with the mountain. However, the desert hagiography and its emphasis on the figure of the desert saint or isolated hermit is not the only literary influence that helped create and develop Montserrat into a site of pilgrimage. The miracle texts of Montserrat, beginning with the first recorded events (the Virgin apparition and the penance of Fray Juan Garín), provide an

additional medium to discuss how the landscape of pilgrimage (symbolic and physical) interacts with the individual during the performance of pilgrimage.

This thesis proposes through discussions of landscape aesthetic theories and performance theory that the pilgrim's interaction with space is a vital component in the creation of the performance and art. The aesthetic theories that relate to appreciations of the beauty and art of nature, as proposed by Allen Carlson (2000) and Noël Carroll (2001), utilize a background of scientific information as their textual sources of literary heritage to engage the environment in an appropriately aesthetic manner. Performance theory uses scripts and scores rather than scientific knowledge to build an understanding of the surrounding cultural environment that aids in the production and interpretation of a play or performance partially informed by the audience of reception. Utilizing a consideration of these methods of discussing art or performance, the textual sources and previously written or culturally shared knowledge needs to be considered when discussing performance art and the actor, artist, or observer's interaction with the landscape. Texts or scripts inform the method in which to interact with a setting, they also help to develop an understanding of how the actor should interpret and move within the location of performance. The following discussion looks at further examples from Montserrat's literary history to determine the impact such sources had on the physical performance of the individual pilgrim as an embodied actor and audience journeying through the specific landscape.

The texts analyzed to determine the manner in which literary sources and hagiographic traditions affected the pilgrim's interaction and construction of space during pilgrimage are the transcribed pilgrim accounts of the processions to Montserrat preserved in Pedro Alfonso de Burgos's sixteenth-century text the *Libro de la historia y milagros, hechos a invocación de Nuestra Señora de Montserrate* (1594). The miracles of Montserrat will continue to be

considered as acts of pilgrimage and performance, but with an additional approach in the analysis of the miracle texts as forms of popular liturgy such as enacted in liturgical dramas. Liturgy entails the ritual or regular services performed by clergy and the public or corporeal worship of pilgrimage and cults of relics (Draper 1987). It can also be considered a communal form of worship of the Christian Church (Hiley 1993) which had distinguishing characteristics such as its use of procession. Reynolds (2000) designates the component of procession as a form of drama characterized by its use of dialogue, action, and impersonation or representation. The dialogue of Reynolds' drama consists of actions of speech such as a monologue, but can also include the use of proclamations and gesticulations to portray meaning through the action of the procession which occurs between the actors (two or more) in the drama. The impersonation consists of people or statues representing or emulating figures of the Church, such as Christ and the saints. According to Reynolds (2000), in his depiction of drama as a religious procession, the clerics involved held prominent positions in the activities. The author does claim that the laity were also actors in the processions, usually through a specific role played in the drama or by carrying items. However, the lay population was excluded from directly participating in most forms of Church liturgy, except for the processions (Reynolds 2000). In dramas such as the Easter processions or feast day festivities, Church ritual tends to be heavily regulated by the clergy as they ensure the appropriated rituals are performed according to the liturgical calender. These are reoccurring or cyclical processions that equate to specific times in the Church calender (Reynolds 2000) and are highly regularized and necessitate the prominent presence of the clergy. However, the infrequent processions which do not take place on a regular basis, such as a pilgrimage (Reynolds 2000), are dramas of procession and acts of worship that give the lay populace a larger part to play in the dramas.

The creation of a work of art such as a play is an active process comparable to a liturgical drama defined as the ritual enactment or drama (procession) involved in pilgrimage which is one of the communal (and individual) forms of worship of the Christian Church. The performance of a play and processions of liturgical dramas or pilgrimages all contain David Davies' (2004) elements of performance theory that lead to the completion of a focus of appreciation: they have an artistic goal, a specification of time, and achieve a determinant outcome utilizing dialogue, action, and impersonation (Reynolds 2000). Each performance is also dependent on a scriptural or textual background combined with the actor's own interpretation of the work and their interactions with the audience and setting of the performance. The only differences between the current definitions and approaches to studies regarding a play, liturgical drama, and this thesis's conceptualization of pilgrimage as performance is that pilgrimage places the role of actor and audience of the performance within the single body of the pilgrim and requires a revision of currently held theories of the role of space or landscape within the performance.

The comparison of the written pilgrimage accounts that detail the Virgin of Montserrat's miraculous influence in the lives of the pilgrim actor to the processed and performed church liturgy (or liturgical dramas) is not a modern observation. Alfonso X's *Cantigas de Santa Maria* set six of the Montserrat miracles to music. These *Cantigas* combined the historical accounts of Montserrat with an oral performative aspect similar to the Psalms, virelai, and antiphons sung within the dramatic cathedral setting. The performance and composition of music in such dramas reflected their historical and theological contexts and were involved in and determined the liturgical and devotional experience (Boynton 2009). Although this form of popular liturgy is in the vernacular (a Galician-Portuguese dialect), the *Cantigas* and their enactments and performances had their roots in the tales of the miracles and liturgy attributed to the Virgin of

Montserrat. The enacted versions of the miracles adhere to the previously provided definition of liturgical drama. They involved procession and ritual movement as a form of drama constitutive of the use of dialogue, action, and impersonation (Reynolds 2000). The *Cantigas* could have been enacted near the shrine of Montserrat, on the way there, or at churches dedicated to the Virgin on feast days throughout the Iberian Peninsula. They were set to music that could be chanted and related events that dealt with the abilities of the Virgin Mary. The songs, movement, and form of worship indicative of liturgical drama are prevalent features of Montserrat from the inception of pilgrimage to the mountain location exemplified by the processing community of Manresa in the apparition narrative. The rubrication and texts of the 'Stella Splendens' and 'O Virgo Splendens' sung by the pilgrims while near the Virgin's shrine also denote the active nature of the dramas.

An analysis of the landscape and space presented within the miracles of Montserrat will determine the degree to which pilgrimage was influenced by a heritage of the textual narratives and how the interactions with space and the routes of each individual performance were dictated and manipulated by those sources. After the nature of drama in the sources is explored, procession, movement, and the interaction with spaces during the performance of pilgrimage will be compared to theories of space and the interactions of liturgy-based or liturgical dramas that utilize processional movement in the enactments of their source texts.

Liturgical Drama

The term *drama* is one almost as variable as *art*. While the definition of liturgical drama as an enacted procession or performance relating to Church texts or traditions as a form of worship is more specific, the overarching concept of drama as performance receives a much

vaguer denomination. To understand how individual instances of liturgical dramas or performances of pilgrimage interact with, change, and adapt to a landscape, the platform of discussing such plays or works of art must be understood in reference to the wider rhetoric used in studies of drama. Once an understanding of drama and specific performances or processions (liturgical dramas) within a church setting have been established, the discussion can expand to include considerations of pilgrimage (drama) that occur outside an architectural setting. The specific liturgical drama that will begin the analysis of space and drama is the *Visitatio Sepulchri* celebrated during Easter. Dunbar Ogden's (2005) article, 'The *Visitatio Sepulchri*: Public Enactment and Hidden Rite', focuses on the function of the *Visitatio Sepulchri*, a dramatic scene extrapolated from the Biblical tale of Christ's Resurrection and his empty tomb. Through an analysis of the text and movements implied in the wording and staging of the *Visitatio*, Ogden addresses how a ritual performance (a drama) can transform into a liturgical drama.[1]

At this juncture, the actors, themes, and text of the *Visitatio Sepulchri* do not need to be discussed. What is useful from Ogden's article to the current section is his proposed definition of drama. According to the author, a drama is a public performance with an audience. The congregation or audience becomes directly involved in the action and is taught through a combination of mimesis, dramatic lines and characters, music, and other such methods (Ogden 2005). Similarly, Rainer Warning's (2001) *The Ambivalence of Medieval Religious Drama*, addresses the public and performative nature of *celebration*, which is his term for drama. From Karl Young's (1962) work on drama in the medieval Church to contemporary authors such as

[1] Performance and procession are used interchangeably in the current discussion regarding drama.

Warning (2001) and Ogden (2005), medieval drama or dramatic liturgy is continually categorized as having a very public and interactive nature. Although scholars since Young have indicated that his method of analysis of medieval drama is dated, the aspects of theater that Young cited as constitutional of drama remain unchanged. As is the case with Young (1962), Reynolds (2000), Warning (2001), and Ogden (2005) promote the use of dialogue, singing, instruments, and mimesis, along with a sense of activity in the movement and posture of the actors as necessary components in the creation of a theatrical performance. These aspects of theater are also present during the creation of liturgical drama.

From the above descriptions and attempts of defining the concept of drama and how it dictates instances of specific works of liturgical drama, certain characteristics synonymous with pilgrimage as performance appear. Both a performance and drama are public acts that necessitate an audience to be complete. Additionally, drama as performance requires the interaction of the audience and actors through a diverse array of movement, gesticulations, and at times musical accompaniment. The confluence of requirements for drama and performance and the similarity of definition and action of the enactments propose that the creation and employment of processional routes (such as utilized during the performance of liturgical dramas) are relevant to the movements of the pilgrim through the landscape of Montserrat.

When the *Visitatio Sepulchri* drama was employed during Easter, the actors followed a fixed, yet adaptable route through the nave and choir to arrive at the altar or other architectural structure that represented Christ's empty tomb. The enactment would take place at the tomb and the rest of the Easter service would follow. The drama and its corresponding literary heritage were used to specify how the actors and audience interacted and moved through the space. If pilgrimage is considered a performance and equal to an enactment of liturgical drama, it is

necessary to determine whether Montserrat had similar specified locations that served as physical representations of literary-based events involved in guiding movement and the development of the Virgin's cult and landscape interactions at the site.

From the histories, ascetic heritage, and foundation myths of Montserrat a variety of locations emerge as pertinent to the development of the site as a pilgrimage destination. Within the narrative of the statue apparition, the cave where the Virgin was discovered, as well as the location where the statue stopped, and the site of the first chapel dedicated to the Virgin are fundamental to the creation and development of the Virgin's cult and the ascetic identity of the mountain. Visitors can still visit Montserrat and walk from the Monastery to the *Santa Cova* (Sacred Cave) where the statue was unearthed. The Sacred Cave does not appear in the tale of Juan Garín, but the newly erected chapel to the Virgin representing the cave of discovery receives a visit from the Hermit and Count Wilfred towards the end of the legend. Other sites named by Montserrat's historians as extant locations from the foundation frequently visited in the eighteenth century are the caves inhabited by Juan Garín and the devil hermit in the tale of Garín's penance as well as the general wild and isolated atmosphere of the mountain.

These sites were locations of key plot moments in the foundation narratives and also the destinations of multiple pilgrimages by the protagonists. In addition to the areas mentioned in the foundation myths, Serra y Postius' histories list the fourteen hermitages of Montserrat as locales that 'a estos visitan los cavalleros, quanto más los peregrinos: a estos los duques, los principes, los reyes y hasta los emperadores' (1747: 13). While Pedro Serra y Postius details the types of pilgrims that journeyed to Montserrat and provides a description of the mountain landscape, he only focuses on the two foundation myths or original miracles of Montserrat and their settings. The author notes that there are many other recorded miracles, referring the reader to Padre Abad

Fray Pedro Alfonso de Burgos' text for the full listing of miracles performed by the Virgin of Montserrat. Burgos' work containing the full-text compilation of the miracles of Montserrat is analyzed to discover the impact the miracle/hagiographic literary heritage had on the pilgrim interactions with the physical landscape of the mountain. In order to understand how the hagiographic literary landscape affected and interacted with the pilgrimage landscape at the mountain during the pilgrim's journey a survey of the theories of the construction and utilization of space in church-based dramas is necessary before extending the conversation to the performance landscape of pilgrimage to Montserrat.

Forms of liturgical dramas, such as the *Visitatio Sepulchri* (the visitation to Christ's tomb) processed during the Easter season tended to follow prescribed routes within the church that incorporated the architectural structure into the wording and performance of the liturgy. For the *Visitatio*, some sort of architecture, whether a temporary movable structure, an altar, or a tomb-like construction acted as a necessary, fixed location for the completion of the performance. The structure representing the sepulcher (Christ's tomb) was a site where the Mary's within the drama (the Virgin Mary, Mary Magdalene, and Mary the mother of James) approached in order to portray to the audience that the tomb was empty and that Christ has risen as prophesized. When looking at the interior performance of a liturgical drama situated within or near a church structure, discrete and easily identifiable locations where predetermined acts of mimesis and repetition occur are necessary to the performance of the enactments and drama. The problematic nature of connecting the actions of the pilgrim body to a fixed location, space, or series of managed steps imposed on a landscape of performance becomes evident when exploring the theories of space and its context and use in medieval ritual, drama, and performance.

The contextualization of liturgical enactments in the 1970s emphasized medieval dramas as a process of imitation of Biblical events, such as the life and trials of Christ (Davidson 1974; Flanigan 1974). As Clifford Davidson (1974) notes in his work on medieval drama, through these dramas or performances, spectators imagined themselves as contemporaries to the characters of the liturgy unfolding before them. The mimetic nature of the enactment gave the performance an iconic or allegorical quality which stressed the symbolism of the events over the realism. Flanigan's work on the liturgical contextualization of the 'Quem Quaeritis' trope, a dialogic interchange within the *Visitatio Sepulchri* performed during Easter services, also focuses on the imitative nature of these performances. According to him, ritual, an activity considered synonymous with drama and performance within the scope of this thesis, is 'an act in which its celebrants seek to imitate the actions of gods in a way that the past events which are commemorated are thought to be rendered present once again for the benefit for the cultic community' (1974: 49). The concept of liturgical drama, performance, or pilgrimage as symbolic imitations occurring within the shrine vicinity is not limited to research of the 1970s.

Hilary Powell (2014) cites mimesis as one of the motivations or consequences of pilgrimage to St. Aebbe's shrine in Scotland. The physical participation expected of the pilgrims took the form of mimetic rituals. By performing and embodying the physical acts required for the healing process, the pilgrims adopted the mantel and previous life of their saint (Powell 2014). Recent studies on theatrical performances and performance theory also seek to denote the importance of mimesis in the act of creating theater. However, authors who study theories of theatrical performances and cognition such as David Davies (2004), Bruce McConachie (2008), and Nicola Shaughnessy (2013) are quick to note that mimesis does not consist of merely seeing or hearing something and repeating the observed actions. Performance theory requires that a

completed performance addresses the concerns of a focus of appreciation which has an initial artistic goal, a finite duration, and achieves a determinant outcome, all of which depend on the interactions between the artist and the audience. Mimesis or the playing of a character or specific role requires a certain component of repetition to ensure that a performance can be re-enacted for a new audience. However, each instance of mimesis or each recitation of the lines of a play becomes a completely unique performance determined not only by the actors repeating lines, but also through their interactions with what they observe in the audience and the setting during the performance. The transmission, observance, and later interpretation of visual and auditory cues occur during the creation and enactment of a work. The pilgrims' capacity as actors and audiences of the performance necessitates that they engage with the entire landscape of the production not one fixed point or scene within the ritual setting.

The processes of perception and the ability to interpret texts or previously heard legends of saints and imitate those acts is highly involved and draws on auditory and visual stimuli in addition to the individual actor's past experiences. The combination of these factors and the actor's continued participation in an analysis of such events or performances formulate an individual's response and capacity for mimesis (McConachie 2008; Shaughnessy 2013). Imitation, emulation, or mimesis discussed in the variety of pilgrimage types described in Chapter Two's tale of Juan Garín (the *curative*, *intermediary*, and *emulative*) can aid in the analysis of the performance of liturgical dramas and pilgrimage as long as the mimesis is understood as one part of an act of art construction. Mimesis is dependent on a combination of the pilgrims' individual and personal histories, needs, and their relation to the current religious journey and the wider socio-economic society of which they are a part. However, an allegorical or symbolic reinterpretation or a role or character is not the only aim or factor involved in the

enactment of a religious drama or ritual. The re-conceptualization of liturgical drama theories and their approach to mimesis is required to understand fully the relationship between the pilgrim and the landscape in which the drama or performance is enacted. Mimesis is only the first component of drama necessary to develop an understanding of the limitations that symbolic concepts of space and roles (of the actor and audience) within medieval religious dramatic theories place on the performances of pilgrimage.

Along with mimesis, which they cite as one of the core characteristics of liturgical drama, Davidson (1974) and Flanigan (1974) also underscore the distinct notion of time and a specialized sense of space as indicative of the iconic nature of ritual or drama. The emphasis on symbolism or the allegorical nature inherent in mimesis, space, time, and action related to liturgical drama and examples of dramatic pilgrimages contained within a church precinct contribute to a warped sense of the necessity of discrete and manageable routes or locations for performance. When the actor of a drama or performance is understood as miming symbolic action only within a contained and specialized or sacred space, the landscape's contribution to the ritual is nullified. The dramatic reinterpretation or role of the actor that takes place within the church or along proscribed processional routes becomes the primary motivating factor in the development of the drama. The root of the limitation of spatial conceptualization within studies of liturgical drama, as well as performance and ritual theories, lies in the continued persistence to designate and differentiate fixed points of ritual space into two conflicting spheres derived from the dichotomy of iconic or symbolic action (the ecclesiastical actors) versus the sphere of realism and ordinary acts (the lay audience). The literary or symbolic tradition of a site overshadows the physical realities of the natural landscape creating a wholly allegorical reading of a location.

Davies' (2004) performance theory promotes art as a production or performance of creation specific to a unique combination of artist, artist attention, audience, culture, and time frame. Previous versions of a theory under the same designation similarly identify time, action, and location (more geographical than cultural) as integral to ritual performance activities. Richard Schechner's (1988) interpretation of performance theory is useful to exemplify the continued focus on the fixed, symbolic locations and timing of ritual dramas or performances.

As is the case with Davies' (2004) performance theory, Schechner (1988) insists that designations of time are integral and act as the basic qualities shared by different performance activities. He divides time into three categories: *event*, *set*, and *symbolic*. *Event* and *symbolic time* are relevant to the current consideration of ritual, drama, and pilgrimage. Schechner (1988) promotes the time of performance activities as adaptable to the individual events and susceptible to variations of creative distortions. However, *event time* does not allow for the fluidity of art creation promoted by Davies' theory or the variability of performance which occurs in the foundation legends of Montserrat. *Event time* imposes a rigid requirement of sequentially completed steps on a ritual performance (Schechner 1988). According to this view of ritual activity, unless all the steps are completed, a performance will never end. While Powell's (2014) account of St. Aebbe requires the stationary elements of Schechner's *event time* and even promotes the viability of such a view of time, Montserrat's performance and pilgrimage require an alternate and more flexible approach. In order to invoke the Virgin of Montserrat certain criteria should be met. However, neither the miracles or foundation narratives are so rigid as to imply that only one specific time frame or sequence of events will garner the desired outcome of a completed performance of pilgrimage. What is expected to occur rarely happens as each performance is individually tailored to the pilgrim's circumstances. This fluctuation and almost

antagonistic interaction between expectation and reality is a key factor in the foundation of Montserrat prevalent in the legend of the Virgin statue and the penance of Fray Juan Garín. As the Virgin statue and community process and interact in the apparition narrative, the presence of the two groups of potential actors and spectators (the statue and the community members) destroys the route and goal to the cathedral pre-selected by the bishop of Manresa. The preconceived expectations of holy men are also rewritten in the tale of Juan Garín by the interaction of the body of the Hermit acting as a holy object that commits multiple sins and falls due to the catalytic presence of the Count and Riquilda. Montserrat demolishes any preconceived notions of strictly ordered timing related to stational ritualistic movement and activity by describing how human interactions with objects, locations, and personifications of religious figures override what has been written and decided upon by outside categorization of authorities such as clerics or theoreticians.

Schechner's (1988) additional category of *symbolic time* introduces the problem of a strict understanding of space regarding ritual and the enactment's place in the debate of symbolic or iconic reality versus ordinary realism. *Event time* requires a specified sequence of acts to occur for a ritual performance to be realized. *Symbolic time* has no such linear component. However, it requires that the activity of the ritual not be thought of in simple chronological terms of minutes and hours. The symbolism of the term's designation derives from considering the ritual actions as outside the regular progression of linear time recalling Eliade's (1959) concept of sacred manifestations as being inherently distinct from the reality of the natural landscape. This time is focused on imitation or as Powell (2014) claims, is a re-visiting and re-enacting of scenes from Biblical and hagiographic histories. In other words, a ritual action 'seeks to bring about the reality it proclaims' where the community involved experiences a liturgical act

characterized by ‘a distinct set of time’ (Flanigan 1974: 49). According to Schechner’s performance theory, this distinct mindset of symbolic Christian time cannot occur in any open location. The specific combination of rigid *event* and *symbolic time* required of ritual performance must occur in ‘special places non-ordinary places’ which are set aside for ritual activity only (Schechner 1988: 6). This fixed conceptualization of separate and special locations for ritual forces a distinction between time designations and different types of performances. Schechner places religious performances in a closed and segregated category separated from those performance activities that he deems more open and similar to theater such as plays and sports. The concept of ritual time existing as a distinct occurrence and somehow elevated above everyday activity of the mundane world requires that symbolic and sacred spaces are created to hold the Christian performance of ritual that ‘encourage their members to look beyond historical time and events’ (Hayes 2003: 5).

Localized, controlled, and strictly managed spaces emerge as the points of reference from the above theories of historic time and ritual symbolism or Christian time. A specified, centralized location of worship with detailed stational steps of performance may be the traditional and preferable approach to understanding liturgical drama, especially if looking at a pilgrimage route which incorporates long stretches of open land. There is a logical desire to address how the perceived sacred space was utilized and formally structured within the minds of the participants engaged in the performance as actors and audience. However, as the following discussion of a designated sacred space argues, such a segregating approach fails to address adequately more open sites of pilgrimage that exist beyond the church precinct and move through phases of interactions with architectural and natural settings such as the mountain shrine of Montserrat.

One of Schechner's defining attributes of performance activities, other than the adaptable concepts of time, is that performance or ritual activities require rules within the specified ritual space. Rules or cultural conventions exist to help guide and define ritual performance. Davies (2004) and McConachie (2008) cite such guidelines or an artist's knowledge and utilization of cultural norms and acceptable practices as key to creating a completed work of art. The rubrication written to aid pilgrims in the singing of 'Stella Splendens' at the Church of Montserrat can be considered a necessary rule imposed by the Benedictines to keep order amongst the celebrating devout. The *Cantigas de Santa Maria* also exemplify that procession and pilgrimage to the mountain require that the devout engage in the activities with good intentions or they will be punished until they correct their actions, such as occurs to the pilgrim thief in *Cantiga* 302. Furthermore, the miracles of Montserrat imply certain actions required during the invocation of the Virgin such as lighting a candle and calling upon Mary with a heart full of confidence and devotion (*Abrégé* 1723). Rules and guidelines assist pilgrims to complete the performance of pilgrimage. What is problematic about Schechner's claim is the degree which regulation and a specified sacred space control the enactment and activities of ritual: 'the rules are designed not only to tell the players [pilgrims/actors] how to play but to defend the activity against encroachment from the outside […]. Special rules exist, are formulated, and persist because these activities are something apart from everyday life' (Schechner 1988: 11). According to the author, since the timing and regulation of ritual create a theoretical desire to segregate pilgrimage from everyday affairs, a specific central location is needed to allow the performance to occur without outside interference. Schechner's understanding of performance and ritual refers to modern versions of the events or contemporary religious practices. He advocates that ritual can only occur in church buildings or structures which remain empty most

of the time (Schechner 1988). Medievalists studying religious drama portray the locations of their rituals as more active and audience engaging than Schechner, but with respect to space, the church is still of central importance to the performances of ritual.

In order to address the accepted complacency of a set church location or systemized progression route and its detrimental effect on medieval studies of the performance of ritual (liturgical drama or pilgrimage), the following section analyzes the use of spaces in liturgical dramas, specifically in the *Visitatio Sepulchri* involved in medieval Easter celebrations. The *Visitatio Sepulchri* and its related studies within churches have been chosen because this particular drama has historical ties with Catalonia and Benedictine communities such as those present at Montserrat. The imagery of the resurrected Christ and the Marys who approach the empty tomb also echo the final scene of the penance of Fray Juan Garín when the Hermit and Count Wilfred discover Riquilda alive in the cave.

Ritual Drama and the Visitatio Sepulchri

The *Visitatio Sepulchri* is a drama developed from the liturgy of Christ's resurrection and is usually performed at the end of Matins on Easter Sunday morning. Depending on the individual church and its customs, this performance could have taken place later in the day or on Easter Monday (Ogden 2002). The drama of the *Visitatio* and its dialogic trope 'Quem Quaeritis?' (whom do you seek?) occurred in a variety of circumstances and architectural settings throughout southern France, Catalonia, and beyond. The wide dissemination of the drama gives a potential of flexibility to the Easter liturgy (Symes 2004). Although the focal point of the liturgical drama's action is the empty tomb discovered after Christ's Resurrection, the site of the tomb within an individual church could vary greatly. The performance of the *Visitatio*

Sepulchri had an adaptability in the drama's creation and manipulation of the physical space of enactment within the church and in the degree of flexibility of the actors' movements. The following basic structure of the *Visitatio Sepulchri* comes from a twelfth-century version of the Easter ritual found in the *Fleury Playbook*.

On the Sunday after Christ's death, the actors playing the three Marys (the Virgin Mary, Mary Magdalene, and Mary the mother of James) approach the tomb. Finding it empty, they begin a futile search for Christ's body. The Marys continue to search, but are unable to find the body until an angel appears and asks: 'Quem quaeritis in sepulchro, o Cristicolae?' The Marys respond 'Jesum Nazarenum crucifixum, O caelicola!' (Thomas 2001: 27).[2] The Marys then receive an admonition from the angelic servant. 'Quid, Christicolae, viventem quaeritis cum mortuis? Non est hic! Sed surrexit, praedixit ut discipulis' (Thomas 2001: 28).[3] After the angelic reprobation, the Marys publicly proclaim the Resurrection to the assembled audience.

The text of the *Visitatio* continues and could include a short scene with the apostles Peter and John (Thomas 2001). The above excerpt, although reproduced in a variety of churches and cultures, was adaptable to the specific architectural environment of the structure in which it was enacted. According to Ogden (2002), the Marys could have followed a path through the nave to the high altar or to the structure that served as the tomb. When available and depending on the tradition of the designated church, the actors could alternatively process to another more private

[2] '"Whom are you seeking in the tomb, O Christians?" The Marys respond "Jesus Christ who was crucified, O creature from Heaven."'

[3] 'Why are you searching for he who is living as if he had died? He is not here! But he has risen, as he told his disciples.'

chapel of the church and perform the liturgical drama obscured from the gathered congregation. Then the actors would return to an area of the church where they could be witnessed by the audience and publically proclaim Christ's Resurrection (Ogden 2002 & 2005).

Although such studies on the drama of the *Visitatio Sepulchri* claim a diversity and adaptability of form and enactment, an understanding of the variability of drama is greatly hindered by the connection of such liturgical performances to a procession within a contained interior space of the church. Generally, the *Visitatio* was meant to be performed within a church and in front of a lay congregation. However, Warning (2001), Ogden (2002 & 2005), Hayes (2003), and others who study dramatic performances and rituals such as the *Visitatio* do not reserve their observations to the Easter Drama alone. The *Visitatio* becomes a standard by which other enactments of dramatic or liturgical performances are studied, regardless of whether the site of procession and dramatic mimesis takes place at an outdoor setting such as pilgrimage to St. Aebbe's shrine in Scotland or within a church.

The *Visitatio Sepulchri* is a well-known and widely disseminated piece of liturgical drama that is used as an example to promote theoretical discussions of religious drama in relation to the medieval Church and the individual body of the actors or audience members. A narrow view and definition of drama arises from adapting examples of internal performance such as the *Visitatio* to processions or other such ritual movements and dramatic enactments. The studies of internal liturgical dramas focus on 'the location of the set piece [Christ's tomb] determined essentially the pattern of the actors' movements and thus the theatrical employment of the church space' (Ogden 2002: 39). It is nearly impossible to consider any enactment of liturgical drama or performance without referencing its relationship or dependence on the standard church structure. The dependence on a specified sacred internal architecture housing dramatic performances gives

set pieces and locations within a church too much agency to dictate performance when discussing ritual movement and pilgrimage. The nature of performance within a church and those that take place in a natural setting are more complex than proposed by liturgical studies' emphasis on scripted mimesis and symbolic time and space. When the study of drama is artificially forced to remain within the space of the church or specifically marked and managed routes (internal and external to the church), drama and ritual become the perpetuators of the sacred versus profane divide. This imposed division restricts the proportion of the population involved in the dramatic proceedings. Only the clergy and other members of the church are allowed to be the actors in such a simulation. They serve as the managers of the contained sacred space and enactors of mimesis within the ritual performances while the lay congregation acts as silent witness to the predetermined scenes.

Discussions of the space, staging, and act of witnessing liturgical dramas have evolved since Young's *The Drama of the Medieval Church* (1967). However, the understanding of drama and liturgy as public enactments accompanied by a mimetic set of actions and performed by characters converging in an appropriate setting remains constant in the consideration of the medieval Church and drama. Young first listed the purpose of liturgical dramas such as the *Visitatio Sepulchri* 'to adorn the liturgical text, to enforce its meaning, and to enlarge its emotional appeal' (1967: 178). Young's study focuses on extra-liturgical dramas and tropes such as the addition to the *Visitatio Sepulchri* in the form of the 'Quem quaeritis?' dialogue of the three Marys. These tropes serve as models told in a public setting to educate the lay audience. The clergy are the actors and it is their job to mime and perform for the benefit of the uneducated masses. Lesley K. Twomey, in her study on liturgy of the Virgin's Conception feast, cites the educative and authoritative characteristic of the dramatic celebrations:

> Liturgy is one of the principal mediators of authority. It was a vehicle for transmitting information about the feast and its nature, as well as underlining its divine origin. In this way, its role was to stimulate public devotion. It was also a way of providing knowledge about new types of authority. (2008: 22)

Liturgy and the texts which the dramatic performances are derived from, such as Alfonso's *Cantigas* performed in churches dedicated to Mary on feast days, have the capacity to transmit information regarding the reason for the celebration and how to perform and complete the drama. However, the focus on liturgy as the educative authority to be transmitted to or performed on behalf of the lay populace situates the lay person as an audience member who will always be directed by the actions contained within the liturgical texts and traditions. The educative and authoritative aspects of the liturgy recall the approach to pilgrimage studies of John Eade and Michael Sallnow (1991) with their emphasis on the role of the shrine location as a vessel into which the pilgrims empty their needs and desires while being directed in their actions by the shrine staff or actors:

> The power of a shrine, therefore, derives in large part from its character almost as a religious void, a ritual space […] though of course the shrine staff might attempt, with varying degrees of success, to impose a single, official discourse. (1991: 15)

The shrine staff or Benedictine monks of Montserrat influenced the acts of the pilgrims once they reached the mountain by directing them how to celebrate and correctly honor the Virgin of Montserrat through the guidance of the 'Stella Splendens'. However, the shrine is not the empty vessel or the only space of interaction during the performance of pilgrimage or liturgical drama. The interactions that occur in the landscape of the performance should not only pertain to the educative efforts of the sacred texts enacted by the clergy within a perceived sacred space. The

narrative of Young's didactic and public consideration of drama that favors the control of the ecclesiastical actor over the lay witness or audience continues to determine the interactions of actor and audience as well as the conceptualization and nature of space refined in the study of the *Visitatio Sepulchri* and other examples of liturgical drama. Young's ideology has developed to designate and distinguish not only the actor and liturgy's authoritative influence from the audience's role as witness, but also ritual from drama.

The diverse aspects and variability of drama initially depicted in the different routes used to complete the Easter drama limit the potential interactions of the pilgrims as actors and audience with the landscape during the creation of ritual, drama, and performance. Ogden (2002 & 2005) mentioned that the Marys of the 'Quem Quaeritis?' could take a route through the nave to the choir or enact the majority of their performance in a side chapel. The citation of distinct locations of performance for the *Visitatio* further separates the ritual space of the church interior into differing designations of action for the locations of liturgical drama. Ogden (2005) adopts Young's (1967) conceptualization of *drama* as a public event where the congregation is involved as spectator and didactic and mnemonic tools are used by the actors dramatically to relate a narrative. This drama equates with the version of the *Visitatio Sepulchri* that allows the clergy to be in view of the laity for the majority of the performance (when the Marys process through the nave into the choir). However, according to Ogden (2005), there is a distinction between this public enactment of drama and the *Visitatio* procession that moves away from the main populace of the nave to occur in a smaller chapel. The second type of hidden rite celebrated in private and concealed from the majority of the lay population is designated as *ceremony* (Ogden 2005).

Warning (2001) also draws a distinction between public and private acts of religious drama. He desires to re-engage with medieval drama and reinvigorate its style of analysis, yet he

focuses on the same designations as provided by previous scholars. As in the case with the arguments found in Young's (1967) earlier monograph, Warning (2001) distinguishes drama from other activities through its public and didactic nature. He divides church drama into *celebration* and *rite*. *Celebration* is the same concept as found in Ogden's (2005) definition of *drama*. It is merely allocated a different title. Warning's (2001) *celebration* is a public and didactic system of allegory and repetition. *Rite* equates with the aspects of ceremony that are invisible and private sacraments making the term synonymous with what Ogden considers *liturgy*. *Rite* and *liturgy* can be used interchangeably, similarly to how this thesis uses performance and pilgrimage in the same contexts.

The aforementioned definitions of medieval drama contribute to the inability of the church structure to house dramatic activities/performances that are simultaneously private and public. Ritual and drama cannot be synonymous with the performed enactment and the movements of the actors and audience involved with their corresponding interpretations. Instead, ritual and drama become separated within the church. The actors of the drama are the clergy who perform the liturgy with the lay public and their education in mind. However, the clergy can take the same drama and turn it into a private rite or ritual away from the lay or profane elements of the congregation. In such a system, the clergy are the actors, managers, and teachers while the laity becomes the expectant, almost passive audience that must wait on the clergy to receive a brief glimpse of the sequestered sacred and private rites. When drama is treated as an act of gift-giving of one section of society to another (Ogden 2002), any performance of piety, including pilgrimage, becomes created and dictated by the physical structures and bureaucracy of the Church institution. The idea that the physical structure of the Church and its actors (the clergy) contain the sole power to disseminate information and create rite and rituals imposes an arbitrary

distinction between the clergy and laity, while simultaneously alienating the sacred and profane realms from one another within the space of liturgical celebration. Even in studies of dramatic or liturgical processions that occur within the wider context of the city or areas of the church outside the choir, such as the Chartres Palm Sunday procession, the emphasis of the movement and dramatic action involved is still placed on the clergy as reenactors or commemorators of religious events. The clergy's duty was to progress to different stational churches in or near the town of Chartres to demonstrate the unity of the Christian community during the Palm Sunday procession (Wright 2000). The clergy continued to be considered the only actors and motivators of performance with the church highlighted as the main staging area of the procession utilizing exits and entrances into the holy space to replicate Christ's journey into Jerusalem.

The separation of drama or performance into public (profane) and private (sacred) components creates a tension between the two that must be dissolved before discussions of dramatic ritual landscapes can be adapted to exterior locations of pilgrimage. The restrictions placed on dramatic enactments force performance to be an either/or activity. Either a performance is a public and didactic drama or it is a hidden rite that belongs to a much smaller group of actors and audience and by this virtue cannot be performed or witnessed by everyone. This division between what is presented as public and private within the church reflects the problematic emphasis on the iconic or allegorical nature of ritual drama and its dominating relationship over the realism of the lives and setting of the movements of the laity involved in pilgrimage or ritual enactment.

Studies of medieval drama and performance highlight the iconic nature which is designated by the participants involved in a localized space acting with a symbolic rather than linear understanding of time. Authors such as Hayes (2003) and Catherine Bell (2009) have

suggested approaches that focus on the movement and interaction of the human body with a given area of focus in order to address the divide of ritual space or landscape into sacred or profane. However, Bell's concept of a ritualized body needs to take place in a highly-structured environment. Part of the author's structure is dependent on the social concepts, constructions, and history the individual body brings to the ritual process. Her conception of structure equates to the cultural knowledge an individual artist contributes to each creation of a performance piece, which is synonymous with performance theory's creation of an artwork through a focus of appreciation. The individual pilgrim's previous experiences will affect the shape of their journey as they alternate between artist and audience in the production of the performance. However, Bell's (2009) concept of a specifically tailored environment is derived from the previously discussed ideas of separate spheres of space and time that occur within or near the sacred precinct of the church. She creates a need to understand ritual in the context of the action and its relation to other ritualized acts through the individual body, an approach she coins as *ritualization*. The strategies of Bell's *ritualization* are rooted in the body, but particularly in the action of the social (public) body within a symbolically created spatial and temporal environment. Even as she portrays the individuals as having a greater license and freedom to understand their role in ritual action, Bell still conceptualizes a ritual or performance within a specifically designated shrine precinct defining ritual as a symbolic act contained within the church.

The symbolic body of participants in rituals and dramatic enactments continue to be of central focus in the study of medieval ritual and performance. In Hayes' (2003) work she explores the exchange between the human body and sacred places. At first, this study shows promise for expanding the consideration of the landscape of performance and combating the

passive role of the lay audience as a congregation which is given or taught specific information but does not really engage with the wider ritual or public drama. However, it becomes evident that this argument uses the Christian body as inextricably joined to the church building to consolidate the symbolic tensions of ritual and the individual body within the Church (Hayes 2003).

Hayes' work describes the tensions created by medieval religious theory and the actual practice within sacred places. Her argument centers on the contradictions between the Old and New Testaments that advocate a physical space of a temple for worship, but also propose the personalized individual Christian body as its own temple (Hayes 2003). The ritual that brings these opposing forces together is the body of Christ elevated in the Eucharist which represents the head of the Church. The human body and the physical structure of the church create and support one another through the representation of Christ as the symbolic Church. Through rituals such as baptism and consecration, the 'churches and human bodies nurtured and sustained each other' (Hayes 2003: 17), although they represented distinct vehicles or modes of worship. When the location of worship, ritual, liturgical drama, or performance becomes embedded in the symbolic relationship of Christ (the head of the Church) to the congregation (the body) and the Church (Christ's bride), the connection of the sacred space to the wider landscape outside the church becomes of secondary importance. The symbolic or iconic nature of the sacred church location becomes so pervasive that a wider landscape-based scenery becomes obsolete. Reality and physicality become unnecessary when the drama of medieval ritual and religion is treated as 'an iconic rather than realistic art' (Davidson 1973: 8). The lack of a real, landscape-based setting outside the church in the performance of liturgical dramas and rituals such as pilgrimage

perpetuates the idea that 'the sacred space of the church building is of the significance' in dramatic action (Davidson 1974: 8).

If the church structure and the sacred space that exists within its confines create and provide the place of enactments of liturgical drama through characters that are solely of symbolic and iconic significance, then the degree to which the physical reality and landscape of the outside world is incorporated into the enactment of drama and performance must be discussed. If drama exists as a highly structured and managed system with set pieces and sacred locations necessary for its enactment, then pilgrimage and the physical realities of its non-symbolic landscape, which includes a majority of the journey at a distance from the church precinct, should engage with, develop, and affect the performance differently than in a church environment. When the individual body of the pilgrim incorporates the roles of the actor and audience of a performance and interacts with an open, physical landscape of pilgrimage the physical realities penetrate the symbolic/iconic realm of medieval Christian practices making a singularly fixed space, either sacred or profane, irrelevant in the context of the creation of pilgrimage.

Miracles: Symbolic or Realistic Landscapes?

The iconic nature of medieval performances of drama and pilgrimage becomes the main focus of study when such practices are tied to one church location or a series of sequential markers (stopping points) within the landscape of ritual. The discussion regarding liturgical drama's public aspect with its iconic/symbolic nature emphasizes that an actual landscape and wider acknowledgment of lay involvement with an interactive scenery is unnecessary to the procession or creation of performed liturgical drama. The focus of previous liturgical drama studies of processions such as the *Visitatio Sepulchri* was on the nature of the clergy as enactors

of the liturgy and transmitters of the educative authority of the dramas to the lay audience. This section analyzes the miracles of Montserrat in order to argue against the priority of the symbolic and sacred nature of ritual and dramatic performances that exist within a specifically sequestered time and contained setting. The transcribed miracles attributed to the Virgin of Montserrat act as one of the bases or scripts of the performed drama of pilgrimage to the site in addition to the ascetic heritage. The texts and the interactions portraying the pilgrims during their performances will determine to what degree the literary sources of the dramas affect the construction of the pilgrimage landscape as a symbolic and publicly didactic or realistic setting and the necessity of a physical location and its contribution to the performance.

Of the three hundred and forty-seven miracles of Montserrat contained within Pedro Alfonso de Burgos' 1594 text, *Libro de la historia y milagros, hechos a invocación de Nuestra Señora de Montserrate*, this thesis pays specific attention to Miracles one through 108. The miracles are listed in nearly chronological order beginning with the earliest Marian event presumed to occur near Montserrat's foundation in 888 through those occurring in 1396. After Miracle 108, Burgos (1594) states that no further miracles were written down at the Church of Montserrat from 1397 to 1496. The transcribed miracles attributed to 1496 and later have a noticeable stylistic difference between them and the preceding one hundred eight accounts. This change is reflected in the distinct format of elongated miracles that digress into lengthy and flowery series of prayers to invoke the Virgin's favor. In fact, the introduction of a highly stylized and an almost obsequious formula of soliciting the Virgin's assistance begins towards the end of the first set of miracles indicating a change in the method of disseminating the information. The earlier miracles are shorter and more concise accounts which are easy to remember and transmit orally. The more descriptive nature of the post-1496 miracles reflects the

impetus of Abbot Cisneros to increase the renown and circulation of events attributed to the Virgin of Montserrat through his efforts of bringing a printing press to Montserrat to publish the Monastery's own texts. The time period of focus for the miracle texts corresponds to the period of the site's foundation (888) to the period before Cisneros' reforms when pilgrimage was at its height (1396).

The tonal and stylistic differences are not the only reasons that the pre-1396 miracles are considered in the following discussion of dramatic landscape. This thesis is concerned with establishing the creation and development of medieval pilgrimage as performance art at Montserrat. The pre-1396 miracles and the foundation myths of Montserrat represent the phase of gradual maturation of devotion. The post-1496 miracles show an advancement from the developmental stage of performance at Montserrat to that of maturation, where style and form are established and in the process of refinement rather than discovery. The following analysis considers the chronologically earliest miracles of Montserrat from 888 through 1396 to reveal the nature of pilgrim interactions with the landscape of performance.

In order to address the symbolic versus realistic argument of the performance landscape's nature and usage in forms and studies of liturgical drama and the unnecessary monopoly of a church as the prominent sacred space for performance, this chapter compiles the miracles of Montserrat into two categories derived from the above discussion of liturgical dramas within a church setting. The miracles are grouped according to those that can be considered private and public occurrences. The private and public categorization of Montserrat's miracles are not adapted from any previous source or study. The purpose of these designations is not to advocate that the miracles can be placed easily into either category. Grouping the events into private and public categories makes it more efficient in referencing the current analysis of miracles with the

public nature of medieval drama emphasized by studies of liturgical drama and the *Visitatio Sepulchri*. By comparing the public or private nature of the miracles to the preconceived notions of drama, this chapter will use the established structure of denominations (public/profane drama and private/sacred rite) to weaken the current trends in ritual and liturgical studies from within.

Public Miracles

A definition of what will be considered a public miracle is necessary to begin the contestation of symbolic versus realistic landscapes derived from liturgical and hagiographic texts and utilized to discuss ritual movement, activity, and performance. The interchangeable terms of *public* or *dramatic performance* are derived from a combination of concepts from Ogden (2005) and Warning's (2001) distinctions of public drama (*celebration*) from private rite (*ceremony*). A public miracle of Montserrat occurs in front of a congregation or group of people, where the assembled individuals can become directly involved (as witnesses) in the action of the unfolding events. A miracle will also be considered public if it has elements of a didactic or mimetic/repetitive nature that are necessary to the completion of the miraculous performance.

Rather than listing all of the occurrences of Montserrat with public aspects, three miracles will be analyzed which highlight public and dramatic attributes. Burgos' (1594) Miracle 39, 'De un mancebo librado', exemplifies the required elements needed to create a public and dramatic performance (Burgos 1594: fol. 56^{v}).[4] The Miracle consists of two large groupings of people

[4] The numbers used to categorize the miracles are the ones used by Burgos in his 1594 compilation. The numeric designations indicate the order in which the miracles appear in the text.

who interact when the outsiders (group 1) enter a family's scene (group 2) of grieving. The plot pertains to a youth living near Vic who is on his deathbed suffering from a severe fever. His family assembles around him and places a candle in his hands to await the boy's demise. A group of pilgrims returning from Montserrat witnesses this gathering and enquires as to its purpose. On hearing the plight of the boy and his family, the pilgrims offer this counsel:

> Nosotros venimos de Montserrate, y havemos visto predicar grandes milagros que haze Nuestra Señora en aquellos que devotamente la llamen, pongamos todos de rodillas y roguemos a la virgen María que ruegue a su bendito hijo por este enfermo. (Burgos 1594: fol. 56^{v})

A few days later, the boy is healed and is able to join his family in a pilgrimage to Montserrat to give thanks and make donations to the Virgin's Church.

The setting of this Miracle initially feels private, since it takes place within a sequestered house of mourning. However, the action and subsequent developments of the narrative are catalyzed by the outside group of pilgrims coming upon the familial scene and joining the drama. The private realm of the home becomes a public space of performance that allows for a larger congregation to interact with the infirmity and the miracle that is eventually witnessed. The addition of the pilgrims to the familial congregation also introduces the didactic and mimetic nature that Young (1967), Warning (2001), Ogden (2002 & 2005), and Twomey (2008) attribute to liturgy and drama. The pilgrims become participants in the ceremony of prayer, but they also bring their experiences of Montserrat and knowledge gained through pilgrimage to aid the boy's family. Without the pilgrims' participation and interactions, the family would not have learned the steps necessary to seek the Virgin's intercession.

The family's performance first requires calling upon the Virgin with devout intent. No matter if the aspects of pilgrimage are considered the creation of performance art as per Davies' (2004) performance theory or drama defined by Young (1967), Warning (2001), Ogden (2002), or Twomey (2008), a devout intention or focused mindset remains the necessary first step of creation. The pilgrims of Miracle 39 also introduce or educate the family to the further requirement of kneeling as one prays to the Virgin, adding the necessity of a specific mimed and repeated act of drama. This first miracle offers no further designation or specification of space other than the house and Montserrat as the site of the family's pilgrimage of thanksgiving. Intent and mimed action appear to be all that are required to gain the Virgin's attention.

A similar mass public prayer occurs in Miracle 93 'De unos que escaparon una tempestad' (Burgos 1594: fol. 83^{v}). A group of Asturian sailors are at sea when a large storm hits and breaks apart their boat. Chaos erupts as the sailors begin to yell and pray on their own with tears in their eyes. One amongst them previously made a pilgrimage to Montserrat and advises his companions how to pray for safety: 'Lo qual oydo todos juntamente hincados las rodillas con muchas lágrimas hizieron oración a la madre de Dios, prometiendo con voto de visitar cada uno de *e*llos su sancta yglesia de Montserrate con dones y ofrendas' (Burgos 1594: fol. 83^{v}). When the sailors pray and 'devotamente su nombre [María] invocan', the sea starts to calm and they are saved (Burgos 1594: fol. 83^{v}). After they arrive safely home, the sailors visit the Church and Monastery of Montserrat to share and document the details of their miracle.

The public components of this miraculous drama unfold similar to the miracle of the healed youth from Vic. A group of individuals milling about in haphazard chaos are directed in the appropriate manner by former pilgrims of how to enact their prayers to be heard by the Virgin of Montserrat and saved. The sailors must devoutly invoke the Virgin and pray on their

knees, but an additional action is required of their performance. Once saved, they must visit or process to Montserrat to give thanks. What is not strictly stated, but rather implied, is that the pilgrims are also directed to share their miracles with the larger congregation of the Christian community. Through the movements of the sailors and family from Vic going to Montserrat and sharing their pilgrim experiences with the Benedictine scribes at the Monastery, the public aspect of the drama reaches a new magnitude. Once a miracle is related to the monastic community, it becomes a potentially international reaching educational tool to further amplify the Virgin's presence and celebration of her liturgy in Spain and Europe and teach future pilgrims how to engage successfully in the drama necessary to invoke her.

The two publicly designated miracles described did not take place at Montserrat or in the vecinity of the Virgin's shrine. However, on the surface, these events might appear to reinforce the symbolic nature of Christian action present in studies of church-based liturgical drama since no one specified place is required for the drama to develop. The groups of devout are somehow able to find one another and come together in a single effort to pray for the salvation of one or more of their members. Those involved in the miracle are also segregated into two groups of actor and audience. The former pilgrims who serve as instructors (actors) of the drama relate their experiences of Montserrat to the assembled group that needs to be led (audience) and directed in prayer. The similar physical acts of devotion and repeated manners of invoking the Virgin recall the approaches taken by authors such as Schechner (1988) and Easterling (1993) who connect religious ritual to drama stating that 'ritual, like tragic theater involves staging, symbolic gestures, dressing up, and role playing' (Easterling 1993: 8). The sense of symbolism, displacement, and an aspect of otherworldliness shroud ritual acts and locations of performances such as pilgrimage making them 'detachable from the "real time" –the minutes or hours– taken

by the performance of procession. And in the same way each is infinitely repeatable' (Easterling 1993: 9). According to the author's consideration of ritual and drama, space and a movement through a physically varied location are unnecessary. The landscape itself is not important. Rather, the dramatic site's ability to act as a contained space of differentiation takes on a symbolic emphasis. The sense of an allegorical or sacred space utilized in the description of performances of liturgical dramas within a church is recreated in pilgrimage outside the architectural boundaries by a similar desire to designate one space or location as distinct (sacred) from the immediate vicinity surrounding the miraculous performance (profane). As long as the words, gestures, and roles remain the same, then each performance can be repeated in a practically identical manner.

This consideration of public dramas or performances (miracles) implies that a physical and reality-based rather than symbolic manifestation of place is unnecessary, as long as a congregation of Christians comes together and engages in the creation of drama through publicly mimed actions dictated by custom or tradition. However, this consideration of ritual, drama, and performance is at odds with the tenets of performance theory (Davies 2004) that outline how each process and creation of a performance is a unique event that can only occur in a specified time frame with a discreet beginning and ending. Furthermore, a performance or drama must also be tailored purposefully by the artist to the culturally accepted practices of the audience. According to performance theory, the creation of a performance of pilgrimage or the enactment of a liturgical drama can be repeatable to a certain degree, but not as an autonomous entity detached from chronological time. The ritual performance is dependent on the time and setting in which the work is created. Although the majority of Montserrat's miracles do not take place in or near the Monastery or Church, they indicate, through a number of the healing miracles, that an

actual location such as the physical and architectural space of a church or the natural landscape of the mountain as opposed to a wholly symbolic setting is required to complete the performance.

Miracle 47 ‘De una enferma curada’ is a public performance that necessitates the church environment (Burgos 1594: fol. 70^{v}). In 1316, a girl from the mountains of Ribes in Barcelona visits Montserrat because she has been possessed for many years. She stays in a corner of the Church of Montserrat for a few days seeking divine aid. While she is there, she reads about the Evangelists and prays. Monks and other pilgrims come to the girl and pray over her. After a few days at the Church, she is healed and returns home. The next year and for many years afterwards she returns to Montserrat to give thanks (Burgos 1594). Of the three miracles that take place on Montserrat including the mountain and the Church vicinity, one of the constant characteristics is that a community of Christians, either of the Benedictine monks or fellow pilgrims, comes together to pray for the afflicted or troubled individual. The group action of prayer in these Montserrat-based miracles is directed to the Virgin, but the performance necessitates the larger interaction and involvement of a Christian community present at the site to complete the drama. In the previous public Miracles 93 (the sailors at sea) and 39 (the sick youth from Vic), the Christian community is present in each in the form of the congregation praying for their own deliverance from the storm and the group of pilgrims and family members praying for the boy’s health. The Miracle that takes place at Montserrat also requires a third-party group (the monks and pilgrims) to direct the intent of the supplicant’s prayers to elevate another member to a higher state free from disease and worry.

The three miracles discussed here have performative aspects that may be considered public. They each require and occur in front of large gatherings of congregated people. The

assembled groups are directly involved in the unfolding drama through prayer or other actions. There is an additional didactic undertone to each miracle through the education of the appropriate manner of prayer and acquiring biblical knowledge through reading. Although the miracles fit into the category of what can be considered a public drama, this does not mean that they promote the performance of pilgrimage, supplication, and drama in a spatial and temporal vacuum of a symbolic Christian (sacred) landscape and time rather than a physical location and linear time.

Only three of Montserrat's miracles promote the precinct of the Church or shrine as a necessary location for the performance of the events. Although the majority of the miracles are not dependent on the Church for the occurrence of the drama, neither do they specifically point to identifiable markers within the landscape that would tie them to a more temporally and linear conception of time and space and their interactions with ritual. Where the *Visitatio Sepulchri* required the church interior for its symbolic setting of Christ's resurrection, the pilgrim miracles do not specify routes or sacred locations necessary to the drama's completion. Any mention of the Church of Montserrat is purposefully vague as is the case with the missing presence of specific markers in the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*. The lack of discreet locations and the focus on the taught and mimed actions of the congregation (enacting their public performance on bended knees as well as 'con lágrimas roga*n*do a Nuestra Señora') seems to imply that Davidson's (1974-75) assumption of the symbolic nature of medieval drama is correct (Burgos 1594: fol. 83^{v}). The paucity of scenery offered in the public dramas or enactments of the miracles gives little or no tangible markers to find one's bearings 'for this is an iconic rather than realistic art' (Davidson 1974-75: 8). Before acknowledging that a lack of discreet and identifiable locations means that only a symbolic, sacred, or static shrine setting is needed for the localized action of

public drama, it is prudent to analyze the private miracles of Montserrat to determine if they offer a different approach to the use and interactions of landscape in performance.

Private Miracles

The public interactions of congregated groups miming certain movements in a didactic atmosphere define drama according to Warning (2001) and Ogden (2005). *Ritual* or *ceremony* encompasses the activities that occur within the arena of private performance. The following miracles fall within Warning (2001) and Ogden's (2005) distinction between the public performance of drama and the hidden or private nature of rite, ritual, or ceremony. The characteristics of private performances are: acts that are hidden and rites celebrated by moving/processing away from the main population gathered in the nave. Generally, these ceremonies moved to smaller chapels or locations that could not be seen or heard by the main congregation in the church. Ogden (2005) designates such ceremonies by their *Feierlichkeit* or the degree of celebrative solemnity of a particular observance. Celebrations of the *Visitatio Sepulchri* that take the Marys' discovery of the empty tomb away from the lay population or monastic observances that occur away from the public have a higher degree of this solemnity. The private ceremony becomes a solemn rite with a greater connection to the original liturgy (and a greater degree of *Feierlichkeit*) than the potentially looser, more raucous and interactive nature of public drama.

The private miracles of Montserrat tend to depict a more intimate, almost subdued scene in comparison with the public miracles and their group enactments of prayer. Instead of impromptu gatherings of sailors lost at sea or congregations of pilgrims, the private miracles are most often individual invocations of the Virgin by a single supplicant or a family member praying for their spouses or children. For example, in Miracle 49 'De una enferma curada' a

father prays for the health of his daughter who is about to die from a fever (Burgos 1594: fol. 61^{r}). After realizing that nothing on earth or no human remedy can save the girl, her father acts: 'Y fuese a una parte de donde podía ver la montaña de Montserrate, y allí hincados las rodillas desnudas, con gran abunda*n*cia de lágrimas y gemidos rogava a la madre de misericordia' (Burgos 1594: fol. 61^{r}). After the father becomes tired from praying, he returns to his daughter and sees that she is healthy once more.

This private miracle resonates with the characteristics of a performance according to performance theory and a private rite according to Warning (2001) and Ogden (2005). Of prime importance to the overall act of supplication is the intent behind the father's prayers. In accordance with the process of art creation, the father (artist) seeks a distinct outcome, the health of his daughter. He enacts the performance through his chosen medium of prayer. The father begins by keeping in mind the culturally relevant tradition (mentioned in the public miracles) of kneeling while praying and orienting his body and thoughts toward Montserrat. The characteristic met specific to Warning (2001) and Ogden's (2005) concept of private ceremony is the secluded nature of the father's devotion as he seeks an auxiliary building or chapel-like structure or 'una parte' of the larger setting where he can be alone (Burgos 1594: fol. 61^{r}).

The desire or tendency to inhabit a space apart from the larger sphere of the familial structure is not relevant to this miracle alone. The majority of Montserrat's miracles where actions of chosen seclusion are specifically mentioned take place in the numerous healings where familial interactions between parents and children occur. In Miracles 47 and 53, parents seek the freedom of seclusion from their children to enact their performances, albeit for different reasons.

Miracle 47 'De una enferma curada,' relates the tale of a very pious woman from Girona who makes a pilgrimage to Montserrat and returns home to find her daughter depressed over the

twenty stillbirths she has delivered in her life (Burgos 1594: fol. 60^{v}). The mother decides that her best course of action is to pray to the Virgin of Montserrat for the health of her daughter: 'assí fue despresto y subió a una parte de donde podía ver las montañas de Montserrate' (Burgos 1594: fol. 60^{v}). With the mandatory show of faith, hope, devotion, and tears she prays for her daughter: 'Acabada que huvo su oración, tornó a ver a la hija, la qual halló sana y alegre' (Burgos 1594: fol. 60^{v}). After the miracle takes place, mother and daughter make a pilgrimage to Montserrat to give thanks to the Virgin. This Miracle repeats almost exactly the actions of the father in first private miracle mentioned, except for the slight variation concerning the method in which the parents escaped the public sphere of the household to find their private space in view of the mountain. In the aforementioned miracles, a clear line of sight to Montserrat and seclusion to perform the acts of piety are necessary for the completion of the rituals. However, the mountain's image and the manipulation of sequestered and unobstructed views are not the only forms of sensory perception utilized within the private or public performances. The auditory also becomes important for the enactments.

Of Montserrat's thirty-eight healing miracles, twelve, both private and public, pertain to sight and its restoration to the devotees of the Virgin. In fact, the first recorded miracle of Montserrat deals with such sight-restoring events. The painter of Miracle one who goes blind while working on the Virgin's statue prays for three months straight to be healed. While at the Church, he hears the monks singing 'Ave Maris Stella'. When they reach the words 'solve vincla reis, profer lumen caecis', he regains his sight (Burgos 1594: fol. 34^{r}).[5] Although this miracle takes place in the Church precinct, it can still be considered a private occurrence. On account of his blindness, the painter Maesse Andrés resides in a visually impaired state of seclusion. Unlike

[5] 'loosen the bonds of the sinners, bring forth light to the blind.'

the previous miracles, Andrés does not need to escape to a separate space of a home to be alone. His blindness distances him from the Church structure and the larger congregation involved in a witnessed public drama. As is the case with the versions of the *Visitatio* performed in auxiliary chapels out of direct sight of the nave, the painter is similarly secluded and relies on his faculties of speech and hearing to restore his sight. However, where blindness separates Andrés from the sacred space of the Church, sound reintegrates him into the Christian community.

A more prominent focus on hearing in performance occurs in Miracle 53. A butcher from Barcelona loses his sight for over two years. He spends most of his money on doctors searching for a cure, but finds none. He begins praying to the Virgin of Montserrat for help and eventually asks his daughter to take him out of the city 'y le llevasse a un collado que llaman el coll de Cerola, de donde se parescen las montañas de Montserrate' (Burgos 1594: fol. 62^{v}). The Butcher's daughter does not have her father's faith and will not take him to the hill of Cerola. A little while later, the man is alone when he begins to hear church bells ring. Getting down on his knees, the Butcher prays to the Virgin and quickly regains his sight.

As in the case with the previously listed private performances, the Butcher's miracle involves an individual enacting ritual movements (getting on his knees and praying) out of sight of a larger contingency of congregated Christians (his daughter and the household). The Miracle also has the aspects of art creation necessary to be considered a performance. These elements consist of intent (desire to pray), culturally appropriate steps or medium of enacting the performance (kneeling and praying), and an achieved or determinate outcome (returned sight).

However, the Miracle of the blind Butcher offers more than just another example of a privately performed ceremony or ritual. This account highlights the very physical components of the miracles and devotion to Montserrat. Visual cues, physical enactment, and auditory stimuli

are the necessarily diverse components engaged in each individual act of worship and performance of pilgrimage. These components interact with and are regulated by the physical landscape where the supplicant invokes the Virgin to help destroy the barrier between a wholly sacred or entirely profane space in ritual drama. Miracles 47 (the depressed daughter) and 49 (the dying daughter) emphasize a separation from family and the physical act of seeing as the necessary steps of performance. The act of looking in medieval society was a powerful one that established a contact with the divine and prolonged visual contemplation enabling the viewer to perceive a divine truth (Woolgar 2006). The visual component is not relegated only to the need of viewing the mountain of Montserrat to focus their prayers and petitions. Once the connection to Montserrat is established by a visual pilgrimage to the mountain, a further act of sight is required by the mother praying for her child. She must return her gaze to the girl in order to act as a witness to confirm the occurrence of the healing miracle. The father of Miracle 49 (the dying daughter) must also return to the main body of the house from his isolation of prayer. As he returns to the house and sees his daughter, she is cured. A further example of the power of sight, recognition, and the variety of spaces inherent in Montserrat's miracles come from a resurrection. In this Miracle recorded from 1345, a young boy falls into a well while playing and drowns. His parents persevere in their prayers for so long that eventually 'el niño resuscitó, lo qual visto por el padre y el madre' (Burgos 1594: fol. 79^{v}). Having a connection to Montserrat and keeping an eye on the mountain is not enough to guarantee a miracle. In order to heal and complete a physical or sensory pilgrimage and engage with the Virgin, attention must be turned away from the iconic symbol of a sacred location (the mountain or shrine) and focused on the human world and those who require help (the child) because 'seeing engenders change in the viewer [and the viewed]' (Frank 2000: 111). Only through the act of looking specifically at their

children and being mindful of their terrestrial obligations can the parents be certain that their prayers were answered and a miracle performed.

The necessity of seeing the recipient of a miracle or its determinant outcome can also be applied to a man such as the blind Butcher who is unable to look upon or face the mountain and does not have a family member praying or enacting a pilgrimage on his behalf. Although he could not turn to face the mountain, the Butcher is still able to regain his sight. The Butcher's initial lack of vision neither represents an aberration in the miracles nor implies that visual concerns such as seeing the mountain or Church precinct are unimportant to the process of pilgrimage and performance of miracles related to Montserrat. Hearing as well as vision were multisensory, two-way processes and sound was also able to convey knowledge of God and the Virgin through an interchange of words (Woolgar 2006). The iconic nature of drama or religious performance does not resist the need of scenery and physical pilgrimage to find its bearings. What these miracles and dramas indicate is that seclusion (whether visual or auditory) and the communal integration of groups in prayer and other forms of piety or devotion do not preclude one from the other. It is impossible to divide performance into public and private spheres that separately affect the laity or clergy. As the foundation legends of Montserrat indicate, it is detrimental to designate humans (the communities of Manresa and Monistrol or Juan Garín) or objects (the Virgin statue) involved in the performance of pilgrimage as only engaged actors or passive witnesses attached to a specific symbol or sacred landscape. Each miracle has different variables and traits that can feasibly be divided along the lines of public (enacted by or in front of a congregated group) or private (performed in a more intimate and secluded setting away from the general population). The problem with imposing such divisions is that each individual and

opposing group is studied in isolating contrasts rather than in their contribution to the whole corpus of the texts and practices of performance related to Montserrat.

The performance of pilgrimage, religious drama, or ritual cannot be conceived of as a series of repeatable liturgical steps only enacted within a contained sacred, symbolic, and distinct space such as the interior of a church. The use of such a finite definition of locations of drama and performance imposes on the landscape the symbolic nature promoted by theories of religious drama that necessitate the separate and idealized (sacred) space of the church architecture for dramatic enactments to be realized. Engaging in the concept of a ceremoniously dedicated route through a designated sacred landscape reiterates Turner and Turners' (1978) limiting symbolic notion of a *communitas* of pilgrims that creates its own extra-societal space and community on the way to the final goal of the shrine. In order to depict the entire nature of pilgrimage performance and its creative process to Montserrat, the notion of a symbolic landscape that is distinct and at odds with the realistic landscape must be abolished.

Montserrat's miracles can be categorized into types such as pertain to healing, liberation, and birth. However, the texts cannot be used to disengage the actions and performances of the mountain from their attachments to the geographical, social, and the cultural pressures and interactions of the pilgrimage with Catalonia and the Iberian Peninsula. Theories of medieval drama must allow for the ability of any actor involved in the performance of pilgrimage to transform their surroundings into a devotional space in which the drama occurs (Ehrstine 2012). A topography dependent on realism (social, familial, and economic concerns) and its intractable connection to the religious culture and practice of those pilgrims and devotees of Montserrat is what emerges from the diversity of practices that occur during the performance of pilgrimage or drama at the site.

A Realistic Approach to Space and Performance

The miracles of Montserrat do not provide a set progression or symbolic path through the mountain such as found in the church-based Easter celebration of the *Visitatio Sepulchri* or the steps through the Scottish wilderness at Saint Aebbe's. The histories of Montserrat describe the bare stage for performance through geographical data and measurements of distance between the different structures and sites on the mountain. They give an allusion to what the pilgrim should expect visually and physically upon visiting the location. However, the foundational texts, myths, and miracles of Montserrat do not dictate precisely how the performance of pilgrimage should be enacted or how space should be constructed and engaged with during the liturgical procession. There is no set formula of invocation of the Virgin or one method of public mimesis that arises from the miracle texts. This lack of regulated specificity does not delineate a void of consideration of space or deny the importance of a physical setting to the process of pilgrimage. On the contrary, the absence of set and repeated stages of progression during the miracles supports a variability of the practice and performance of pilgrimage in relation to the available space and routes to the mountain.

In Chapter Three, Montserrat's foundation myths pertaining to the apparition of the Virgin statue and the penance of Fray Juan Garín provided various types of motivations for pilgrimage. These motivations were placed into the following categories: *curative*, *intermediary*, and *emulative*. Juan Garín's movements throughout Catalonia and Europe promote the different stimuli needed for enacting the performance of pilgrimage. The Hermit, as well as those involved in the statue apparition exemplify how those who undertake the pilgrimage encompass all sectors of society from young shepherds to the Bishop of Manresa. The foundation myths provide a

sense that variability of practice existed within the tradition of Montserrat since the site's foundation. Studies of liturgical dramas and processions that promote the distinct private sphere and landscape of the church with its secluded rites and rituals, versus the public drama of the lay sector deteriorate when confronted with the realities of Montserrat's miracles and performances. In the apparition legend, young shepherds at work on the mountain are the first to witness the Virgin's miracles. Next, they relate their experience to their superiors, who then transmit the same occurrence to the members of the Church. The governing body of the Church is necessary in giving credence to the witnessed events, but it is the last social group to become aware of the miracle. This progression of news does not relate a separation of Church and state or that of the sacred and profane spheres, but a cultural and social hierarchy where the Church may exert an overwhelming amount of authority yet it does not act without the public contribution of all sectors of society.

Juan Garín's tale describes a failed separation between the private life and actions of the Hermit which are opposed to the public, raucous presence of the Count and his court. At first, the Hermit's ascetic lifestyle of removed isolation may support the identification of separate acts and landscapes of public drama (profane) and private rite (sacred) found in studies of liturgical drama. Yet, as is the case with apparition narrative that established the necessity of the interactions between the hidden statue and the local community, the private life of the Hermit also requires co-mingling with the public figure of the Count of Barcelona in order for Garín to heal, rediscover his piety, and to complete his pilgrimage of penance. These miracles promote a diversity of contributing factors and sectors of society involved in the performance of pilgrimage, ritual, or the creation of art. The miracles offer further levels of diversity through each component of supplication that contributes to the successful enactment of pilgrimage. The

variety of public and private interactions between the different characters involved in the performance of Montserrat's foundation myths and miracle accounts works against the sentiment of public or private drama and ritual rather than reinforcing the divisive approach to pilgrimage that arises from ritual or dramatic approaches.

This chapter divided the one hundred and eight miracles of Montserrat from the ninth to the fourteenth century into categories grouped according to the miracle type. These types were derived from the beneficial outcome of the miracles rather than any imposed sense of public or private enactment of the performances. The six categories are as follows: miracles of healing, liberation of prisoners, resurrection, rescue from peril, pregnancy and birth, and those involved with landscape. These groupings are by no means absolute. Many of the miracles could fit into multiple designations. For example, the resurrection type might be listed as a subcategory of healing. However, within this thesis, the discussed miracles grouped together are not only contingent on the outcome of the performances, but also on the format and components of the related events. While the resurrections and some of the pregnancy miracles each obtain healing benefits for the supplicant, the manner of invocation of the Virgin, characters involved, and actions make each category distinct despite the obtainment of similar outcomes.

Each of the six categories of miracles has a vast diversity that is impossible to list in the course of this thesis. However, it is unnecessary to relate all one hundred and eight miracles to discover the themes that emerge. One of the most noticeable patterns that arises from the texts is that all levels of society from the working class, to nobility, and clergy are represented in the related events. Within these distinct societal sectors, women and children appear in every category of miracle including that of the liberated prisoners. Not only was the pervasive presence of women and young children involved in the procurement and reception of miracles, but after

the Virgin's intercession, this same group undertook pilgrimages of gratitude to Montserrat. Occasionally the women or parents of healed family members and children would join other pilgrims on their way to Montserrat. For example, after the poisoned seven-year-old boy in Miracle 88 dies and is resurrected, he joins his father and a group of pilgrims processing to Montserrat and becomes their leader: 'Adonde viendo, el niño yva delante de *e*llos mostrándoles el camino, que antes havía visto siendo muerto' (Burgos 1594: fol. 81^{r}). More frequently this miracle type occurs once a woman or child or even a man is healed and they undertake a pilgrimage with their family unit carrying along children and babies no older than two years of age: 'Y la devota muger con gran alegría hizo su peregrinació*n* a Nuestra Señora de Montserrate ofreciéndole sus votos y dándole gracias' (Burgos 1594: fol. 38^{v}). The women are also not to be excluded from the more physically arduous forms of pilgrimage to Montserrat when giving thanks. After their children or husbands are resuscitated, a number of the women approach Montserrat with 'los pies descalços, y la madre prometió de venir de rodillas, desde la hermita de Sant Miquel, hasta la capilla de Nuestra Señora' (Burgos 1594: fol. 83^{r}). As Figure 13 depicts, the descent from the chapel of Saint Michael to the Monastery of Montserrat is a simple progression. The steep and rocky path would have been painful to the unshod foot or knee. The path and performance to Montserrat was not easy and everyone from peasants to nobles, women, and children had to find a way to navigate the mountain's unique terrain.

Figure 13. The view from the chapel of Saint Michael to the Basilica and Monastery of Montserrat. The Chapel is about 1.3km from the Monastery entrance.

The number of people involved in a miracle was not subject to a predetermined designation, which added further variety to the performance and interactions with the landscape. One parent, mother or father could pray for the return of their child. Sometimes both parents were involved. Even extended family members and complete strangers could enter the scene offering guidance and prayer to the grieving. Those engaged in giving thanks for the miracle ranged from a single person who was affected to a family, a boatload of sailors, or distinct groups of pilgrims coming together to travel to Montserrat in each other's company. The foundation narratives and miracles describe that anyone from an individual shepherd to large groupings of a community can be witnesses, actors, and audiences in the performance of a

miracle and pilgrimage. The drama unfolding does not engage only with one select group of people placed within the proper location at a set date and time. The miraculous events leading to the subsequent pilgrimages can occur in the presence of the individual or a group in the constantly adapting routes used in the journey and procession of pilgrimage. Variability continues to persist in the actions of those involved in group performances of miracles and their pilgrimages.

The previous section analyzed the feasibility of categorizing Montserrat's miracle texts into public or private occurrences. Two types of scenes were illustrated: miracles that took place away from the main body of the home in quiet seclusion and miracles involving large groups of people simultaneously dedicated to prayer. This division of people involved in prayer does not advocate the differentiation of the performance's actors and audience into separate acts of secluded and individual supplication versus the unified involvement of a congregated group. Although the individual can only call upon one voice, it does not mean that their supplication and performance is any less raucous or vehement than that of a gathered group or that the individual act exhibits a higher degree of sacredness than the group. For example, in Miracle 58 a man sentenced to death awaits his execution when 'con grandes lloros y gemidos rogava a todo el pueblo que rogassen a la Virgen María de Montserrate que le quisiesse ayudar' (Burgos 1594: fol. 65^{v}). In Miracle 37, another individual is thrown into a life and death situation at sea. Instead of internally begging the Virgin for help, he takes a more vocalized approach. As he begins to pray loudly 'todo oýa el ma*n*cebo, que muy devotamente estava rogando' (Burgos 1594: fol. 56^{r}).

There is no one way to invoke the Virgin of Montserrat or one specific sacred space or performance or series of locations in her miracles. The practice, use, and engagement of space in

the Middle Ages was never homogenous, but a 'heterogeneous space [...] thoroughly imbued with quantities and qualities marking the [diverse] presence of bodies, signs, and thoughts' (Hanawalt & Kobialka 2000: xi). A parent or spouse may quietly take themselves to a secluded space to look at the mountain and silently pray for their family or a mother might clutch the body of her dead child in her arms and pour out her pain to the Virgin with 'lloros y lágrimas' (Burgos 1594: fol. 66^{v}). Communities may come together and pray silently for the soul of one near death or sailors may rally, defying the elements and circumstances to 'publicamente confessavan sus pecados los unos a los otros, y a grandes vozes llamavan a la virgen María de Montserrate que les socorriesse' (Burgos 1594: fol. 38^{r}). No matter how the supplication or drama is enacted, with 'manos juntas y los ojos al Cielo. Unos con velas y otros con antorchas encendidas. Unos con pesadas cruzes de madera y otros con barras de hierro en sus ombros' or simply with a prayer or a journey of intent, a miracle or performance can occur regardless of a symbolic location or pre-constructed circumstance (Serra y Postius 1747: 471).

Specific spaces are not engaged in the miracles of Montserrat. This allows for individual interactions of the pilgrim, serving as the actor and audience of the pilgrimage, to be more integral to the performance than a designated sacred space or a set route of progression through a specially manipulated landscape. Yet diversity of form does not embody or denote a chaos of performance at Montserrat, although pilgrimage could be raucous and verging on overly stimulating. As discussed in Chapter Three, the physical location and specific landscape of Montserrat are necessary components of worship and pilgrimage to the site. The setting of the mountain helped to mold and promote the ascetic heritage implicit in the creation myths and form of monasticism and eremitic practices developed at Montserrat. With regard to the miracles and hagiographic tradition of Montserrat, the mountain plays an additional, vital role in the

complete performance and progression of miracles to pilgrimage at Montserrat beyond the ascetic landscape it provides. Although the miracles take place throughout the Iberian Peninsula, the surrounding seas, and Europe in an infinite combination of performances, there is one component present in each miracle. A miracle and performance can only be properly completed if the supplicant or pilgrim journeys to the mountain of Montserrat and its Church, unless the traveler is prevented by death or otherwise incapacitated. A symbolic prayer and orientation of the body towards the mountain location is not all the Virgin of Montserrat requires from her supplicants, it is merely the first initiating step of the performance of pilgrimage. The Virgin demands physical movement, pain, and visitation from those she aids. Pilgrimage to Montserrat is never a solely symbolic endeavor because without a real, physical engagement with the suffering and arduous nature of pilgrimage to the mountain, the Virgin rescinds her gifts.

The miracles of Montserrat follow a fairly formulaic layout which adhere to Michael Goodich's (2007) standard components for healing miracles in which visions or dreams are integral. The stages of Goodich's (2007) miracles are: a description of the symptoms or issue, an unsuccessful attempt to seek human aid, an invocation to the saint, and a cure. For Goodich's vision-based miracles, there are further components when saintly apparitions take place: the utterance of a vow and ultimately the fulfillment of the vow by the recipient of the miracle. Some of these additional steps pertain to the miracles of Montserrat in which the Virgin appears to the praying proto-pilgrim.[6] However, of the one hundred and eight miracles of Montserrat between 888 and 1396, only three such visitations occur in dreams and four contain conscious apparitions

[6] The term proto-pilgrim refers to the individual's identity at the point in the miracle before the protagonist engages in a journey or performance.

of the Virgin. The majority of the Montserrat miracles do not describe visions of the saint, yet the concept of vow fulfillment by the recipient of the divine intervention is a key component.

Not every miracle required a vow from the supplicant. Occasionally, a parent would bargain with the Virgin on behalf of their child promising a certain amount of donations in gold, silver, or wax in exchange for the Virgin's intercession. Vows not only consisted of donations, but also promises to make a pilgrimage to Montserrat in thanks. A knight named Bernardo de Falconibus from Vic was a regular visitor to Montserrat (Burgos 1594), who falls ill with an infirmity in his arm. He prays to the Virgin and promises to donate to her Church. However, after five years, the Knight fails to make his promised donation. While traveling with some friends, the Virgin rescinds the Knight's gift: 'Y quando fue en las montañas de Montserrate, permitió Dios en pena de su olvido que el mal que solía tener en el braço se le tornasse' (Burgos 1594: fol. 40^{v}). After praying for forgiveness and finally paying the agreed upon gift, the Knight is healed again. In the Knight's case, his donation implied visiting or enacting a pilgrimage to Montserrat to give his promised goods directly to the Church. As a result of the prolongation of his incomplete vow and performance of pilgrimage, he suffered a very real and physical consequence because of his inaction. A knight without a properly functioning arm cannot successfully fulfill his duties or his function within the economically propagated society. The Virgin's vengeance is effectively engaged over a realm larger and more practical than the symbolic aspects of the church sphere.

Failure to complete a vow of pilgrimage in a timely manner further depicts how the mundane or lay world's realities, landscape, and physical suffering are integral parts of the performance which is not meant to be a merely symbolic or mimetic representation of martyrdom and Christ's suffering. As is the case with the Knight, a man from Tarragona has an

incurable pain in his knee and promises to make a pilgrimage to Montserrat if he is cured (Burgos 1594). He is quickly healed, but instead of going to Montserrat and then returning home, he prolongs his pilgrim wanderings for over three years. Within this extended performance, he is near fatally wounded as a result of the Virgin's influence. He prays for clemency and is cured, but is then obliged to visit Montserrat once a year. What these miracles reveal is that pilgrimages should not be perpetuated indefinitely. Also, the space of the Virgin's direct influence, in ensuring her pilgrimages are protected from the bad influences or habits of not completing a performance, encompasses the entire space of the mountain which is the physical embodiment of the Virgin. It is detrimental to the pilgrim to wander for extended periods in solitude, just as it was detrimental for Fray Juan Garín to live a solitary existence in the mountain cave with only the isolated landscape and demons to tempt him into sin. The necessity of a determinate time frame indicates a desire to curb the freedoms and structure religious wanderings. Mary's vindictive actions also imply, as does performance theory, that a performance of pilgrimage should have an identifiable beginning and end and not overly encroach upon the day to day life of the pilgrim. The actor should not completely surrender to a symbolic/iconic life of pious wandering which mimicks the journey and life of Christ, the martyrs, and the early desert fathers. Reality and the pilgrims' place within society and coexistence with the economic and physical aspects of religious practice need to be addressed as the pilgrims enact and complete their journeys.

Vows can be made, but if death, infirmity, or age prevent the enactment of the agreed on promises to the Virgin, they can be altered. However, the majority of Montserrat's miracles do not include a vow. In general, once a miracle occurs, the beneficiaries make a pilgrimage to give thanks to the Virgin on their own accord. The majority undertake the performance willingly, but

those who forget to visit Montserrat or do not think of giving thanks at the Church are quickly reminded of the necessity of trekking to Montserrat as a part of the performance process that allows for the satisfactory completion of events.

Pilgrimage, performance, and the drama of Montserrat cannot be categorized as either public or private, solely realistic or symbolic endeavors. The only place or space in common to all the miracles and subsequent pilgrimages is the Church as a location to give thanks. How the pilgrim invokes the Virgin, initiates, and completes the performance is defiant to categorization in its multiplicity of enactment. Instead of accusing pilgrimage and liturgical or religious dramas as reflecting either symbolic rites or public dramas, the performances should be considered as individually tailored demonstrations of the indivisible bond between the sacred and profane landscape and the interaction of the pilgrim with the realities of the entire space of pilgrimage. No one space holds the title of symbolic or realistic sphere because the pilgrims as actor and audience motivated by individual intents in their performances carry both realities with them in a united body that defines its space and staging as it progresses through the landscape. The miracles of Montserrat promote a diversity of performance, rather than a binary categorization of action and intent, that aid the pilgrims in creating their own individual identities through the interactions with any space they inhabit. The miraculous landscape of Montserrat described in the compilation of pilgrim testimonies does not remain the same as each actor generates a performance through the space to arrive at the end goal. The mountain setting physically interacts with each performer/spectator as another necessary component to the completion of the pilgrimage. The interactions of Montserrat's space and textual heritage are determined by the physical nature of the specific landscape of the performance. When the landscape of ritual drama and performance is removed from a strictly symbolic analysis its physical reality becomes an

integral component to understanding the creation of the performance of pilgrimage and the individual pilgrim's identity.

Chapter Five

A Personal Space of Torture: Pilgrimage and Identity Creation

Introduction

The current chapter continues to analyze the miracles contained within Pedro Alfonso de Burgos' 1594 *Libro de la historia y milagros, hechos a invocación de Nuestra Señora de Montserrate* and builds upon the ascetic practices mentioned in Chapter Three in combination with the necessity of a physical landscape of performance proposed in Chapter Four. Each pilgrimage is a unique performance taking inspiration from the cultural, textual, and oral traditions of Montserrat as well as the individual pilgrim's needs and reasons for embarking on the performance. This chapter discusses the corpus of Montserrat's miracles in a manner related to Chapter Four's emphasis on the interaction between pilgrim actors and the realities of the changing landscape they inhabit as the performance or drama unfolds. Where Chapter Four analyzed how the mountain setting and its physical realities affected pilgrimage, this chapter addresses how the ascetic heritage of Christian martyrs and representations of suffering and implemented pain interacted with the actor through the journey and helped to create and shape not only the physical aspects of the performance described in the miracle texts, but also the pilgrim identity. The discussion begins with an introduction to the ascetic practices and activities of suffering and torture involved in the tradition of the early Christian martyrs that came before the Egyptian desert ascetics. The activities of those who died for their beliefs varied in Christian history and the variations present in the deaths of martyrs and the ascetic lives of the desert hermits are both relevant to pilgrimage practices at Montserrat. The hermitages of Montserrat take their namesakes from the desert ascetics and also from a number of Christian martyrs prominent in the Iberian Peninsula.

The eremites residing in the Egyptian desert conformed to lives of ascetic isolation in the manner of Juan Garín before he sinned. They constructed identities through solitude and reputation. In other words, their affairs were private and circulated within the limited sphere of other knowledgeable eremites or figures living an enclosed or cloistered lifestyle. These performances were intensely personal and unique to the individual hermit, as is the case with each journey undertaken by the pilgrims to Montserrat. However, pilgrimage at Montserrat was at times a loud, raucous event that could be enacted by a single actor, a family, or entire community vocally processing and giving thanks to the Virgin. These large public spectacles do not resemble the quiet periods in the lives of the desert hermits or Juan Garín as they silently prayed and enacted their individually tailored penance within the sanctuary of their cave dwellings. The sometimes riotous and sensorially dependent and visual aspects of pilgrimage resemble spectacles that specifically recall the public nature of the violent deaths of early Christian martyrs. However, the distinction between the private asceticism of the desert eremites as opposed to the more public mode of suffering of the early Christian martyrs does not mean that the concept of public versus private drama and ritual should become a distinguishing feature in the analysis of pilgrimage. The eremitic and martyr-like modes of ascetic suffering are distinct from one another, but as is the case with the miracles and roles of the actor and audience at Montserrat, neither form of devotion is wholly private or public. This chapter proposes that the Christian martyrs and the process of their spectacles and narratives of directed pain (the cause/the medium and focus of intent) which led to the unique creation and establishment of their identities (the effect/the desired outcome or determinant goal) is similar to the acts of suffering and identity creation experienced by a pilgrim during a performance to Montserrat. The suffering of the martyrs and desert ascetics provides the foundation for looking at pilgrimage

through a physical lens in which acts of varying degrees of public and private enactments of pain lead to the creation of a unique individual identity and personal form of piety. The stage, landscape, or site where this suffering occurs is a key component to the completion of the performance of pilgrimage resulting in the attainment of the actor/pilgrim's goal of supplication and the formation of a new identity.

The Landscape of Suffering

Montserrat's remote location and its difficulty of access recall the self-sequestered cave settings of the ascetic desert fathers. The foundation myths and combination of eremitic, cenobitic, and ascetic practices of Montserrat also contribute to the development and emphasis of the landscape and the geological structure of the isolated cave as necessary components to the evolution of the shrine and cult of the Virgin. The textual histories establish the feeling of isolation where the mountain acts as the crucial backdrop to Fray Juan Garín's spiritual development. At the same time, the deserted mountain portrays the solitary lifestyle created by the unique landscape as detrimental to Garín's holy status. The related texts and miracles of Montserrat also describe the necessity of forces (individuals and communities) from outside the mountain precinct enacting purposeful and timely processions to and from the mountain. Montserrat cannot exist or function as a sacred symbol on its own. As described in the discovery of the Virgin statue and Garín's deliverance from his wild existence, although isolated locations and specific objects are important in honing and directing pious activities, without the human factor and infrastructure of the mundane world, the miraculous events would not have the required spectators or actors involved to legitimize and popularize the witnessed performances.

However, studies regarding the forms of asceticism practiced in the early Christian Egyptian desert promote a highly private and concealed type of piety (enactment of religious devotion) performed away from the gaze of the general public and the larger realm of the Christian community. The cave dwellings of eremites such as Juan Garín and Onnophrius served as personal spaces of privately performed acts of piety and suffering through extreme self-control and denial of most comforts of life save the bare minimum of food and drink needed to sustain the body. The ascetic's cave or landscape of performance alternated between a final resting place and a secure and sustaining locale. The cave was a tomb and womb where simultaneously the hermits' flesh rotted and withered from their extreme lifestyles and was protected and concealed from exposure to obliteration by the elements (Beresford 2010). The ascetic world of the desert hermits is almost exclusively accessible through the accounts of their lives in the hagiographic texts. The intimate act of daily suffering represented as a slow but inevitable progression towards death as the body degrades marks the ascetic's cave as a private locus of suffering (Beresford 2010). The lives of the eremites are performances of private martyrdom that are enacted in personal amphitheaters for an audience of one. The tradition of the cave as a liminal or transitory location purposefully removed from the urban centers of society furthers the acceptance of ascetic devotion as a drastic break and flight from the mundane sphere into the wilderness by an individual seeking a private or ritual form of worship (Harpham 1987; Beresford 2010).

The isolated or liminal cave location of ascetic suffering existed on the geographical outskirts of society and mainstream religious practices. However, the personal acts of pain, such as the lives of the ascetic hermits full of suffering from near starvation and exposure and the torture and deaths of the early Christian martyrs, are not meant to remain marginal works or acts

of a pious minority. Instead, such modes of personal suffering can be enacted or performed by any pilgrim with a culturally imbued focus of intent. The lives and actions of the ascetics and pilgrims do not preclude integration into the wider world of Christendom merely because they take place in spaces traditionally considered liminal or on the outskirts of society and art. The narratives of hermits such as Onnophrius, which usually focus on their acts of suffering leading to their deaths, are meant to serve as educational tools of emulation to their brethren and others who hear the exploits. The ascetic lives function in a manner akin to the deaths of the martyrs and Christ. They act as the ultimate exemplars of faith and devotion for the wider Christian community.

The tradition of individual acts of suffering did not begin or end with the desert ascetics. Christ remains the original exemplar of personal suffering into the medieval period. His acts and lessons are followed by the early Christian martyrs of Late Antiquity who are connected to the later examples of desert suffering and finally the individual sufferer enduring pilgrimage. The ascetic practices of the later desert fathers are indebted to the actions of the Christian martyrs. However, where the hermits appeared to endure pain in the relative peace of isolation, the martyrs were exposed to the destruction of their bodies as spectacles of suffering in the Roman world (Merback 1999; Decker 2015). While the location and audience to the suffering varied greatly between martyrs and ascetics, both serve as examples to develop the necessity of the individual body (of the ascetic or supplicant pilgrim) as a focal point of destruction and suffering within the development of enactments and performances of Christian piety.

The public stage of the Roman amphitheater at first might seem at odds with the ascetic practices of the hermits or the path of the individual medieval pilgrim processing to Montserrat. However, a focus on the individual bodies of the martyrs or hermits during their enactments of

pain reveals how those instances of public (martyrdom) and private (eremitic) suffering informed and evolved into the personal performance and physical experience of pain present in medieval pilgrimage to Montserrat. The following section addresses the more public setting and nature of pilgrimage developed from the martyr tradition.

Rome and its Martyrs

The foundation myths of Montserrat focus on the discovery of the Virgin's statue by a pastoral community and the solitary life of Fray Juan Garín. While individuals and tightly-knit communities are present at the inception of the cult dedicated to the Virgin of Montserrat, the wider social and hierarchical contexts of Catalonia and in specific the region of Barcelona also play prominent roles in the establishment of Montserrat as a site of veneration. The Bishop of Manresa (from the Virgin's apparition) and Count Wilfred of Barcelona (from Garín's penance) introduce elements of local lay and ecclesiastical power. Their presence demonstrates that a tale of a remote mountain shrine and the ascetic life of a hermit are never entirely distanced from the wider Christian community. Further contextualization of Montserrat within Christendom arises from Garín's search for penance. After fornicating with Riquilda and murdering her, Garín undertakes a pilgrimage to Rome. In this single act of penance, the Hermit irrevocably links the seemingly private lifestyle of an ascetic hermit with the most visual symbol of Christian authority, the Pope's See of power in Rome.

Influenced to repent, at least in the French version, the recently sinned Fray Juan Garín was touched by God in 'son coeur d'un repentir si vis, qu'il alla à Rome se jetter aux pieds du S.

Pere pour en obtenir le pardon: il lui enjoignit une penitence de sept ans' (*Abrégé* 1723: 11).[1] Pedro Serra y Postius' 1745 version also depicts Garín fleeing the death of Riquilda 'para huir de las manos del Conde' and 'para confesar sus pecados a los pies del Papa' (11). The different eighteenth-century versions of Garín's penance reveal a variety of motivations and styles of pilgrimage. However, instead of restating Garín's different attitudes towards pilgrimage found in these excerpts, the following section analyzes what the similar textual reiterations reveal about Rome's role within the evolution of the Christian practice of suffering and bodily destruction that influenced later forms of pilgrimage. The analysis begins with a consideration of the *Abrégé de l'histoire Notre-dame du Montserrat*.

Although the French text's succinct wording of Garín's penitential journey to Rome at first depicts the caring and benevolent God, the connotations with Rome create a scene rife with the violent past of early Christian martyrdom on further examination. The God mentioned in Garín's flight to Rome is not the wrathful one of the Old Testament smiting entire communities. Nor is this God connected to his role as Father of the self-sacrificing Christ. Instead, the God who intimately engages with Juan Garín and alters the inner workings of his heart to be receptive to repentance is the God who preserves the innocent and elevates up those who have fallen (*Abrégé* 1723). For the immediate situation of Garín's triple sin of fornication, murder, and denial, God picks up a beaten man and motivates him to seek forgiveness. Although Garín must spend the next seven years 'sans jamais èlever ses yeux vers le Ciel qu'il avoit offensé', God

[1] '[touched in] his heart with a repentance so strong, that he went to Rome and threw himself at the feet of Saint Peter in order to obtain pardon: where he was ordered to serve a penance of seven years.'

eventually lifts the penitent Hermit from his bestial existence and reinstates his holy status (*Abrégé* 1723: 11).[2] God as the supportive preserver of innocence pertains to Garín's immediate predicament which was induced by a life of ascetic solitude. This God also purposefully recalls the more violent and pain-laced imagery of Christ's sacrifice and the deaths of the Christian martyrs who were tortured in the public arena of Rome's amphitheaters.[3]

The imagery of the innocent Christ as *Agnus Dei* (the lamb of God) dying for the sins of humanity was reenacted by the deaths of his martyred followers and displayed in the Middle Ages through depictions such as the *Man of Sorrows* in which Mary holds her son after he is taken down from the Cross and is in a state of simultaneous life and death as his broken body decays (Kirkland-Ives 2015). Emulative of Christ, the martyrs' crime was believing in one God and refusing to worship in the manner dictated by Roman society. For the desire of publicly proclaiming 'I am a Christian', the martyrs met their deaths in violent and graphic manners (Boyarin 1999: 96). The relevance of innocence and martyrdom to Montserrat is prominent in the designation of hermitages on the mountain as well as the character of Riquilda in Garín's penance. Of the fourteen hermitages and chapels constructed and inhabited on Montserrat, the three dedicated to Saints Mary Magdalene, Benedict, and Anne were constructed by Abbots Cisneros and Burgos in 1498 and later as part of the Benedictine reform of the Monastery and its holdings. The late date of these hermitages places them outside the medieval phases of foundation, construction, and evolution of Montserrat that constitute the temporal focus of this

[2] 'without ever lifting his eyes to God whom he had offended.'

[3] In the context of this thesis, torture is considered an act of bodily destruction or degradation that induces physical suffering.

thesis. As a result of their later construction, these three hermitages are not included in the following discussion.

The original twelve medieval hermitages of Montserrat include dedications to the martyrs Saints Catherine (287-305), Acisclus (fourth century), and his sister Victoria (fourth century). The suffering endured by these martyrs varied from the wheel to a myriad of other tortures before their deaths. Whether a more self-induced and reflexive form of violence, such as the stigmatization of Saint Francis of Assisi, or of a physical variety, that of Saint Catherine on the wheel, the pain, destruction, and bodily mutilation of the saints and martyrs share the visual and sensory nature of their spectacles of violence (Pinkus 2015). Although figures that endured such violent wounds and deaths were limited to Christ and the saints and martyrs recognized by the Church, the imagery, narratives, and medieval tradition of suffering that destroys the body through it partition and destruction does not have a negative connotation (Pinkus 2015). The wounds and body parts of Christ and the martyrs that were affected did not represent a tradition of violence, but of participation and spectatorship in Christ's passion and the martyrs' suffering (Bynum 2002; Decker 2015). Each wound provided an opportunity for the medieval Christian to reflect on, imitate, identify, and experience the violence done to the founders of their religion. According to Jerome, as long as the pain and suffering inflicted damaged the body and not the soul, then 'if the individual suffers for the sake of his or her own redemption, exposure to physical brutality has positive qualities' (Pinkus 2015: 24-25). As is the case with the narratives of the ascetic lives of the desert eremites, the wounds and physical suffering and mutilation of the martyrs' bodies acted as exemplars upon which the medieval audience reflected and meditated. The deconstructed bodies of the martyrs and the wounds of Christ were the narrative beginning and end points that viewers activated by sensorially engaging with images of suffering

(Decker 2015). The narratives and images detailing Christian suffering in devotional works engaged the audience by 'leading readers [or viewers] through a carefully organized narrative meditation' making the visual experience one that was an involved process of sensory interaction and reflection to gain the reward of the positive outcome of the soul (Kirkland-Ives 2015: 39). Although the suffering involved in Montserrat's legend of Juan Garín and the miracles and pilgrimages attributed to the site are not as severe as the physical wounds enacted upon Christ and the martyrs, the physical hardships endured by Montserrat's protagonists and the process of being deconstructed and recreated for the Christian identity is reiterated by the need of Fray Garín to go to Rome, which is the Papal See of power and also the hereditary site of Christian repression and the spectacle of martyrdom.

The French and Spanish texts of Montserrat utilize similar methods to denote Garín's desire to go to Rome for an audience with the Pope. In the French *Abrégé* (1742), Rome is equated to the location where the Hermit throws himself at the feet of the Holy Father to obtain pardon. Serra y Postius (1745 and 1747) emphasizes Rome's location as the home of the Pope, the site of the ultimate confessor to which the Hermit can relay his sins. The differences in designation of the character of the Pope is slight, but his status as head and authority of the Church proffers Rome as an authoritative site and ultimate exemplar of confession, judgement, and sentencing.

Rome as a center of confession draws attention to the interaction between roman civic authority and Christian martyrs. When Christians were taken by Roman officials, as in the case with Christ's interactions with Pontius Pilate, some were given a chance to recant their faith and make sacrifices to the Emperor and the gods. The refusal of the Christians to be swayed into denouncing their faith (in spite of the prospect of torture and death) is where the concept of

confession arises. True martyrs would never confess that they were wrong and denounce God. Instead, their admissions were voluntary, prompted by an effort to rally against the torturer. The confessions of the early Christians were not of their sins and crimes committed against the Roman authority, but of their belief in one God and Christ. In the imitation of the suffering of Christ, martyrdom became a declaration of the essence of the internal self, touched and moved by God to confess (Jensen 2010). This element of self-creation and proclamation was encapsulated in the core statement or confession of faith made at the end of a martyr's life: 'I am a Christian' (Boyarin 1999: 96). The use of the martyr motifs in the Middle Ages turned instances of Christ-like suffering into 'generative work[s] of images of torture' that were 'the most complete when the bodies depicted in them were the most altered or destroyed' (Decker 2015: 3). Although Fray Juan Garín is initially prompted to go to Rome '[para] huir de las manos del Conde' and only admits his sins as an afterthought, his act of confession is a constructive one that is the first step in the creation of his identity that solidifies in the years of penitential suffering he endures (Serra y Postius 1745: 11).

The confession, the need to go to Rome in order to legitimize the vocalization of sin and to share the proclamation with an audience identifies Rome and other metropolitan areas such as Barcelona as centers of spectacle which destroyed the bodies of the martyrs through suffering. The ascetic tradition of the desert hermits, which Juan Garín embodies before and during his penance, promotes a flight from the urban corruption of civilization in order to be free from human distractions that would interrupt a life dedicated to suffering. Yet the tradition of martyrdom requires the urban setting with its structures and regulating authority as integral to the public construction of the martyr identity through a confession of faith and suffering. In order to confront this simultaneous need (of the martyr) and revulsion of the urban center (of the desert

ascetic) present in the creation of Garín's identity, the following section determines whether the Hermit's flight into the urban environment of Rome represents an inversion or denial of his ascetic hermit self for the adoption of a more civic-based identity of the martyr.

The Hermit-Martyr

The creation of Fray Juan Garín's identification as a pilgrim invoking the martyr tradition necessitates the public setting of Rome to initiate the imposed acts of suffering, penance, and bodily deconstruction that instigate the creation of his new, but still ascetically informed and equally private identity. Pilgrimage and ritual are not passive performances of spectatorship, neither is the ascetic discourse of a life based on suffering one dimensional and only enacted for the benefit of the individual eremite: 'While appearing to be the discourse of retreat, and thus of the marginalized, it [the ascetic text] calls for an audience' (Cameron 1998: 154). As is the case with the medieval tradition of narratives and imagery regarding suffering, the internal or spiritual contemplation of the eremites as well as the viewing of the breaking bodies of the martyrs require a witness to give the events meaning and credence. Without an audience capable of experiencing disgust or empathy, imagery and narratives that relate such scenes of violence are robbed of their ability to antagonize and affect the viewer, and have no cultural purpose (Pinkus 2015). The exemplars of the hermits and martyrs are designed to affectively alter the audience through the senses, which is why the 'brutality of the martyrdoms seem to reshape the entire context of the sacred narrative and, consequentially, the viewers' experience' (Pinkus 2015: 27). The necessity of an audience to the spectacle of deconstruction and suffering is evident in the Montserrat foundation myths.

Without an outside third-party (in this case the Pope) knowing of Garín's deeds, the Hermit's healing and reclamation of his identity as a holy Christian would never be initiated. The reason Juan Garín would not find his identity without the audience of the Pope to his confession is that without the presence of the authority of Rome (the Papacy), no trial of suffering would be inflicted by a third party upon Garín's body. Suffering, whether in the form of minimalistic self-inflicted cave dwelling or the systematically imposed torture of an arena, necessitates a strong public presence to create a widespread reputation and identity for the sufferer. The public enactments of pain such as performed by the saints, desert stylites and other ascetics: 'attracted so much attention because, like the martyrs, they enacted for all to see the cultural script that determined to be Christian *was* to suffer' (Perkins 1995: 205). At Montserrat, Juan Garín gains renown during his pre-penitential phase as a holy hermit who 'no havia hecho en su vida pecado mortal' and furthers his reputation through his more visual and public stint as a wandering, penitential beast (Serra y Postius 1745: 8). The episode of Garín's required seven-year pilgrimage and eventual lifting of his journey of penance indicates the tension between destruction and creation in the extreme treatment of the human body (Decker 2015) and serves as an example of the suffering required to create a Christian identity in the imitation of Christ and the martyrs.

After confessing his sins, Juan Garín is sentenced to an animalistic existence in which his humanity and recognizable body are almost completely destroyed:

> Pendant ce long espace de temps il brouta la terre, toûjours la tête baissée sans jamais élever ses yeux vers le Ciel qu'il avoit offense. Il Marcha sur ses pieds & ses mains comme les bêtes, mangea l'herbe, ne parla à personne: en un mot, il devint si difforme &

si hideux, que ne lui restant plus aucune figure d'homme, il ne fut plus reconnoissable. (*Abrégé* 1723: 11)[4]

In her discussion of ascetics and early Christian martyrs, Judith Perkins (1995) claims that from the time period of martyrdom to asceticism there was a change in the style of suffering involved: 'The suffering was now located in the afflicted human body of the saint rather than the tortured body of the martyr' (205). By creating distinct categories for the afflicted body of the saint and tortured martyr, Perkins differentiates between the suffering body of desert ascetic and the early Christian martyr. The afflicted body is represented by eremitic figures such as Fray Juan Garín before his fall and during the course of his penance. The image of the emaciated, hair-covered desert saint is a familiar motif in the ascetic tradition exemplified by individuals such as Saints Onnophrius, Paphnutius, Peter, and Paul the Hermit depicted in Figure 14 below.

[4] 'During this long span of time he grazed on the land, always with his head down without ever lifting his eyes to God whom he had offended. He walked on his feet and hands like an animal, eating grass, never speaking to anyone: in a word, he became so deformed and hideous, that there was nothing left of him that looked like a man, he was no longer recognizable.'

Figure 14. ‘Four Desert Saints with the Mandylion’ from the Temple Gallery. Representations of Saints Paphnutius, Peter the Hermit, Onnophrius, and Paul the first Hermit.

The ascetic body is practically starved and lives in self-imposed, exposed, and extreme conditions. This emaciated figure of the desert saint exemplifies the first and second components of Garín’s ascetic and Christian identities. During his pre-penitential isolation and his penance leading to his forgiveness, Garín is the solitary, suffering eremite who allows his hair to grow and body to dwindle as he lives off nothing but the minimal quantities of herbs and wild vegetation to sustain his physical form. Once Garín is captured and forced to exhibit his bestial suffering or degredation of his human self for the entertainment of Count Wilfred and his court,

the nature of the Hermit's pain changes. The captured beast-hermit and the public viewing and witnessing of his non-human form or the extreme and broken body his suffering represents no longer pertain to the ascetic tradition of the desert saints alone. The former Fray Juan Garín tried to warn the Count of the change in status that an audience would cause in his life before the events transpired leading to Riquilda's premature death. According to Garín, a shared or public life is 'muy contraria y impertinente a la vida solitaria que tenía […] porque ala vida heremítica, convenía estar fuera de toda compañía y ruydo de gente' (Burgos 1594: fol. 5^{v}). What disrupted Garín's solitary suffering and forced it into a more public arena of an observable spectacle of pain was the involuntary nature of his abduction from the mountain landscape of Montserrat.

Between the ascetic and martyr modes of performance there is a sense of voluntary versus involuntary suffering and pain. Perkins' (1995) conception of the location of Christian suffering is firmly centered on the human body and the differences between the affliction and imposition of pain. The above version of suffering and Christian identity relies on the human body. Yet, the suffering body in question, that of Juan Garín, was no longer considered human, but something more like an animal that had no control over his actions (*Abrégé* 1723). The regression, destruction, or obstruction of the human self through voluntary as opposed to involuntary action necessitates a different approach than Perkins' that can address the process of the individual creation of identity present in the acts of Christian suffering such as martyrdom, penance, and pilgrimage. The image of the four identical desert eremites (Figure 14) depicts the necessary contributions of suffering and pain to the creation of their ascetic identities. The similar physicality and nearly identical emaciated appearances of the saints does not support the concept that the eremites or martyrs have the same identities such as the participants in the Turner and Turner concept of a shared, extra-societal pilgrim *communitas*. The repeated visages

of the saints indicate that the creation of an ascetic or pious identity requires a similar physical enactment of pain and suffering from all its participants or actors.

The following section argues that the destruction of the human self to the most basic unit of a physically functioning body through the suffering induced in martyrdom is not merely a destructive process with the sole aim of deconstructing the sufferer's voice (Scarry 1985: 1-27) through the degradation of their body, but also a creative one which is a necessary step to achieving a completed performance of pilgrimage.

Deconstructing the Self

The animalistic state of Juan Garín during his penance is comparable to the psychological processes of deconstruction behind torture or the infliction of pain to induce a physical degredation and suffering of the body, such as endured by early Christian martyrs. In his introduction, Peter Suedfeld (1990) begins by providing the five most common rationales for torture. Maureen A. Tilley (1991) cites these same rationales or goals of torture in her discussion of the concept of the ascetic Christian body and its place in the creation of the martyr's world. The five main reasons or goals of torture are the desires for: information, incrimination, indoctrination, intimidation, and isolation (Suedfeld 1990; Tilley 1991). This thesis also adds Elaine Scarry's (1985: 25-7) conceptualization of physical pain (torture) as language destroying to the motivations behind torture discussed in conjunction with Garín's suffering. Scarry (1985) contends that torture's purpose is not to elicit needed information, but to deconstruct visibly (publicly) the prisoner's (sufferer's) voice. Before identifying the components of induced pain as applicable to the idea of Christian suffering of the martyrs, ascetic figures, and pilgrims as they

pertain to Montserrat, this chapter expands on the significance of each of the categories of torture and their relation to the suffering individual.

Tilley (1991) groups the first three goals of torture (information gathering, incrimination, and intimidation) together as those which the early Christians were easily capable of fighting against and overcoming. She glosses over these categories to favor a discussion of the practices of isolation and indoctrination with regard to the process of martyrdom and torture. Tilley takes for granted that information gathering (the forced incrimination of family members and associates in activities contrary to the accepted reality of the torturer) and the intimidation of factions (to deter individuals (Christians) from behavior unacceptable to the power-wielder) are immediately surmounted by the Christian faith (Suedfeld 1990). These three initiatives of suffering become less pertinent to the creation of the martyr identity than the aspects of isolation and indoctrination involved in torture. Furthermore, Tilley and Suedfeld's inclusion of information gathering as an impetus to Late Antique and contemporary acts of torture is problematic as it directly conflicts with Scarry's (1985) assertion that the inducement of pain through torture actively destroys language and thus the sufferer's capacity to deliver any sort of information (useful or otherwise) to their captors. Although this chapter later explains how the exchange of information induced as a by-product of suffering relates to Montserrat, Tilley and Suedfeld's category of information gathering needs to be modified presently.

Scarry (1985) describes that any attempt at information gathering through torture can only last until the moment that the victims reach their breaking points and lose their ability to vocalize pain. The desire for information is less about accurate intelligence-gathering and more concerned with using the questions, answers, and the failing of the sufferer's voice to determine that the objective of torture has been achieved (inducing pain and bodily and vocal destruction).

Since the accuracy of information is secondary or a mere consequence of the deconstruction of language through pain, the category of information-gathering is more accurately designated as that of voice-manipulation. Regarding the implementation of destruction through pain associated with the process involved in pilgrimage exemplified at Montserrat through Juan Garín's imitation of Christ's suffering, the goals of information-gathering (or voice-manipulation), incrimination, and intimidation should be interpreted alongside isolation and indoctrination in the process of constructing a completely realized performance of pilgrimage to Montserrat.

While each rationale or motivation of torture can be identified within the foundation myths and miracles of Montserrat, the discussion concerning the heritage and enactment of suffering at the pilgrimage site begins with an analysis of isolation. Imposed seclusion and a degree of separation from the noise of the large civic centers such as Barcelona or smaller cities such as Manresa provided the desert-like atmosphere that promoted the heritage of the Egyptian fathers as part of the foundation of Montserrat. The figure of Juan Garín and the practice of living in the cave hermitages on the mountain provide links to the earlier ascetic fathers. However, the phases of Garín's ascetic life and penance not only reflect the quiet and more private practices of the desert ascetics, but also the louder and more public spectacles of the early Christian martyrs and the medieval tradition of reflecting upon such images and narratives of physical harm and destruction. The nature of Garín's isolation fluctuates between the voluntary (desert asceticism) and the involuntary (martyrdom) modes of suffering. However, as is the case with the nature of drama that can be publicly and privately enacted, performances of desert asceticism and martyrdom should not be understood as only voluntary or involuntary expositions of pain. Instead, they vary and alternate representing both modes of suffering to different degrees. Isolation is the key component around which the rest of the motivations of torture

circulate. From imposed isolation develops the destruction, reconstruction, or manipulation of voice.

Once Juan Garín accepts his sentence from the Pope, he becomes the embodiment of the penitential pilgrim crawling on hands and knees from Rome to Montserrat (a distance of about 1392 kilometers or 865 miles). As he commits to his journey, Garín is engaged in the isolating component of torture as is the case with the other pilgrims of Montserrat. Some methods used to impose such isolation through torture include characteristics inherent in the long journey of pilgrimage such as semi-starvation, exposure to the elements, a lack of proper hygiene, and sleep deprivation (Tilley 1991). The penitential Hermit embodies an extreme version of suffering through isolation adapted from the martyr and ascetic traditions to the performance of pilgrimage exemplified in his meager diet of herbs, the filthy matt of hair growing all over his body, and his life of aimless wandering over the landscape of Montserrat. The suffering is not experienced by the legendary hermit alone, but also by the medieval pilgrim journeying to and from Montserrat.

The variety of pilgrims and their modes of approaching Montserrat are detailed in Pedro Alfonso de Burgos' (1594) compilation of the Virgin's miracles. Pilgrims such as Garín undertook their journeys in a state of self-inflicted suffering: 'otros vienen hiriéndose los pechos açota*n*do y disciplinán*n*dose co*n* cuerdas y sogas, o cadenas derramando la viva sangre por el suelo' (Burgos 1594: 29^{v}). Pain and bodily torture are not endured and inflicted only as a means of a private physical enactment designed to help the body recall the suffering of Christ, the martyrs, desert hermits, and Fray Juan Garín. The individual acts of penance, contrition, and thanksgiving (exemplified in the private miracles of Montserrat described in Chapter Four) manifest in the literal carrying of weights which serve as physical representations of sins, bleeding, or giving life for the performance. Garín's narrative of wandering penance and the

destruction of his body become aids of devotion and imitation of medieval pilgrims to Montserrat. The images represented in the Garín tale and the martyrs' lives acted as 'evocative and often lurid mnemonic prompts for readers [and listeners] who could follow Christ's [the protagonist's] movements and abuses in their minds and imagine in vivid detail the physical experience of Christ's [the protagonist's] suffering' (Kirkland-Ives 2015: 40). However, as in the case with the miracles of Montserrat that were neither completely public or private, the personal acts of suffering, comparable to the more internal and reflective and sequestered lives led by the desert eremites, are accompanied by a vocal confession of deeds that reinforces and adds a more public manifestation of pain to the construction of the Christian identity of suffering: 'otros vienen dolorosa y agramente llora*n*do, y dando sollozos y vozes, unas por reclamar y alcançar el ayuda de Nuestra Señora en sus necesidades, y otros por dolor y arrepentimiento de sus culpas y pecados' (Burgos 1594: 29^{v}). The narrative traditions of Montserrat act in a manner reminiscent of devotional images in the Middle Ages which led the audience through a 'carefully organized narrative meditation', but the interactive and movement-dependent nature of pilgrimage permitted the internal empathetic suffering to become a corporeal imitation and identification with the suffering of Garín, the martyrs, eremites, and Christ (Kirkland-Ives 2015: 39). Through a declaration and confession of their sins, fears, and needs to a third-party audience, the pilgrims respond to the isolation inherent in their unique performances by accepting their sins and recognizing that their penance or performance necessitates acts of suffering such as that of Juan Garín. Only once the proto-pilgrim's life and mistakes are owned and the body destroyed through suffering, isolation, and exposure can the new elevated and holier Christian identity be created and established.

Isolation is a component of torture that is irrevocably tied to deprivation. The victim (pilgrim) is deprived of adequate food, sleep, and other necessary provisions of a healthy lifestyle. According to Tilley (1991), the rescinding of physical comforts is the first step in achieving the ultimate purpose of isolation: the deprivation of the victim's compensatory techniques by removing them from familiar places and systems of support in an effort to weaken their will to resist. Tilley (1991) states that the martyrs were removed from their fellow Christians and isolated in prison prior to their torture and execution in an effort to make them regret their choices and to recant. Once removed from their support systems, ideally the Christians should have become weaker in their faith and easier to dehumanize. The goal of isolation is not only to separate the victim from the familiar, but also to convince them that they no longer have anything in common with the outside world or with their torturer, not even a common humanity.

Tilley (1991) claims that although isolated through physical separation and acts of deprivation, the early Christian martyrs were able to fight against the efforts of dehumanization inflicted by their captors to forge a stronger belief and a thoroughly Christian identity developed from suffering. Attributing a super-human ability to the martyr to combat and defy pain, dehumanization, and isolating techniques through an indefatigable faith and a perceived embodiment of Christ's suffering oversimplifies the process of suffering and its interactions with the individual. The dehumanizing effects of torture through isolation and pain administration are not overcome as easily as Tilley suggests. Rather, in differing yet related manners, the martyrs, desert ascetics, and pilgrims embrace the dehumanizing effects of their suffering. This does not mean that medieval pilgrims lose their Christian identities and become unraveled on account of the inflicted pain. The experiences of pilgrim suffering open an arena of discourse contingent on

the symbolic death of the previous identity of the individual (the proto-pilgrim) before they engage in the act of pilgrimage. Martyrdom, the ascetic life of the desert hermits, and pilgrimage are all literal or figurative practices of dying for God (or Mary) and of discussing the process (Boyarin 1999). The pilgrims and martyrs are witnesses and creators of their own Christian identities through the deconstruction or dehumanization experienced during their physical suffering.

The primary examples of isolation and vocal manipulation with regard to Montserrat come from the mountain setting and foundation myths considered the first miracles attributed to the Virgin. The mountain is repeatedly denoted as appearing uninhabitable and inaccessible from afar (Serra y Postius 1745 and 1747). Montserrat is a natural landmark as distinct and recognizable as the boundaries of the desert to the Egyptian hermits, the elevated urban amphitheater to the early Christian martyrs, and the images of the Passion of Christ to the medieval Christian. The distinct landscape of the mountain creates the appropriate setting of isolation where the suffering pilgrims establish their identities in a manner reminiscent of the desert hermits and martyrs who enacted imposed or inflicted isolation in caves or arenas to complete their performances.

Repeated instances of isolation form the basis of the Virgin statue's rediscovery. According to the texts, during the Muslim invasion of the Iberian Peninsula, the statue was hidden deep in the mountain by devout Christians trying to keep it safe from the invading forces (Serra y Postius 1747). Over the centuries, as the statue remained hidden in its protective yet isolating cave, the presence of the Virgin of Montserrat faded from local memory. In this instance, isolation is imposed on the statue and distances it (the sufferer) from all former associations with the world outside the prison or cave. Isolated in this manner, the Virgin can no

longer interact with the supplicants and retain her traditional space or influence in the lives of the pre-conquest Christians. Through isolation, the goal of dehumanization is realized. In the case of the Virgin statue, dehumanization does not imply that the sacred object lost an anthropomorphic humanity or that the Virgin lost her ability to influence events on the mountain. For the purposes of this argument, the statue is geographically dehumanized. It is separated from the presence of humanity and an outside audience's ability to witness the statue.

The Virgin statue's dehumanization at the beginning of the apparition legend is problematic for the creation of an identity through isolated suffering. Since it was removed from its usual place of veneration, hidden away, and its existence forgotten for over a century, the statue has no voice of its own or manner in which to denote its presence and to proclaim its location to gather a following.[5] Without a voice or manner in which to relate its suffering to an outside audience, the statue sits alone in a cave. The Virgin statue remains hidden, silent, and unable to communicate its existence with the wider Christian community. The tactic of isolation imposed on the statue succeeds in deconstructing the sufferer's voice. Without a tangible voice (presence), the dilemma arises of how to disseminate knowledge of the statue's location, attributes, or miracles, and its Christian identity. However, the manipulation and destruction of the statue's voice or presence in Catalonia was not an instantaneous occurrence. Isolation needs time. As is the case with torture, it is 'a process which not only converts but announces the conversion of every conceivable aspect of the event and the environment | into an agent of pain'

[5] The concept of *voice*, with regard to the character of the Virgin statue, is synonymous with the object or individual's known presence or status within the community of its audience and witnesses.

(Scarry 1985: 27-28). Where Scarry's reading of torture transforms the actions and environment into agents of pain, this thesis argues that the events and environment of ascetics, martyrs, and pilgrims are processes of change, specifically in the construction of the Christian identity.

The written martyr acts and the hagiographic texts of the desert fathers were generative processes of the self, as in the case of the performance of suffering (Bowersock 1995; Boyarin 1999; Krueger 2004; Jensen 2010). The presence of crowds and the urban spectacle of martyrdom could serve to 'emphasize the important role of the exemplary martyrs as teachers and leaders of the Christian community' (Bowersock 1995: 44). The discourse, examples, and lessons of piety the martyrs offered were visual acts. Martyrdom was most effective when the greatest number of people could witness the spectacle (Bowersock 1995). Assaf Pinkus (2015), in his discussion on modes of violence articulated through visual means in the medieval era, also emphasizes the need of instances of violence and sensory pain of having an audience to give the witness (viewer or reader) a model for elevation of the soul through imitation, identification, and self-indoctrination. However, the loud, vocal, and visual spectacles in which the martyrs were sacrificed were not opposed or distinct to the sequestered and 'bloodless witnessing (or confession) of late antiquity: anchorites in the desert, pillar saints in their aerial isolation, holy men in remote and less remote places, ascetics of all kinds' (Bowersock 1995: 56).

The literary creation of the trials and sufferings of the saints and eremites was also a process of production embodied within the experience of the witness to the events that were later recorded and shared. The construction and dissemination of the isolated lives and suffering of holy figures such as the desert eremites or the isolated Virgin statue could only take place through the discovery of such individuals and interactions with an audience: 'the performance of hagiographical authorship provided images of the saints to inspire imitation and moral change'

(Krueger 2004: 7). To be isolated, to suffer the deprivation of familiar places (Tilley 1991), and to be dehumanized from the wider social environment are not guarantees of the construction of a Christian identity or the fame and renown of a statue unless there is an audience present to witness the events. Isolation and vocal manipulation are only the first steps in the creation of a new identity through torture. Human interactions and the witnessing of pain are what develop the following or cult of the Virgin of Montserrat. To establish a new identity, the isolated suffering must be made public in order that the 'body's destruction is made a spectacle from which is created a new, and theoretically better, moral narrative' or enactment of pilgrimage (Decker 2015: 10).

Between the initial hiding of the Virgin statue and its traditional rediscovery date of 888, the statue had no voice or manner in which to communicate its status and presence to the outside world. The pain of torture seeks to achieve this inability to vocalize the self through the deconstruction of the voice (Scarry 1985; Tilley 1991). Without voice and audience, isolation and suffering mean nothing. However, the process of torture combined with the actions and the environment involved in the induced suffering are not only deconstructive, but in the case of pilgrimage are positive agents of change and the creation of a new Christian identity. The deconstruction of the statue's voice or integrated presence in society is a necessary first step, after which the statue finds its voice and the construction of Montserrat as a sacred pilgrimage location begins. This moment of creation occurred when the seven bergers or shepherds:

> virent la nuit plusieurs lumieres dans cette caverne, d'où sortoient des chants mélodieux: ils [bergers] en avertirent leur superieur; & celui-ci, l'Evêque nommé Godomare; qui

résidoit à Manteze. | [Godomare] vit ces rayons lumineux; il entendit cette musique angelique qui sortoit de cette grote mysterieuse. (*Abrégé* 1723: 6-7)[6]

Lights, smells, and loud music attract the discoverers (witnesses) of the statue to its isolated cave dwelling. The draw of the statue's vocalization or cries of isolation bring a private matter of suffering into the public eye of the local community, thereby reintroducing the statue to humanity in order to create its identity and overcome the obstacles of its imposed torture. The statue reemerges from the cave to find that it is confronted by a new generation of witnesses. Through the actions of the audience (the shepherds, nobles, and bishops of the area) and their performances of devotion, they help establish the Virgin of Montserrat's reputation through a new discourse ultimately made possible by her period of isolated and silent torture.

Isolation, suffering, and the need for an audience to establish a holy identity or cult following are also the prominent motivational forces behind the miracle of Riquilda's resurrection in the tale of Fray Juan Garín. The Hermit's renown as a 'varón santo' existed before the events of his sin and penance (Serra y Postius 1747: 51). It was because of his reputation that Count Wilfred gave his daughter to the Hermit to heal. However, as demonstrated by Garín's subsequent acts, this reputed saintly identity was not justly deserved or appropriately established. Before his fall, Juan Garín is praised as being dedicated to prayer, contemplation, and hard living, so much so that he had never committed a sin (Serra y Postius 1747). Once

[6] 'saw that night many lights around the cave, from where the melodious songs emanated: the shepherds advised their superior; and the closest one was the Bishop named Godomare; who resided in Manteze. He saw the rays of light; and understood that the angelic music was coming from the mysterious cave.'

Riquilda had been with the Hermit for a few days, he was introduced to the tangible pressure of temptation for the first time. The development of Garín's actions until his penance indicates that his previous holy man identity was meaningless because it was built on hubris and untested piety rather than a reputation established through suffering. In order to overcome his failings and truly create a lasting and permanent identity, Garín must go through the process of vocal deconstruction aided by the events that occur on the mountain of Montserrat.

Twice leading to his flight from Montserrat Garín seeks the advice of the Demon disguised as a fellow hermit sent to tempt him. Each time Garín wants to flee or confess to the stirring of lust incited by Riquilda's presence, the Demon monk sends him back to his cave almost mocking Garín's resolve. The first time Garín comes to the Demon is to discuss the expulsion of Riquilda from his cave to be free of this new factor inciting lascivious thoughts within him. The Demon sends Garín back to the cave citing scripture and chiding the Hermit for not facing and overcoming his temptations as Christ did in the desert:

> El demonio (como tan grande artífice de marañas, y embustes) con muchas razones, y autoridades de la Sagrada Escritura le persuadió a que ninguno merecía ser coronado sino él que vence grandes dificultades y que el christiano que solamente es bueno no aviendo sido tentado, tendrá poca gloria; y por el contrario será grandissima la de aquel que viéndose en urgentes ocasiones, y grandes peligros, los contrastó, y alcanza victoria de ellos. (Serra y Postius 1747: 54)

Although the Demon mocks the Hermit, its words nevertheless emphasize the need for Garín to suffer and battle his temptations to preserve and deserve his status as holy man. Without suffering and the possibility of failure a reputation means nothing.

The second instance Fray Garín seeks the Demon-monk's advice is after he rapes Riquilda. Initially, the Hermit wants to confess and give voice to his crime. However, the Demon convinces Garín that if Riquilda lives, she will ruin his reputation and the identity he has constructed for himself:

> El demonio deseando que fuese la soga trás el caldero, encareciéndole el pecado, y no tanto por la gravedad, quanto si viniesse a ser público, y manifiesto. Estás (le dixo) en buena reputación en esta comarca, si la donzella vive, no es possible se encubra este negocio; tendría por mejor que le quitasse la vida para que un caso tan feo no dé estampido por toda la tierra. (Serra y Postius 1747: 55)

Again, the Demon raises the questions of the perseverance of Garín's reputation, but also the public nature of his renown. If one does not make a spectacle and fight against his demons, then he is not really worthy of his reputation. Garín's dependence on the Demon's advice indicates that once an action or deed is made public it has the potential to solidify or destroy the enactor's identity.

The result of Garín's deliberation is that he murders Riquilda to keep her quiet and to save his reputation. The series of events leading to the Hermit's penance reveals that until this point, Garín's reputation as a 'varón santo' was an untested one built on pride (Serra y Postius 1747: 51). The Hermit's lifestyle and isolation were purposefully constructed to give him the appearance of a devout eremite. However, without true pain and the deconstruction of the self induced through suffering to bolster the reputation in a manner reminiscent of the lives of the desert saints who came before him, Garín is left with an identity that crumbles under the weight of the first real obstacle he encounters.

Not until Fray Garín receives his seven-year penance of wandering on his hands and knees does he begin to undergo the true suffering and isolation promoted by acts of pilgrimage at Montserrat. Garín's departure from Rome initiates his physical separation from systems of familiarity and support, such as the act of confession provided by the ecclesiastical hierarchy. As in the case with the Virgin statue, Juan Garín is removed from an audience and dehumanized so thoroughly that he loses the ability to communicate verbally with other humans: 'pues no hablaba, no se levantaba en los pies, no se veía en el rastro de razón ni entendimiento' (Serra y Postius 1747: 12). Not only does speech leave the former holy man, but his physical appearance changes to such an extent as to liken him more to a beast than a man: 'tan feo, tan desmejorado, y cubierto de un tan largo pelo que de todo punto parece que havía perdido la forma de hombre' (Serra y Postius 1747: 12).[7] As a victim or participant in the suffering and isolationist tactics of an imposed penance and suffering, the well-renowned and prideful monk is unmade. He is deconstructed into the basest unit of life, a non-vocal, unthinking body only concerned with the physical necessities required for survival. At this stage in his penance, Garín represents the traditional figure of the privately suffering eremite rather than the publicly tortured martyr.

Bowersock (1995) claims that the early Christian sacrifice of martyrdom was very different from the continual sacrifices enacted by the desert ascetics in their daily lives. He also focuses on the public and performative aspects of martyrdom that necessitate the presence of a witness to be successful. Similarly, Boyarin (1999) promotes the public aspects of the discourse created by dying for God in a ritualized and performative manner. Bowersock (1995) and Boyarin's (1999) focus on ascetic practices propose desert asceticism as the opposite of martyrdom or at least an evolution away from the practices engaged in Late Antique Rome. Key

[7] See Figures 12 and 14.

words used to describe asceticism are: a withdrawal, a renunciation, or flight into the desert depicted as a liminal space (Goehring 1999; Beresford 2010). The manner in which the Christian identity reacts and interacts with the methods and elaboration of suffering does not take the same form in martyrdom and desert asceticism. However, the categories of martyr-like and eremitic suffering should not be compared utilizing such opposing terminologies to denote their natures. Both traditions lead to the manipulation and creation of identity through performed and witnessed suffering which are present in the tale of Juan Garín.

Fray Garín goes through a process of recalibrating his identity during his seven years of penance. The Hermit's changing status can be separated into three stages: the prideful solitary eremite, the wandering beast, and the true ascetic. These categories correspond to Garín's life before the penance received in Rome, the penitential stage spent wandering Montserrat as his humanity becomes unrecongnizable under his animalistic appearance, and the rediscovery of his voice through the lifting of his penance and the confession of his sins to the Count of Barcelona. Contrary to Tilley's (1991) assessment of the ability of the Christian martyr to overcome the dehumanizing effects of torture, Fray Juan Garín does not emerge from his years of isolation and penitential suffering the same man he was before sinning against Riquilda. Garín's change, like the meditations on images of the martyrs', Christ's deaths, and the narratives of the desert eremites, induces not only a psychological or internal elevation of the soul, but a physical alteration as well. In the case of Paphnutius, the writer of the life of Onnophrius, the younger cenobite travels the desert and meets the two isolated hermits he describes as horrible beasts upon seeing them. Once Paphnutius (2000) further examines his elders, he notes that they are naked save for the growth of hair that served as raiment to cover their shame. Even Paphnutius (2000) who briefly leaves his cenobitic community to become a temporary eremite or pilgrim

undergoes a physical transformation which results in the monk losing half of his garments to clothe a recently deceased hermit in a death shroud. Garín's time as a solitary desert hermit and his hairy vestments physically serve to mark his internal religious progression and lifestyle to a higher state (or new identity) such as the famous desert fathers Onnophrius, Antony, and Paul the Hermit.

As in the case with the martyrs, Fray Garín's identity is one of physical changes and corporeal suffering dependent on an audience acting as witness to his pain. Garín is only recognized as a holy man when his penance is lifted in front of the Count and his court. This recognition allows the bestial Hermit to rise and assume the upright stance of a man. Instead of denying the dehumanizing effects of torture which isolate the individual and deconstruct the perceived world through induced pain, Garín accepts the obliteration of his former self as a necessary component of his penance. Only with a complete destruction of his former prideful self can the Hermit become a template upon which the environment of Montserrat and the presence of the Virgin Mary can imprint a new identity of an individual who has realized a performance of pilgrimage.

In Garín's tale, the destruction of the old identity through the loss or manipulation of voice is prominent. Each instant of vocal deconstruction leads to a literal or symbolic rebirth. Juan Garín is silenced during his imposed penance and released from beast-hood through the manipulation of God's voice or authority through the body of Wilfred's three-month-old son. A final example of isolation and vocal destruction leading to a rebirth or construction of a new identity is embodied by the figure of Wilfred's daughter. Riquilda suffers a violent and sudden loss of voice as Garín cuts her throat, ending her life. After a period of isolation and rediscovery of the girl through Garín's penance and return pilgrimage to Montserrat, Riquilda emerges

reborn with a new goal and identity: to become a nun dedicated to the Virgin on Montserrat. The narratives of identity destruction and creation are paralleled in the rediscovery of the Virgin statue in the apparition miracle. The threefold process of the obliteration of Garín's former identity and the establishment of his new persona are also reflected in the apparition legend. The creation of the statue's identity and the foundation of the Virgin's cult can be separated into three chronological phases that consist of: the post-Muslim invasion identity and the statue's initial hiding, its solitary confinement within the cave, and the rediscovery of the statue and establishment of a new shrine and cult following.

On either side of the statue's solitude are two different identities. The histories of Montserrat (Serra y Postius 1747) mention that no one knows who originally hid the Virgin statue. It is assumed that the Virgin was placed in the cave by a group of devout Christians trying to save it from the invading Muslim forces. Those who were witnesses to the original practices and location of worship of the pre-conquest statue are long gone by the time the Virgin of Montserrat is rediscovered. Without any witnesses or ties to past events and without any texts or traditions to be passed down the statue loses its former identity and ability to affect an audience and culture. It no longer belongs to the earlier era of the Muslim invasion culture of Catalonia. Once the statue is found by the shepherds and Bishop of Manresa, the Virgin becomes involved in a new performance determined by the needs and culture of her current audience from the re-conquered region of Barcelona. The Virgin statue that emerges from the solitary confinement of the cave is comparable to the bestial Fray Juan Garín who is brought once more into the circle of human society and interactions. The Hermit and the statue undergo periods of isolation and suffering in private ascetic and public martyr-like manners in order to focus on the destruction of

self. Once the appropriate setting and witnesses appeared, the performers emerge with new identities tied to the expression of Christianity at Montserrat.

The foundation myths of Montserrat, also considered the first miracles attributed to the Virgin of Montserrat, are not the only instances of the intermingling of performance, suffering, and identity creation at the site. Isolation and torture by the extrication of the performers or pilgrims from their established systems of support and coping mechanisms are also present in the miracles compiled by Fray Abad Pedro Alfonso de Burgos of Montserrat in 1594. The miracles of Montserrat are wide-ranging. Their topics vary from miracles of healing and childbirth to the liberation of Christian captives in Africa. The previous chapter began the discussion of these accounts by looking at how the miracle texts related to the landscape of Montserrat and the pilgrims' interactions with the natural and architectural components of the site. This chapter examines further miracles from Burgos's compilation to determine the roles isolation, voice manipulation, and suffering play in the completed performance of pilgrimage and how these factors affect the pilgrim identity. The first two miracles discussed have a more obvious link to the practices of isolation and torture as described and studied by Scarry (1985), Suedfeld (1990), and Tilley (1991). These first miracles from Burgos' (1594) text deal with the unlawful imprisonment of innocent individuals who are the victims of overt implementations of bodily harm and suffering (torture) by a third party.

Pilgrim Miracles

The first miracle of Montserrat related to torture describes a nanny freed from captivity through the intervention of the Virgin. In Tortosa, there was a very devout woman who made a pilgrimage to Montserrat every year. This woman took care of the son of a local gang leader.

One day the boy is caught by his father's rivals and he is later found with his throat cut. The Nanny becomes suspected of working with the murderers and is tortured by her former employer to tell the truth of her involvement in the affair (Burgos 1594). The Nanny does not suffer the deprivation of sustenance like an ascetic, but rather feels a physical pain more akin to the suffering of the early Christian martyrs: 'ca [la ama] en subiendo en la rueda del tormenta' (Burgos 1594: fol. 38^{r}). Whereas Garín initiates the suffering and isolation necessary to the creation of a new identity by confessing his sins, the Nanny's torture begins with a confession of her innocence.

Fray Garín and the Virgin statue went through three stages in the recreation of their identities: the first identity, isolation and suffering, and the loss of voice which culminated in the creation of a new identity. The Nanny's tale also follows this pattern. Her first identity is that of an inept nanny who loses her charge. Then she is caught, isolated, and tortured on the wheel. The turning point in the Nanny's Miracle and identity comes when she is being tortured by her employer's men and on the verge of collapsing from pain: 'ca en subiendo en la rueda del tormento le apareció Nuestra Señora en una ventana de la casa y la confortava de manera que no recebía mal alguno por el tormento' (Burgos 1594: fol. 38^{r}).

The Virgin appears as a comforting image within a visceral scene of pain to become a point of meditation upon which the Nanny focuses during the physical destruction of her body to elevate her spiritual self. Within the Miracle, the Virgin intercedes to remove all fear of suffering for those with good intentions who invoke her and have a connection to Montserrat, such as the Nanny who made annual pilgrimages to the mountain. However, the use of the Virgin's image within the narrative serves a further purpose. Her presence not only comforts the Nanny and takes away the pain she feels during her torment, but the Virgin turns the whole scene into an

exemplar of contemplation for the medieval audience in a manner reminiscnent of the images and texts of the martyrs and Christ. The motif of the Nanny on the wheel becomes an 'experience of *seeing and imagining* a body that was ravaged and bleeding from torture' (Merback 1999: 19) in a setting that was safe for the audience to observe and aided them in imagining themselves as witnessing or participating in the unfolding drama (Decker 2015). The dissemination of the Montserrat miracles at the mountain and on feast days of the Virgin provided prospective pilgrims with a guarantee that no matter how much they suffer, if they call upon or visualize the Virgin then she will provide an escape from the pain and free those who meditate on her from their suffering.

Holy visions and voices also intercede in the narratives of Juan Garín and the Virgin statue to lift the protagonists from their periods of penance, isolation, and suffering. In the Virgin apparition, lights, smells, and sounds announced to the shepherds the location of the lost statue (Serra y Postius 1747). At the end of his penance, Garín relies on being captured and told to rise by the Count's infant son to help him find his humanity and reintegrate into society (Burgos 1594; *Abrégé* 1723; Serra y Postius 1747). The Nanny of Tortosa receives a silent vision of the Virgin during her torture and degradation of her former self. The Virgin appears when the process of destruction of the former identity is complete and when the supplicant needs aid in the form of intervention to progress to the next stage. However, the suffering Nanny is not the only one who must share in the vision. She is not freed or able to embark on her new identity without an additional audience to witness and verify the visions or miracles:

> Los atormentadores viendo que aunque cruelmente la atormentavan, no sentía dolor alguno le preguntaron la causa. Y ella mostró a dos de'llos la visión, y como Nuestra

> Señora la confortava y la defendía de la pena del tormento. Lo qual visto y conocido que no tenía culpa la quitaron de las pena y quistiones. (Burgos 1594: fol. 38^{r}-38^{v})

In the apparition myth, the Virgin statue only becomes renowned and establishes her new cultic identity once she is released from isolation by the local populations of Monistrol and Manresa. Similarly, Garín's change in status from a four-legged creature to an upright man requires that he is surrounded by the Count's court as his voice is reinstated. Following in this tradition, the Nanny (through a silent act of the Virgin's vision) moves on and becomes freed from her former occupation, but only once the captors become engaged as an audience. The Nanny's rebirth comes at the cost of the stability and responsibilities of her old occupation. Through the death of a child and her subsequent suffering and release, the Nanny can never return to her former life. Her previous existence ended with the death of her charge. Now she has the chance to create a new identity that begins with 'su peregrinació*n* a Nuestra Señora de Montserrate' (Burgos 1594: fol. 38^{v}).

The next Montserrat miracle of torture occurs in 1343 and pertains to the trials of a friar from Valencia. As is the case with the previous Miracle, the protagonist in this account endures an involuntary and physical torture at the hands of his captors. The Friar is captured by the social grouping inaccurately designated as the Moors from Granada and taken to Ceuta with many other Christian captives. Upon seeing the Moors harming the Christians, the Friar intervenes only to become another victim to his captors' harsh treatment 'y desque le tuvo en su poder, dióle muchas heridas, apaleándole y con hierros ardientes quemándole la boca. Y como nunca le quisiesse confessar cosa alguna aunque estava ta*n* maltratado que casi al pobre se le quería salir el alma' (Burgos 1594: fol. 74^{v}). Until the Friar intervenes in an attempt to protect a fellow Christian from mistreatment he is more of a passive witness and involuntary participant in the

events unfolding around him. His punishments do not begin until he receives the actions of torture on behalf of a fellow suffering Christian. Only then does his identity begin to fluctuate between the viewing audience and the participatory actor in the scene of violence surrounding him.

The journeys and interactions of Juan Garín throughout his penance as well as the figure of the Virgin statue and her community of discoverers reflect the change in the Friar's status. In each narrative, during the time frame of a pilgrimage or performance, one protagonist has a constantly shifting identity that moves back and forth between actor and audience in order to interact with a third-party catalyst. The interactions with the necessary outside stimulus help the pilgrim achieve a determinant aim and enact a fully realized and completed performance. The shifting of the pilgrim identity between actor and audience also occurs in miracles such as those involving isolation and corporeal suffering. The torture becomes the third-party stimulus, akin to the Virgin's intervention in Montserrat's foundation myths. This impetus alters the identities of the sufferers from recipients and witnesses to the harm inflicted upon their bodies to actors that call upon and meditate on the Virgin to receive divine aid that initiates an irreversible change in their status of isolation and suffering.

Prior to the infliction of bodily harm on the Valencian Friar, he resembles the isolated Fray Garín or the Virgin statue hiding in their caves. The Friar is captured and carried as an object against his will from Granada to Ceuta. His lack of resistance recalls the witnessing or audience-like phase of Juan Garín during the course of his performances where the Count of Barcelona demanded that his men 'se le traxessen [Juan Garín] delante de el Conde' and 'que atado a una cadena le pusiesen en una zaguan, y público, para que todos le viesen' (Serra y Postius 1745: 12). The Virgin statue was also bodily processed to a secondary location 'y

tomándolo el buen Prelado en sus brazos, la [Virgen] llevavan procesionalmente cántado hymnos, con ánimo de colocarla en la Catedral de Manresa' (Serra y Postius 1747: 33). When the Virgin statue is carried a certain distance it stops the procession to force an establishment of the shrine on Montserrat. Count Wilfred's son is also carried into the audience hall by his mother and speaks prompting Garín to rise from his status of a feral, caged animal and return to the upright stance of a man who acts as a guide to the discovery of Riquilda's resurrection and leads to the establishment of a church on Montserrat. When the captured Friar of the miracle reaches a predetermined setting, as is the case with Garín and the Virgin statue, he is also galvanized into action. Once the Friar in Miracle 76 takes a stand against his captors, he changes his identity from carried object to the affecter of change. By defending a fellow Christian against the Moors, the Friar puts himself at the forefront of the action. He draws attention to his presence and becomes the focus of inflicted pain.

The Friar's suffering is a necessary component in the change and construction of his new identity. Only once the Friar is tortured and his voice destroyed through bars of burning iron placed in his mouth does he seek aid in the form of silent prayers and concentration on the figure of the Virgin of Montserrat. Unable to vocalize his needs through an audible call, the Friar turns his thoughts to the Virgin. He allows himself to depend on her influence to drive his actions and alter his physical and emotional state 'y estando assí oyó en sueños una voz de muger que dezía "O frayle, o padre quanto me llamas levántate y vete a la iglesia que tanto nombras"' (Burgos 1594: fol. 74^{v}). The description of the Friar's egress from captivity recalls the termination of Garín's penance. Each man, once he has reached the point of dehumanization or the complete inability to vocalize his pain, is informed through divine intervention to rise and end his suffering. When Garín stands he is freed from an animalistic existence and returns as a new

sinless man to Montserrat. When the Valencian Friar is told to rise he wakes from his dream, manages to escape from Ceuta, and journeys to Montserrat to obey the Virgin's demands and give thanks at her Church.

The Miracles of the Nanny and the Friar offer explicit examples of martyr-like isolation and involuntary suffering of the protagonists. The torturers or accusers physically remove the Nanny and the Friar from the familiar surroundings of their daily lives. In the process of their removal, the protagonists go through a phase of isolated inactivity where they lose the capacity to act on their own accord. In this stage, the individuals become moveable objects devoid of their own power, humanity, and voice. Stripped of humanity and the ability to exert influence over the situation or vocalize their pain, they become witnesses or audience to the torture inflicted upon their bodies. The stage of suffering is where the old identity dies. Through prayers of intercession and the visual and auditory involvement of the Virgin (through visions or the specific focus and meditation on the figure of the Virgin), a new identity is created where the witnesses become active participants in the process of their escape and freedom. The recreation and establishment of the new identity necessitates the completion of performance through a pilgrimage of thanksgiving to Montserrat rather than the finality of a corporeal death that occurs in martyrdom or in the ascetic ascension of the desert saints after their deaths. By focusing on the Virgin, pain does not have to lead to a physical demise. Instead, these miracles of suffering reaffirm that pain in the name of the Virgin will lead to her intervention and a healing of the body and soul of the devout.

The majority of Montserrat's miracles follow a basic plot structure. For the purposes of the current discussion of the pilgrim or sufferer's identity creation, the miracles generally consist of three parts: the identification of a problem or ailment, intercession by the Virgin, and a visit or

pilgrimage of thanks to the Virgin's shrine at Montserrat. These three stages progress the individual from the destruction of the old self to the creation of the new identity initiated by the suffering of the pilgrim suppliant. In general, the process of establishing a new Christian identity follows these steps linearly. Most of the thankful pilgrims visit Montserrat without being prompted by the Virgin or any other outside force. However, on occasion, as soon as the pilgrim or devout beseecher of the Virgin is delivered from their pain or suffering they omit the final step in their performance and the creation of a new identity. Without the final establishment stage of the new self the body can revert to its former identity or the state of pain it was in before the Virgin's intercession.

The following miracles offer similar examples of the tenuous nature of a pilgrim's life and identity. Without an acknowledgement of the complete destruction of the old self or voice the newly created identity remains incomplete until the necessary performance of pilgrimage to Montserrat is enacted. The first miracle of discussion centers on the actions of a devout knight named Bernardo de Falconibus from Vic first mentioned in Chapter Four (Burgos 1594). As is the case with the martyrs and ascetic monks who chose lives and deaths full of pain, Bernardo's life was also full of suffering. Since his youth, the Knight had an incurable infirmity in his arm that caused him much grief. One day he prayed to the Virgin of Montserrat promising to donate a proscribed weight of wax to her Church if she healed him. The next day, he regains full working use of his limb. In Chapter Four, the Knight's cycle of pain and healing demonstrated the practical and physical nature of pilgrimage to Montserrat. The pained limb also acts as the focus of suffering or corporeal degredation and the pivot around which the creation of this new identity revolves. Once the Knight's former lame self dies upon the Virgin's intercession, he is transformed into a new body made whole.

The first miracles discussed (of the Nanny and Friar) highlight acts of isolation and physical pain through the clear removal of the captives from their ordinarily inhabited environments to different locations of imprisonment and suffering (an undisclosed room and Ceuta). Isolation and a separate space to allow the death of the former identity and creation of the new is embedded in the Montserrat foundation miracles through the utilization of locations such as the cave and the isolated wilderness provided by the landscape of the mountain. When there are not blatant removals from the normal environment such as found in the miraculous texts relating to captives, prisoners, and shipwrecks, Montserrat acts as the necessary component of suffering through isolation. The mountain supplies the component of torture through isolation in its guise of acting as the miracle's setting, the Virgin's domain, an observable and identifiable location from afar, or a tool used to orient the supplicant's gaze while turning their thoughts inwards in prayer.

In the Knight's Miracle, he immediately changes his status from the pained recipient of infirmity to a man healed through his efforts of focusing his mind in prayer and the intercession of the Virgin. However, Bernardo fails to make his promised donation to the Virgin for over five years and never entirely establishes his identity through the complete destruction of his old self. One day, the Knight accompanies his friends on a journey 'y quando fue en las montañas de Montserrate permitió Dios en pena de su olvido que el mal que solía tener en el braço se le tornasse' (Burgos 1594: fol. 40^{v}). As in the case with Juan Garín, Bernardo's initial life of suffering was not enough on its own to establish him as a truly devout, unwavering man. Only once purposeful and to a degree involuntary suffering is inflicted for sins and broken promises can the person tortured through the isolation, physical discomfort, and the difficulties experienced on Montserrat assert a firm and pious identity. After the Knight's illness is returned

to him, he prays and finally visits the shrine of Montserrat to present his donation to the Virgin. Once Bernardo completes his promise and processes to Montserrat, he solidifies his new identity born through suffering and the destruction of his old self to become healed and whole.

The following Miracle similarly exemplifies the need to secure a new healthy identity through a journey of suffering to the isolated location of Montserrat. In this Miracle, a father prayed to the Virgin to heal his incurably sick son, promising to donate the son's weight in wax to the Virgin and that father and son would visit the shrine on Montserrat (Burgos 1594). The son is healed and later marries, but the father does not complete his promise to the Virgin until the son's pregnant wife falls ill. Once more the father prays for mercy and the girl is healed. After the birth, the father takes his son and infant grandson to Montserrat to give thanks and fulfill his original promise. The key components to the completion of the above miracles and the foundation myths of Montserrat are periods of isolation and suffering that lead to the establishment of a new virtuous and healed identity contingent on the completion of the performance by journeying to Montserrat. Sometimes the isolation which achieves the destruction of the former self takes place away from Montserrat (such as in the miracles of overt torture), yet most of the time the mountain offers the necessary location for the suffering to occur. No matter where the initial torment takes place Montserrat must be on the itinerary for the newly created pilgrims to confirm their identities. The original proto-pilgrims or supplicant selves are first deconstructed and then achieve a completed performance as they alternate between actor and audience during the pilgrimage to Montserrat.

The process of performance and journey through pilgrimage at Montserrat has elements of isolation and dehumanization discussed in Tilley (1991) and Suedfeld (1990) as two of the main components or goals of torture. However, Tilley (1991) claims that the early Christian

martyrs and later ascetics were able to retain rather than rewrite or recreate the identities with which they entered into their martyrdom and suffering. She states that the Christians who were familiar with the circulated martyr acts and texts were preemptively able to train their minds and bodies to be accustomed to the tactics of isolation and other components of torture and combat them. In fact, Tilley (1991) states that the components of torture including isolation, indoctrination, information gathering, incrimination, and intimidation did not affect the practicing Christians who easily overcame such tactics. However, the examples of Montserrat's miracles and foundational texts indicate that isolation and suffering are not only components that later Christians (ascetics and medieval pilgrims) also face, but that they are not easily overcome. In fact, this thesis counters Tilley's (1991) claim with the observation that corporeal suffering in an ascetic lifestyle, such as that of the eremite Fray Juan Garín or in the performance of pilgrimage, are necessary components to reconstruct, not retain, the identity and voice.

Although vocal manipulation, the deconstruction of the former self, and isolation are the major components of torture that find a direct correlation from practices of Christian martyrdom to the enactment of pilgrimage at Montserrat, that does not mean that the tactics of intimidation and information-gathering do not appear in the performance of pilgrim suffering. This thesis replaced Tilley's category of information-gathering as one of the main components of torture with Scarry's concept of voice manipulation and deconstruction. However, this does not suggest that the gathering of information did not occur as a result of the suffering a pilgrim experiences during the performance and journey to Montserrat. In fact, the cult of the Virgin of Montserrat depended on a certain level of information-gathering and intimidation to perpetuate the popularity of the site of pilgrimage and veneration.

The creation of the ascetic hermit and pilgrim identities is closely linked to the experience of the suffering body such as represented in the torture of the martyrs. Also, as is the case with the martyrs and desert fathers, whose exploits served as models for martyrdom, the ascetic life, and medieval devotional meditation, the pilgrims' actions and experiences of suffering acted as exemplars to future generations. The manner in which the pilgrims disseminated their lessons was through gathered miracle texts such as the Burgos corpus of Montserrat. Instead of a refusal to share information, these texts and their public readings represent the desire of the pilgrims to describe freely their journeys and their own suffering with the monks of Montserrat acting as scribes preserving the Virgin's authority.

While the martyrs and eremites or saintly desert fathers tend to be written about and are objects of biographical texts rather than writers of their own stories as a result of the premature and solitary nature of their deaths, the pilgrims who undergo a transformation of identity through the Virgin's intercession are generally able to relate their miracles first hand by visiting Montserrat: 'y con la ayuda de la misma Nuestra Señora, yo me esforçaré en publicar sus verdaderas maravillas' (Burgos 1594: fol. xiii^{r}). The Spanish and French versions of the miracles of Montserrat seek to disseminate the truth of the hundreds of daily-occurring miracles attributed to the Virgin:

> Lo que hasta aquí avemos dicho para mostrar la gran devoción que todo el universal mundo tiene a este sancto lugar, y cámara angelical de Nuestra Señora de Montserrate empero por ser cosa mucho de notar, es razón que más particularmente tratemos aquí dello, y lo publiquemos. (Burgos 1594: fol. 19^{r})

Each narrative serves as a testimony or a necessary and voluntary sharing of information promoting the pilgrim's new identity of devotion and the power of the Virgin. The usual sense of

testimony or declaration of the pilgrim's identity generally comes at the onset of the text where a brief biological description occurs: 'un mancebo de un lugar cerca de Vique llegó a morir de una grave enfermedad de fiebres y puesta la candela en su mano ya casi espiraval' (Burgos 1594: fol. 56^{v}). The location of the description of the supplicant's initial identity vary, either beginning with the identification of the pilgrim's plight or the healed identity of the pilgrim who has arrived at Montserrat to share his or her tale with others. Whether or not the miracle begins with the pilgrim before or after the destructive episode of the old self does not change the outcome of the biographical narratives. The over one hundred miracles of Montserrat surveyed end with those of able body making the pilgrimage to Montserrat to give thanks and share the intimate events of their suffering and self-destruction with the monastic scribes of the shrine:

> Y la monja despertó, y se halló sana, y luego se levantó, y fue a maytines con las otras monjas muy alegre cantándoles el milagro. Por lo qual todas juntas hizieron gran procesión, dando gracias a Dios y a su sanctissima madre: y notaron aquel día con testigos y lo hizier*on* escrivir para memoria, y las dos religiosas lo hizier*on* predicar en esta Iglesia. (Burgos 1594: fol. 63^{v}-64^{r})

Anyone who refused or forgot to visit Montserrat after the intercessory miracle and failed to share the details of the experienced suffering, supplication, and miracle that would serve as exemplars of meditation for future pilgrims was intimidated into completing the performance by the Virgin of Montserrat.

The Individual Self

Of the five common rationalizations for torture previously listed this thesis has discussed the gathering of information (or vocal manipulation), the incrimination of others in confessable

acts, and isolation. Each element of torture attributed to Christian martyrdom has a synonymous occurrence in the pilgrim's procession and performance of pilgrimage to and from Montserrat. In the case of the martyr, third-party actors (usually in the form of government-sponsored torturers) illicit pain-inducing techniques to extract confessions, deconstruct the body, and alter the victim's world view. However, in the case of pilgrimage, the source of the application and implementation of suffering is less obvious. Unless the pilgrim is a victim of abduction and captivity, as is the case with the protagonists in the Miracles pertaining to the Nanny and the Friar, it is difficult to identify the catalyst which induces the pilgrim's suffering. Many of the Montserrat narratives pertain to the healing of limbs, organs, and larger acts such as death-bed miracles and the resuscitation of recently deceased children. This sort of biologically induced suffering does not directly equate to that experienced by the martyrs. Where the martyrs had jailers to induce the process of martyrdom which led to their public deaths and the solidification of their causes and identification with the sacrifice of Christ, the majority of pilgrims experience an incurable illness that began the equivalent of their suffering which is embodied in the process and performance of pilgrimage.

The introduction of techniques and implements of torture on the bodies of martyrs changes from an external inducement of pain to an internal one through the pilgrim's biological suffering from disease. The illness is the first step towards the suffering of pilgrimage. From this initial pain, the proto-pilgrims slowly and temporarily lose all other connections to their outer, social, and psycho-physical selves. They become completely defined and consumed by their illnesses or plights:

> En el año de 1323 en la Bisbal, cerca de Girona, fue una muger enferma de muy grandes dolores en una pierna por espacio de siete semanas, y tan grandes dolores sentía que no

> dexava dormir a ninguno de casa con sus vozes, y por mucho | que los phísicos trabajaron haziendo muchas experiencias, nunca le pudieron remediar el dolor. (Burgos 1594: fol. 54^{v}-54^{r})

The proto-pilgrims or supplicants become isolated in the psychological cells of their minds where all thoughts are centered on the incurable pain from which they suffer. This leads to a process of deconstructing and deactivating the sufferer's (proto-pilgrim's) former identity through a process of self-shrinkage which involves 'the dissociation and elimination of the social self, with its identity, roles, statuses, skills, and attributes, from individual self-awareness. What is left […] is the self as a living psychophysical entity, conscious and unconscious' (Malina 1998: 163). The psychophysical entity into which the martyrs and pilgrims escape the unending sensations of pain is the sensory and motor self or the self as a body capable of action, but one that has purposefully escaped from being identified (or no longer capable of being identified) through another's perspective. This self has become separated and distinguished from the group, but not in the manner of a body extricated from the lay (profane) sphere to be established solely in the ecclesiastical (sacred) space of ritual activity.

The body and self turn inward as a flight response in an effort to escape and possibly overcome the outward connections to physical pain. At this point, the actor or pilgrim is convulsing or reacting to the pain stimulus in a manner akin to an audience unconsciously and momentarily drawing away from an uncomfortably emotive scene on stage. The pilgrim/actor cringes away from one method of experience as an audience and recipient of pain. By momentarily being separated from the surroundings as a result of this reflexive and convulsive act brought on by pain, the pilgrim/martyr sheds the former identity and begins to embark on the creation of a new one as an artist/actor who emerges from the process of suffering with the aid of

an outside force such as the Virgin of Montserrat who serves as catalyst and focal point of internal reflection to reaffirm the new identity. This form of suffering through illness is the catalyst and beginning of the proto-pilgrim's journey. In the pilgrim's experience, the suffering prevents the body from performing the daily duties as a socially integrated citizen who contributes to the wider community and the pain also forces the sufferer to seek further isolation to find the necessary space to supplicate to the Virgin. Once the healing or freedom has been granted, the pilgrim becomes the catalyst to the second round of suffering not present in the life of the martyr. Where the martyr and eremite die, the pilgrims determine the continuation of their newly given lives by undertaking pilgrimages to a location with landscapes and roads that are:

> muy ásperos y fatigosos, y sino los adereçassen muchas veces cada año, no avría quien pudiessen andar por ellos, mas po[r] el mucho cuydado que dellos se tiene, aunque con harto gasto, están de manera que se puede yr a caballo por ellos sin peligro notable. (Burgos 1594: fol. 12^{r})

Although the miracles end with a fairly standard construction relating that the pilgrim was healed and went to the mountain to give thanks, the final journey to Montserrat was not free from further suffering. Age and other such impediments could prevent the grateful pilgrim from making the difficult and sometimes deadly journey to Montserrat. As long as the Virgin accepted the pilgrim's reason for not being able to commit to the final solidifying aspect of the torture (pilgrimage) to Montserrat the miracle text ends confirming the events in the hagiography. The medieval actor and audience of the performance (the pilgrim) utilize images, narratives, and physical experiences as a means to focus prayers and actions that will elevate the self through corporeal healing and an internal elevation of the soul to a state closer to the Virgin and the ultimate examples of suffering, advancement, and moral strength through the martyrs and Christ.

The general impetus for the acts of the proto-pilgrim that evolve through the Virgin's intercession and episodes of suffering into a completed performance is determined by the pilgrim's own motivations. The pilgrims choose when to invoke the Virgin to begin the process of the creation of new identities and undertake the perilous journey to Montserrat on their own volition. Yet the voluntary nature of the pilgrims' acceptance of suffering in the change and evolution of their identities seems contrary to the act of intimidation which is a further reason or component of torture. In the case of the martyr's, the jailer acts as intimidator and inducer of pain. The identity of the inflictor of pain during the performance of pilgrimage is less clear and must be discussed. The act of instigating or inducing pain falls to the Virgin of Montserrat, the omniscient third-party intercessor and motivator of the pilgrimages attributed to the foundation myths and miracles of Montserrat.

Mary: Enforcer of Change

The Miracles of the father and son and the infirmed Knight who delayed their promised donations and pilgrimages of thanksgiving exhibit the necessary traits of isolation and suffering in relation to the creation of a pilgrim or supplicant's new identity. The texts also relate that the supplicants' new identities only take hold if the receivers of divine intervention complete their promises to the Virgin in the form of pilgrimages to her shrine on Montserrat and donations to the Church. By rescinding the new health bestowed on the pilgrims, the miracles promote the necessity of physically visiting Montserrat and entering the domain of Mary. The actions taken by the Virgin to direct the correct course of supplication and performance also add to her role within pilgrimage. She is the liberator and restorer and through her intervention she also acts as an enforcer or intimidator of divine will. In this dual role of savior and torturer, the Virgin of

Montserrat further strengthens the association of the suffering of pilgrimage with the corporeal destruction faced in martyrdom.

Intimidation is one of the five common rationalizations of torture utilized to deter prisoners from unacceptable behavior. In many cases, the mistreatment of the victim is made public knowledge 'as a means of frightening other potential victims' (Suedfeld 1990: 2). During the delayed pilgrimages of the Knight and the father and son, the Virgin of Montserrat engages in such intimidation tactics to deter her pilgrims from acting in a manner contrary to the accepted practices and performances of pilgrimage. The deterring methods include acts of restoring a healed pain (the Miracle of the Knight) and visiting the suffering healed in one generation on the next (the father and son). The following miracle reveals additional ploys utilized by the Virgin such as increasing the level of suffering felt before the healing process and the establishment of the pilgrim's final identity. The Virgin acts as a lord protector over her mountain ensuring that her devotion is kept from desecration (Twomey 2019: 320-25) by those who would try to circumvent the necessary components of suffering required of the performance of pilgrimage.

Another miracle of Montserrat motivated by the Virgin's identity as torturer concerns a man from Taragona who had so much pain in his knee that 'ningún phýsico le podía curar ni dar remedio' (Burgos 1594: fol. 48^{v}). In due course, he calls upon Mary, promising to go on a pilgrimage to Montserrat and is then quickly healed. However, as is the case with the Knight Bernardo with the infirmed arm, the man from Taragona does not immediately journey to Montserrat. Rather, he delays his promised pilgrimage for more than three years. At the end of the three years, the man comes into the vicinity of the mountain and is struck down by a fatal accident:

> Y como prolongasse la romería por más de tres años, acaesció que teniendo un cuchillo en la mano se le cayó, y en tal manera se le hincó por la rodilla que le hizo una mortal y gran llaga, por donde se le acordó el voto que havía hecho y de su negligencia. (Burgos 1594: fol. 48^{v})

Through additional prayers the man is cured, but he is also obliged to visit Montserrat once a year to retain the healed and sound status of his body (Burgos 1594). In the testimonies of delayed pilgrimage, extreme and violent measures are taken by the Virgin to ensure that her supplicants-turned-pilgrims complete the entire performance required of their new status and identity. This Miracle not only exemplifies the need for undertaking a pilgrimage to Montserrat, but also directs those involved to perform the journey in a timely manner as dictated by the Virgin.

A last episode that addresses the Virgin's vindictive, controlling, and intimidating aspects occurs in the following miracle that begins by listing the protagonist (a man from Barcelona) and his predicament (an incurable pain in his leg). The man promises to go on a pilgrimage and is healed. What comes next is a slight deviation from the previous miracles that require the Virgin to act as a catalyst of suffering. This supplicant immediately initiates a journey to Montserrat 'prometiendo con gran devoción de yr en romería a su Sancta Iglesia de Montserrate, y llevar una pierna de cera' (Burgos 1594: fol. 49^{v}). However, he only journeys a league from Barcelona when he is tempted by demons in the form of fellow travelers on the road. The travelers (demons) tell the pilgrim that there is no need to take his offering to Montserrat: 'Hartas y mejores que esta llevan otros a Montserrate, no te cures de yr adelante ven acá bevamos, y holguemonos aquí. El pecador co*n* poco achaque de cansado quedóse allí y jugóse la cera, y después tornóse a su casa' (Burgos 1594: fol. 49^{v}). Taking the advice of his fellow travelers, the

man decides to return home and is immediately stuck by an intense pain, this time in both of his legs. Once he promises to make his pilgrimage and donate two legs of wax to the Virgin instead of the one originally promised he is healed in order to make his pilgrimage. Although the elements of this Miracle are similar to the other examples of the Virgin's role as intimidator, this one acknowledges the practical difficulties of undertaking a pilgrimage, rather than a lack of performance through forgetfulness. The man from Barcelona begins with good intentions, yet is still waylaid by temptation and the realization at the enormity and time-consuming process of the pilgrimage ahead of him. He starts performing the motions of supplication correctly. After exhausting all human methods of healing, he invokes the Virgin. Once cured, he begins the pilgrimage but is easily deterred from its completion by the demons that claim continuing the journey would not afford him any further healing benefits and mocking the worth of his donation. However, the fact that the Virgin rescinds her gifts unless the pilgrim completes the full journey and performance to Montserrat demonstrates the integral roles of suffering, physical travel, and the mountain location to the process and enactment of pilgrimage to the site. A physical interaction of the human body with Montserrat is necessary to the performance, even though, as stated in Burgos (1594) description of Montserrat, the roads up the mountain were not always passable on foot and some could only be surmounted on horseback. Figure 15 shows one of the medieval routes up the mountain and its irregular and dangerous aspects.

Figure 15. Remnants of the medieval pilgrimage route from Collbató to the Monastery (Camí de les Voltes).

Given the state of the trails up the mountain, it seems only logical and practical for the Man from Barcelona to turn back home once healed. If the point of supplication to the Virgin and the performance of pilgrimage were only to engage in mimed worship in a contained space until healed, then there would be no reason to visit Montserrat and the man from Barcelona or the Knight would not have been reinjured to force them to complete their promised performances. However, this trend is not supported by the miracle texts of the Virgin of Montserrat. The Virgin induces further pain and suffering in the bodies of her supplicants to remind them of their obligations and help them complete their physical and spiritual elevation. Discomfort, pain, and physical suffering are necessary to the creation of the pilgrim identity and also to the preservation of this new identity through the entire journey to and back from Montserrat. The

round-trip interaction with a physical landscape that induces pain and suffering is what constitutes a completed performance of pilgrimage.

Mary as intimidator ensures that the performance of pilgrimage has a set and finite time period of performance with a discrete beginning and ending. Her actions that induce the suffering of the performers ensure that the pilgrims and supplicants remain focused on their promised goals of pilgrimage. This focus is further supported by the Virgin requiring that her supplicant's actions follow the culturally normative steps of pilgrimage to Montserrat laid out in the foundation myths of the Virgin's cult on the mountain and the Monastery's corpus of collected miracles. Additionally, by inducing a catalyst (pain or illness) at the exact moment when the pilgrim deviates from his or her performance, the Virgin ensures that the grateful supplicant completes the necessary act of thanksgiving and that the pilgrim (actor) achieves a determinant outcome. Not only does the pilgrim solidify the new, healed identity through the completed performance, but the Virgin and her Church also reap the added outcome of further funding and donations for the site. The miracles are shared through their collection and copying into compilations, such as Burgos' *Libro de la historia y milagros*, detailing how the correct steps occur in her supplication and pilgrimage. As is the case with the rubrication before the lyrics of 'Stella Splendens' discussed in Chapter One, the entire corpus of miracles, including, but not limited to those that place the Virgin in the role of torturer, serves to deter behavior that would prevent the full enactment of the performance and journey of isolated suffering that constitutes pilgrimage. These publicly read miracle texts assist new pilgrims by giving them examples of guided suffering.

The application of torture to the early Christian martyrs finds a parallel discourse in the suffering of pilgrims. However, unlike Tilley (1991) who claims that the martyrs and those living

the ascetic lifestyle overcome the deconstructive effects of torture by using the pain to reinforce their world and Christian identity, this chapter agrees with Scarry (1985) and argues that the ascetic lifestyle (that of the desert hermit and the martyr) does not prevent such a destruction of identity. Instead, the destruction and manipulation of the voice, body, and previous identity of the martyr, desert ascetic, and pilgrim, are necessary steps in the performance and construction of piety. Only through the inducement of suffering can the old self be destroyed or die (literally or figuratively) and ascend to a newly elevated and pain-free existence. The martyrs and their texts acted as beacons and training guides that educated future martyrs and served as examples of piety. However, the examples of suffering such as that of the desert hermits who submit their bodies to the extremes of pain and death and more specifically the suffering form of the Christian pilgrim do not overcome the bodily pain and psychological exhaustion of torture and the physical activity of pilgrimage. Neither does the ascetic suffering that acts as a constitutional component of pilgrimage manage to overcome the ultimate goal of torture. Instead, the performance and suffering involved in the pilgrims' process of creation and enactment of their personal form of performance art seeks out pain to be changed into something new: an identity reborn under the intimidating presence of the Virgin of Montserrat. This new identity needs the ascetic and dramatic landscape of Montserrat. The suffering required in pilgrimage promotes an interactive journey through a physical setting of a much greater scope than the symbolic ritual processions and enactments performed within or near a church precinct.

Conclusion

The Development of a Personal Piety

Indoctrination and Identity Creation

This thesis has been concerned with re-examining the study of pilgrimage to reformulate the consideration of its processional movement as performance art that is dependent on the constantly fluctuating landscape of enactment that shifts between the ambiguous designations of the sacred and profane as the pilgrim's identity fluctuates between actor and audience. The landscape and actions of pilgrimage do not consist merely of a set of ritual steps enacted in an environment separated from the individual actor's daily life. Chapter One proposed David Davies' performance theory as an alternative method in which to analyze pilgrimage and to consider it a performance or a process of art production. The manner in which the performance is enacted is dependent on the pilgrims' affective and sensory experiences with the environment they inhabit. The landscape determines how the pilgrims react, adapt to, and interpret their performances. Chapter Two discusses the inherent diversity in the process of pilgrimage determined by the landscape, cultural sources, traditions, and individual actor. Through an examination of the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*, 'Stella Splendens', 'O Virgo Splendens', the foundation legends of Montserrat, and its histories, the types of pilgrimages were discussed (*curative*, *intermediary*, and *emulative*), along with the variety of social classes involved in the ritual progression. Chapter Two demonstrates that the pilgrims, while enacting their pilgrimages, were not limited to the roles of audience or actor, but fluctuated constantly between both identities. As the pilgrims' roles shifted during the creation of their performances, the manifestation of a sacred space along the route also became possible depending on the goals and desires of the pilgrims. The roles and methods of pilgrimage were analyzed in relation to

performance theory. The correlation between performance and the ritual of pilgrimage reveals that in order for the pilgrim to be both the actor/creator and spectator/audience of a performance, a focus of appreciation was a necessary contribution (constitutive of a goal, specified time period of performance, and a determinant creative outcome) on the part of the actor/artist. By introducing the Montserrat foundational miracles, located within the larger eighteenth-century historical texts, this thesis proposed that the focus of appreciation could be honed through the physical act of pilgrimage at Montserrat. This process of focusing the artistic goal and achieving a determinant outcome is synonymous with the procession that occurs in the narratives of the Virgin statue apparition as well as the penance of the Hermit Juan Garín. The medieval pilgrims could emulate the attainment of focus described in the foundation myths through supplication and orienting their body towards the mountain, such as occurred in the miracle or foundation texts.

The apparent redundancy of physically progressing to Montserrat became a problematic issue at the end of Chapter Two. If the devout could reap healing benefits and acts of intercession from the Virgin of Montserrat by simply turning towards the mountain and praying, then the necessity of enduring the physical hardships of journeying to the geographic location of Montserrat becomes superfulous. Chapter Three began the discussion of this pilgrimage paradox by analyzing the landscape of Montserrat to include its natural and architectural components. The architecture of Montserrat's hermitages and their ascetic inhabitants are as integral to the site's foundation as the origin myths, associated miracles, and natural landscape. Montserrat's ascetic heritage along with its foundation legend of the Hermit Juan Garín reflect a constant interaction between the quest for true ascetic isolation and the louder integrated world of the wider Christian community. The space of the mountain is a necessary attribute of setting that

gives the pilgrim the freedom to create a culturally relevant pilgrimage. The mountain provides enough isolation for pilgrims to enact their performance, while still being physically tied to the locality of Catalonia and visually connected to Barcelona and its commercial negotiations.

Chapter Three concluded with the idea that Montserrat's ascetic heritage and landscape offer a depth of performance unattainable by merely orienting the body towards the mountain and praying. The cave dwellings and natural setting of Montserrat give the pilgrims the freedom to travel and suffer in a manner recalling Christ, the early Christian martyrs, and the desert hermits. Their performances are unique and their stage includes the mountain site, as well as all the roads leading to and from the isolated location. The ascetic heritage of Montserrat promotes a sense of an intensely personal and private area in which the ascetic practitioner or eremite can perform a life of suffering and devotion. However, the emulation of the desert-like solitude cannot persist in perpetual isolation if its function is to serve as a model of ascetic living and piety for future generations of eremites, cenobites, and pilgrims. These ascetic performances are only attainable when acts of personal piety or private isolation integrate with the larger social sphere and community (audience) surrounding the individual (performer). Since the performances could not be completed in a setting of total isolation it was necessary to understand the degree that the heritage of ascetic practices and literature interacted with the actual physical and geographical setting of Montserrat and the broader Catalonian landscape. A discussion of the ritual landscape as a necessary physical component to performance, rather than a setting solely discussed in the context of religious theory and symbolism, was incorporated into the practice of pilgrimage at Montserrat.

Chapter Four reinforced the necessity of an interactive and integrated landscape of performance discussed in Chapter Three through an introduction of the extant miracles attributed

to the Virgin of Montserrat in addition to the apparition narrative and the penance of Juan Garín. The ascetic tradition with its motifs of landscape and religious practices is not the only textual heritage that contributes to the performance of pilgrimage at Montserrat. A study of the miracles of Montserrat, through a consideration of pilgrimage as an enactment of procession and performance in ritual dramas, revealed that the variety of divine interventions described in the histories of Montserrat does not create one single biblical narrative or uniform landscape comparable to studies of drama and pilgrimage. Although a uniform landscape or established theatrical setting such as appears in the church-based dramas does not emerge from the miracles, landscape plays a vital role in the creation of a performance. From an analysis of the interactions of the pilgrim, landscape, and textual narrative, Montserrat developed a setting of ritual performance, pilgrimage, and drama that emulated imagery from the ascetic and hagiographic literary traditions. However, the Montserrat tradition derives its main interactive and creative effectiveness of performance through a consideration of landscape as a variable and physical component to interact with and overcome during a pilgrimage. Montserrat's landscape and the variety offered by its cultural practices and performances erodes the concept inherited from studies of liturgical drama, performance, ritual, and pilgrimage theories that label medieval pilgrimage, ritual, or drama as distinct acts from the everyday lay landscape that only affect a small community of like-minded individuals engaged in the process. The pilgrimage landscape of Montserrat is not one of an easily definable or contained route, but one that necessitates a physical connection with the reality of the mountain's geographical formations and cannot exist solely as a metaphorical setting for pious intentions.

Chapter Five cited the rationales for committing torture as: information gathering, incrimination, intimidation, isolation, and indoctrination. The category of information gathering

was replaced with Elaine Scarry's (1985) idea of voice-manipulation through the destruction of voice. According to Suedfeld (1990), a successful infliction of torture should leave a body so debilitated and dehumanized that what remains is easily manipulated and has no voice of its own. This lack of voice or ability to vocalize pain leads to an uncertainty of the victim's previous conceptualization of their reality and identity (Scarry 1985). As a result: 'the victim's previous identity can be substituted for the reality of the torturer: indoctrination sets up a new world to which the victims are forced to assent' (Tilley 1991: 469). Indoctrination, the rewriting or reconstruction of the sufferer's previously held identity and conceptualization of self becomes the ultimate objective of torture according to Tilley, Suedfeld, and Scarry. Indoctrination should be considered a summation of the previous efforts and pain induced by torture, rather than one of its components. It is the culmination of the breakdown of voice, infliction of pain, fear, and bargaining that leads to the reconstruction of the sufferer's previous identity and the indoctrination into a new version of self, which is in part dependent on the intervention of a third-party actor or intervener.

The miracles of Montserrat began with overt acts of torture by a third-party inflicting destructive pain upon the bodies of Mary's supplicants. The victims in these Miracles, the Nanny and the Friar, were brought out of their states of suffering to a new existence of freedom as a result of the intercessory efforts of the Virgin of Montserrat. In the subsequent Miracles analyzed pertaining to delayed donations and pilgrimages, the Virgin Mary also acted on behalf of her supplicants. Not only did she change the lives of her beseechers by removing their illnesses, but when required, the Virgin inflicted additional physical pain to ensure that the victims of her

torture were motivated to complete their performances of pilgrimage to Montserrat and correctly establish their new identities as devotees to the Virgin.[1]

The basis of this new identity is contingent upon the body, journey, and performance of a pilgrim serving as the center of the process of a metaphoric death. Complete with real physical suffering that must take place in a reasonable length of time as dictated by precedent and the Virgin's interventions, the pilgrim achieves a determinant goal of the destruction of the old self and identity. The goal of the pilgrimage and performance, the purpose of all the endured pain and suffering, is not the consolidation and reaffirmation of their original proto-pilgrim self. Through the dual process of enacting and witnessing a performance at the site of Montserrat, the pilgrimage satisfies the necessary components established in Chapter One as constitutive of performance theory. The actions of the individual pilgrim translate into a performance or work of art, which by David Davies' (2004) definition is an act of creation. Specifically pertaining to pilgrimage at Montserrat, this act of creation results in a new identity or self for each individual pilgrim through suffering, ultimately indoctrinating the participatory pilgrim into the cult of the Virgin of Montserrat. The generation of self and act of creation realized in the performance of pilgrimage at Montserrat arises from the combination of the ascetic heritages (martyr and desert eremite), landscape, and the individual pilgrim's motivations and interactions at the mountain location. Performance or pilgrimage at Montserrat is the next evolutionary step of ascetic acts and lifestyles found in the tales of the martyrs and desert saints. Pilgrimage is distinct from its

[1] The term *correct* refers to the full completion of the process of identity creation through the performance of pilgrimage rather than one set and established method of achieving this new identity.

forerunners through the nature of expression and interactions of the pilgrim body with the ritual act or performance of pilgrimage and the necessity of an adaptable and fluctuating landscape that is sacred and profane depending on the individual's needs. The participating pilgrim serving as actor and witness to the narrative of the miracle and identity transformation does not need to become permanently isolated through martyred death or ascetic cave-dwelling to enact a uniquely personal and potentially wide-reaching act of self-motivated piety.

The Pious Evolution of Solitary Figures

Death and suffering are bound together with the act of witnessing (Jensen 2010) and are further connected to the act of creating a new pilgrim identity thoroughly embedded in the cult of the Virgin of Montserrat. The efficacy of martyrdom to act as the ultimate example of Christian piety and to establish the identity and renown of the martyr was tied to a sense of audience and observance. The spectacle of executions in the Roman arena 'unfolded publicly within a threefold interactive dynamic involving the crowd and authority figure(s) as well as the direct participants or victims' (Kyle 1998: 9). Without this open and physical performance acting as a discourse or a bridge between the suffering body of the martyr and the assembled crowd, the lessons of the martyrs as exemplars and teachers of the Christian communities in Rome would not have reached the necessary audience to have an impact or bring potential witnesses over to their cause (Boyarin 1999). Alternately, without the public nature of the martyrs' deaths, Roman authorities would not have had as wide-reaching a platform to attempt to quash deviant behavior thorough visible acts of violence and execution.

The witness of suffering leads to the dissemination of acts of Christian identity creation and its various enactments of piety. Open and public spectacles create the necessary setting for

the acts of witnessing which are integral components of torture (the implementation of corporeal destruction leading to a physical suffering) and the subsequent loss of voice and previous identity that is a precursor to indoctrination. If publicity is a key factor in identity manipulation, then it is necessary to determine how the practices of the desert ascetics and the individual pilgrim (which appear to be more hidden and private affairs than the earlier tradition of martyrdom) manifest the necessary components of a gathered audience. Through the processes it uses to produce pain, torture 'bestows visibility on the structure and enormity of what is usually private and incommunicable, contained within the boundaries of the sufferer's body' (Scarry 1985: 27). As discussed in Chapter Three concerning the ascetic practices and heritage of Montserrat, the desert hermits such as Onnophrius did not enact their daily lives of suffering through prayer and fasting in the urban center of spectacle provided by the Roman arena. Despite the isolated location of their desert caves, there were nevertheless witnesses to their suffering who came into the hermits' lives at key moments, usually just before the eremite's death. On the hermit's demise and elevation, a single witness (such as Paphnutius in the *Life* of Onnophrius) served to record and transmit the acts and reputation of the holy individual. The personal testimony was then transmitted orally and transcribed so that communities of cenobites and anchorites could learn about the guarded life of a single hermit. Although there was only one initial witness to the life, death, and elevation of a solitary figure, the individual's renown and reputation became widespread as if the hermit had enacted the ascetic death in the manner of the martyrs in front of an arena full of witnesses.

The concepts of witness and suffering distill into a smaller scale from martyrdom to desert asceticism, yet an audience, physical pain, and an appropriately interactive setting are still necessary in the creation of the identity of the individual martyrs as well as the desert hermits.

Pilgrimage, either on the individual level or enacted through a larger group performance, condenses further the role of witness and testimony from the ascetic hermits and their observers into the single pilgrim. Through this process, the pilgrim who becomes elevated or indoctrinated into a new identity through the dual role of actor and audience (witness) to the unique performance. What are the private acts of individuals processing through an isolated and sensorially affective landscape of pilgrimage become shared and visible examples of piety through the testimonies provided by the pilgrims when they reach Montserrat.

Not only do the pilgrims elevate themselves and become indoctrinated into the community of those devoted to the Virgin of Montserrat, but through their related testimony, they establish the Virgin's superiority of intercession and further elevate the status of her cult for future generations. The Virgin as torturer (inducer of corporeal suffering) and intimidator is highly effective. Utilizing the careful deconstruction of the supplicants' old lives through suffering, the Virgin Mary becomes the sole source of life or death for the pilgrims by the manipulation and deprivation tactics employed to bolster her popularity and influence. Through the intervention of the Virgin of Montserrat and the implementation of suffering, the martyr and desert ascetic forms of witnessing that required distinctive and separate roles of the actor and audience reach the final stage of maturation in the single suffering body of the pilgrim who becomes the witness and actor in the performance of pilgrimage. As witness to the Virgin's roles of intervening savior and implementer of pain, the pilgrims are ultimately indoctrinated into the cult of the Virgin of Montserrat through individual journeys and experiences of suffering. Their testimonies are forever preserved in the publicly recorded and disseminated compilations of her miracles. The original images of Christ and the martyrs' suffering that led to the contemplation, meditation, and elevation of the medieval viewer is adapted to the visual, auditory, and mobile

performance of pilgrimage allowing the pilgrims to experience their own suffering in a more encompassing and interactive landscape through their bodies.

Pilgrimage does not serve as a simple quid pro quo substitution of previous incarnations of Christian ascetic suffering such as martyrdom and the lives of the desert fathers. As is the case with a performance, each method of the expression of self and the Christian identity depends on the time period and culture of context. Instead of considering the suffering of pilgrimage as a substitute for the corporeal destruction endured by the martyrs or the extreme lives of asceticism represented by the desert saints, each instance of death and suffering (the physical and the metaphorical) should be treated as a culturally and time sensitive process of discovering the individual Christian identity through suffering. In his book, *Dying for God*, Daniel Boyarin (1999) proposes that martyrdom be considered a discourse, a practice of dying for God and discussing the actions involved. By establishing the suffering involved in martyrdom, as well as ascetic eremitic practices as open discourses for understanding one's relationship to God, martyrdom and other forms of asceticism prepared pilgrimage and the suffering endured during its enactment to be considered in a similar discourse. However, the discussion of martyrdom and the creation of a martyr's identity are dependent on the public execution of an individual being shared with an audience. The visual death and subsequent martyr acts (usually shared orally amongst the Christians) served to put forth one individual, the martyr, as a figure to be celebrated and to be studied and emulated in the preparation of future martyrs (Kelley 2006). The cultivation of a firm identity of self in martyrdom is a selfish act in which one individual dies to show their devotion: 'Stories of martyrs functioned much like scripts, giving prospective witnesses models of speech and action to follow' (Kelley 2006: 729). The tales of the suffering of the desert fathers also served as models to the subsequent generations of eremites and

cenobites who would later study the texts. The martyr acts and ascetic narratives were 'vehicles for the inculcation of a particular set of values' (Kelley 2006: 729). However, the guidelines and scripts set down by such tales were meant for copying by a very select and specific group of individuals. Only those who prepared for death through a life of near starvation or deprivation through an isolated existence living in a cave or a cloistered community could achieve the establishment of a martyr-like Christian identity through death. The solitary figures of the martyr or the monk were the pious individuals who existed almost on a different plane than the rest of the members of society. Their holy status conferred a sacred aura on their acts of suffering. This perceived separation of the sacred status forced the role of witness in the exchange and discussion of the interactions between ascetic individuals and their audience to become of secondary importance. The holy act (the martyred death) was something to be observed and emulated, but not enacted by the general Christian population or what could loosely be equated to the profane or mundane spheres of society.

However, this style of completely self-motivated ascetic discipline placing a decisive barrier between the emulated (ascetic individual/sacred) and the emulator (witness/audience/profane) prevents the average lay person from being actively engaged in the construction process of performances of piety. The foundation legends of Montserrat warn against the styles of ascetic devotion found in the martyr and desert saints' texts. They address how infeasible it is to obtain the complete isolation necessary or inhabit a wholly sacred space in order to construct a viable form of ascetic Christian life. Unaccustomed to human contact in his solitary hermit existence, Fray Juan Garín did not know how to cope with the intrusion of the Count of Barcelona and his daughter Riquilda into his ascetic life. Isolated torture and suffering led Garín to sin since he did not have the guidance of a divine, intercessory figure to aid him. It

was only when the Hermit was reintegrated into the wider system and society of human interaction at the end of his penance was he elevated and his holy identity established. The discovery of the Virgin statue by shepherds, youths, and bishops also denotes that the best way to construct and confirm a Christian identity is through the constant interaction of the suffering individual with intercessory figures and the wider community. Engaged interactions with a physical and integrated landscape, not independent suffering in a sequesterd (sacred) environment is what frees the Virgin statue and Juan Garín from their isolated cave-dwelling existences and helps to establish their renown.

Although the acts of the martyrs and deserts ascetics occurred in vastly different arenas, they were both isolating acts of devotion. This form of expressing piety imposes strict identities of actor and audience upon those involved in the ritual acts of suffering and on the landscape of performance. In these styles of suffering and enactments of piety there is more of a need for strictly defined roles of the actor and those who come upon the suffering body and act as witness to their pain. The interactions of actor and witness in the martyr and ascetic traditions are necessary to establish the superiority of the saints and ascetic fathers. The narratives and the set roles of the individuals involved are required as the Church established its authority and confirmed holy status on certain individuals. However, by the time the statue of the Virgin of Montserrat is rediscovered and her cult established, individual, isolated, and near selfless and perfect acts of piety are no longer what is expected of the individual Christian. Without a community of onlookers and helpers to verify and spread the manifestation of the sacred to the wider community, the Virgin's statue would never have been retrieved from the cave. Similarly, without the disruption of Juan Garín's solitary life that pushed him violently into the realm of the larger society and court of Barcelona, the Hermit would have remained in an inferior state. Even

the pilgrims of Montserrat require assistance in the form of fellow pilgrims and strangers, as well as the intervention of the Virgin to help extricate them from an isolated existence induced by pain, suffering, torture, infirmity, or incarceration.

Periods of isolation are key to the performance of pilgrimage, they induce suffering, pain, or loss that in turn leads to the supplicant's desire to invoke the Virgin for assistance. Isolation leads to indoctrination. Indoctrination and the creation of a new identity are the results of the performance and acts of pilgrimage. The process of performance creates an individually tailored form of piety that is on the one hand extremely personal and dependent on the individual sufferer's circumstance. Yet at the same time, third party intervention and a connection to the wider Christian community and landscape help to solidify and spread the word of the participating actor's involvement with the Virgin and her cult through pilgrimage. The suffering involved in pilgrimage does not end in a metaphorical death, but in rebirth. The manner of suffering and rebirth varies greatly in the performance of pilgrimage allowing for the creation of an identity influenced by the actions of the individual pilgrims in their roles as actor and audience.

Moving Forward with Pilgrimage and Performance

This thesis proposes a restructured performance theory that incorporates both the roles of actor/artist and witness/spectator/audience in the singular body of the performing pilgrim as the next methodological stage in the analysis of pilgrimage. Pilgrimage is not a component to the divisive dichotomy of the sacred versus profane divide. It does not create a sacred, spiritual, and ritualistic landscape that only exists in the minds of the pious and within the biblical narratives created from source texts. The miracles and songs dedicated to the Virgin of Montserrat

combined with the mountain's uniquely present heritage of ascetic martyrs and the desert saints (eremitic and cenobitic) demonstrate that one integrated body of the Virgin's supplicant can act as the source and transmitter of pious activity. The human body is a fully integrated member of society that has the capacity to shift back and forth between more private and public spheres and interactions during the enactment of the performance. The body in turn observes, interacts, and reacts with the equally fluid landscape of the performance that has the potential to manifest a sacred space from the profane surroundings if that is the actor's intent. Just as images of Christ and the martyrs' grotesque bodily deconstruction become positive tools of sympathy (Merback 1999: 19-25), suffering can help concentrate and elevate the viewer. The actors' and audiences' intentions can change an ordinary landscape into a place that has the potential to manifest the sacred.

When performance is utilized to analyze pilgrimage, the sacred versus profane divide, the concept of *communitas*, and the rest of the limiting dichotomies that demarcate ritual acts as points of discussing the differences between the periphery interactions of two separate realms of society become moot. Synonymous with an act of performance art, pilgrimage creates a manner in which to interpret the world for lay and ecclesiastical pilgrims alike through the process of individually manipulated identity creation dependent upon the actor/audience's interactions with a real, physical, and constantly adaptable landscape of performance. This landscape is a mixture of architectural and natural spaces that goes beyond the predetermined, reenacted dramatic movements present in the processions within the church interior and shrine precinct.

Bibliography

Abadia de Montserrat, 2016. *Abadia de Montserrat*. http://www.abadiamontserrat.net/(S(4svxw1cjx0wqj2j5u0jxmjaq))/Espiritualitat/Catala/santuari.aspx?newsid=89 [accessed: 9.10.2016]

Abasolo, José A., 1990. 'El conocimiento de las vías romanas: un problema arqueológico', in *Simposio sobre la red viaria en la Hispania romana*, ed. Magallón Botoya (Zaragoza: Institución Fernando el Católico), pp. 7-20.

Abregé, 1723. *Abregé de l'histoire Notre-dame du Montserrat* (Mons: Jean-Nicolas Varret).

Agència Catalana de Turisme, 2016. 'Camí de Sant Jaume: Rutas turístiques', *Agència Catalana de Turisme*. http://www.catalunya.com/cami-de-sant-jaume-24-1-61 [accessed: 12.10.2016]

Agnes, Michael, ed., 2008. *Webster's New World College Dictionary*, IV (Cleveland OH: Wiley Publishing).

Alarcón Román, Concepción, 2007. 'Las versiones medievales de la leyenda de Montserrat', *Studia Monastica*, 49: 29-73.

---, 2008. 'Las ilustraciones marianas de la leyenda de Montserrat', *Revista de Dialectología y Tradiciones Populares*, 63.2: 169-96.

Albareda, Anselm M., 1931. *L'Abat Oliba, fundador de Montserrat (971?-1046): assaig biogràfic*, Biblioteca Abat Oliba, 1 (Montserrat: Publicaciones de l'Abadia de Montserrat).

Albarrán Martínez, María Jesús, 2010. 'Ascetismo y monasterios femeninos en el Egipto tardoantiguo: estudio de papiros y ostraca griegos y coptos', *Studia Monastica*, 52: 9-436.

Albert i Corp, Esteve, 1966. *L'obra social i política de l'abal-bisbe Oliba*, Episodis de la Història, 79 (Barcelona: Rafael Dalmau).

Alfonso X, King of Castile and León, 1988. *Cantigas*, ed. Jesús Montoya, Letras Hispánicas, 293 (Madrid: Cátedra).

Alfonso X, O Sábio, 1981. *Cantigas de Santa Maria*, 2 vols. ed. Walter Mettmann (Vigo: Edicións Xerais de Galicia).

Altés i Aguiló, Francesc Xavier, 2008. 'A l'entorn de la vista del rei Jaume I a Santa Maria i a Santa Cecília de Montserrat, l'any 1218', *Studia Monastica*, 50: 7-39.

Arnold, John H., ed., 2014. *The Oxford Handbook of Medieval Christianity*, Oxford Handbooks (Oxford: University Press).

Ashmore, Wendy, & A. Bernard Knapp, ed., 1999. *Archaeology of Landscape: Contemporary Perspectives*, Social Archaeology (Malden MA: Blackwell Publishers).

Baldovin, John F., 1987. *The Urban Character of Christian Worship: The Origins, Development, and Meaning of Stational Liturgy*, Orientalia Christiana Analecta, 228 (Rome: Pontificat Institutum Studiorum Orientalium).

Barasch, Moshe, 2001. *Blindness: The History of a Mental Image in Western Thought* (New York: Routledge).

Baraut i Obiols, Cebrià, 1949-1950. 'Les *Cantigues* d'Alfons el Savi i el primitiu *Liber Miraculorum* de Nostra Dona de Montserrat', *Estudis Romànics*, 2: 79-92.

Baumeister, Roy F., 1991. *Escaping the Self: Alcoholism, Spirituality, Masochism, and Other Flights from the Burden of Selfhood* (New York: Basic Books).

Beardsley, Monroe C., 1958. *Aesthetics: Problems in the Philosophy of Criticism* (New York: Harcourt, Brace & World).

Bell, Catherine M., 2009. *Ritual Theory, Ritual Practice* (Oxford: University Press).

Benton, John F., 1999. 'Consciousness of Self and Perceptions of Individuality', in *Renaissance and Renewal in the Twelfth Century*, ed. Robert L. Benson, Giles Constable, & Carol D. Lanham (Toronto: University of Toronto Press), pp. 263-95.

Beresford, Andrew M., 2007. *The Legends of the Holy Harlots: Thaïs and Pelagia in Medieval Spanish Literature*, Colección Támesis, A238 (Woodbridge: Tamesis).

---, 2010. 'Rereading Jerome in Spain in the Middle Ages: The *Vida de Sant Paulo* and The Legend of St. Paul of Thebes', *Medieval Studies*, 72: 1-37.

---, 2013-14. 'Reforming Identity in Medieval Castilian Hagiography: Visions, Dreams, and the Ascetic Imperative', *Medium Aevum*, 82.1: 293-313.

---, & Lesley K. Twomey, 2013-2014. 'Visions of Hagiography: From the Gaze to Spiritual Vision in Medieval Lives of Saints', *La Corónica*, 42.1: 103-32.

Berger, Blandine-Dominique, 1976. *Le drame de Pâques du X^{e} au XIII^{e} siècle: liturgie et théâtre*, Théologie Historique, 37 (Paris: Beauchesne).

Bergmann, S., P. M. Scott, M. Jansdotter Samuelsson, & H. Bedford-Strohm, ed., 2009. *Nature, Space and the Sacred: Transdisciplinary Perspectives* (Aldershot: Ashgate).

Berman, Constance H., 2013. 'Monastic and Mendicant Communities', in *A Companion to the Medieval World*, ed. Carol Lansing & Edward D. English, Blackwell Companions to European History (Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell), pp. 231-56.

Besserman, Lawrence, 2006. 'Sacred and Secular in Medieval and Early Modern Cultures: Issues and Approaches', in *Sacred and Secular in Medieval and Early Modern Cultures: New Essays*, ed. Lawrence Besserman (New York: Palgrave Macmillan), pp. 1-15.

Boase, Roger, 1989. 'The "Penitents of Love" and the Wild Man in the Storm: A Passage by the Knight of La Tour-Landry', *The Modern Language Review*, 84.4: 817-33.

---, 2016. 'The Siren in the Storm and the Wild Man's Solace: A Folkloric Motif in Fifteenth-Century Poetry', *eHumanista*, 32: 668-76.

Bourdieu, Pierre, 1990. *In Other Words: Essays Towards a Reflexive Sociology* (Stanford CA: Stanford University Press).

---, 2010. *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste*, trans. Richard Nice (London: Routledge).

Bowersock, G.W., 1995. *Martyrdom and Rome*, The Wiles Lectures Given at the Queen's University of Belfast (Cambridge: University Press).

Bowman, Glenn, 1991. 'Christian Ideology and the Image of a Holy Land: The Place of Jerusalem Pilgrimage in the Various Christianities', in *Contesting the Sacred: The Anthropology of Christian Pilgrimage*, ed. John Eade & Michael J. Sallnow (London: Routledge), pp. 98-121.

Boyarin, Daniel, 1999. *Dying for God: Martyrdom and the Making of Christianity and Judaism*, Figurae (Stanford CA: Stanford University Press).

Boynton, Susan, 2009. 'Religious Soundscapes: Liturgy and Music', in *Christianity in Western Europe, c.1100-c.1500*, ed. Miri Rubin & Walter Simons, The Cambridge History of Christianity, 4 (Cambridge: University Press), pp. 238-53.

Burgos, Pedro Alfonso de, 1594. *Libro de la historia y milagros, hechos a invocación de Nuestra Señora de Montserrate* (Barcelona: Casa Sebastian de Cormellas).

Bynum, Caroline Walker, 1991. *Fragmentation and Redemption: Essays on Gender and the Human Body in Medieval Religion* (New York: Zone).

---, 2002. 'Violent Imagery in Late Medieval Piety', *Bulletin of the German Historical Institute*, 30: 3-36.

Cameron, Averil, 1998. 'Ascetic Closure at the End of Antiquity', in *Asceticism*, ed. Vincent L. Wimbush & Richard Valantasis (Oxford: University Press), pp. 147-61.

Camille, Michael, 1988. 'Visualizing in the Vernacular: A New Cycle of Early Fourteenth-Century Bible Illustrations', *The Burlington Magazine*, 130.1019: 97-106.

---, 1991. 'Gothic Signs and the Surplus: The Kiss on the Cathedral', *Yale French Studies*, 151-70.

---, 1992. *Image on the Edge: The Margins of Medieval Art*, Essays in Art and Culture (London: Reaktion).

---, 2000. 'Signs of the City: Place, Power, and Public Fantasy in Medieval Paris', in *Medieval Practices of Space*, ed. Barbara A. Hanawalt & Michal Kobialka, Medieval Cultures, 23 (Minneapolis MN: University of Minnesota Press), pp. 1-36.

Camino de Santiago, 2016. 'Camino de Santiago: The Pilgrimage Routes to Santiago de Compostela'. http://santiago-compostela.net/cami-de-sant-jaume/ [accessed: 11.10.2016]

Candy, Julie, 2009. *The Archaeology of Pilgrimage on the Camino de Santiago de Compostela: A Landscape Perspective*, BAR International Series (Oxford: Archaeopress).

Carlson, Allen, 2000. *Aesthetics and The Environment: The Appreciation of Nature, Art and Architecture* (London: Routledge).

Carroll Noël, 2001. *Beyond Aesthetics: Philosophical Essays* (Cambridge: University Press).

---, 2015. 'Theater and the Emotion', in *The Oxford Handbook of Cognitive Literary Studies*, ed. Lisa Zunshine, Oxford Handbooks of Literature (Oxford: University Press), pp. 313-26.

Casali, Sergio, 2006. 'Il monachesimo delle origini tra conoscenza di sé e paternità spiritual: Antonio e Pacomio (I)', *Studia Monastica*, 48: 25-58.

Cherry, Peter, & Arantza Mayo, 2016. 'The Fabric of Saintly Proof: Leocadia of Toledo from Orrente to Calderón', *Bulletin of Spanish Studies*, 93.7-8: 1339-70.

Christian, William A., 1981. *Apparitions in Late Medieval and Renaissance Spain* (Princeton NJ: University Press).

Claramunt, Salvador, 2007. 'Catalunya, porta d'entrada del Camí de Sant Jaume', in *El camí de Sant Jaume i Catalunya: actes del Congrés Internacional celebrat a Barcelona, Cervera, i Lleida, els dies 16, 17 i 18, d'octubre de 2003*, ed. Maria Teresa Ferrer i Mallol, & Pere Verdés Pijuan, Biblioteca Abat Oliba, Sèrie Il¨lustrada, 21 (Barcelona: Publicacións de l'Abadia de Montserrat), pp. 15-20.

Clariana Roig, Joan-Francesc, 1990. 'Aproximación a la red viara de la comarca del Maresme', in *Simposio sobre la red viaria en la Hispania romana*, ed. Magallón Botaya (Zaragoza: Institución Fernando el Católico), pp. 113-30.

Classen, Albrecht, 2012. 'Rural Space in Late Medieval Books of Hours: Book Illustrations as a Looking-Glass into Medieval Mentality and Mirrors of Ecocriticism', in *Rural Space in the Middle Ages and Early Modern Age: The Spatial Turn in Premodern Studies*, ed. Albrecht Classen, Fundamentals of Medieval and Early Modern Culture, 9 (Boston MA: De Gruyter), pp. 529-60.

Coleman, Simon, 2002. 'Do You Believe in Pilgrimage?: *Communitas*, Contestation and Beyond', *Anthropological Theory*, 2.3: 355-68.

---, & John Eade, ed., 2004. *Reframing Pilgrimage: Cultures in Motion*, European Association of Social Anthropologists (London: Routledge).

---, & John Elsner, 1994. ‘The Pilgrim’s Progress: Art, Architecture and Ritual Movement at Sinai’, *World Archaeology,* 26.1: 73–89.

---, 1995. *Pilgrimage Past and Present: Sacred Travel and Sacred Space in the World Religions* (London: British Museum Press).

Constable, Giles, 1977. ‘Monachisme et pèlerinage au Moyen Age’, *Revue Historique*, 258.1 (523): 3-27.

---, 2002. *The Reformation of the Twelfth Century* (Cambridge: University Press).

Cook, Amy, 2013. ‘Introduction: Texts and Embodied Performance’, in *Affective Performance and Cognitive Science: Body, Brain, and Being*, ed. Nicola Shaughnessy, Methuen Drama (London: Bloomsbury), pp. 83-90.

Copeland, Rita, 2006. ‘Sacred and Secular: The History of Rhetoric and Religious Community in the Middle Ages’, in *Sacred and Secular in Medieval and Early Modern Cultures: New Essays*, ed. Lawrence Besserman (New York: Palgrave Macmillan), pp. 135-47.

Crane, Mary Thomas, 2015. ‘Cognitive Historicism: Intuition in Early Modern Thought’, in *The Oxford Handbook of Cognitive Literary Studies*, ed. Lisa Zunshine, Oxford Handbooks of Literature (New York: Oxford University Press), pp. 15-33.

Dahlberg, Andrea, 1991. ‘The Body as a Principle of Holism: Three Pilgrimages to Lourdes’, in *Contesting the Sacred: The Anthropology of Christian Pilgrimage*, ed. John Eade & Michael J. Sallnow (London: Routledge), pp. 30-50.

Da Costa, Ricardo, & Bárbara Dantas, 2015. ‘A arquitetura sagrada e a natureza nas *Cantigas de Santa María* (séc. XIII)’, *Mirabilia*, 20: 44-65.

Danto, Arthur C., 2009 'The Future of Aesthetics', in *Rediscovering Aesthetics: Transdisciplinary Voices from Art History, Philosophy, and Art Practice*, ed. Francis Halsall, Julia Janzen, & Tony O' Connor (Stanford CA: University Press), pp. 103-16.

Davidson, Clifford, 1974-75. 'Medieval Drama: Diversity and Theatricality', *Comparative Drama*, 8.1: 2, 5-12.

Davies, David, 2004. *Art as Performance*, New Directions in Aesthetics, 2 (Oxford: Blackwell).

Davies, Paul, Deborah Howard, & Wendy Pullan, ed., 2013. *Architecture and Pilgrimage, 1000-1500: Southern Europe and Beyond* (Farnham: Ashgate).

Davies, Stephen, 2013. 'Definitions of Art', in *The Routledge Companion to Aesthetics*, ed. Berys Gaut, & Dominic McIver Lopes, Routledge Philosophy Companions (London: Routledge), pp. 213-23.

Decker, John R., 2015. 'Introduction: Spectacular Unmaking: Creative Destruction, Destructive Creativity', in *Death, Torture and the Broken Body in European Art, 1300-1650*, ed. John R. Decker, & Mitzi Kirkland-Ives (London: Ashgate), pp. 1-16.

Del Alamo, Elizabeth Valdez, 1990. 'Triumphal Visions and Monastic Devotion: The Annunciation Relief of Santo Domingo de Silos', *Gesta*, 29.2: 167–88.

Del Campo i Jorda, F., A. Cuso i Recasens, & M. Eri i Rufat, 1990. 'La red viaria prerromana y romana en la comarca del Alto Ampurdán (Girona) hasta el siglo I a. C.', in *Simposio sobre la red viaria en la Hispania romana*, ed. Magallón Botaya (Zaragoza: Institución Fernando el Católico), pp. 77-84.

Derks, Ton, 1997. 'The Transformation of Landscape and Religious Representations in Roman Gaul', *Archaeological Dialogues,* 4.2: 126-47.

Dietz, Maribel, 2005. *Wandering Monks, Virgins, and Pilgrims: Ascetic Travel in the Mediterranean World. A.D. 300-800* (University Park PA: Pennsylvania State University Press).

Dox, Donnalee, 2000. 'Theatrical Space, Mutable Space, and the Space of Imagination: Three Readings of the *Croxton Play of the Sacrament*', in *Medieval Practices of Space*, ed. Barbara A. Hanawalt & Michal Kobialka, Medieval Cultures, 23 (Minneapolis MN: University of Minnesota Press), pp. 167-98.

Donovan, Richard B., 1958. *The Liturgical Drama in Medieval Spain*, Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies, 4 (Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Mediaeval Studies).

---, 1970. 'Two Celebrated Centers of Medieval Liturgical Drama: Fleury and Ripoll', in *The Medieval Drama and its Claudelian Revival: Papers Presented at the Third Symposium in Comparative Literature Held at the Catholic University of America, April 3 and 4, 1968*, ed. Catherine E. Dunn, Tatiana Fotitch, & Bernard M. Peebles (Washington DC: Catholic University of America Press), pp. 41-51.

Draper, Peter, 1987. *Age of Chivalry: Art in Plantagenet England, 1200-1400*, ed. Jonathan Alexander & Paul Binski (London: Royal Academy of Arts), pp. 83-91.

Eade, John., & Michael J. Sallnow, ed., 1991. *Contesting the Sacred: The Anthropology of Christian Pilgrimage* (London: Routledge).

Easterling, P. E., 1993. 'Tragedy and Ritual', in *Theater and Society in the Classical World*, ed. Ruth Scodel (Ann Arbor MI: University of Michigan Press), pp. 7-23.

Ehrstine, Glenn, 2012. 'Passion Spectatorship between Private and Public Devotion', in *Thresholds of Medieval Visual Culture: Liminal Spaces*, ed. Elina Gertsman & Jill

Stevenson, Boydell Studies in Medieval Art and Architecture (Woodbridge: The Boydell Press), pp. 302-20.

Eliade, Mircea, 1959. *The Sacred and the Profane: The Nature of Religion*, trans. Willard R. Trask (New York: Harcourt, Brace & World Inc.).

Elkins, James, 2009. 'Aesthetics and the Two Cultures: Why Art and Science Should Be Allowed to Go Their Separate Ways', in *Rediscovering Aesthetics: Transdisciplinary Voices from Art History, Philosophy, and Art Practice*, ed. Francis Halsall, Julia Janzen, & Tony O' Connor (Stanford CA: University Press), pp. 34-50.

Elm, Susanna, 1996. *'Virgins of God': The Making of Asceticism in Late Antiquity*, Oxford Classical Monographs (Oxford: University Press).

Encyclopaedia Britannica, 2019. 'Liturgical Drama: Medieval Drama' (London: Encyclopaedia Britannica, Inc.). https://www.britannica.com/topic/liturgical-drama [accessed: 11.02.19]

Epstein, Robert, & William Robins, ed., 2010. *Sacred and Profane in Chaucer and Late Medieval Literature: Essays in Honour of John V. Fleming* (Toronto: University Press).

Federación Española de Asociaciones de Amigos del Camino de Santiago, 2011. 'Camino de Santiago "el camino de las estrellas"'. http://caminosantiago.org [accessed: 11.10.2016]

Ferrer i Mallol, Maria Teresa, 2007. 'El Pelegrinatge a Saunt Jaume de Compotel·la a la Catalunya medieval', in *El camí de Sant Jaume i Catalunya: Actes del Congrés Internacional Celebrat a Barcelona, Cervera, i Lleida, els dies 16, 17 i 18, d'octubre de 2003*, ed. Maria Teresa Ferrer i Mallol, & Pere Verdés Pijuan, Biblioteca Abat Oliba Sèrie Il·lustrada, 21 (Barcelona: Publicacións de l'Abadia de Montserrat), pp. 61-81.

Festugière, André Jean, 1961. *Culture ou sainteté: Introduction au monachisme oriental*, Les Moines d'Orient, 1 (Paris: Les Éditions du Cerf).

Filgueira Valverde, José, trans. 1985. *Alfonso X El Sabio 'Cantigas de Santa María': Códice Rico de El Escorial*, Editorial Castalla (Madrid: Odres Nuevos).

Fischer-Lichte, Erika, 2013. 'Performance as Event', in *Theorising Performance: Greek Drama, Cultural History and Critical Practice*, ed. Edith Hall & Stephe Harrop (London: Duckworth), pp. 29-42.

Flanigan, C. Clifford, 1974-75. 'The Liturgical Context of the "Quem Queritis" Trope', *Comparative Drama*, 8.1: 45-62.

---, 1991. 'Medieval Latin Music-Drama', in *The Theatre of Medieval Europe: New Research in Early Drama*, ed. Eckhard Simon, Cambridge Studies in Medieval Literature, 9 (Cambridge: University Press), pp. 21-41.

Flory, David A., 1996. 'Berceo's *Milagros* and the *Cantigas de Santa Maria*: The Question of Intended Audience', *Cantigueiros*, 8: 15-29.

Font, Juan Pablo, 1820. *La Vida de Fr. Juan Garín, y de la penitencia, que hizo en la montaña de Montserrate* (Barcelona).

Foucault, Michel, 2014. 'Heterotopias', trans. Pamela Johnston, *AA Files*, 69: 18-22.

Frank, Georgia, 2000. *The Memory of the Eyes: Pilgrims to Living Saints in Christian Late Antiquity*, The Transformation of the Classical Heritage, 30 (Berkeley CA: University of California Press).

Genicot, Léopold, 1984. 'Sur la survivance de la notion d'État dans l'Europe du Nord au haut Moyen Âge: l'emploi de publicus dans les sources belges antérieures à l'an mil', in *Institutionene, kultur und Gesellschaft im mittelalter: Festschrift für Josef Fleckenstein zu seinem 65. Geburtstag* (Sigmaringen: Jan Thorbecke Verlag), pp. 147-64.

Gertsman, Elina, & Jill Stevenson, 2012. 'Limining the Field', in *Thresholds of Medieval Visual Culture: Liminal Spaces*, ed. Elina Gertsman & Jill Stevenson, Boydell Studies in Medieval Art and Architecture (Woodbridge: The Boydell Press), pp. 1-10.

Gibson, Erin, 2007. 'The Archaeology of Movement in a Mediterranean Landscape', *Journal of Mediterranean Archaeology*, 20.1: 61-87.

Goehring, James F., 1999. *Ascetics, Society, and the Desert: Studies in Early Egyptian Monasticism*, Studies in Antiquity and Christianity (Harrisburg PA: Trinity Press).

Gogtay, Nitin, Jay N. Giedd, Leslie Lusk, Kiralee M. Hayashi, Deanna Greenstein, A. Catherine Vaituzis, Tom F. Nugent III, Daivd H. Herman, Liv S. Clasen, Arthur W. Toga, Judith L. Rapoport, & Paul M. Thompson, 2004. 'Dynamic Mapping of Human Cortical Development During Childhood Through Early Adulthood', *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America,* 101.21: 8174-79.

Gómez Muntané, María del Carmen, 1990. '*El Llibre Vermell de Montserrat': cantos y danzas siglo XIV*, Papeles de Ensayo, 5 (Barcelona: Los Libros de la Frontera).

Goodich, Michael, ed., 1998. *Other Middle Ages: Witnesses at the Margins of Medieval Society*, The Middle Ages Series (Philadelphia PA: University of Pennsylvania Press).

---, 2007. 'The Role of the Dream in Thirteenth-Century Hagiography', in *Procession, Performance, Liturgy, and Ritual: Essays in Honor of Bryan R. Gillingham*, ed. Nancy van Deusen, Claremont Cultural Studies (Ottawa: Institute of Mediaeval Music), pp. 175-89.

Gopnik, Blake, 2012. 'Aesthetic Science and Artistic Knowledge', in *Aesthetic Science: Connecting Minds, Brains and Experience*, ed. Arthur P. Shimamura & Stephen E. Palmer (New York: Oxford University Press), pp. 129-59.

Gronze, 2006. ‘El Camino de Santiago’. https://www/gronze.com [accessed: 11.10.2016]

Guerrero Lovillo, José, 1949. ‘*Las Cántigas’: estudio arqueológico de sus miniaturas*, Consejo superior de investigaciones científicas (Madrid: Instituto Diego Velázquez).

Gunn, Cate, & Liz Herbert McAvoy, ed., 2017. *Medieval Anchorites in their Communities*, Studies in the History of Medieval Religion, 45 (Woodbridge: D.S. Brewer).

Haldane, John, 2013. ‘Medieval Aesthetics’, in *The Routledge Companion to Aesthetics*, ed. Berys Gaut & Dominic McIver Lopes, Routledge Companions (London: Routledge), pp. 25-35.

Halsall, Francis, Julia Jansen, & Tony O’ Connor, 2009. ‘(Re)Discovering Aesthetics: An Introduction’, in *Rediscovering Aesthetics: Transdisciplinary Voices from Art History, Philosophy, and Art Practice*, ed. Francis Halsall, Julia Janzen, & Tony O’ Connor (Stanford CA: University Press), pp. 1-15.

Hamilton, James, R., 2013. ‘Theater’, in *The Routledge Companion to Aesthetics*, ed. Berys Gaut & Dominic McIver Lopes, Routledge Companions to Philosophy (London: Routledge), pp. 543-53.

Hanawalt, Barbara A., & Michal Kobialka, 2000. ‘Introduction’, in *Medieval Practices of Space*, ed. Barbara A. Hanawalt & Michal Kobialka, Medieval Cultures, 23 (Minneapolis MN: University of Minnesota Press), pp. ix-xviii.

Hardison Jr., O.B., 1970. ‘Gregorian Easter Vespers and Early Liturgical Drama’, in *The Medieval Drama and its Claudelian Revival: Papers Presented at the Third Symposium in Comparative Literature Held at the Catholic University of America, April 3 and 4, 1968*, ed. Catherine E. Dunn, Tatiana Fotitch, & Bernard M. Peebles (Washington DC: Catholic University of America Press), pp. 27-40.

Harpham, Geoffrey Galt, 1987. *The Ascetic Imperative in Culture and Criticism*. (Chicago: University Press).

Hart, F. Elizabeth, 2006. 'Performance, Phenomenology, and the Cognitive Turn', in *Performance and Cognition: Theatre Studies After the Cognitive Turn*, ed. Bruce A. McConachie & F. Elizabeth Hart, Routledge Advances in Theatre and Performance Studies, 4 (London: Routledge), pp. 29-51.

Hayes, Dawn Marie, 2003. *Body and Sacred Place in Medieval Europe, 1100-1389*, ed. Francis G. Gentry, Studies in Medieval History and Culture, 18 (New York: Routledge).

Hiley, David, 1993. *Western Plainchant: A Handbook* (Oxford: University Press).

Holly, Michael Ann, 2009. 'Stones of Solace', in *Rediscovering Aesthetics: Transdisciplinary Voices from Art History, Philosophy, and Art Practice*, ed. Francis Halsall, Julia Janzen, & Tony O' Connor (Stanford CA: University Press), pp. 51-65.

Hopper, Sarah, 2002. *To Be a Pilgrim: The Medieval Pilgrimage Experience* (Stroud: Sutton).

Howes, Graham, 2007. *The Art of the Sacred: An Introduction to the Aesthetics of Art and Belief* (London: I. B. Tauris & Co.).

Huttenlocher, Peter R., & Arun S. Dabholkar, 1997. 'Regional Differences in Synaptogenesis in Human Cerebral Cortex', *The Journal of Comparative Neurology*, 387. 2: 167-78.

Ibarz, Alexander, 2011. 'Medieval Catalan Culture: 801-1492', in *A Companion to Catalan Culture*, ed. Dominic Keown, Colección Támesis, A293 (Woodbridge: Tamesis), pp. 41-70.

J. Gaultier, Prestre, 1619. *L'histoire de Notre Dame de Montserrat* (Paris).

Jacob, Pierre, & Marc Jeannerod, 2003. *Ways of Seeing: The Scope and Limits of Visual Cognition*, Oxford Cognitive Science Series (Oxford: University Press).

Jaén, Isabel, & Julien J. Simon, 2016. 'Introduction', in *Cognitive Approaches to Early Modern Spanish Literature*, ed. Isabel Jaén & Julien J. Simon, Cognition and Poetics (Oxford: University Press), pp. 1-10.

Jensen, Michael P., 2010. *Martyrdom and Identity: The Self on Trial*, T & T Clark Theology (London: T & T Clark).

Johnston, Andrew James, Ethan Knapp, & Margritta Rouse, ed., 2016. *The Art of Vision: Ekphrasis in Medieval Literature and Culture*, Interventions: New Studies in Medieval Culture (Columbus OH: The Ohio State University Press).

Jung, Jacqueline E., 2000. 'Beyond the Barrier: The Unifying Role of the Choir Screen in Gothic Churches', *The Art Bulletin*, 82.4: 622-57.

Kant, Immanuel, 2000. *Critique of the Power of Judgment*, ed. Paul Guyer, trans. Paul Guyer & Eric Matthews, The Cambridge Edition of the Works of Immanuel Kant (Cambridge: University Press).

Keller, John Esten, & Annette Grant Cash, 1998. *Daily life Depicted in the 'Cantigas de Santa Maria'*, Studies in Romance Languages, 44 (Lexington KY: University Press).

Kelley, Nicole, 2006. 'Philosophy as Training for Death: Reading the Ancient Christian Martyr Acts as Spiritual Exercise', *Church History*, 75.4: 723-47.

Kirkland-Ives, Mitzi, 2015. 'The Suffering Christ and Visual Mnemonics in Netherlandish Devotions', in *Death, Torture and the Broken Body in European Art, 1300-1650*, ed. John R. Decker & Mitzi Kirkland-Ives (London: Ashgate), pp. 35-54.

Klein, Colin, 2010. 'Images Are Not the Evidence in Neuroimaging', *British Journal for the Philosophy of Science*, 61.2: 265-78.

Kobialka, Michal, 2000. 'Staging Place/Space in the Eleventh-Century Monastic Practices', in *Medieval Practices of Space*, ed. Barbara A. Hanawalt & Michal Kobialka, Medieval Cultures, 23 (Minneapolis MN: University of Minnesota Press), pp. 128-48.

Krueger, Derek, 2004. *Writing and Holiness: The Practice of Authorship in the Early Christian East*, Divinations: Reading Late Ancient Religion (Philadelphia PA: University of Pennsylvania Press).

Kyle, Donald G., 1998. *Spectacles of Death in Ancient Rome* (London: Routledge).

Larsa Montserrat, 2017. 'Montserrat'. http://www.montserratvisita.com [accessed 14.10.2016]

Lawrence, Arnold Walter, 1983. *Greek Architecture*, Pelican History of Art (Harmondsworth: Penguin).

Livingston, Paisley, 2013. 'Narrative', in *The Routledge Companion to Aesthetics*, ed. Berys Gaut & Dominic McIver Lopes (London: Routledge), pp. 340-50.

'Llibre Vermell de Montserrat': edició fascímil parcial del manuscript núm. 1 de l'Abadia de Montserrat, 1989. ed. Francesc Xavier Altés i Aguiló, Llibres del Mil·lenari, 2 (Barcelona: Fundació Revista de Catalunya).

Locher, Paul J., 2012. 'Empirical Investigations of an Aesthetic Experience with Art', in *Aesthetic Science: Connecting Minds, Brains, and Experience*, ed. Arthur P. Shimamura & Stephen E. Palmer (New York: Oxford University Press), pp. 163-88.

Louth, Andrew, 1991. *The Wilderness of God* (London: Darton, Longman and Todd).

MacGregor, Geddes, 1947. *Aesthetic Experience in Religion* (London: Macmillan).

Malina, Bruce J., 1998. 'Pain, Power, and Personhood: Ascetic Behavior in the Ancient Mediterranean', in *Asceticism*, ed. Vincent L. Wimbush & Richard Valantasis (Oxford: University Press), pp. 162-77.

Malone, Edward E., 1950. *The Monk and the Martyr: The Monk as the Successor of the Martyr*, ed. Johannes Quasten, The Catholic University of America Studies in Christian Antiquity, 12 (Baltimore MD: The Catholic University of America Press).

Malpas, Jeff E., 1999. *Place and Experience: A Philosophical Topography* (Cambridge: University Press).

Martín Ansón, M. Luisa, 2007. 'Tradiciones, devociones, reliquies y relicaries de Camino de Santiago en el nordeste', in *El camí de Sant Jaume i Catalunya: Actes del Congrés Internacional Celebrat a Barcelona, Cervera, i Lleida, els dies 16, 17 i 18, d'octubre de 2003*, ed. Maria Teresa Ferrer i Mallol & Pere Verdés Pijuan, Biblioteca Abat Oliba. Sèrie Il·lustrada, 21 (Barcelona: Publicacións de l'Abadia de Montserrat), pp. 351-64.

---, 2011. 'El culto de las reliquias en las *Cantigas de Santa María* de Alfonso X el Sabio', *Espacio, Tiempo y Forma*, 24: 185-218.

Massip, Francesc, 2007. 'Teatre i dansa en els camins de pelegrinació a l'edat mitjana', in *El camí de Sant Jaume i Catalunya: Actes del Congrés Internacional Celebrat a Barcelona, Cervera, i Lleida, els dies 16, 17 i 18, d'octubre de 2003*, ed. Maria Teresa Ferrer i Mallol & Pere Verdés Pijuan, Biblioteca Abat Oliba. Sèrie Il·lustrada, 21 (Barcelona: Publicacións de l'Abadia de Montserrat), pp. 477-84.

Mayo, Arantza, 2009. '"Parece lo que no es, y es lo que no parece": Guises and Disguises in Poems to the Most Holy Sacrament', *Bulletin of Hispanic Studies*, 86.6: 751-61.

McConachie, Bruce, 2008. *Engaging Audiences: A Cognitive Approach to Spectating in the Theatre*, Cognitive Studies in Literature and Performance (New York: Palgrave Macmillan).

---, 2013. ‘Introduction: Spectating as Sandbox Play’, in *Affective Performance and Cognitive Science: Body, Brain, and Being*, ed. Nicola Shaughnessy, Bloomsbury Methuen Drama (London: Bloomsbury), pp. 183-97.

---, & F. Elizabeth Hart, 2006. ‘Introduction’, in *Performance and Cognition: Theatre Studies After the Cognitive Turn*, ed. Bruce A. McConachie & F. Elizabeth Hart, Routledge Advances in Theatre and Performance Studies, 4 (London: Routledge), pp. 1-25.

McKevitt, Christopher, 1991. ‘San Giovanni Rotondo and the Shrine of Padre Pio’, in *Contesting the Sacred: The Anthropology of Christian Pilgrimage*, ed. John Eade & Michael J. Sallnow (London: Routledge), pp. 77-97.

Merback, Mitchell B., 1999. *The Thief, the Cross and the Wheel: Pain and the Spectacle of Punishment in Medieval and Renaissance Europe* (Chicago IL: University Press).

Milbank, John, 2004. ‘Sublimity: The Modern Transcendent’, in *Transcendence: Philosophy, Literature, Theology Approach the Beyond*, ed. Regina Schwartz (New York: Routledge), pp. 211-34.

Milbank, John, Graham Ward, & Edith Wyschogrod, 2003. *Theological Perspectives on God and Beauty*, Rockwell Lecture Series (Harrisburg PA: Trinity Press).

Miquel y Planas, Ramón, 1940. *La Leyenda de Fray Juan Garín, Ermitaño de Monsterrat. Estudio sobre sus orígenes y formación* (Barcelona).

Molas, Joaquim, 1961. *Literatura catalana antiga,* I: *El segle XIII*, Col·lecció popular Barcino, 1 (Barcelona: Barcino).

Montserrat Tourist Guide, 2010. *Montserrat Tourist Guide*. https://www.montserrat-tourist-guide.com [accessed 10.10.2016].

Morgan, David, 2005. *The Sacred Gaze: Religious Visual Culture in Theory and Practice* (Berkeley CA: University of California Press).

Morris, Colin, 1972. *The Discovery of the Individual, 1050-1200*, ed. V. H. H. Green, Church History Outlines, 5 (London: SPCK).

Mundicamino Travel, 2001. *Mundicamino*. http://www.mundicamino.com/ [accessed 10.10.2016].

Museu Nacional d'Art de Catalunya, 2016. *Museu Nacional d'Art de Catalunya.* http://www.museunacional.cat/ca/cataleg [accessed 17.10.2016].

Mutgé Vives, Josefina, 2006. 'Alfonso el Benigno y el Santuario de Montserrat (Barcelona) en el siglo XIV', in *Culti, santuari, pellegrinaggi in Sardegna e nella Peninsola Iberica tra Medioevo ed Età Contemporanea* (Rome: Consiglio nazionale delle ricerche), pp. 409-33.

Nellhaus, Tobin, 2006. 'Performance Strategies, Image Schemas and Communication Frameworks', in *Performance and Cognition: Theatre Studies After the Cognitive Turn*, ed. Bruce A. McConachie & F. Elizabeth Hart, Routledge Advances in Theatre and Performance Studies, 4 (London: Routledge), pp. 76-92.

Ogden, Dunbar H., 2002. *The Staging of Drama in the Medieval Church* (Newark DE: University of Delaware Press).

---, 2005. 'The *Visitatio Sepulchri*: Public Enactment and Hidden Rite', in *The Dramatic Tradition of the Middle Ages*, ed. Clifford Davidson, AMS Studies in the Middle Ages, 26 (New York: AMS Press), pp. 28-35.

Olivier, Matthieu, 1617. *Histoire de l'abbaye, et des miracles de Nostre Dame de Montserrat* (Lyon).

O'Reilly, Terence, 1997. 'Meditation and Contemplation: Monastic Spirituality in Early Sixteenth-Century Spain', in *Faith and Fanaticism: Religious Fervour in Early Modern Spain*, ed. Lesley K. Twomey (Aldershot: Ashgate), pp. 37-57.

Oxford Dictionaries, 2018. (Oxford: University Press). https://en.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/kinaesthetic [accessed: 25.10.18]

Paphnutius, 2000. *Histories of the Monks of Upper Egypt and The Life of Onnophrius*, ed. & trans. Tim Vivian, Cistercian Studies Series, 140 (Kalamazoo MI: Cistercian Publications).

Peacock, James L., 1990. 'Ethnographic Notes on Sacred and Profane Performance,' in *By Means of Performance: Intercultural Studies of Theatre and Ritual*, ed. Richard Schechner & Willa Appel (Cambridge: University Press), pp. 208-20.

Perkins, Judith, 1995. *The Suffering Self: Pain and Narrative Representation in the Early Christian Era* (London: Routledge).

Phillips, C. Matthew, 2010. '"Crux a cruciatu dicitur": Preaching Self-Torture as Pastoral Care in Twelfth-Century Religious Houses', in *A Companion to Pastoral Care in the Late Middle Ages (1200-1500)*, ed. Ronald J. Stansburg, Brill's Companions to the Christian Tradition, 22 (Leiden: Brill), pp. 284-309.

Phillips, Natalie M., 2015. 'Literary Neuroscience and History of Mind: An Interdisciplinary fMRI Study of Attention and Jane Austen', in *The Oxford Handbook of Cognitive Literary Studies*, ed. Lisa Zunshine, Oxford Handbooks of Literature (New York: Oxford University Press), pp. 55-81.

Pinkus, Assaf, 2015. 'Guido da Siena and the Four Modes of Violence', in *Death, Torture and the Broken Body in European Art, 1300-1650*, ed. John R. Decker & Mitzi Kirkland-Ives (London: Ashgate), pp. 19-34.

Piper, Adrian, 2009. 'Intuition and Concrete Particularity in Kant's Transcendental Aesthetic', in *Rediscovering Aesthetics: Transdisciplinary Voices from Art History, Philosophy, and Art Practice*, ed. Francis Halsall, Julia Janzen, & Tony O' Connor (Stanford CA: University Press), pp. 193-209.

Potter, David, 1993. 'Martyrdom as Spectacle', in *Theater and Society in the Classical World*, ed. Ruth Scodel (Ann Arbor MI: University of Michigan Press), pp. 53-88.

Powell, Hilary, 2014. 'Pilgrimage, Performance, and Miracle Cures in the Twelfth-Century Miracula of St. Aebbe', in *Medicine, Healing and Performance*, ed. Effie Gemi-Iordanou, Stephen Gordon, Robert Matthew, Ellen McInnes, & Rhiannon Pettitt (Oxford: Oxbow Books), pp. 71-85.

Ramachandran, Vilayanur S., & Elizabeth Seckel, 2012. 'Neurology of Visual Aesthetics: Indian Nymphs, Modern Art, and Sexy Beaks', in *Aesthetic Science: Connecting Minds, Bodies, and Experience*, ed. Arthur P. Shimamura & Stephen E. Palmer (New York: Oxford University Press), pp. 375-89.

Reader, Ian, 2015. *Pilgrimage: A Very Short Introduction* (Oxford: University Press).

Reeve, Matthew M., 2008. *Thirteenth-Century Wall Painting of Salisbury Cathedral: Art, Liturgy, and Reform* (Woodbridge: The Boydell Press).

Reynolds, Roger E., 2000. 'The Drama of Medieval Liturgical Processions', *Revue de Musicologie*, 86.1: 127-42.

Ribas i Calaf, Benet, 1997. *Annals de Montserrat: (1258-1485)*, Textos i Estudis de Cultura Catalana, 52 (Barcelona: Publicacions de l'Abadia de Montserrat).

Ricard, Robert, 1972. 'L'érémitisme en Espagne', *Bulletin Hispanique*, 74: 544-48.

Rokotnitz, Naomi, 2013. 'Between Faulty Intellects and Failing Bodies: An Economy of Reciprocity in Wit and 33 Variations', in *Affective Performance and Cognitive Science: Body, Brain, and Being*, ed. Nicola Shaughnessy, Bloomsbury Methuen Drama (London: Bloomsbury), pp. 117-31.

Romeu, Joesp, 1961. *Literatura catalana antiga,* II: *El segle XIV* (Barcelona: Editorial Barcino).

Rudd, Gillian, 2007. *Greenery: Ecocritical Readings of Late Medieval English Literature*, Manchester Medieval Literature (Manchester: University Press).

Sacred Destinations, 2005. *Montserrat Shrine.* http://www.sacred-destinations.com/spain/montserrat-shrine [accessed 13.10.2016]

Scarborough, Connie L., 2009. *A Holy Alliance: Alfonso X's Political Use of Marian Poetry*, Estudios de literatura medieval, 6 (Newark DE: Juan de la Cuesta).

---, 2013. *Inscribing the Environment: Ecocritical Approaches to Medieval Spanish Literature*, Fundamentals of Medieval and Early Modern Culture, 13 (Boston MA: De Gruyter).

---, 2013-14. 'Seeing and Believing: The Gaze in the *Vida de Santa María Egipçiaca*', *La Corónica*, 42.1: 299-319.

Scarry, Elaine, 1985. *The Body in Pain: The Making and Unmaking of the World*, Oxford Paperbacks (Oxford: University Press).

Schechner, Richard, 1988. *Performance Theory*, Routledge Classics (New York: Routledge).

Schütz, Bernhard, 2004. *Great Monasteries of Europe*, trans. Steven Lindberg (New York: Abbeville Press).

Serra y Postius, Pedro, 1745. *Historia verdadera, de la aparición de a Nuestra Señora de Monserrate, y los Condes de Barcelona, con los sucesos estraños, y maravillosos de la Infanta Doña Riquilda, y el Ermitaño Fray Juan Garin* (Barcelona: Pablo Campins).

---, 1747. *Epitome historico del portentoso Santuario, y real Monasterio de Nuestra Señora de Montserrate, ilustrado con los sucesos historicos más memorables de los Principes sus devotos y bienhechores* (Barcelona: Pablo Campins).

Shaughnessy, Nicola, 2013. 'General Introduction: Operating in Science Theatres', in *Affective Performance and Cognitive Science: Body, Brain, and Being*, ed. Nicola Shaughnessy, Bloomsbury Methuen Drama (London: Bloomsbury), pp. 1-24.

Shelley, James, 2013. 'The Aesthetic', in *The Routledge Companion to Aesthetics*, ed. Berys Gaut & Dominic McIver Lopes, Routledge Companions to Philosophy (London: Routledge), pp. 246-56.

Sheridan, Kimberly M., & Howard Gardner, 2012. 'Artistic Development: The Three Essential Spheres', in *Aesthetic Science: Connecting Minds, Brains, and Experience*, ed. Arthur P. Shimamura & Stephen E. Palmer (New York: Oxford University Press), pp. 276-96.

Shiff, Richard, 2009. 'Sensation in the Wild: On Not Naming Newman, Judd, Riley, and Serra', in *Rediscovering Aesthetics: Transdisciplinary Voices from Art History, Philosophy, and Art Practice*, ed. Francis Halsall, Julia Janzen, & Tony O' Connor (Stanford CA: University Press), pp. 75-86.

Shimamura, Arthur P., 2012. 'Toward a Science of Aesthetics Issues and Ideas', in *Aesthetic Science: Connecting Minds, Brains, and Experience*, ed. Arthur P. Shimamura & Stephen E. Palmer (New York: Oxford University Press), pp. 3-28.

Simon, Julien J., 2016. 'Contextualizing Cognitive Approaches to Early Modern Spanish Literature', in *Cognitive Approaches to Early Modern Spanish Literature*, ed. Isabel Jaén & Julien J. Simon, Cognition and Poetics (Oxford: University Press), pp. 13-33.

Slavin, Sean, 2003. 'Walking as Spiritual Practice: The Pilgrimage to Santiago de Compostela', *Body and Society*, 9.3: 1-18.

Smith, Kathryn A., 2009. 'Chivalric Narratives and Devotional Experience in the Taymouth Hours', in *Negotiating Secular and Sacred in Medieval Art: Christian, Islamic and Buddhist*, ed. Alicia Walker & Amanda Luster (Farnham: Ashgate), pp. 17-54.

Smolden, William L., trans., 1964. '*Visitatio Sepulchri': An Acting Version of a Twelfth-Century Liturgical Music-Drama for Easter from the 'Fleury Playbook': For Soloists, Unison Chorus, and Organ Accompaniment, with Optional Parts for Certain Solo Instruments* (London: Oxford University Press).

Spicer, Andrew, & Sarah Hamilton, ed., 2005. *Defining the Holy: Sacred Space in Medieval and Early Modern Europe* (Burlington: Ashgate).

Starr, G. Gabrielle, 2015. 'Theorizing Imagery, Aesthetics, and Doubly Directed States', in *The Oxford Handbook of Cognitive Literary Studies*, ed. Lisa Zunshine, Oxford Handbooks of Literature (Oxford: University Press), pp. 246-68.

Staub, Ervin, 1990. 'The Psychology and Culture of Torture and Torturers', in *Psychology and Torture*, ed. Peter Suedfeld (New York: Hemisphere Publishing), pp. 49-76.

Stevenson, Jill, 2010. *Performance, Cognitive Theory, and Devotional Culture: Sensual Piety in Late Medieval York*, Cognitive Studies in Literature and Performance (New York: Palgrave Macmillan).

Stirrat, Richard L., 1991. 'Place and Person in Sinhala Catholic Pilgrimage', in *Contesting the Sacred: The Anthropology of Christian Pilgrimage*, ed. John Eade & Michael J. Sallnow (London: Routledge), pp. 122-36.

Stopford, J., 1994. 'Some Approaches to the Archaeology of Christian Pilgrimage', *World Archaeology*, 26.1: 57–72.

---, ed., 1999. *Pilgrimage Explored* (Woodbridge: York Medieval Press).

Suedfeld, Peter, 1990. 'Torture: A Brief Overview', in *Psychology and Torture*, ed. Peter Suedfeld (New York NY: Hemisphere Publishing), pp. 1-11.

Sumption, Jonathon, 1975. *Pilgrimage: An Image of Mediaeval Religion* (London: Faber & Faber).

Symes, Carol, 2004. 'A Few Odd Visits: Unusual Settings of the *Visitatio Sepulchri*', in *Music and Medieval Manuscripts: Paleography and Performance*, ed. John Haines & Randall Rosenfeld (Aldershot: Ashgate), pp. 300-22.

Terry, Arthur, 1972. *A Literary History of Spain: Catalan Literature* (London: Ernest Benn).

Thomas, Kyle A., 2018. 'The Medieval Space: Early Medieval Documents as Stages', *Theatre Survey*, 59.1: 4-22.

Thomas, Wyndham, ed., 2001. *The Fleury Playbook*, II: *Plays for Christmas and Easter: 'The Play of Herod'; 'The Massacre of the Innocents'; 'The Visit to the Sepulchre'*, Antico Edition Medieval Church Music, 5 (Newton Abbot: Antico Edition).

Tilley, Maureen A.,1991. 'The Ascetic Body and the (Un)making of the World of the Martyr', *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, 59.3: 467-79.

Tohme, Lara, 2009. 'Spaces of Convergence: Christian Monasteries and Umayyad Architecture in Greater Syria', in *Negotiating Secular and Sacred in Medieval Art: Christian, Islamic and Buddhist*, ed. Alicia Walker & Amanda Luyster (Farnham: Ashgate), pp. 129-46.

Tribble, Evelyn B., & John Sutton, 2013. 'Introduction: Interdisciplinarity and Cognitive Approaches to Performance', in *Affective Performance and Cognitive Science: Body, Brain, and Being*, ed. Nicola Shaughnessy, Bloomsbury Methuen Drama (London: Bloomsbury), pp. 27-37.

The Confraternity of Saint James, 2016. 'The Confraternity of Saint James: Step by Step to Santiago'. https://www.csj.org.uk/planning-your-pilgrimage/routes-to-santiago/routes-in-spain/catalan-caminos/ [accessed 10.10.2016]

Tuan, Yi-Fu, 1977. *Space and Place: The Perspective of Experience* (London: Edward Arnold).

Turbull, Colin, 1990. 'Liminality: A Synthesis of Subjective and Objective Experience,' in *By Means of Performance: Intercultural Studies of Theatre and Ritual,* ed. Richard Schechner & Willa Appel (Cambridge: University Press), pp. 50-81.

Turner, Victor, 1990. 'Are There Universals of Performance in Myth, Ritual, and Drama?' in *By Means of Performance: Intercultural Studies of Theatre and Ritual,* ed. Richard Schechner & Willa Appel (Cambridge: University Press), pp. 8-18.

---, & Edith Turner, 1978. *Image and Pilgrimage in Christian Culture: Anthropological Perspectives* (New York: Columbia University Press).

Twomey, Lesley K., 1997. '"Cechs són aquells que tenen lo contrari": Fanatical Condemnation of Opponents of the Immaculate Conception in Fifteenth-Century Valencia', in *Faith and Fanaticism: Religious Fervour in Early Modern Spain*, ed. Lesley K. Twomey (Aldershot: Ashgate), pp. 23-35.

---, 2008. *The Serpent and the Rose: The Immaculate Conception and Hispanic Poetry in the Late Medieval Period*, Studies in Medieval and Reformation Traditions, 132 (Leiden: Brill).

---, 2013-14. 'Mary Magdalene and the Virgin Mary: Women Seeing the Resurrection in Isabel de Villena's *Vita Christi* and in the *Vita Christi* Tradition', *La Corónica*, 42.1: 321-48.

---, 2019. *The Sacred Space of the Virgin Mary in Medieval Hispanic Literature from Gonzalo de Berceo to Ambrosio Montesino*, Colección Támesis Serie A Monografías, 381 (Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer Ltd.).

Vitz, Evelyn Birge, 1989. *Medieval Narrative and Modern Narratology: Subjects and Objects of Desire* (New York: University Press).

Vivian, Tim, trans. 1993. Pisentius of Coptos, *Histories of the Monks of Upper Egypt and the Life of Onnophrius*, Cistercian Study Series, 140 (Kalamazoo MI: Cistercian Publications).

Walker, Alicia, & Amanda Luyster, 2009. 'Introduction', in *Negotiating Secular and Sacred in Medieval Art: Christian, Islamic and Buddhist*, ed. Alicia Walker & Amanda Luyster (Farnham: Ashgate), pp. 1-16.

Ward, Benedicta, trans., 1984. *The Sayings of the Desert Fathers: The Alphabetical Collection*, Cistercian Studies Series, 59 (Kalamazoo MI: Cistercian Publications).

Warning, Rainer, 2001. *The Ambivalences of Medieval Religious Drama*, trans. Steven Rendall, Figurae (Stanford CA: University Press).

Webb, Diana, 2002. *Medieval European Pilgrimage, c.700-c.1500*, European Culture and Society Series (Hampshire: Palgrave).

Welsch, Wolfgang, 2009. 'Aesthetics Beyond Aesthetics', in *Rediscovering Aesthetics: Transdisciplinary Voices from Art History, Philosophy, and Art Practice*, ed. Francis Halsall, Julia Janzen, & Tony O' Connor (Stanford CA: University Press), pp. 178-92.

Wilkinson, John, ed. & trans., 2002. *Egeria's Travels* (Warminster: Aris & Phillips).

Williams, Charles Allyn, 1926. *Oriental Affinities of the Legend of the Hairy Anchorite in its Early Forms with Reference to 'Die Lügend von Sanct Johanne' and to Other European Variants*, University of Illinois Studies in Language and Literature, 11.4 (Urbana IL: University of Illinois).

Williamson, Beth, 2010. 'How Magnificent Was Medieval Art?', in *Magnificence and the Sublime in Medieval Aesthetics: Art, Architecture, Literature, Music*, ed. C. Stephen Jaeger, The New Middle Ages (New York: Palgrave Macmillan), pp. 243-62.

---, 2014. 'Material Culture and Medieval Christianity', in *The Oxford Handbook of Medieval Christianity*, ed. John H. Arnold, Oxford Handbooks (Oxford: University Press), pp. 60-75.

Woolgar, C.M., 2006. *The Senses in Late Medieval England* (New Haven CT: Yale University Press).

Wright, Craig, 2000. 'The Palm Sunday Procession in Medieval Chartres', in *The Divine Office in the Latin Middle Ages: Methodology and Source Studies, Regional Developments, Hagiography*: *Written in Honor of Professor Ruth Steiner*, ed. Margot E. Fassler & Rebecca A. Baltzer (Oxford: University Press), pp. 344-71.

Wursten, Dick, 2010. 'The Music from the *Llibre Vermell* of Montserrat: Revised Text Edition, Based on the Original Manuscript'. https://dick.wursten.be/Vermell_originaltexts_translations.htm [accessed: 12.06.17]

Yamamoto, Dorothy, 2000. *The Boundaries of the Human in Medieval English Literature* (Oxford: University Press).

Young, Karl, 1909. *Some Texts of Liturgical Drama*, ed. Karl Young, Publications of the Modern Language Association of America, 24.2 (Baltimore MD: Modern Language Association of America).

---, 1967. *The Drama of the Medieval Church* (Oxford: Clarendon Press).

Zeki, Semir, 1999. *Inner Vision: An Exploration of Art and the Brain* (Oxford: University Press).

Zunshine, Lisa, 2015. 'Introduction', in *The Oxford Handbook of Cognitive Literary Studies*, ed. Lisa Zunshine, Oxford Handbooks of Literature (Oxford: University Press), pp. 1-9.